Changing Channels:  
A Framework for Communication Planning in a Media Intensive Society

By Voloe Jefferson Scott

B.A. Psychology, Denison University, 1997

Submitted to the MIT Sloan School of Management in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of Master of Business Administration at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology

June 2009

© 2009 Voloe Jefferson Scott. All rights reserved.

The author hereby grants to MIT permission to reproduce and to distribute publicly paper and electronic copies of this thesis document in whole or in part.

Signature of Author: ____________________________

MIT Sloan School of Management May 8, 2009

Certified by: _________________________________

Glen L. Urban, David Austin Professor of Marketing, Dean Emeritus Thesis Advisor

Accepted by: _________________________________

Stephen J. Sacca Director, MIT Sloan Fellows Program in Innovation and Global Leadership
Changing Channels:
A Framework for Communication Planning in a Media Intensive Society

By Voloe Jefferson Scott

Submitted to the MIT Sloan School of Management on May 8, 2009 in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of Master of Business Administration

ABSTRACT

In today’s media intensive society, where consumers are well equipped to resist advertisers’ strategies, creative and messages, it is becoming increasingly more difficult for advertisers to break through the concofany of noise to persuade the consumer that their product or service is worthy of a consumer’s attention and eventual purchase.

The purpose of this research is ultimately to suggest a framework for use in communication planning that is measurably successful in moving users up a succession of steps starting prior to awareness through purchase utilizing a combination of traditional and digital advertising tactics and techniques. We assume that in today’s media intensive society, were traditional and digital advertising is thought to cannibalize one another, an integrated approach across multiple communication channels is the most effective way to reach and motivate the modern consumer whose media consumption habits are increasingly fractured.

The framework proposed within the paper will contribute to a better understanding of how to leverage traditional and digital media tactics within communication planning.

Thesis Advisor: Glen L. Urban, David Austin Professor of Marketing, Dean Emeritus
Acknowledgements

I would like to thank Professor Glen Urban for his advice, patience and his ability in shepherding me through the process of writing a thesis. I also would like to thank my wife Sarah for her faith, patience, perseverance and support as I went about writing this thesis. In addition, I want to thank the Sloan Fellows Program in Innovation and Global Leadership program staff for their tireless dedication to the class of 2009. Finally, I would like to thank God for helping me to undertake and complete this thesis.
# Table of Contents

Introduction ...................................................................................................................... 6  
Today's Consumer .............................................................................................................. 6  
Purpose of the Research ................................................................................................... 7  
Advertising Today ............................................................................................................. 7  
  Traditional and digital tactics .............................................................................................. 7  
  Traditional or conventional tactics .................................................................................. 8  
  Digital tactics ..................................................................................................................... 10  
Advertising Value Chain .................................................................................................. 12  
Advertising Hierarchy of Effects Model ......................................................................... 14  
Literature Review .............................................................................................................. 17  
  Support for the Advertising Hierarchy of Effects Model ............................................. 17  
  Support for the Effectiveness of Digital Tactics ........................................................... 18  
    Digital advertising as a standalone medium ................................................................. 19  
    Interrelationship (synergies) between digital advertising tactics ............................... 20  
    Effectiveness of digital media tactics when compared to traditional media tactics ...... 22  
    The combined effectiveness of traditional and digital tactics .................................... 23  
    The effectiveness of television and digital advertising .............................................. 23  
    The effectiveness of television, print and digital advertising .................................. 25  
Research Methodology .................................................................................................... 26  
  Purpose ............................................................................................................................. 26  
  Population and Sampling ................................................................................................. 26  
    Limitations of findings ................................................................................................ 27  
Survey Design .................................................................................................................... 27  
Research Analysis & Discussion ...................................................................................... 27  
  Giving and receiving advice ............................................................................................ 27  
  Communication channel agnostic .................................................................................. 28  
Media mix ........................................................................................................................... 29  
Consumer first .................................................................................................................... 29  
Conclusion ......................................................................................................................... 30
Introduction

Today’s Consumer

Today consumers and non-consumers alike are bombarded by advertising in various forms regardless of consumers’ emotional states, levels of awareness, purchase intent, locations or mediums in which they are interacting. Advertising is ubiquitous – it is present on the radio in our cars and located on billboards during our morning commute, on the train in various forms of display or radio or podcast, at our jobs in the form of a company’s brand on display in the reception area to the signature line of each and every email sent throughout the day. Advertising is present while at play in the form of company sponsorship of various playing fields, when at leisure regardless if you are surfing the internet, reading a book or in some cases simply staring out of a window. Advertising in all forms permeates all facets of our lives, unless of course one lives on a remote mountain top without access to or need of interaction with the outside world. In this case one would need to grow and consume all that a body requires to sustain itself without purchasing a single item. Barring this exception, advertising is a partner in consumers’ lives and like various other “partners” that demand attention consumers have developed mechanisms that allow them to filter out the noise of everyday life in order to accomplish that which they set out to do.

Chingning Wang, Ping Zhang, Risook Choi, and Michael D.Eredita in their paper entitled “Understanding Consumer Attitude Toward Advertising”¹ indicate that advertising and information system research supports the notion that traditional and digital media is easily ignored or has little value on the perceptions of the consumer (Wang, Zhang, Choi, & Eredita, 2002). The paper goes further to state that Leo Bogart argued, in his paper entitled “War of the Words: Advertising in the year 2010”, that chances of careful processing of advertisements are lowered by the high number of advertisements competing for individual’s attention on a daily basis. Limited time and mental resources make it difficult for the audience to dedicate sufficient attention to most advertisements. The development of the Internet is resulting in great growth of online advertising. This is making the competition for attention more intensive (Wang, Zhang, Choi, & Eredita, 2002).

In today’s media intensive society, where consumers are well equipped to resist advertisers’ strategies, creative and messages, it is becoming increasingly more difficult for advertisers to break

¹ (Wang, Zhang, Choi, & Eredita, 2002), The paper explores consumer’s attitudes towards advertisements., http://melody.syr.edu/hci/amcis02_minitrack/RIP/Wang.pdf
through the concofany of noise to persuade the consumer that their product or service is worthy of a consumer’s attention and eventual purchase.

**Purpose of the Research**

The purpose of this research is ultimately to suggest a framework for use in communication planning that is measurably successful in moving users up a succession of steps starting prior to awareness through purchase utilizing a combination of traditional and digital advertising tactics. We assume that in today’s media intensive society, were traditional and digital advertising is thought to cannibalize one another, an integrated approach across multiple communication channels is the most effective way to reach and motivate the modern consumer whose media consumption habits are increasingly fractured. It is our belief that this topic is as broad as to be impossible to conduct significant primary research to successfully validate the proposed frameworks within the time constraints of the author’s Master’s program. Instead the research and proposed framework along with proposed future research should be taken as a starting point for further analysis and testing. It is also our believe that the industry and the current state of communication planning research in this area benefits from the research, proposed framework and future research recommendations contained herein. It is my hope that the framework proposed within the paper will contribute to a better understanding of how to leverage traditional and digital media tactics within communication planning.

**Advertising Today**

The state of advertising today is one that is evolving. There are at least two mainstream and one emerging advertising media channels. The first two are traditional and digital media channels. The third emerging channel is the mobile channel. This paper will primarily discuss the interaction between traditional and digital media while acknowledging that mobile may play a significant role in how advertising is consumed in the future.

**Traditional and digital tactics**

Traditional and digital tactics while operating in different mediums can be placed into similar categories. While not all traditional or all digital tactics fit into the following categories it is none the less useful to place the tactics within the following categories:

1. Advertising
2. Public Relations
3. Direct Response
4. Trade Shows and Events
5. Sponsorships
6. Viral

Traditional or conventional tactics

Traditional or conventional tactics have been developed and tested since the advent of marketing. The tactics are the basis for the previously mentioned categories of marketing and can be applied to other mediums. The Australian Information and Communication Technologies website provides a good reference for the tactics of traditional marketing with the exception of viral. They are as follows:

1. Advertising
   a. When used effectively, advertising can:
      i. Sell to new and existing customers
      ii. Promote new products and services
      iii. Publicise special offers, sales and events
      iv. Build and maintain brand awareness
      v. Announce price changes.

2. Public Relations
   a. PR is designed to ensure positive editorial coverage in trade and consumer media.
   Public relations can be very powerful because customers view third-party news stories as more credible and less biased than advertising. Positive publicity can increase your company's mind-share and create awareness and demand for your products. Positive editorial coverage can be used in future marketing and promotional materials. The best part is that this can be achieved at a far lower cost than advertising. Elements may include:
      i. **Press release**: one or more interesting, professionally written press releases that pitch a good story angle to differentiate a company.
      ii. **Press kit**: a comprehensive press kit, with background on a company and products, white papers, FAQs and colour photographs (hard copy or on CD-ROM).
      iii. **Demonstration**: an inspiring product demonstration presented by a knowledgeable and personable spokesperson.
iv. **Press tour:** meet the press to introduce a company and products.

3. **Direct Response**
   
a. Promoting a business through direct mail can be an effective and affordable marketing strategy. Direct mail can help a company reach selected prospects cost-effectively. Advantages of direct marketing:
   
i. *Direct marketing can be focused.* Mass media relies on a 'shotgun approach' to hit a diverse universe of potential customers. In contrast, direct marketing can be targeted at a single individual at a particular address. How effective this is depends on the quality of the list a firm uses.
   
   ii. *Direct marketing sales can be predicted with accuracy.* By carefully testing and tracking responses on a small scale, you can effectively predict the results of a large-scale campaign.
   
   iii. *Direct marketing takes a firm’s product to the customer.* Direct marketing can make it easier for customers to purchase a firm’s products. For example, a company can alert customers to new products or upgrades before they go on sale. A company can also make buying easy with a pre-populated order form.
   
   iv. *Direct marketing is economical.* Depending on the magnitude and complexity of a campaign, direct marketing can be a cost-effective way to reach a sizeable audience of potential customers on an individual basis.

4. **Trade Shows and Events**
   
a. A trade show allows communication with a targeted audience of prospective customers, all gathered in the same place and primed to buy. Many of these people will have no prior awareness of a company and products. Trade shows give you an opportunity to demonstrate s firm’s products first hand. This has greater impact than a brochure or website and is more cost-effective than an individual sales call. Trade shows also attract many journalists, allowing a firm to try to gain publicity for your product. Trade shows provide introductions to prospective distributors, resellers, venture partners and investors. Moreover, exhibitors usually showcase similar products, so this gives a firm a chance to assess their competitors.

5. **Sponsorships**
a. This refers to sponsoring conferences, seminars, publications, local events and promotions at trade shows. The intention is always to gain greater exposure for a company and build further brand recognition among the people that count. In an environment such as a trade show or industry conference, a number of sponsorship techniques can be used effectively. For effective sponsorships, it pays to think creatively – especially if the firm has a low budget. This is one form of marketing where a well-executed and novel idea can create more buzz than expensive alternatives. These include:
   i. Hosting hospitality suites
   ii. Sponsoring small events or ‘birds of a feather’ functions
   iii. Advertising in the event program or handbook
   iv. Arranging for a promotional item to be included in delegate satchels

(Australian Information and Communication Technologies, 2009)

6. Viral
   a. Word of mouth – Wikipedia defines word of mouth as a reference to the passing of information from person to person. Originally the term referred specifically to oral communication (literally words from the mouth), but now includes any type of human communication, such as face to face, telephone, email, and text messaging. (Wikipedia, 2009)

Digital tactics

Roderick White in his Admap article “Best Practices - Exploiting the Internet” describes internet advertising as the fastest – growing medium. In addition the medium should have a larger share of adspend then the 3-5% it garners in most developed markets (White, 2005). The article describes several different tactics that are available for use within the digital medium. These tactics can be placed in the above categories, with the addition of viral marketing as follows:

1. Advertising
   a. Display: static or animated ads can be run in a variety of standard formats (developed from the original banners), from buttons to the much –hated pop-ups,
much as traditional print advertising, but supplemented by the use of links direct to
a company site for information and interaction.
b. **Streaming**: this may take a fairly traditional commercial format or something much
more like entertainment – for example, the now-famous BMW film series.
c. **Search**: all-type small ads, bought to appear against search keywords employed by
surfers on the major search engines.

2. **Public Relations**:
   a. **Websites**: company or brand websites or microsites can provide a wide range of
      information and entertainment, up to and including a full ecommerce capability

3. **Direct Response**:
   a. **Email**: the direct exploitation of databases drawn from on-site registration and
      elsewhere.

4. **Trade Shows and Events**:
   a. **Webinars**: seminars which take place exclusively online
   b. **Webcasts**: speaking engagements which are exclusively online similar to streaming
      advertisements

5. **Sponsorships**: of pages or sectors of major portals such as AOL.

6. **Viral marketing**: seeding ads and information that are then passed on by surfers (White,
   2005)
   a. **Word of Mouth**
      i. **Social Messaging**: content produced by an individual or a company
         1. **Web Blog**: digital diary
         2. **Twitter**: a micro blog restricted to a certain number of characters
            per entry
         3. **Facebook**: a personal display advertisement which incorporates
            many aspects of social messaging including blogs and instant
            messaging
         4. **Youtube**: a video streaming blog where individual post video clips
         5. **Hulu**: a video streaming website where corporations post
            professional video content
b. **Interactive Television:** broadcast television were the consumer of the media can impact the content by providing selections during the broadcast which determine subsequent content that is displayed.

Digital advertising tactics are gaining an increasing share of advertising spend. According to the European Internet Advertising Association’s “Marketers’ Internet Ad Barometer 2009”\(^3\), in a survey of some of the world’s largest advertisers, advertisers will continue to increase their internet advertising despite the current economic downturn (Administrator, 2009). 171 respondents, on average, predicted growth in online advertising of +18% in 2009, +21% in 2010 and +15% in 2011 (Figure 1). In addition, the use of search, email, display and video advertising is increasing significantly (Administrator, 2009). These trends indicate, at least in Europe, advertisers are interested in leveraging the digital channel (Figure 2).

**Advertising Value Chain**

Today’s advertisers are not completely without a network that makes their task of moving a user through the purchase cycle easier. The advertising value chain has evolved along with the consumer to become more sophisticated, more quantitative, more complex and more expensive. The old advertising value chain model consisted of advertisers, agencies, publishers and the consumer (Figure 3). The new advertising value chain model unfolds as follows: advertiser, advertising agency – either traditional or digital or both, media planning agency – which sometimes is a part of an agency or a media neutral standalone entity, publisher network and publisher, researcher and consumer (Figure 4).

Advertisers represent the beginning of the advertising value chain. The advertiser is generally a company that has a product or service that it wants a consumer to purchase. This product or service represents the “brand” that is further refined, positioned and sold to the consumer. The advertiser’s brand represents the engine that drives the value chain. Next within the advertising value chain is the agency.

If the brand is the engine then the agency is the body shop that shapes and molds the brand to make it sleeker, faster and better than the other brands against which it is competing. The agency’s role

---

\(^3\) (Administrator, 2009), A European Interactive Advertising Association survey regarding advertisers attitudes towards advertising., http://www.eiia.net/ftp/casestudiesppt/EIAA_Marketers_Internet_Ad_Barometer_2009_PR_Presentation.pdf
is to consultant to the advertiser on how to package and shape the brand in order to persuade the consumer to purchase. The agency has more tools and experience in shaping brands than the advertiser. These tools and experiences are derived from working across multiple brands and across multiple industries allowing it to create more value than the advertiser could alone. The next step in the advertising value chain is the media planning agency.

The media planning agency has evolved from a department within the advertising agency (old model) to an extension of the agency, to finally a standalone entity that can exist separately from an agency. An example of this phenomenon is the communication planning agency Naked Communications. Naked Communications was created as a media neutral and stand alone communication planning agency. They have been selected by several of the world’s largest advertisers to lead communication planning for the advertisers’ brands. Their approach is media agnostic. The media plans they provide are independent of the influences traditional and digital agencies are subjected because media neutral agencies do not buy media, increasing the objectivity of their plans.

The evolution of the media planning agency has followed the evolution of the consumer. As the consumer has become more sophisticated in their media consumption habits, the media planning agency has become more sophisticated in their methods of planning and buying media. To continue the brand as engine metaphor the planning agency is the entity that decides the venue in which the brand will compete. In addition, the media planning agency is the handicapper that attempts to “fix” the odds in favor of the brand over other brands and ultimately over the consumer. The media planning agency creates value by placing the brand in situations where it will be accepted by consumers over other competing brands.

The publisher network is one of two owners of arenas where the brand competes. In the old model publishing networks were not as preeminent as they are today. The proliferation of venues in which to advertise today is due to the “long tail” of the internet. The internet reduces the barriers to entry for content providers that cater to a specific niche consumer increasing the reach or “tail” of the digital medium. The publishing network creates value by contracting with content providers (publishers) that are either too small or so narrowly focused as to not be able to participate within the advertising value chain. The Publishing Network also can create exclusive partnerships to restrict access to certain publishers. Much like the planning agency, the publishing network has enjoyed increasing levels of
market power due to the increasing sophistication of the consumer and the availability of narrowly focused digital content.

The next step in the advertising value chain is the publisher, perhaps more powerful than the publishing networks. The publisher is generally a high volume website/portal and or a search engine. The publisher creates value within the advertising value chain by providing access to the consumer. The publisher is valued due to its reach, whether the reach is the sheer volume or the specificity of the traffic segment that frequents the publisher’s site. Amazon.com is an example of a publisher with a high volume of traffic, while a niche publisher, like Orchids.com, is an example of a publisher that has a specific consumer segment.

The advertising value chain is only one factor of several factors that influences advertising campaign effectiveness. The next factor that determines advertising effectiveness is grounded in an understanding of how users progress through the purchase cycle. In order to understand how users progress through the purchase cycle it is helpful to apply a framework to the movement through the purchase cycle. In this context, the Advertising Hierarchy of Effects Model is the appropriate framework to use.

**Advertising Hierarchy of Effects Model**

The Advertising Hierarchy of Effects Model was proposed by Robert J. Lavidge and Gary A. Steiner in 1961. The model has been proven relevant for the application in both traditional and digital advertising. Lavidge and Steiner describe advertising as a “force, which must move people up a series of steps” (Lavidge & Steiner, 1961). The model describes six steps which people move through towards purchasing a product. The six steps are as follows:

1. Near the bottom of the steps stand potential purchasers who are completely **unaware of the existence** of the product or service in question.
2. Closer to purchasing, but still a long way from the cash register, are those who are merely **aware of its existence**.
3. Up a step are prospects who **know what the product has to offer**.

---

4 (Lavidge & Steiner, 1961). This is an article that describes a model for predictive measurements of advertising effectiveness. The model is the basis of this paper’s framework.
4. Still closer to purchasing are those who have favorable attitudes toward the product—those who like the product.

5. Those whose favorable attitudes have developed to the point of preference over all other possibilities are up still another step.

6. Even closer to purchasing are consumers who couple preference with a desire to buy and the conviction that the purchase would be wise.

7. Finally, of course, is the step which translates this attitude into actual purchase. (Lavidge & Steiner, 1961)

Lavidge and Steiner go further to state that while the hierarchy is linear the distances between each of the seven steps is not equidistant. This implies that the move up a step from awareness to knowledge may be a smaller distance than to move from conviction to purchase and vice versa. Finally, depending on the level of consideration (involvement) of the purchase, purchasing a fast moving consumer package good like a pack of chewing gum versus purchasing an automobile, consumers may rapidly ascend the model of advertising effectiveness to purchase.

The vast majority of advertising campaigns are geared toward moving consumers from conviction to purchase or moving consumers from awareness to knowledge. Within traditional advertising in store promotions or in store coupons are examples of the type of advertisements that attempt to move consumers from conviction to purchase. Within digital advertising direct response ads that include an “add to cart” button are examples of ads that attempt to move consumers from conviction to purchase.

These approaches may not take advantage of coordinating messages to move consumers from their current step to the next proceeding step within the middle of the model. The model is intended to indicate that advertising campaigns should be designed to target specific consumers that are on a particular step and advance them to the next step in the model and not become preoccupied with the final movement to purchase. Approaching advertising campaigns in this way has several implications which will be explored in further detail later in the paper.
In addition to outlining the six steps Lavidge and Steiner map the six steps “to a classic psychological model which divides behavior into three components or dimensions:” (Lavidge & Steiner, 1961). The dimensions are as follows:

1. The cognitive component – the intellectual, mental, or “rational” states.
2. The affective component – the “emotional” or “feeling” states.
3. The cognitive or motivational component – the “striving” states, relating to the tendency to treat objects as positive or negative goals. (Lavidge & Steiner, 1961)

The mapping is important because advertising messaging or call to action will differ depending on where a particular consumer is in relation to a particular state. The messaging you use to create positive influence within a consumer most closely aligned to the rational state is markedly different then the messaging or action used to create a positive reaction within the striving state.

The final area in which the model provides guidance is in measurement. Each and every product, whether as a standalone product or within a line of products has certain features that a consumer can develop an affinity towards. This is an important distinction for determining the effectiveness of advertising through measurement. Along with the six steps a consumer ascends through towards purchase, the authors of the model map the six steps to two categories of measurements. They are as follows:

1. Over-all or “global” measurements, concerned with measuring the results – the consumers’ positions and movement on the purchase steps.
2. Segment or component measurements, concerned with measuring the relative effectiveness of various means of moving people up the purchase steps – the consumers’ positions on ancillary flights of steps, and the relative importance of these flights.

The majority of advertising campaigns are geared towards moving individuals from the last step to purchase or from awareness to knowledge, thus success measures are also geared towards assessing the success of achieving those objectives. For example, the majority of brand success metrics are geared toward brand awareness and brand recognition, while the majority of digital tactics like search are geared toward direct response metrics like ROI. However, the authors suggest that campaigns and their success metrics should concern themselves with the following three concepts:
1. Realistic measurements of advertising effectiveness must be related to an understanding of the functions of advertising. It is helpful to think in terms of a model where advertising is likened to a force which, if successful, moves people up a series of steps toward purchase.

2. Measurements of the effectiveness of the advertising should provide measurements of changes at all levels on these steps — not just at the levels of the development of product feature awareness and the stimulation of actual purchase.

3. Changes in attitudes as to specific image components can be evaluated together with changes in over-all images, to determine the extent to which changes in the image components are related to movement on the primary purchase steps. (Lavidge & Steiner, 1961)

If advertising is a force and this force is applied to all consumers and each consumer is positioned on one of the six steps then measurements of success should be calibrated to include sensitivity to specific movements within each step and constructed to observer movements from one step to another. Measurement of success should consider each part individually and each part taken together to represent the whole of an advertising campaign.

**Literature Review**

**Support for the Advertising Hierarchy of Effects Model**

The hierarchy-of-effects model as proposed by Lavidge and Steiner in 1961 was for use in measuring the effectiveness of traditional advertising. However, the model can be adopted for use in other mediums, most notably digital advertising. There are three studies that have been conducted with findings that directly support the advertising hierarchy of effects model for use digital marketing.

The first study conducted by Brunner II, Kumar and Stevenson entitled “Webpage Background and Viewer Attitudes” ⁵ was conducted in April of 2000. This study analyzes the concept of attitudes toward a website and shows how it can play an important role in the advertising hierarchy-of-effects (Brunner Ii, Kumar, & Stevenson, 2000). They found that simpler backgrounds have a positive effect on attitude-towards-the-ad, attitude-toward-the-brand, purchase intention, and attitude-toward-the-website.

---

⁵ (Brunner II, Kumar, & Stevenson, Webpage Background and Viewer Attitudes, 2000), The study explores the effects of website background color on commercial effectiveness. The study also links findings to the advertising hierarchy-of-effects model.
The visual layout of the webpage on which a commercial is displayed positively impacts measures of advertising effectiveness (Brunner II, Kumar, & Stevenson, 2000).

The second study which supports the advertising hierarchy-of-effects model was also conducted in April of 2000 by two of the previously mentioned researchers Brunner II and Kumar. The second study\(^6\) furthers the first and is concerned with web experience, webpage complexity, and interestingness on attitude toward-the website. This study provides further support for the advertising hierarchy-of-effects model (Brunner II & Kumar, 2000). This study’s primary purpose was to further explore the advertising hierarchy-of-effect and its antecedents in the context of the web (Brunner II & Kumar, 2000). The finding of this experiment, which built upon the first study by Brunner II, Kumar and Stevenson suggest that the advertising hierarchy-of-effects seen in traditional media can be used to study the web (Brunner II & Kumar, 2000).

The final study, that supports the hierarchy-of-effects model, was conducted by Stewart Adam and Desmond Minh Hou Poh entitled “An Exploratory Investigation of Attitude toward the Website and the Advertising Hierarchy of Effects”\(^7\). This study “discusses the finding of a study to increase the generalisability, validity and reliability of earlier studies concerning the relationships between attitude toward the ad and aspects of the advertising hierarchy of effects model in the online marketing context (Adam & Minh Hou Poh, 2002). The study goes further to state “the relationship between attitude toward the ad, brand attitude and purchase intention were found to hold in the internet context, thus providing evidence that the model can be extended into research concerning the Web and marketing communication...their findings provide evidence that marketing organizations have a sound means of evaluating the effectiveness of their online advertisements (Adam & Minh Hou Poh, 2002)”. The implication from the three studies is that the advertising hierarchy-of-effects model for measuring advertising effectiveness is a relevant framework for use in studying the web.

Support for the Effectiveness of Digital Tactics

There is considerable research supporting the effectiveness of digital advertising tactics. This is most likely the result of the idea that digital advertising is in direct competition with traditional advertising, effectively cannibalizing consumers who would otherwise succumb to the effect of

---

\(^6\) (Brunner II & Kumar, Web Commercials and Advertising Hierarchy-of-Effects, 2000), A continuation of a previous study by Brunner in which web advertising hierarchy-of-effects is further explored.

\(^7\) (Adam & Minh Hou Poh, 2002), The study supports the relevance of the hierarchy-of-effects model for use on the web., http://ausweb.scu.edu.au/aw02/papers/refereed/poh/paper.html
traditional advertising. In addition to the negative publicity heaped upon digital advertising by traditional advertisers is the fallout from the burst dotcom bubble. The inflation of the dotcom bubble had many factors and first among them were business plans that linked advertising related monetization strategies to fatally flawed business models. The pervasive negative view of digital advertising was all but inevitable. However, despite the negative view, digital advertising has risen again fueled, in part, by business plans built around advertising related monetization strategies linked to sound business models. Google is a shining example of this effect. The success of Google, other search websites and portals lead to an increasing amount of industry research supporting the effectiveness of digital advertising. Digital advertising’s effectiveness is support by research that describes the effectiveness of digital advertising as a standalone medium. The effectiveness caused by the interrelationship (synergies) between various digital advertising tactics, and the effectiveness in comparison to traditional media tactics.

**Digital advertising as a standalone medium**

The most common argument against the effectiveness of digital advertising is that regardless of the size of a digital campaign, consumer purchases, consumer traffic, and consumer interaction with an advertisers brand would have increased. A research study conducted by Young-Bean Song of the Atlas Institute refutes this argument. Song’s study used a cookie based methodology to compare two groups of users, users who saw ads and users who did not see the ads. By utilizing a control group the study neutralizes the “what would have happened anyway argument” (Song, 2001). The study found that the group which was exposed to the ads “generated 10% more sales and traffic than the control group” (Song, 2001). Song’s study is significant in that both groups, those exposed to ads and the control group would have been affected by traditional advertising equally. The study further describes the effect of digital marketing on offline sales. As traditional advertisers increase digital spending the effect of digital spending on offline purchasing is increasing. Song sites research conducted by Procter & Gamble and Information Resources, Inc. that measured the effect of digital advertising on offline sales across several of P&G’s brands. “Offline sales from households that were served online advertisements for impulse food products increase 19% over the control group” (Song, 2001). In addition, of the households who were served digital ads, increasing the frequency of ad resulted in an increase in total sales – 7-10 exposures resulted in a 28% incremental lift (Song, 2001).

---

8 (Song, 2001), This study indicates that there is an incremental lift in online travel sales over a control group signaling online advertising works., http://www.pe.com/mediakit/audience/industry_research/images/proof_1.pdf
In addition to the effectiveness of display advertising as a digital marketing tool, search advertising is at least as effective as display advertising, if not more so. In research conducted by Microsoft and Sony they found that exposure to search ads considerably lifted purchase intent and drove increased likelihood to recommend the brand (Microsoft Advertising, 2008). The study used a control group methodology. The survey respondents were aged 18-64. “Search advertising can help you increase your return on investment by including it in your overall advertising media mix. Furthermore, it increases campaign reach and complements brand messaging” (Microsoft Advertising, 2008).

This research clearly indicates the effectiveness of display advertising as well as the effectiveness of search advertising. While the research indicates the effectiveness of these two digital advertising tactics independently, the effectiveness of combining the two tactics is greater than each alone. The advertising value chain should leverage the synergies between these two tactics to produce the most effective campaigns.

**Interrelationship (synergies) between digital advertising tactics**

Darran Snatchfold in an Admap Magazine article entitled “Search and online display” discusses research supporting the increased effectiveness of both display and search advertising. He cites a Forrester research study that found when consumers were exposed to a finance provider’s display advertisement they were 61% more likely to search on topics related to the display advertisement and were 249% more likely to click on company-sponsored links (Snatchfold, 2006). This is relevant to allocating ad spend across the purchase cycle in that advertisers should consider leveraging the interrelationship between digital advertising tactics, like display and search, when crafting campaigns that target specific consumers on various steps within the hierarchy of effects-model.

Another series of studies that supports leveraging the interrelationship between digital advertising tactics, specifically search and display, to increase effectiveness is reviewed in Nick Drew’s article entitled “The Importance and Implications of Planning Integrated Online Campaigns.”

---

9 (Microsoft Advertising, 2008), This study explores the branding impact of Sony search advertising.,

10 (Snatchfold, 2006), This article details the synergies between search and display advertising.,
http://www.warc.com/LandingPages/Generic/Results.asp?txtWordSearched=&Ref=622&LimitTo=&selNarrowByDate=&selNarrowBySource=&txtSearchWithin=Snatchfold

11 (Drew, The Importance and Implications of Planning Integrated Online Campaigns, 2008), This article supports the notion that digital advertising tactics should be utilized in concert with one another.,
series of studies explored the concept of allocating adspend more strategically by utilizing more than one digital advertising tactic to target users that are on different steps in the purchase cycle to boost campaign effectiveness. The studies analyzed the effect display advertising had on consumers’ online behavior. The research was panel based and within the context of a single advertising campaign compared three groups of consumers; consumers who viewed display advertising, consumers who viewed search advertising, and consumers who viewed both display and search advertising. The research found that viewing display advertising lead to 54% more consumers searching on the advertiser’s key brand terms (Drew, 2008). Another finding of the research is that even though search is one of the most powerful digital tactics for enticing consumers on a higher step within the hierarchy-of-effects-model to make a purchase, adding display advertising to a campaign increases the reach of the campaign to consumers who are on lower steps in the model. “In other words, if a consumer has seen a display advert for a particular brand and later sees a search ad when searching in that product area, the association of the advertising will make him more likely to click through to that brand’s website, and once there, spend more time and be more likely to make a purchase than a consumer who had seen only one form of the advertising” (Drew, 2008).

Similar to Nick Drew's research, a study entitled “Close the Loop: Understanding Search and Display Synergy” by Yahoo! that was conducted by comScore Networks found that campaigns that utilized both display and search tactics were more successful than either tactic individually. Furthermore, the research found that consumers who were exposed to both display and search advertisements increased online purchasing by 244% and offline purchasing by 89% compared to consumers who were not exposed to the advertisements (Mattis, 2006). This study further underscores the synergies between search and display advertising. Another study by Avenue A/Razorfish had similar results as the research by Nick Drew and the study conducted by Yahoo! and comScore Networks. In Avenue A/Razorfish's report entitled “Actionable Analytics,” Razorfish executed a display and search campaign. The study utilized a control group methodology isolating the effect of display advertising. The study found that there was an 80% lift in consumer purchases by combining display with search over search alone (Razorfish, 2006).

http://www.warc.com/LandingPages/Generic/Results.asp?txtWordSearched=&Ref=622&LimitTo=&selNarrowByDate=&selNarrowBySource=&txtSearchWithin=Nick+Drew
12 (Mattis, 2006), A blog entry describing the a study commissioned by Yahoo! conducted by comScore Networks which found evidence supporting the synergies between search and display advertising., http://www.ysmblog.com/blog/2006/12/21/combining-search-and-display-advertising/
This research demonstrates that advertisers should plan digital campaigns across multiple channels and formats in order to increase the effectiveness of each campaign.

**Effectiveness of digital media tactics when compared to traditional media tactics**

DoubleClick’s Touchpoints series of reports is particularly supportive to the debate about the effectiveness of digital advertising when compared to traditional media tactics. The first study in the series details “effective marketing sequences in the interactive age” (Koegel, Touchpoints - Effective marketing Sequences in the Interactive Age, 2003). DoubleClick’s Touchpoints research studies build upon previous studies in the series and were undertaken to determine what tactics most influence consumers’ purchase habits regardless of point of purchase (Row, 2006). The fourth study, similar to the previous three, was a survey administered to a representative sample of internet users inquiring about their purchase behavior across several product categories. The study outlines the steps in a consumer’s purchase cycle, Initial Awareness: “First Learn”, Information Gathering: “Further Learn”, Purchase Decision: “Most Influenced” and asks the consumer a series of questions regarding purchase behavior at each one of the steps. The steps DoubleClick uses within the study are a condensed version of Lavidge and Steiner’s hierarchy-of-effects model: awareness and knowledge are condensed to form First Learn, Liking and Preference are condensed to form Further Learn, and Conviction and Purchase are condensed into Purchase Decision.

The finding from the study provides support for the effectiveness of digital advertising. The findings are as follows:

- Internet users find that corporate websites are very influential in the purchase cycle, 18% of respondents were most influenced by product research conducted on a website, more than word of mouth and brick and mortar stores.
- Web advertisements were as influential as TV, direct mail, print, and higher than radio, outdoor, and telemarketing.
- Streaming advertising in the form of video is being absorbed by consumers at an increasingly higher rate.
- Consumer purchase behavior is similar across most product categories, however, there is considerable variation, with respect to the effectiveness of certain traditional or digital tactics.

---

14 (Koegel, Touchpoints - Effective marketing Sequences in the Interactive Age, 2003), The first in a series of studies which analyzed the various consumer touch points as consumers progressed through the purchase cycle.
when purchase cycles (advertising hierarchy-of-effects-models) are compared across certain product categories

1. Physical Store is most effective at driving towards purchase for:
   i) home products  
   ii) apparel

2. Word of Mouth is most effective at driving towards purchase for:
   i) investments  
   ii) telecommunication

3. Traditional Advertising (television) is most effective at driving towards purchase for:
   i) Movie tickets

- Online advertisements are useful to consumers for research and not for awareness building (Row, 2006)

The DoubleClick Touchpoints studies’ findings described above suggest that digital advertising is effective relative to television and print advertising when compared across product categories. However within certain product verticals, movies for example, the effectiveness of digital advertising pales in comparison to traditional broad reach media tactics like television.

**The combined effectiveness of traditional and digital tactics**

Traditional and digital marketing tactics are effective as independent channels, though, when used together there is a powerful additive effect. The discipline of multiple-media advertising is called integrated marketing communications. Integrated marketing communications has been used primarily in planning traditional campaigns; however, the discipline is expanding to include digital tactics. Advertisers and advertising agencies are increasingly concerning themselves with how to apply integrated marketing communication across multiple-media forms.

**The effectiveness of television and digital advertising**

Bill Havlena describes several research studies conducted by Dynamic Logic which demonstrate the power of integrated marketing communications across multiple-media forms. The studies utilized a survey methodology that measured exposure and branding metrics; brand awareness, favorability and purchase intent. Similar to the DoubleClick studies the branding metrics used in these studies are a condensed version of the hierarchy-of-effects model were the three branding metrics map to related

---

(Havlena, 2005), This article describes research concerning the effectiveness of cross-media campaigns.
behavioral dimensions – cognitive, affective and conative. There are several finding from the analysis of the 27 Dynamic Logic studies. One finding of the study demonstrates that aided brand awareness was 63% higher for consumers that had an opportunity to see television and online advertising when compared to consumers who had an opportunity to see television advertising alone (Havlena, 2005). Another finding is that digital advertising is remarkably effective in communicating sponsorships to consumers (Havlena, 2005). A third finding from the analysis of the studies was that creative executions, whether designed for television or the internet, with a strong call to action are more likely to have a significant impact on behavioral intent than those designed primarily to build awareness (Havlena, 2005). A final finding relevant to allocating adspend across the purchase cycle is that print, because it requires greater consumer effort to process, could have an increased impact on conviction then more passive tactics (Havlena, 2005). The article further supports the notion that it is critical that each member of the advertising value chain have an understanding of the role different tactics, digital and traditional, play in the hierarchy-of-effects model in order to develop campaigns that capitalize on each tactics’ full potential (Havlena, 2005).

David Brennan provides further research supporting the combined effect of television and digital advertising in a study sponsored by Thinkbox and the UK’s Internet Advertising Bureau. In the study Q Media Research used a methodology which combined qualitative and quantitative techniques. The qualitative technique employed a household panel, were each household was required to report online/ television consumption, each member of each household was required to maintain a diary, and each household underwent a 3 hour in-home session. The qualitative portion of data collection was comprised of nationally representative, UK based, online interviews. The research covered several industry verticals. There were several findings from the study. First, combining television and advertising increase positive brand perception by 50% and increase likelihood of purchase by over 50% (Brennan, WARC Online Exclusive TV and online: better together, 2008). Second, television and digital advertising can be used in combination to target specific consumers on different steps within the hierarchy-of-effects model. The combination of the two mediums has a larger reach than either medium independently (Brennan, WARC Online Exclusive TV and online: better together, 2008). Third, the study provides an indication of media usage; 64% of the sampled population indicated they

---

16 (Brennan, WARC Online Exclusive TV and online: better together, 2008), This is an article that details research concerning the synergies between TV and digital advertising, http://www.warc.com/LandingPagesGeneric/Results.asp?txtWordSearched=&Ref=1032&LimitTo=&selNarrowByDate=&selNarrowBySource=&txtSearchWithin=Brennan
sometimes watch television while interacting with the internet, furthermore, 48% stated they participated in this behavior on most days (Brennan, WARC Online Exclusive TV and online: better together, 2008). Finally, the study concerned itself with the heaviest UK internet population, which was 25% of the total internet using population, meaning the results point to the eventually usage patterns of UK consumers (Brennan, WARC Online Exclusive TV and online: better together, 2008). The implications are clear, combining television and digital advertising increases awareness and likelihood to purchase further supporting the hierarchy-of-effects model, increases advertising campaign reach, and indicates these results will only improve as more consumers become more tech-savvy.

The effectiveness of television, print and digital advertising

Dynamic Logic and Millward Brown undertook a study for a large automotive company to understand the effectiveness of a campaign that utilized television, digital and print advertisements\(^\text{17}\). The research uses the hierarchy-of-effects model as the basis for their methodology. The study employed multi-variant testing comparing eight possible combinations: control, television, magazine, digital, television + magazine, television + digital, magazine + digital, and television + magazine + digital (Cardarelli, de Montigny, Eadie, & Havlena, 2007). The study employed an internet based survey tool combined with self-reported panel data as their data collection method. The findings were significant.

1. All three media – television, magazines, and Internet – are effective at increasing consumer awareness, preference, and purchase intent.
2. Media synergy is evident across all levels of the purchase funnel.
3. TV remains a powerful medium for increasing aided brand awareness and magazine and online advertising are associated with incremental increases over television alone.
4. Television and magazine advertising produced greater incremental lift in awareness than digital.
   a. Digital advertising was able to produce awareness
5. Magazine advertising had the largest effect on brand persuasion of the three mix media advertising tactics tested.
6. The findings support earlier research that advanced the notion that magazines are the most effective medium enticing consumers at certain steps in the hierarchy-of-effects model; awareness, liking, preference and purchase. (Cardarelli, de Montigny, Eadie, & Havlena, 2007)

\(^{17}\) (Cardarelli, de Montigny, Eadie, & Havlena, 2007). This study analyzes the effect of advertising campaigns that utilize multiple forms of media., http://www.dynamiclogic.com/na/research/whitepapers/docs/WRRS_2007.pdf
There are several other studies which discuss the apparent synergies which exist between several combinations of traditional and digital advertising. The implication of the Dynamic Logic and Millward Brown research discussed above along with other media mix research suggests that combining digital and traditional tactic increase total campaign effectiveness.

Research Methodology

Purpose

The previously stated purpose of this research is ultimately to suggest a framework for use in communication planning that is measurably successful in moving users up a succession of steps starting prior to awareness through purchase utilizing a combination of traditional and digital advertising tactics. The aim of this approach is to collect insight from the different actors within the advertising value chain in order to better understand their views of the communication channels, their understanding of the trends within the communication channels and ascertain the level of understanding of the synergies between traditional and digital media tactics within communication planning.

Population and Sampling

The sample population was a set of individuals that represented the advertising value chain: advertisers, agencies (digital), media planners, publishers and researchers. Due to the difficulty of recruiting individuals who have high level positions a convenience sample methodology was employed. The participants were recruited by contacting several companies with high advertising expenditures via e-mail across the advertising value chain either by directly sending e-mails to individuals, by e-mail submissions through companies’ customer service departments, or by contacting intermediaries that the author had a previous professional relationship with and asking for a referral (Figure 16). Ten interviews were conducted: Lisa Hillenbrand Director Global Marketing Innovation Procter & Gamble, Lucas Watson Global Team Leader Digital Business Strategy Procter & Gamble, Rishad Tobaccowala CEO Denuo, Jane Balenger Associate Media Director Agency.com, Ron Balenger Vice President Yahoo!, Norman DeGreve Senior Vice President Digitas, Kathryn Koegel Independent Marketing Consultant, Nick Drew Search Research Manager Microsoft, John Quelch Lincoln Filene Professor of Business Administration Harvard Business School, and David Brennan Research & Strategy Director Thinkbox.
Limitations of findings

The convenience sample of this study is not random and as a result is not projectable onto the larger advertising value chain population. The sample population was heavily skewed in favor of digital members of the advertising value chain. A more robust sample of members of the advertising value chain needs to be obtained to validate the findings of this research. Specifically, a statistically significant random sample of each agent of the advertising value chain including researchers is needed. Finally, consumer surveys should be undertaken in order to further understand their media consumption habits.

Survey Design

The interviews were structured using an open ended survey design in the form of a questionnaire (Figure 17-22). The questionnaires were used as primers for the interviews in all but one case. Due to time constraints, David Brennan submitted his responses to the questionnaire via e-mail. The questionnaires were not followed extensively, but rather, were used as a starting point for the discussions. The questionnaires were tailored to the individuals’ role in the advertising value chain. The interview length was approximately 30-60 minutes depending on the amount of time the participant had available and the content of the discussion. The questionnaires were designed to produce insight about each individual’s role within the advertising value chain, uncover learning concerning the convergence of traditional and digital advertising and to uncover general attitudes regarding synergies between various traditional and digital tactics used in marketing.

Research Analysis & Discussion

The interviews produced several insights concerning traditional and digital advertising. The advertising value chain is a very useful framework in understanding the varied responses by the different actors within the chain. The advertising value chain operates like any other value chain in that the actors within the chain have more or less power within the chain depending on the actor’s location within the chain in relation to the consumer and the actor’s relationship with the brand. Each actor’s insight reflects the desire to create more value for the brand and the consumer and the desire to gain more market power within the chain. The insights are as follows:

Giving and receiving advice

Each actor in the chain gives advice to and or receives advice from other actors. The player’s in the advertising value chain need to understand how to connect the dots of consumer behavior of when they are offline versus when they are online (de Greve, 2009). This is achieved by conducting consumer
research. Consumer research becomes the basis for a series of steps in designing a marketing campaign: account planning, ideation, execution, and post engagement learning which includes success metrics (de Greve, 2009). Furthermore, for those actors within the chain who provide advice, (agencies, media planners, publishers, and researchers) each either conducts or sponsors primary research regarding the effectiveness of brand and direct response advertising. David Brennan of Thinkbox states about their research “It is always based on rigorous, professional and often innovative research techniques – we attempt to get ‘beyond the black box’ of TV viewing metrics (Brennan, Thesis Interview, 2009).”

**Communication channel agnostic**

The general sentiment from those surveyed was that digital advertising tactics should be used in conjunction with traditional advertising tactics when and where it is appropriate. Advertisers should consider if the tactic is relevant to the campaign and use the most appropriate tactic available to them. For example, search may not be the most effective tactic for use in targeting consumers on the consideration step of the hierarchy-of-effects model when consumers are considering purchasing a good that is relatively low in level of consideration. In the case of chewing gum, when a consumer is on the consideration step within the advertising hierarchy-of-effects model and is moving toward purchase, in considering which pack of chewing gum to purchase, consumers rarely if ever query a search engine before purchase. Most likely the consumer will choose a package and make a purchase (Belanger, 2009). In low involvement or impulse goods, like chewing gum, brand loyalty may play an important role in product selection. This is not to say that search isn’t extremely effective at moving users up to a different step in the model, but, depending on level of consideration and location within the model other tactics may be more effective.

Several of the respondents also believe that it is difficult for a brand to utilize only one communication channel. Kathryn Koegel suggested that a brand needs to identify the target consumer and understand the consumer’s media consumption habits, and depending on the segment some brands may be able to achieve their goals by utilizing digital alone (Koegel, Thesis Interview, 2009). In addition, Lisa Hillenbrand indicated that brands need to engage in both traditional and digital advertising and that it was hard to utilize 100% digital advertising in the marketing mix when designing campaigns for large brands (Hillenbrand, 2009). Lucas Watson stated a similar point of view, that a brand can exclusively utilize digital advertising depending on size (Watson, 2009).
Media mix

Another finding is that digital advertising tactics are still gaining favor with respect to the total advertising spend. Proctor & Gamble, which has perhaps the world’s most sophisticated marketing team, spends about 5% of its marketing budget on digital marketing (about 11% in the US market) (Watson, 2009). However, Proctor & Gamble does understand the benefits of digital advertising and is planning to increase their digital advertising spend relative to their total marketing spend. When asked to indicate future digital spend, both Lucas Watson and Lisa Hillenbrand indicated Proctor & Gamble does not release future spending information. In addition, Agency.com’s media planners, though their media planning clients are mostly digital entities, have seen the requests by their traditional clients for integrating traditional and digital planning degrease in recent years (Balenger, 2009). However, Agency.com still feels that their clients will have more success in meeting their marketing objectives if their clients integrate digital tactics into their overall marketing mix (Balenger, 2009). Clients can achieve this by shifting traditional advertising spending to digital advertising. Tobaccowala, CEO Denuo, holds a similar view. He has created his agency to align with the belief that digital and analogue tactics should be integrated when it is appropriate for the tactics to be integrated (Tobaccowala, 2009).

Consumer first

Finally, all the participants sampled were focused on the consumer. The overall theme was that if you focus on the consumer then the consumer will dictate which tactic, whether traditional or digital or both, to use to move the consumer up the steps of the hierarchy-of-effects model. Developing this understanding will help advertisers acquire consumers online and acquire consumer’s offline (de Greve, 2009). Nick Drew had similar thoughts in that he advised brands to think about their audience and level of penetration as this leads to different digital and traditional tactics (Drew, Thesis Interview, 2009). The best way to understand how to market to a consumer across various media is to ask them what their media consumption habits are and how and when they would like to receive marketing messages. Professor Quelch indicated that brands should go directly to their customers to understand how they consume media. Furthermore, brands should conduct focus groups with consumers to understand the consumer’s media, purchase and decision making habits. There seems to be quite a bit of behavioral quantitative research concerning consumers but very little qualitative (Quelch, 2009).
Conclusion

Framework

The framework consists of two steps. However, before describing the two part framework it is necessary to emphasize the truism of the importance of focusing on the consumer. Advertiser should conduct qualitative research, perhaps a focus group, to understand the media consumption habits of their consumers. This is a natural extension of brand research. While determining brand association, brand recall and brand preference through research, also seek to determine where the consumer interacts with your brand and where they prefer to interact with your brand. Consumers’ media consumption habits will help refine an advertiser’s marketing mix.

Consumers, for the most part are no longer mono-dimensional regarding their media consumption habits. As consumers travel up the hierarch-of-effects model and change behavioral states they also change mediums. The starting point, ending point and all steps in between for consumers may be traditional or digital. A combination of tactics, both traditional and digital, targeted at specific segment of consumers on particular step is the most effective way to move consumers through the purchase cycle.

Currently, digital advertising is dominated by search. According to David Hallerman of eMarketer in the report entitled “Us Advertising Spending: The New Reality” search advertising accounts for nearly half of digital market’s budgets (Hallerman, 2009). Based on advertising spending it would be natural to assume consumers search online for most products and services and that an effective way to reach them is search advertising. However, if an advertiser, like New Line Cinema, focuses on the consumer it follows that search may not be the most effective form of advertising to generate awareness or purchase for certain consumer product verticals. For example, DoubleClick’s Touchpoints research indicates that for movies, television advertising is the most effective at generating awareness while word of mouth is the most effective at moving consumers from conviction to purchase (Row, 2006). (Figure 6) An advertiser, like New Line Cinema, who focuses on search to make consumers aware of a movie or to entice purchasing movie tickets, may not be spending their advertising dollars as effectively as possible. Though search may not be the most effective at generating awareness or enticing consumers to purchase movie tickets the increasing belief in digital marketing is reflected in digital advertising spending forecasts. According to eMarketer.com’s forecast entitled “US Online
Advertising Spending, 2008-2013” digital advertising spending is set to almost double by 2013 (eMarketer, 2009) (Figure 5).

**Step 1**

The first step in the framework is to utilize the advertising value chain. The advertising value chain is useful to understand the distance between advertisers and consumers. As you proceed across the value chain towards the consumer, each entity has a better understanding of consumers’ media consumption habits. From this understanding each member of the advertising value chain creates greater value for the advertiser. These relationships need to be leveraged by advertisers to increase the effectiveness of advertising campaigns. This means that advertisers should view other members of the advertising value chain as strategic partners that can create more value than the advertiser can alone. However, brands also need to understand that each actor within the value chain is seeking to increase their market power. For agencies, this means becoming the brands agency of record. For media planners, this means potentially becoming an independent media neutral communication planning agency. For Publishers and Publishing Networks, this means providing access to certain hard to find segments or having an enormous reach. The drive to increase market power within the chain creates a situation in which research and advice from the various actors contains an inherent bias based on the lens of the actor conducting the research. The inherent bias in the research and advice provided by certain actors within the value chain has caused the emergence of new actors in the chain, like media neutral communication planning agencies. These new actors are gaining increasing acceptance among brand. Evidence of the level of acceptance is Naked Communications ability to win business from some of the world’s largest advertisers. Further evidence of this phenomenon is Proctor & Gamble’s use of media neutral communications planning by Carat (Watson, 2009).

**Step 2**

The second step is to utilize a process model to identify steps in the purchase cycle. This recommendation is made despite the belief, by some, that process models are not representative of a consumer’s journey towards purchase. David Brennan of Thinkbox does not believe in process models. He believes “the consumer journey is usually much more random, less ‘linear’ and much less rational than awareness –interest –desire – action. It is probably best at the beginning of the consumer journey-generating awareness and interest, which may well then be harvested by other channels such as online. (Brennan, Thesis Interview , 2009). Professor John Quelch also suggests that some believe process models are irrelevant for low involvement products (Quelch, 2009 ). However, the research contained within this paper indicates that Lavidge and Steiner’s hierarchy-of-effects model, originally developed
for traditional mediums, has been proven valid for use within the digital context. It then follows, with perhaps the exception of low involvement goods such as a pet rock, that each consumer is receptive to a particular tactic depending on where the consumer is located within the steps of the advertising hierarchy-of-effects model.

Advertisers should not construct a single process model and apply the process model to each of their product types, but rather, they should develop a process model that aligns with each of their product types. Consumers do use mental models to assist them in their purchase decisions. A consumer’s mental model corresponds to an advertiser’s product types. Figures 6-14 present different scenarios (frameworks) across different product categories that represent how a consumer moves through the advertising hierarchy-of-effects model.

The advertising value chain needs to understand not only the steps in the model to move the consumer to purchase but also the behavioral dimensions related to the steps; cognitive – awareness and knowledge steps, affective – liking and preference steps, conative – conviction and purchase steps. To maximize campaign effectiveness advertisers should leverage digital and traditional methods. The following is a bulleted list is an example of how to apply a process model to the consumer purchase process based on Lavidge and Steiner’s hierarch-of-effects model:

- **Awareness:** In order to generate awareness combine digital and traditional tactics which have the most reach and have the most synergy for your product market vertical. For example, use television, radio, outdoor, search and display advertising supported by relevant messaging on a corporate website/ microsite. Figure 8 demonstrates how digital and traditional tactics can be leveraged to produces awareness and knowledge within the electronics product category. Awareness resides within the behavioral cognitive realm. Campaigns should include traditional tactics that maximize reach such as television and salespersons. Digital tactics search and display should be combined to leverage the synergies between the two tactics. You can also augment your television, search and display advertising with print advertising. Print advertising allows more information to be conveyed to the consumer over other broad reach tactics.

- **Knowledge:** Consumers are seeking knowledge and this is where the digital tactics like search and display can intercept consumers during their quest for knowledge and deliver them to
relevant content contained on a corporate website or third party website. Support awareness advertising with relevant messaging and content on a corporate website/microsite. Television and display drive toward search. Search should drive to corporate/third party websites. Figure 10 demonstrates that the use of video media content within a corporate or third party website is useful in increasing a consumer’s knowledge and moving the consumer towards liking.

- **Liking:** When a consumer is located on this step within the hierarchy-of-effects model the advertising value chain needs to hone the message to appeal to consumers tastes by leveraging public relations in the form of product placements and articles within print magazines. The advertising value chain also should leverage search, display and print advertising. Finally the advertising value chain needs to increase word of mouth to move the user from liking to preference. Figure 12 demonstrates the use of promotions, word of mouth, salespersons, television and print advertising, and public relations to move a consumer up the hierarchy. The goal should be to increase the sense of utility within the target consumer segment by increasing trust or through demonstrating the superior qualities of the product by offering side by side comparisons of the product and competing products.

- **Preference:** Several of the same tactics used to achieve liking should be used for consumers located on the preference step. The key to increasing preference is to further reinforce the positive emotion of liking to create preference. Word of mouth and public relations reviews are effective in achieving consumer preference. Seeding your target consumer segment with sample products, utilizing public relations product reviews, or identifying social messaging taste makers and supplying them with product are effective methods of increasing word of mouth. Figure 14 demonstrates the uses of multiple traditional and digital tactics to move a consumer through preference to conviction.

- **Conviction:** Moving a consumer from preference to conviction requires an accumulation of messages that culminate in increasing the receptivity of a consumer to a very specific message. For example, figure 14 demonstrates, in the consumer package goods category depending on level of consideration, coupons—whether digital or traditional are extremely effective in moving users from conviction to purchase. A morphing campaign is another technique that brands can utilize to capitalize on the cumulative effectives of moving a consumer up through the hierarchy.
The campaign can morph based on the various touch points in the campaign, refining the message as a consumer moves up through the hierarchy.

Certain tactics are better suited to the different consumer behavioral dimensions. Utilizing the hierarchy-of-effects model is fundamental to increasing the effectiveness of advertisers’ campaigns. However, in order to fully leverage the model members of the advertising value chain need to understand the following:

1. Advertisers need to work with their corresponding agencies to map the advertising-of-effects model to the specific product type for which they are designing a campaign. The steps in the model, awareness, knowledge, liking, preference, conviction, and purchase, will have different corresponding tactics depending on several factors.

   i) Understand the vertical in which the products reside. Whether the product is a consumer package good, a fast moving consumer package good, an automobile, electronics etc. plays an important role in the tactics the advertising value chain should recommend and use.

   (1) Figures 6-14 demonstrate that consumers are more receptive to certain tactics whether traditional or digital depending on the product vertical as well as where the consumer is located within the hierarchy-of-effects model.

   ii) Understand the level of consideration (involvement) the consumer places on a specific product. The level of consideration has a profound effect on how rapidly the consumer ascends the steps in the model and on how effective a particular tactic is to persuading the consumer to move to another step in the model.

   (1) The level of involvement across the different market verticals in Figures 6-14 differs considerably. This in turn leads to changes in how a consumer navigates through the advertising hierarchy-of-effects model.

   iii) Each step of the model represents a different set of consumers. Each set of consumers may correspond to a different consumer segment, meaning there are six steps a consumer moves through towards purchase regardless of the segment the consumer is placed in by the advertisers. Each step will require a unique set of tactics to entice the consumer to move to the next step. During campaign planning the advertising value
chain needs to concern itself not only with a consumer’s segment but also with how each segment moves within the model.

**Future Research**

There are several limitations with the scenarios presented in Figures 6-14. First the frameworks are based on existing research findings. Second, the frameworks have not been rigorously tested. Third, there may be more than one path a consumer takes through the hierarchy-of-effects model depending on consumer segment, the consumers’ media consumption habits and the level of consideration required in determining whether to purchase the product. A multivariate test utilizing a control methodology is recommended to determine the effectiveness of the frameworks for the different market verticals. Furthermore, the size of the test may require a firm to modify their product portfolio marketing plans to fit into the context of a longitudinal study. For example, a consumer package good company that wishes to employ the framework outlined in Figure 14 should construct a campaign that tests each tactic. The results of the tests should be used to develop threshold spending models. The effect of this approach is that each step in the hierarchy-of-effects model is a different campaign within the overall marketing program. Within each campaign, each cell, with the exception of the control, would consist of a different traditional and digital tactic based on the recommendation of the research referenced in this paper. The overall effectiveness of the program would be the cumulative effect of each campaign, were success of the program is determined by the ability of the program to move a consumer up the various steps in the hierarchy-of-effects model through purchase. Fourth, future studies should include mobile advertising.

**Mobile Advertising**

Mobile advertising has tremendous potential to radically change the marketing mix due to the rate of mobile phone penetration. According to a study released by SNL Kagan U.S. cell phone subscriptions will increase 3% per year over the next 10 years and 100% mobile phone penetration will take place in 2013 (Keyson, 2007). The study goes further to state that data revenue will increase at 14% per year (Keyson, 2007). This bodes well for mobile marketing within the U.S.. It is potentially even more powerful for markets outside of the U.S. as the US has a lower penetration rate than several other countries. According to The Economist magazine “despite their enthusiasm for PCs and broadband links, Canada and the United States have been slower to adopt mobile phones than other rich countries” (The Economist print edition, 2005). As mobile advertising continues to grow as mobile penetration grows
consumers will begin to develop mental purchasing models that include mobile advertising. These “new” mental model will signal an opportunity to revise old hierarchy-of-effects frameworks to include mobile advertising. The traditional and digital advertising marketing mix will be replaced with a traditional, digital and mobile marketing mix. Figures 6-14 would be updated to include mobile advertising.

While the potential for mobile advertising is great due to mobile phone penetration, the adoption of mobile advertising has been slow to develop. One of the main reasons for slow adoption by the advertising value chain, according to David Katz Head of Mobile Advertising and Publishing, is that the ad buying process is too complicated, as well as, advertisers are having a difficult time figuring out how to unlock demand and demonstrate ROI. The mobile environment is very challenging considering the number of sizes, complexities, buying, tracking, and reporting (Burns, 2008). The role mobile advertising will play in the marketing mix continues to evolve.

**Future traditional and digital advertising convergence**

The future of tradition and digital advertising convergence is uncertain. Harvard Business School Professor John Quelch indicated that convergence is a bit uncomfortable because the overlay of traditional and digital is not as easy as you think (Quelch, 2009). David Brennan provided additional insight as to why future convergence is uncertain. Brennan stated “First of all only 60% of the population is broadband and about 1/3 of those are very light internet users, so there is no way online only can provide mass reach in the short-medium term. Also, we know that brands that are not well known offline rarely gain engagement amongst a mass audience online – in fact, without an offline presence, they tend to be viewed with suspicion (Brennan, Thesis Interview, 2009).” However, despite the uncertainty surrounding future digital and traditional convergence, Lisa Hillenbrand indicated that traditional and digital advertising could converge to create an environment where brands and consumers interact one on one in an environment similar to the era of the corner drug store where consumers seek and receive advice from a trusted advisor.

Though digital advertising is increasing favor and all agree on the importance of digital advertising no one knows for certain the correct spending amount. Forecasts indicate future digital advertising will grow; however, the increase in spending seems to be reactionary rather than proactive. Digital advertising will continue to grow, across all product verticals, as a share of total advertising spend until equilibrium is reach between traditional and digital advertising. While traditional and digital advertising spending moves towards equilibrium emerging communication channels, like mobile, will
also compete for advertising dollars. In the short run, across all product verticals, traditional advertising will still command the majority share of advertising spend, followed by digital advertising with increasing share, and emerging channels, like mobile, garnering single digit growth. In the long run, as technology improves increasing consumers desire to own one device which powers all media consumption channels, traditional and digital advertising spend will become balanced and mobile advertising spend will reach low double digits. (Figure 15)
Bibliography


http://www.warc.com/LandingPages/Generic/Results.asp?txtWordSearched=&Ref=622&LimitTo=&selNarrowByDate=&selNarrowBySource=&txtSearchWithin=Roderick+White

Overall 70% of advertisers cited that their internet ad spend is increasing in 2009

On average, advertisers predict a growth in online advertising of +18% in 2009, +21% in 2010 and +15% in 2011.

Figure 1
Figure 2

Use of search, email, display and video advertising is increasing significantly.
Advertising Value Chain (old model)

Figure 3
Advertising Value Chain (new model)

Figure 4
US Online Advertising Spending, 2008-2013
(% of total advertising spending)

Figure 5
Hierarchy-of-Effects Model

**Conative**
- the realm of motives.
Ads stimulate or direct desires.

**Affective**
- the realm of emotions.
Ads change attitudes and feelings.

**Cognitive**
- the realm of thoughts
Ads provide information and facts

**Purchase**

**Conviction**

**Preference**

**Liking**

**Knowledge**

**Awareness**

Across Market Verticals

**Digital Tactics**
Website: Corporate and Third Party
Direct Response: Display, Search, E-mail, Coupons
Targeting: display, E-mail, Search
Word of Mouth: Social Messaging

**Traditional Tactics**
Salesperson
Word of Mouth
In Store Display
DR Television
Advertisement: Print - Catalogue, Coupon
Direct Mail

**Digital Tactics**
Websites: Corporate and Third Party
Display & Search
Streaming Media
Event: Webinar
Public Relations: Product Review
Word of Mouth: Social Messaging

**Traditional Tactics**
Word of Mouth
Print: Magazine, Public Relations: Product Review
Events
Sponsorship
Newsletters

**Digital Tactics**
Display & Search
Website: Corporate and Third Party
E-mail

**Traditional Tactics**
Advertisement: Television, Radio
Outdoor
Direct mail
Advertisement: Print - Magazine and Newspaper

Figure 6
Hierarchy-of-Effects Model

Conative
- the realm of motives. Ads stimulate or direct desires.

Affective
- the realm of emotions. Ads change attitudes and feelings.

Cognitive
- the realm of thoughts. Ads provide information and facts.

Purchase
Conviction
Preference
Liking
Knowledge
Awareness

Digital Tactics
- Website: Corporate and Third Party
- Direct Response: Display, Search
- Targeted: Display, E-mail, Search

Traditional Tactics
- Salesperson
- Word of Mouth
- In Store Display
- Advertisement: Print - Catalogue, Magazine
- Public Relations: Magazine Review

Digital Tactics
- Website: Corporate and Third Party
- Display & Search
- Public Relations: Product Review
- Word of Mouth: Social Messaging

Traditional Tactics
- Word of Mouth
- Print: Magazine and Newspaper Advertisement
- Public Relations: Product Review
- Salesperson

Digital Tactics
- Website: Corporate and Third Party
- Display & Search

Traditional Tactics
- Salesperson
- Television Advertisement
- Print: Magazine

Figure 7
Figure 8
Hierarchy-of-Effects Model

Conative
- the realm of motives.
  Ads stimulate or direct desires.

Conviction

Affective
- the realm of emotions.
  Ads change attitudes and feelings.

Preference

Liking

Cognitive
- the realm of thoughts
  Ads provide information and facts

Knowledge

Awareness

Movies

Digital Tactics
- Website: Corporate and Third Party
  Public Relations: Review

Traditional Tactics
- Word of Mouth
  Public Relations: Review
  Advertisement: Television

Digital Tactics
- Website: Corporate and Third Party
  Public Relations: Review
  Website: Streaming Media Preview
  Word of Mouth: Social Messaging

Traditional Tactics
- Word of Mouth
  Public Relations: Newspaper Review
  Advertisement: Television

Digital Tactics
- Website: Streaming Media Preview

Traditional Tactics
- Advertisement: Television
  Advertisement: Print - Magazine
  In Theater Preview

Figure 9
Figure 10
Hierarchy-of-Effects Model

**Conative** - the realm of motives. Ads stimulate or direct desires.

**Affective** - the realm of emotions. Ads change attitudes and feelings.

**Cognitive** - the realm of thoughts. Ads provide information and facts.

**Health & Beauty**

**Digital Tactics**
- Website: Corporate and Third Party
- Public Relations: Product Review
- Targeting: Display
- Word of Mouth: Social Messaging

**Traditional Tactics**
- Word of Mouth
- Public Relations: Product Review
- Advertisement: Television

**Figure 11**
Figure 12
Hierarchy-of-Effects Model

Conative
- the realm of motives.
Ads stimulate or direct desires.

Affective
- the realm of emotions.
Ads change attitudes and feelings.

Cognitive
- the realm of thoughts.
Ads provide information and facts.

Purchase
Conviction
Preference
Liking
Knowledge
Awareness

Consumer Package Goods / Food

Digital Tactics
Website: Third Party - Coupons
Direct Response: Display, Search, E-mail
Targeting: Display, E-mail, Search

Traditional Tactics
Word of Mouth
In Store Display, Coupons
Advertising: DR Television, Print - Catalogue, Coupon Direct Mail

Digital Tactics
Website: Third Party - Recipes
Display & Search
Streaming Media: How to Event: Webinare - How to Public Relations: Product Review

Traditional Tactics
Word of Mouth
Advertisement: Print - Magazine, Newspaper
Direct Mail Coupons
Public Relations: Product Review

Digital Tactics
Website: Corporate
Website: Third Party - Recipes
E-mail

Traditional Tactics
Advertisement: Television, Print - Magazine and Newspaper

Figure 13
Consumer Package Goods/Food

Digital
- Third Party Website: Recipes Featuring Product, Coupon
- Third Party Website: Recipes Featuring Product
- Public Relations Third Party Website: Recipes Featuring Product

Traditional
- Print: Coupon, Catalogue, Direct Mail, In Store
- Word of Mouth
- Public Relations: Product Placement
- Public Relations: Product Placement
- Word of Mouth

Public Relations
- A Product Placement

Price

Advertising:
- Television, Print, Word of Mouth

Liking
- 3

Knowledge
- 2

Word of Mouth

Awareness
- 1

Advertisement:
- Television

Figure 14
Future Marketing Mix

Figure 15
Hello XXXXX,

My name is Voloe Scott and I am working on a thesis which analyzes the intersection of traditional and interactive advertising. I’m working with Glen Urban Professor of Marketing at MIT Sloan. The working title of my thesis is Changing Channels: A framework for building awareness and converting users in a media intensive society. An abstract is below:

The emergence of digital brand and direct response advertising as an efficient method for converting users to purchasers has led some to believe the medium should be reserved for harvesting purchasers, thus leaving traditional brand and direct response advertising to brand building activities. The reality is that in order to effectively build and sustain brand equity, firms will require a combination of traditional and digital brand and direct response advertising. The purpose of this thesis will be to establish a framework which can be used to define allocations of traditional and digital brand and direct response advertising spend across the purchase cycle in order to develop and sustain brand equity while maximizing purchasing by consumers.

As part of the research process I’m selecting thought leaders, from agencies like yours, in the XXXXXX field and interviewing them. I’m currently developing a short interview questionnaire. I have begun selecting the principles to be interviewed and would like to add someone from XXXXXXXX to the list.

If someone from XXXXXXXX would like to participate in my study please have them contact me via e-mail at Voloe@MIT.edu. I will forward the interview guide and schedule a meeting for early March. I hope someone from XXXXXXXX is interested in participating in the study as the findings from this research could have a significant impact on how traditional and digital media is viewed and purchased. I look forward to speaking with someone soon.

Best regards,

Voloe Jefferson Scott
Thank you for making the time to speak with me. As I mentioned previously I am conducting thesis research under the direction of Glen Urban Professor of Marketing at MIT Sloan. The goal of my research is to develop a framework that will help to define how to allocate media spend across traditional and digital advertising to generate Awareness, then arouse Interest, enter a consumers Consideration set, and then complete a Purchase. This interview guide is meant to be used as a primer for our conversation.

- What is the composition of your current media spending?
  - Digital
    - Display Advertising
      - Video
      - Different Types of Display Advertising
    - Direct Response Advertising
      - Search
        - Pay Per Click
        - Pay for Placement
    - Other
  - Traditional
    - Television
    - Radio
    - Newspapers
    - Other

- Do you receive advice concerning your traditional advertising spend?
  - If yes, please describe the type of advice you receive
    - Is the advice based on rigorous media studies?
    - Who provides this advice?

- Do you receive advice concerning your digital advertising spend?
  - If yes, please describe the type of advice you receive
    - Is the advice based on rigorous media studies?
    - Who provides this advice

- Is the advice you receive regarding traditional or digital advertising spend segregated by agency type?

- Do you receive advice about integrated media campaigns including the relative weight to place on each tactic (traditional & digital) by media?
  - If so, may I receive a copy of the brief?
  - If not, is this something that would be of value to you?

- What are your feelings about the convergence of digital and traditional media advertising?
  - Do you feel you can reach your target audience by using digital methods alone?
  - Do you feel you can reach your target audience by using traditional methods alone?

- Have you conducted an experiment utilizing both traditional and digital media?
  - If so what was the result of the study(s) and may I have a copy of the final study(s) / report(s)?

- How do you typically use different traditional and or digital media tactics to drive individuals through the purchase cycle?
  - Digital
    - Awareness
    - Interest
    - Consideration
    - Purchase
  - Traditional
    - Awareness
    - Interest
    - Consideration
    - Purchase
  - Do you feel the method of point of purchase (physical store) for CPGs has an impact on the effectiveness of
    - Traditional advertising
    - Digital advertising
Thank you for making the time to speak with me. As I mentioned previously I am conducting thesis research under the direction of Glen Urban Professor of Marketing at MIT Sloan. The goal of my research is to develop a framework that will help to define how to allocate media spend across traditional and digital advertising to generate Awareness, then arouse Interest, enter a consumers Consideration set, and then complete a Purchase. This interview guide is meant to be used as a primer for our conversation.

- What is the composition of your agency by department?
  - Strategy
  - Account
  - Creative
  - Video production
  - Media Planners/ Buyers
  - Etc.

- What do you feel is the role of the traditional agency in today’s media intensive society?

- Are clients aware of the myriad of traditional tactics available to them to include within their media campaigns?

- What is the role of the corporate website?
  - For an e-tailer?
  - For CPG company?
  - For retailer?
  - For a financial services firm?
  - Etc.

- Are clients asking for integrated traditional and digital campaigns?
  - If yes, how is your agency fulfilling these requests?
  - If no, in your opinion why are clients not asking for this integration?

- Do you collaborate with digital advertising agencies?
  - If yes, please describe a project in which your agency collaborated with a digital advertising agency?
  - If not, why not?

- In your opinion could collaborating with digital advertisers provide your clients with
  - Tighter traditional campaigns?
  - Better websites?
  - Reduced costs?
  - A better understanding of their customer?

- Is an interaction between traditional and digital advertising necessary for a client to achieve its objectives?

- Your client is a CPG company whose products point of purchase are physical locations other than the home (no internet sales). Could you please describe the agency process of providing advice to your client concerning traditional marketing and advertising?
  - Would your process change if your client’s goal was to:
    - Increase awareness of an existing product?
    - Increase interest in an existing product?
    - Enter the consideration set of a consumer?
    - Increase sales of an existing product?
  - Would your advice change if your client’s goal was to:
    - Increase awareness of a new product?
    - Increase interest in a new product?
    - Enter the consideration set of consumers?
    - Increase sales of a new product?
  - How would your advice change if your client was:
    - An e-tailer?
    - A CPG company?
    - A retailer?
    - A financial services firm?
    - Etc.

- What else would you like to add or feel is missing from this discussion?
Thank you for making the time to speak with me. As I mentioned previously I am conducting thesis research under the direction of Glen Urban Professor of Marketing at MIT Sloan. The goal of my research is to develop a framework that will help to define how to allocate media spend across traditional and digital advertising to generate Awareness, then arouse Interest, enter a consumers Consideration set, and then complete a Purchase. This interview guide is meant to be used as a primer for our conversation.

- What is the composition of your agency by department?
  - Strategy
  - Account
  - Creative
  - Video production
  - Media Planners/ Buyers
  - Etc.

- What do you feel is the role of the digital agency in today's media intensive society?

- Are clients aware of the myriad of digital tactics available to them to include within their media campaigns?

- What is the role of the corporate website?
  - For an e-tailer?
  - For CPG company?
  - For retailer?
  - For a financial services firm?
  - Etc.

- Are clients asking for integrated traditional and digital campaigns?
  - If yes, how is your agency fulfilling these requests?
  - If no, in your opinion why are clients not asking for this integration?

- Do you collaborate with traditional advertising agencies?
  - If yes, please describe a project in which your agency collaborated with a traditional advertising agency?
  - If not, why not?

- In your opinion could collaborating with traditional advertisers provide your clients with:
  - Tightly integrated digital campaigns?
  - Better websites?
  - Reduced costs?
  - A better understanding of their customer?

- Is an interaction between traditional and digital advertising necessary for a client to achieve its objectives?

- Your client is a CPG company whose products point of purchase are physical locations other than the home (no internet sales). Could you please describe the agency process of providing advice to your client concerning digital marketing and advertising?
  - Would your process change if your client’s goal was to:
    - Increase awareness of a new product?
    - Increase interest in a new product?
    - Enter the consideration set of a consumer?
    - Increase sales of a new product?
  - Would your advice change if your client’s goal was to:
    - Increase awareness of an existing product?
    - Increase interest in an existing product?
    - Enter the consideration set of consumers?
    - Increase sales of an existing product?
  - How would your advice change if your client was:
    - An e-tailer?
    - A CPG company?
    - A retailer?
    - A financial services firm?
    - Etc.

- What else would you like to add or feel is missing from this discussion?
Thesis Interview Guide (Media Planners-Digital)(Figure 20)

Thank you for making the time to speak with me. As I mentioned previously I am conducting thesis research under the direction of Glen Urban Professor of Marketing at MIT Sloan. The goal of my research is to develop a framework that will help to define how to allocate media spend across traditional and digital advertising to generate Awareness, then arouse Interest, enter a consumer’s Consideration set, and then complete a Purchase. This interview guide is meant to be used as a primer for our conversation.

- What do you feel is the role of the Media Planner in today’s media intensive society?
- Please list and describe the different Media types?
- Are clients aware of the myriad of digital tactics available to them that can be included as part of their media plan?
- Which type of media comprises the majority of a company’s media plan?
  - Is search considered a media type?
- Are clients asking for integrated traditional and digital campaigns?
  - If yes, how are media planners fulfilling these requests?
  - If no, in your opinion why are clients not asking for this integration?
- Do you collaborate with traditional advertising agencies?
  - If yes, please describe a project in which your media planners collaborated with a traditional advertising agency?
  - If not, why not?
- In your opinion could collaborating with traditional advertisers provide your clients with:
  - Tighter digital campaigns?
  - Reduced costs?
  - A better understanding of their customer?
  - Other?
- Is an interaction between traditional and digital advertising necessary for a client to achieve its objectives?
- Your client is a CPG company whose products point of purchase are physical locations other than the home (no internet sales). Could you please describe the media planning process of providing advice to your client concerning a digital media plan?
  - Would your process change if your client’s goal was to:
    - Increase awareness of a new product?
    - Increase interest in a new product?
    - Enter the consideration set of a consumer?
    - Increase sales of a new product?
  - Would your plan change if your client’s goal was to:
    - Increase awareness of an existing product?
    - Increase interest in an existing product?
    - Enter the consideration set of consumers?
    - Increase sales of an existing product?
  - How would your plan change if your client was:
    - An e-tailer?
    - A CPG company?
    - A Retailer?
    - A Financial Services firm?
    - Etc.
- What else would you like to add or feel is missing from this discussion?
Thesis Interview Guide (Publishers)(Figure 21)

Thank you for making the time to speak with me. As I mentioned previously I am conducting thesis research under the direction of Glen Urban Professor of Marketing at MIT Sloan. The goal of my research is to develop a framework that will help to define how to allocate media spend across traditional and digital advertising to generate Awareness, then arouse Interest, enter a consumers Consideration set, and then complete a Purchase. This interview guide is meant to be used as a primer for our conversation.

- As an ad network who is your client?
  - Agencies
  - Brands

- How is search marketing best used within an advertising campaign?
  - A lone tactic
  - A complimentary component

- How effective is television marketing at driving
  - Awareness
  - Interest
  - Placing products within a users consideration set
  - Purchases

- Please describe the best use of television within an integrated campaign?
  - If the majority of media tactics are offline
  - If there is a combination of online and offline media tactics

- What should the role of television become within the media mix?

- Do you provide advice concerning the most effective way to reach users within your network?
  - If yes, please describe the type of advice you provide
    - Is the advice based on rigorous media studies?
    - Would it be possible to receive a copy of research and or recommendations

- Do you receive advice concerning the most effective use of your network?
  - If yes, please describe the type of advice you receive
    - Is the advice based on rigorous media studies
    - Who provides this advice

- Are you approached most frequently by
  - Traditional agencies
  - Digital agencies
  - Digital departments within traditional agencies

- Does your network receive advice about integrated media campaigns including the relative weight to place on each tactic?
  - If so, may I receive a copy of the brief?
  - If not, is this something that would be of value to you?

- What are your feelings about the convergence of digital and traditional media advertising?
  - Do you feel brands can reach their target audience by using digital methods alone?
  - Do you feel Brands can reach their target audience by using traditional methods alone?

- Has your network conducted an experiment utilizing both traditional and digital media?
  - If so what was the result of the study(s) and may I have a copy of the final study(s) / report(s)?

- Do you feel the method of point of purchase (physical store) for products has an impact on the effectiveness of
  - Traditional advertising
  - Digital advertising
Thesis Interview Guide (Researchers)(Figure 22)

Thank you for making the time to speak with me. As I mentioned previously I am conducting thesis research under the direction of Glen Urban Professor of Marketing at MIT Sloan. The goal of my research is to develop a framework that will help to define how to allocate media spend across traditional and digital advertising to generate Awareness, then arouse Interest, enter a consumers Consideration set, and then complete a Purchase. This interview guide is meant to be used as a primer for our conversation.

♦ How should a brand allocate their media spend?
  ➢ Digital
    • Display Advertising
      ❧ Video
      ❧ Different Types of Display Advertising
    • Direct Response Advertising
    • Search
      ❧ Pay Per Click
      ❧ Pay for Placement
    • Other
  ➢ Traditional
    • Television
    • Radio
    • Newspapers
    • Other

♦ Should brands receive advice concerning traditional advertising spend?
  ➢ If yes, please describe the type of advice they should receive
    • Should the advice be based on rigorous media studies?
    • Who should provide this advice?

♦ Should brands receive advice concerning digital advertising spend?
  ➢ If yes, please describe the type of advice they should receive
    • Should the advice be based on rigorous media studies?
    • Who should provide this advice?

♦ Should the advice brands receive regarding traditional or digital advertising spend be segregated by agency type?

♦ Do brands receive advice about integrated media campaigns including the relative weight to place on each tactic (traditional & digital) by media?

♦ What are your feelings about the convergence of digital and traditional media advertising?
  ➢ Do you feel brands can reach their target audience by using digital methods alone?
  ➢ Do you feel brands can reach their target audience by using traditional methods alone?

♦ How would you advise using different traditional and/or digital media tactics to drive individuals through the purchase cycle?
  ➢ Digital
    • Awareness
    • Interest
    • Consideration
    • Purchase
  ➢ Traditional
    • Awareness
    • Interest
    • Consideration
    • Purchase

♦ Do you feel the point of purchase (physical store) for CPGs has an impact on the effectiveness of
  • Traditional advertising
  • Digital advertising