About Snails, Franciscans, Homelessness and the City

A contribution to a culture of 'collage thinking'

by

Florian Stocker

Diplom Ingenieur 1995
Architecture and Design
Academy of Arts, Stuttgart, Germany

Submitted to the Department of Architecture in Partial Fulfillment for the Degree of a Master of Science

at the

Massachusetts Institute of Technology

January 1997

© 1997 Massachusetts Institute of Technology
All Rights reserved

Signature of Author.......................................................... Florian Stocker, Department of Architecture, HTC
December 18, 1996

Certified by...........................................................................
Mark Jarzombék
Professor of Architecture, HTC
Thesis Supervisor

Accepted by............................................................................
Stanford Anderson
Professor of Architecture, HTC
Chairman, Department Committee on Graduate Students

MAR 26 1997
Readers:

---------------------------------- Duke Reiter
Professor of Architecture

---------------------------------- Krzysztof Wodiczko
Professor of Visual Arts
About Snails, Franciscans, Homelessness and the City
A contribution to a culture of ‘collage thinking’

by

Florian Stocker

Submitted to the Department of Architecture on January 10, 1997
in Partial Fulfillment for the Degree of a
Master of Science

Abstract

Four fragments constitute the focus of analysis of this study; at the same time they are used as objects in the experimental set up of the thesis. This set up investigates the possibilities of a collage as a model for a research. The Vitruvian notion of the architect as a person standing between a variety of subject fields is connected to Kurt Schwitters collage techniques. The four pieces researched with four different research modes: Art, scientific research, report and design:
1. A collection of images and collages. This collection consists of images of snails, Franciscan architecture, personal memory and allegorical objects.
2. A historic research of the initial state of the Franciscan Movement and St. Francis with respect to their attitude towards buildings.
3. Three case studies of Franciscan Facilities in Boston and Providence.
4. A design proposal for an extension of the homeless day care center St. Francis House, which is located at the Boston Common.

The objective of the thesis is to study how fragments can be connected along their fringes to produce productive results. Parallel to this experiment the focus of the research investigates the development of the Franciscan movement with respect to its contribution to the urban fabric.

From the start, Franciscans encountered the problem of alienation both personally and at a larger scale of the city. In Germany, Franciscan settlements flourished with the urbanization in the 13th century. Acceptance of the city as a place for a Christian life by the friars and the consequent welcome by the burghers for the Minorites made it possible that Franciscan settlements became an integral part of the historic city. The contemporary friaries in Boston and Providence R. I. demonstrate the continuing activities of the Friars in the city. These friaries started several programs which center around the questions of alienation and reconciliation. The design proposal is an extension of St. Francis House which contains a fully automated parking garage, an ambulatorium with benches and pin up boards and several platforms for public appearances. This facility commemorates Franciscan tactics and provide a space in the city for homeless citizens.

This thesis challenges traditional research models that try to produce a totality. The design proposal serves as a correlating part between the other fragments.

Thesis Supervisor: Mark Jarzombek
Title: Professor of Architecture
Acknowledgments

I want to thank with all my heart everybody who helped me to write my thesis especially:

Barbara A. N. Fischer

Prof. Mark Jarzombek
Prof. Duke Reiter
Prof. Krzysztof Wodiczko
Prof. Stanford Anderson

Prof. Karl Heinz Stocker
Johanna Stocker
Franz Fischer
Magarete Fischer

Jeff Leiter
Adnan Morshed
Gary Rohrbacher
James O’Brien
John Lewis

Kevin Mullin O.F.M.
William Beaudin O.F.M.
David Convertino O.F.M.
David Flemming O.F.M.
Index

#0 Introduction

Layout of the thesis 18

#1 Images

#2 The initiation of the Franciscan movement with respects to its policies toward buildings and the urban context

Francis an exceptional phenomenon and his legacy 55
Structures inhabited by the early Franciscans 59
The incorporation of Franciscans in German cities in the 13th century 68
The building style and typology of the Mendicant settlements 77
Franciscan schizophrenia 79
The fall of the Order 80

#3 The Franciscans in Boston: Three case studies of Franciscan architecture

The history of Franciscan activities in Boston 83
The St. Anthony’s Shrine 84
St. Francis House 90
The St. Francis Chapel and City Minister Center in Providence Rhode Island 92

#4 Design of a facility for homeless citizens under the usage of Franciscan urban tactics

Homelessness in New England 95
Social pockets in the urban fabric of Boston 96
The program of the facility 97
The position in the city 99
Applied Franciscan tactics 99
Drawings 101
Model photos 107

#5 Conclusion and cross-references 119

#6 Bibliography 123
For an architect ought not to be and cannot be such a philologian as was Aristarchus, although not illiterate; nor a musician like Aristoxenus, though not absolutely ignorant of music; nor a painter like Apelles, though not unskillful in drawing; nor a sculptor such as was Myron or Polyclitus, though not unacquainted with the plastic art; nor again a physician like Hippocrates, though not ignorant of medicine; nor in the other sciences need he excel in each, though he should not be unskillful in them. For, in the midst of all this great variety of subjects, an individual cannot attain to perfection each, because it is scarcely in his power to take in and comprehend the general theories in them.¹

Vitruvius

I did this, so as to efface the boundaries between the arts....²

Kurt Schwitters

The classical interpretation of this quote from the Vitruvius text is that of an image of the well educated architect who finds a fine tuned balance between a variety of subjects. The hero of overall education. Seen in the light of present day confusion³, our focus in the text shifts more to the stressful and schizophrenic position of an architect within an enlarged field of knowledge.

The body of knowledge was without doubt already immense in the late Roman phase of history but the fields of science and art were more clearly identifiable. It was more

---

³ This confusion is the result of the distrust in the formal language of architecture. It is the result of the historic development from abstraction over post modern quoting methods to the final deconstruction not only of a building but as well of the profession.
feasible for Vitruvius to attempt to interconnect the meaningful quintessences of each subject field. Nonetheless even in his time this connection resembles an octopus which is always lacking one arm to get hold of everything. There is reasonable doubt whether this is really about finding a balance between the subjects or more of an grotesque tensile test in which Vitruvius will be torn into pieces because the centrifugal force in the different subjects.

Through the course of history some of the arts became science and science continuously splitted up into more and more specialized subgroups. We have lost even the possibility of the idealistic aim to embrace the whole knowledge of our time. Additionally in our century, scientists lost their faith in the prevailing mechanistic world picture and developed additional and complemental theories such as the quantum theory. The situation is far from being easy to survey. Even the most abstract technique of mankind, the language of mathematics, is not safe from doubts. In a recent article in ‘Scientific American’, mathematics’ ability to function as a representation of reality is questioned.

So to draw any conclusions about the inability of science to deal with these questions, we must either justify the mathematical model as a faithful representation of the physical situation or abandon mathematics altogether.\(^4\)

Because of the continuos fragmentation and multiplication of subject-fields or knowledge the meaningful hearts of the subjects lost importance. It shifted to the wildly growing borders and edges between the specialized subjects. The art of merging the pieces together became essential. This thesis endeavors to be part of the project of developing an aesthetic strategy to merge scattered fragments together.

Collage and assemblage are popular devices to integrate disintegrated parts. This tactic has accompanied humankind throughout history. To arrange fragments and found objects into a new object or a new artifact is a tactic which has always been exploited to gain an enlarged picture.

Besides their functional reality, some mundane objects have always held the potential of an 'inner' more magical reality that is connected with man's wonder about the nature of existence and his own destiny.  

Meanwhile many examples could be shown of how collage techniques were used in different time periods to form an artistic expression or to collect items in order to form a memory. In the work of Kurt Schwitters many aspects of collage reached their culmination point. Kurt Schwitters, as a member of the Dadaistic movement, used collage to propagandize against a prevailing bourgeois society. Hence Eddie Wolfram writes about the Dada movement:

Like Futurism it is best understood not simply as a stylistic and visually aesthetic manifestation but as an all-embracing cultural and social revolt against nineteenth century attitudes.  

But this political action was only one side of Schwitters 'Merz' project. On a higher level Schwitters researched methods how he could merge different parts into one art piece. Different parts from all art forms including parts of his personal environment and such as newspaper publications were extracted and reassembled in a juxtaposed manner.

The effect of each of Schwitters' mature collages is not of a (stylistically predetermined) whole made up of pieces, but of pieces making a whole.

---

6 Ibid., p. 67.
His ultimate goal was the “total work of art”. This he attempted in the ‘Merzbau’, a three-dimensional collage, and the ‘Merzbühne’ in which he used performance and stage-sets to incorporate his fragments. Therefore, one can argue that the greater emphasis was to create a unifying maelstrom, that would unify what was separated. In this scenario, political action is only needed to loosen the components which are frozen in the established society.

The potential of forcing these parts together and keeping them together by a kind of magnetic glue was of great interest during postmodern discussion. In this discussion, a reconnection to the historic structures had to be established to free oneself from the dogmas of the modern movement. The phenomena of connection therefore reoccurred. One example is the book ‘Collage City’ by Colin Rowe and Fred Koetter.

It is suggested that a collage approach, an approach in which objects are conscripted or seduced from out of their context, is—at the present day—the only way of dealing with the ultimate problems of, either or both, utopia and tradition;8

Colin Rowe utilizes several theorists to make Schwitters maelstrom even larger. For instance, Karl Popper discusses science in relation to the understanding that there is no unitary evolution of knowledge.

(1) There is no method of discovering a scientific theory.
(2) There is no method of ascertaining the truth of a scientific hypothesis, i.e., no method of verification.

8 Rowe and Fred Koetter: Collage City. Cambridge, p. 144.
(3) There is no method of ascertaining whether a hypothesis is ‘probable’, or probably true.9

Another theorist, Isiah Berlin argues not to believe in a ‘total architecture’.

...there exists a great chasm between, on one side, who relate everything to a single central vision, one system less or more coherent or articulate, in terms of which they understand, think and feel-a single universal, organizing principle in terms of which all that they are and say has significance-and, on the other side, those who pursue many ends, often unrelated and contradictory, connected, if at all, only in some de facto way, for some psychological or physiological cause, related by no moral or aesthetic principle; these last lead lives, perform acts, and entertain ideas that are centrifugal rather than centripetal, their thought is scattered or diffused, moving on many levels, seizing upon the essence of a vast variety of experiences and objects, for what they are in themselves, without consciously or unconsciously seeking to fit them into or exclude them from any one unchanging... at times fanatical, unitary inner vision.10

Assuming that it is possible to act without any moral or aesthetic principle Berlin’s bold statement is a manifest for a collage thinking. Rowe refers to this idea from Levi-Strauss’s “The Savage Mind”11 as when the thinker becomes the savage mind of the bricoleur12. Rowe manages to get around the difficulty of applying these concepts to the design of an artifact by investigating the realm of the city. Within this scale he did fall into the pitfall that most postmodern architects fall. They applied these collage methods literally in their buildings and incorporated historic quotations into their houses. This strategy became quickly a one-liner and was moreover easily incorporated

by mediocre ‘commercial’ architecture firms as a cheap device to tune up bad architecture. What happened to the mighty maelstrom? Did it turn out to be a weak superficial idea?

We might be able to observe the emerging problem in Rowes incorporation of Hadrian’s Villa. He mentions the Villa as the *miniature Rome*\(^{13}\). The Villa has an ambivalent position in its appearance between mini-city and a huge building, that Rowe describes as an example of ‘anti-totality’.

...we have the curiosity of Hadrian who is, apparently, so disorganized and casual, who proposes the reverse of any ‘totality’, who seems to need only an accumulation of disparate ideal fragments...\(^{14}\)

Nonetheless we see the Villa Hadriana as a self-contained entity. We have books and research projects about the ‘Villa Hadriana’, which manifest the phenomenon of the ‘Villa Hadriana’ which is built by several architects during a specific stretch of time. The ‘collision mini-city’, to write along Rowe’s lines, which is in fact a ‘collision-building’, is a unique appearance, similar to postmodern buildings, which collage historical architectural quotations. The potent and urgently needed idea of a ‘collage thinking strategy’ is in danger to be abolished and thrown away because it has become figurative.

This thesis is an attempt to contribute to a culture of collage thinking without being trapped by making a literal translation to building. Trying to find a truly Vitruvian thinking the thesis must find an approach which takes into account the current level of specialization. The objectives are to reconnect architectural theory to the real life in

---

\(^{12}\) Colin Rowe, p. 105.
\(^{13}\) Ibid., p. 94.
which scientific developments are currently the most revolutionizing ideas. Exposing the architect again to this tensile test with an exponential widening of subjects and knowledges moves the focus from the cores of these fragments to their periphery, their fringes. By their very nature these fringes grow more quickly than the number of subject cores. The sheer number of possible connections between each of the fragments is so immense that an analytical or numerical approach is impossible. The strategy must be one which utilizes images since our potential to consume information through images is much higher, than through linear data like language or writing. The questions of many fragments we need to create a meaningful whole or what number of fragments we can manage to handle, becomes crucial. These questions revolve around the task of merging the part in an intelligent way along their edges into one arbitrary model. This should happen with the awareness of the own disability to create a melting pot. The juxtaposition and therefore their readability is important. To avoid the pitfall of postmodern quotings it is important for the planning of an artifact and not for its physical appearance since every artifact is an entity in itself. Therefore it contains a certain completeness in its appearance. An additional tactic to ship around the danger of a totality could be encountered with the notion that all things we build are ruins. This enhances an incompleteness which breaks the notion of a totality. Ruins as a device which holds the desire for completeness and perfection.

Das Ruinieren wäre also ein Verfahren, die für jede Erkenntnis notwendige Differenz von Erscheinung und Wesen, von Gegenwart und Vergangenheit, von Wunsch und Wirkung, von Plan und Realisierung, von Entwurf und Verwirklichung herzustellen. Durch Ruinieren erzwingen wir die Differenzen im

14Ibid., p. 90.
This awareness of building ruins does not mean to build a literal ruin but to build an artifact that aims for total completeness, but faces the unavoidable initial ruinous state. How do I want to engage with this very ambitious enterprise within the format of a thesis? The strategy is to pursue four parallel mini projects that are deliberately kept in a fragmentary state. Four fragments constitute the focus of analysis of this study; at the same time they are used as objects in the experimental set up of the thesis. Four different research methods are chosen: Art, scientific research, report, and design. During the process, I might be able to look over my shoulder and observe crucial situations and methods for the development of a larger awareness of the process. What are the four parallel mini projects? They can be explained along the title of the thesis: About Snails, Franciscans, Homelessness, and the City.

Snails (art):
This part is a collection of images which are collaged and translated into readable or observable units. The sources of the fragments are historical and contemporary. Crucial personal incidents are incorporated as well as constructed images that investigate closely the researched problems.

Franciscans (scientific research):
In this historic research the impact of St. Francis on the medieval society is reflected by the initial attitude of the Franciscans towards buildings and city context. This will reveal

---

15 Bazon Brock: *Die Ruine als Modell der Differenz*. In: Lucien Dällenbach und Christian L. Hart Nibbrig (Hrsg.): *Fragment und Totalität*, Frankfurt 1984: The ruining could be a process to produce the for every knowledge necessary difference between appearance and essence, between presence and past, between wish and impact, between plan and realization between design and realization. By ruining we enforce the differences in the things given to us. The ruin is the representation of the enforced difference.
the tension which the Franciscans experienced from the very start of their amazing
expansion all over Europe.

The City (report):

This is an investigation of how Franciscan institutions relate to the current context of
the city, and how Franciscans weave into the urban fabric. Three institutions will be
covered: the St. Francis day care shelter for the homeless in Boston, the friary St.
Anthony’s Shrine in Downtown Boston and the friary in Providence.

Homelessness (design):

In this sketchy Design proposal an addition to the St. Francis house will be proposed.
The design contains certain facilities for citizens without a permanent address such as
lockers, mailboxes, and access to public networks as telephone and the internet.
Additionally the construction would serve as an exchange market for information about
the city of Boston. The whole project is funded by a parking garage comparable to a
‘Waqf foundation’16. Finally the artifact serves as a point of reference to the public
realm of the Boston Common.

These four elements represent a wide range of approaches and have their focus on the
Franciscans movement. After these four projects we can draw cross connection through
the whole and find possible conclusions about the researched topics and the layout
model of the thesis. The objective is to connect the fringes of the elements. In a way we
rub the cat in the wrong way which is the general scope of this thesis. The following
diagram should explain the set up of the research model as well.

---
16 A ‘Waqf’ is a social endowment in the Islamic world which consists of a fundraising facility and a
charitable institution.
About Franciscans Snails the City & Homelessness

The life of St. Francis and in its singular appearance

The initial problems and the set up of the Franciscan dilemma

Buildings inhabited by the early Franciscans

The Franciscans as a movement without a roof

new questions arising around built environment

the turnover after the death of Francis

Franciscan tactics in the medivial city

The fall of the movement

XXX

the Franciscan revival

The history of Franciscan activities in Boston

impressions from the environment of the site

extracts from historic development

observations

design project

images go into storage and will pop up as fragments in future projects

Tactics and the actual situation of Franciscans with respect to the initial scope of the movement

spotting of social pockets of homeless citizens in the city of Boston

Research for needed facilities

research of already done facilities or concepts for projects for the homeless persons

incorporation of 'Franciscan City Tactics'

writing of the program for the artefact

Developing of models and design solutions

proposal of a tactic for homeless facilities in Boston

St. Anthony Shrine and its position in the urban infrastructure & St. Francis House and the history of its location & the found shell of the friary in Providence
I  The fringe of the fragment
II  Schwitters Collage MZ239 Frau-Uhr, 1921.
III  The ideal plan of St. Gall is sucked into an ambivalent shell
IV  The ambivalence of the relation between shell and soft organs threatens
     the concept of rooted homeliness
V   Moment of departure - beauty of the jump - dissolving in the shells
VI  Reinhabited objects of various flavors
VII St. Francis in the tension between the ideal city and the Boston Common
     park
VIII Rivotorto: the simple shed glorified and destroyed
IX  The concept of the epiphytic parasitic lily
XI  Franciscan settlements along city infrastructure
XII St. Anthony Shrine: the meditation in the heart of the city
XIII Homelessness and back streets
XIV Images of published projects stored in the brain appear
XV  A personal performance of religious trust in God
XVI The floor plan of the monastery as a frozen choreography of a life cycle
XVII Portiuncola in the gilded cage
XVIII The squatting campaign of the friars in providence
Gastropod

Cerebral g.

Pedal

Visceral
see how the lilies of the field grow
Francis of Assisi - an exceptional phenomenon and his legacy

Right from the start the legacy of St. Francis was a highly political one. Three years after his death, the first biography was published. This text was written as a commission of the pope written by Thomas of Celano. The fact that St. Francis became later a heretic, according to the policies of his own movement is crucial in the judgment of all the historic researches written by Franciscan scholars up to the present day. Since the middle of 13th century, the Minorites have been known as an 'ordo studens'.

Yet by the middle of the thirteenth century - that is to say, within twenty-five years of the death of the founder - the Order of Friars Minor had become one of the most learned institutions in the world.

Therefore most of the history of the movement was written by the friars themselves and cannot at all be regarded as an impartial view. Nonetheless Francis' appearance in history is unanimously seen as a unique one. From 1208, on Francis was a challenge to the code of the society in which he lived. His contemporaries were lacking the words to express what was actually happening. They used the expression "relinquere saeculum". This expression 'leaving the world' is not only used because they retreated to a life in the promised heavenly Jerusalem, starting on earth, but also because the early

companions simply failed to fit into any category of the time. Therefore they left the realm of the society - "relinquere saeculum". Their intention was to live like Christ with his apostles, consequently they rejected all worldly possession and having a home. Francis must have had an unique ability to disintegrate and loosen the codex of the early 13th century society because of his impact on all social classes, which were represented in his twelve companions. The incorporation of Francis into the policy of any institution was not possible and is therefore a striking similarity to the position of Jesus Christ in the context of history writing. Since this special 'unforgettable' character of Francis is of great importance for the development of the movement in its constant bad conscience after a partly betrayal of the legacy of Francis, we must try to capture the essentials of that phenomenon. The most important ideals are, Joyfulness, radical peacefulness, a simplicity close to naiveté, the rejection of worldly possession, a plain appearance and an absolute faith in God. Since these concepts are similar to that of some other alternative and later heretic movements around that time, Adolf Holl’s biography explicitly lists the similarities with heretic movements:

1. Orientation toward the primitive Church.
2. Appeal to direct divine inspiration.
4. Rejection of all leadership roles.

Most of these character traits render the image of an anti-hero: "an insignificant, homely-looking man" "I am a hen, small in built and black from birth." Indeed a

---

21 Celano, I, 83 (grau, p. 242)
great number of the stories in the collection of anecdotes, “Fioretti”, have whimsical character paired with an immense stubbornness. Holl summarizes Francis' ambiguous and exemplary relation to his cloak, one of the few allowed possessing. The point of time is some months before Francis' death:

Giving away the relatively valuable cloak was only one of the peculiarities that the honored patient (Francis) took pleasure in - not always to the delight of the staff around him. Francis' seems to have been especially gifted at mending, despite his bad eyes. He managed to write this mania into the papal rule, where he recommends that the friars repair their clothing with burlap. Every attempt to force a cloak on Francis became a major production. First his companions had to be careful to choose the right words. The most successful formula seems to have that Francis really ought - on account of the extreme cold, for example - to let somebody lend him a cloak for the time being. Thereupon Francis would ask if he could give it away if he felt that someone needed it more than he did. Only when they told him "yes" would he finally take the cloak.

After founding one of the most successful movements in the Catholic church, which had grown within ten years from 12 to 5000 friars, he died isolated from his movement, blind and severely ill at the age of 44 in 1226. Two years before his death he received the stigmata. This thesis cannot provide another revised biography of St. Francis, which already exist in the dozen, but will merely single out the important moments when the relation to the built environment is concerned. This relation was a difficult one. In his testimony Francis especially addressed the following question:

---

22 Ibid. (grau, p. 248)
...Let the brothers take care that churches, humble lodgings, and all other things that will be built for them become their property....and the brothers are not to say: 'This is another rule': because this is a record (recordo), admonition, and exhortation, and my testament, that I, Brother Francis, small as I am, make for you, my blessed brothers...and the minister general and all the other ministers and custodians shall be bound by obedience not to add or subtract from these words. And they shall always have this document with them, next to the Rule. And in the chapter meetings they hold, when they read the Rule they shall read this too. And I absolutely order all my brothers, clerics, and laymen, on obedience, that they shall not put glosses on the Rule or these words, saying: 'They want to be understood in this way': but, just as the Lord granted me to speak and write simply and purely both the Rule and these words, so simply and purely they shall be understood and put into practice.25

The style and force of his last message speaks volumes. In 1230, the same year in which Francis' body was transferred into the newly built Basilica of San Francesco Pope Ugolino, decreed that Francis' Testament had no binding power over the brothers of the order, because Francis had drafted it without the consent of the order's ministers.26 The body of Francis was secretly transported into the basilica and put to rest at a hidden place. Francis' grave was so well hidden that it took till 1818 to find it.27 In a papal bull of the year 1323 by Pope John XXII condemned as heretical the idea that Christ and the Apostles had possessed no property either individually or communally, but had only the use of it.28 The order of the Franciscans had indeed accumulated so many worldly possessions that the Pope was tired of sophisticated differences of the usus iuris and the usus facti and asserted that poverty, as the Friars

Minor understood it, was an absurdity, and declared that the Holy See no longer accepted ownership of the Order's property.\textsuperscript{29} The Testament of Francis lost its power to shape the daily life of the friars but it was always present as a thorn in the side in the development of the Franciscan movement. It was exactly this tension which made the Franciscans special throughout their history of frequent schisms and reformations. Every friar today is at least alarmed when it comes to the question of 'poverello'. This at least has been the impact of the exceptional historic figure of Francis.

Structures inhabited by the early Franciscans

The early friars were not allowed to possess anything but a cloak (\textit{tunicis laneis caputatis})\textsuperscript{30} a rope and underwear. These were their only shell to protect them from the surrounding world. Consequently they had to lead a vagabond life. It was explicitly forbidden for them to possess any kind of house or shelter. Two things are interesting to investigate:

1. What is the underlying structure for such an organization?
2. What was the friars attitude towards built structures?

The friars led a life as wandering preachers. The monastery of the friars was the great world\textsuperscript{31}. They were wandering around in groups of at least two: \textit{Per universum}

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{enumerate}
\item ibid., p. 219.
\item Fr. Lazaro Iriarte O.F.M. Cap: \textit{Franciscan History}. Chicago, 1982, p. 61.
\item ibid., p. 60.
\item Testimonia minora saeculi XII de s. Franciscano Assisiensi, Quarachi 1926, 92
\item Kajetan Esser O.F.M. 1966, p.55.
\end{enumerate}
\end{footnotesize}
mundum bini et bini dividuntur\(^{32}\). So where did they sleep? According to Kajetan Esser they slept in the houses of generous people, of clericals, of members of other orders and in leprosoria. It is written in the *regula non bullata* that the friars should *pay attention, wherever they might be, may it be in hermitages or elsewhere, to claim a place as their property, or to dispute someone’s right to this place*\(^{33}\).

The fact that the friars stayed as well in shelters for lepers illuminates the radicalism of their deviation from the social norm of the city. Between the townsmen and the lepers, a line of death was drawn. Townspeople who showed a sign of the disease were expelled from human society with a ritual in which soil from the graveyard was spread over their heads\(^{34}\). At the same time the lepers were connected to the city because they were the drop out which could not be dealt with. This will be of importance when we will discuss in what ways the friars were specifically tied to the city.

What was the structure of the movement? Francis was *minister et servus*\(^{35}\). There was a written rule for the movement. Everyone in the movement followed the suggestions of Francis. Every friar wore the same clothing which were protected by the pope as a ‘Franciscan trademark’. The hourly prayer was done by everyone. Every year all friars came together for a meeting, no matter how far they had to travel. These meetings often took place at the Portiuncola on Pentecost, one of the chapels which Francis had renovated in the years before he turned away from his father and the established society of the city.

---


\(^{33}\) Kajetan Esser O.F.M. 1966, p.56.


\(^{35}\) Kajetan Esser O.F.M. 1966, p.138
We have a report on one of the meetings which seemed to have been governed by an unusual spirit of serenity. Domenikus was a witness of one of the gatherings. Several thousand friars participated.

Domenikus wunderte sich, dass es den vielen Brüdern an nichts fehlte, obschon sie in keiner Weise für den kommenden Tag besorgt waren. Der Herr selbst habe ihnen durch die Gebefreudigkeit der Gläubigen alles Notwendige zukommen lassen. Daraufhin habe Domenikus seinen Brüdern sehr die Besitzlosigkeit empfohlen.36

The friars came to the gatherings normally in groups of two. The gathering itself was the only time when the movement became visible to the outside. During the chapter, the friars reported about what had happened in the last year and exchanged information. Francis’ inspiration for the yearly meeting was King Arthur’s roundtable at which the companions met each other regularly. After this event of massing together, all the friars had to disperse to the four winds in groups of two. In 1221 the second group of friars was sent to Germany after the first one had not been successful because the only German word they could say was ‘ja’. Consequently they had answered all questions they were asked with ‘ja’. This became their doom because they had answered as well the question of whether they were heretics with ‘ja’. The second attempt to expand to Germany was far more successful37. The chapters gave a perfect picture of the transient nature of the movement:

36Ibid., p. 83. Domenikus was wondering that the brothers were not lacking anything in spite of the fact that none was worried about the next day. The Lord himself had cared for them through the willingness to give of the believers. After that Domenikus recommended poverty for his brothers.
This new lifestyle, consciously antihierachical, egalitarian, and decentralized, of theological untrained laymen with neither Holy Order nor clerical privileges, is very much reminiscent of the practices of the Cathars and Waldensians, those reforms movements that the Pope's of Francis' time persecuted with such total savagery.\textsuperscript{38}

So one of the main differences to heretic movements was that St. Francis had received recognition by the Pope, which he had tried to get in the very early stage when he had only twelve companions. This early interest in the agreement of the church shows that Francis was not only an antihierachical individual but knew very well about the necessities for a hierarchical order:

Offensichtlich erstrebte er eine Lebensform, die für ganze Kirche Bedeutung haben sollte...Hier wird also zweifelsohne ein starkes Sendungsbewuβtsein in die Kirche hinein spürbar.\textsuperscript{39}

The hourly prayer was as well an important tie for the Fraternitas. Francis put strong emphasis on it when he dictated his testimony from his deathbed. This commonly performed prayer of all friars created solidarity no matter how far away from each other the friars were located.

After looking at these ephemeral concepts of the movement which allowed them to live without a to the outside visible but at the inside sheltering structure, we have now to observe the behavior of the Franciscans towards actual buildings. As already mentioned Francis, renovated several small churches during his years of conversion.\textsuperscript{40}

\textsuperscript{38}Ibid., p. 125.
\textsuperscript{39}Kajetan Esser O.F.M. 1966, p. 27: Obviously he longed for a lifestyle which should be important for the whole church...Without doubt we feel strongly that he was a man with a mission for the church.

\textsuperscript{40}Adolf Holl, 1979, p. 81.
This shows a caring devotion for buildings, or more particularly, for churches. Coming from the city, Francis was a son of the culture of the city. He became a drop out from the city and therefore he was especially sensitive to the lower class of the townsmen. He never rejected the city as evil. On the contrary, it had been always his stage for his spiritual performance after his turning away from his father. His first retreat was the church St. Damian, which was close to the city. He seeked its proximity. After he broke with his father, he could have retreated into the solitude of nature, which was a common practice for a spiritual retreat. Instead he used the city as a stage for his new life as “God’s fool”. After several other sons of the city had joined him, the companions stayed for a time in a small stable in Rivo Torto not far away from Assisi. Why did they choose to stay there? We can only speculate. One fact is that nearby was a place for the lepers, who the friars cared for. Again they cared for the city by caring for its lowest end, the expelled. Another aspect was the poverty of the place. But the stable in Rivo Torto was as well chosen as a retreat for meditation. The place was so small that Francis assigned places to sleep for each person by writing their names on the wooden beams. The way this attempt of a pastoral retreat ended, is significant:


Francis took the event as a sign that they must move, and abandoned the place, poor and wretched and cramped though it was, that was about to become a home for

---

42 Kajetan Esser O.F.M. 1966, p.39: Nevertheless the silence is disturbed. Not from someone of the circle of the brothers, but from outside by a farmer who is driving his donkey with big noise into the barn.
the friars. A meditative retreat away from the city is not permitted to the brothers. The task is to endure the conflict of the friars with the world.\textsuperscript{44} This attitude becomes more clear in the Rule of St. Claire who acted as an advisor for Francis in his doubts about his desire to retreat to a meditative life.

The sisters are not to acquire houses, lands, nor anything else, for their use, but they are to serve God as strangers and pilgrims on this earth, in humility and poverty, confidently having recourse on alms.\textsuperscript{45}

According to Anton Rotzetter the advise of St. Claire is that Francis has to give up a “life like an angel” and has to live as a human being amongst human beings, he has to relive the incarnation of God and “make the feet of his soul dusty”. He must live for one who died for all. The world and men are no obstacle but the precondition for the true meditation. Therefore Francis enforces his moving around in the world and to preach. But he always comes from the meditation of the crucified Christ and goes back to it.\textsuperscript{46} The friars went back to live at the Portiuncola for a while before they started to continuously split up and did their true work among the people, on the roads, in the cities and villages, in the fields and vineyards\textsuperscript{47}. How did they live at the Portiuncola for that short period of time in a kind of “Franciscan settlement”? 

\textsuperscript{44} Anton Rorzetter, 1981, p.109. 
\textsuperscript{45} Omer Englebert: St. Francis of Assisi. Chicago, 1965, p.143. 
\textsuperscript{46} Anton Rorzetter, 1981, p. 42. 
\textsuperscript{47} John R. H. Moorman, 1963, p.66.
Around the church a circle of huts was built out of mud and branches; and, in so far as the friars came to have any place which they would regard as "home", this was it.48

The features of the place are proximity to the city, closeness to a little church, which Francis had repaired, and simple shelters. These shelters were completely built from transitory material. The proximity to the city was chosen since most of the friars were sons of the city and the city therefore was their natural stage for their lifes, in whatever form they led them. The little church was a special case since the founding of the movement is so tightly connected to it. The friars had rented the little chapel for a basket of fish from a nearby Benedictinian monastery. The chapel was a witness to a lot of milestones in the development of the movement. First Francis repaired it, than during the early mass, celebrated by a Benedictine after the repairs were done, Francis received through a verse in the Gospel the layout for his way of life49. Some of the most important of the previously mentioned annual gatherings took place there, the friars built some huts around it to live there and finally Francis will die in the chapel. This shows his intimate connection to this little building.

Francis dearly loved it and everything about it - its name, its simplicity, its position in the woods, its associations with the days of his conversion and the early adventures of the friars.50

The little chapel in its poor environment suffered a major transformation in the further development of the order. This was due to the fact that St. Francis managed to receive

48 Ibid., 1963, p.66.
a plenary indulgence from Pope Honorius\textsuperscript{51}, for everyone who takes part in one of the annual services on the day of consecration the chapel. The plenary indulgence was in these days only granted to the crusaders. Therefore this new plenary indulgence subverted the need for knights of gaining the indulgence by participating in crusades.

In later times a pompous cathedral was erected over the Portiuncola chapel. In the midst of the giant baroque nave stand the primitive ruins of the little church, looking like a foreign body and a glaring anachronism. Francis would barely recognize the “little plot” if he returned to visit Assisi today. His followers’ passion for architecture would greatly astonish – and distress – him. For his part Francis never erected a new building anywhere.\textsuperscript{52}

Francis only built completely transient structures. Even newly built churches should be of humble appearance. The Franciscans are not allowed to built cathedrals. But by renovating churches Francis, showed his dependence on “stone-buildings”. The movement seems to be in a symbiotic relation to its built environment. Like an epiphyte, or to be more specific, an orchid uses a tree to be positioned to the source of light, they use existing structures to intensify their performance. The following instructions of Francis about how friars should settle in a city, date from the his last years:

Let us suppose that the brothers come to a city where they have no shelter. When they find someone who puts some land at their disposal, then they must first ask how large a site it will take, lest they offend against holy poverty. They should constantly recall that they are obliged to set a good example, so that they never live otherwise than as strangers and pilgrims among men, without any right to property...Then the brothers are to go to the bishop of the town and ask his permission to built a shelter...Once they have the bishop’s

\textsuperscript{51} Adolf Holl, 1980, p. 146.
blessing, they should first of all plant a hedge around the plot. Instead of a wall. Then they can set up simple huts out of wood and clay, then workshops, and a little church. The brothers are never to build large churches, of the kind they have for preaching. It is better that the brothers go to other churches to preach, so that they always observe holy poverty. Besides, the unpretentiousness of the shelters will be a continual and powerful sermon for the prelates and clerics of the town... I know that the brothers already have erected big buildings, and thus offended against poverty and given a bad example... The brother’s shelters should be small and shabby, and there shouldn’t be too many companions in one place, because then it’s harder for them to observe holy poverty.53

This text shows not only the strategy that Franciscans should use when they start a settlement but as well the difficult situation in which Francis was at the end of his life. After things became complicated because of the success of the movement, Francis had a lot of disputes with friars of his movement about the question of poverty. With the bigger expansion of the movement, the rough weather in northern Europe made it impossible for the friars to maintain the life style they had around Assisi and in Italy54. Even in Italy the conditions changed. Francis expelled friars from a just finished house which was built out of stones in Bologna. This building was a house of study. The movement became an “ordo studens” much to Francis distress. But from the above quoted advice, on how the friars should found a settlement, taken from the long forbidden collection stories of Leo, we know that Francis himself gave way to certain compromises. In fact, he spent the last years of his life struggling against the centrifugal forces in the movement. He wrote the Rule in which he tried to prevent the worst

52 Ibid., 1980, p. 48.
53 Ibid., 1980, p. 205.
without having to compromise too much. In May 1221 he resigned as the leader of the movement with the words “from now on I am dead for you”.

Parallel to the Franciscans, the other important mendicant order was founded by Domenicus. This order was much less concerned about ethical questions of poverty. As an anti-heretical movement the Dominicans settled right from the start in cities, such as Toulouse, where the heretic movements found most of their followers. The adopted concepts of the canons of Augustine, which were active in the immediate surroundings of castles and cities and performed multiple services for the citizens and lords of the castles but as well for the sick and poor, pregnant women, blind and lepers. To gain a higher impact on society, Domenicus shifted the interest of the order to the environment of the early universities.

The Franciscans did not take that very direct route to establish themselves in the cities.

The incorporation of Franciscans in German cities in the 13th century

How did the Franciscans become integrated into the development of the cities in spite of their strong meditative bonds to nature? What specific tactics were developed by the Franciscans in order to be influential in the city?

We know that after the first failed attempt to spread out into Germany in 1219 the friars were successful in 1221. Since then we have written evidence of about their appearance in many German cities. It was a very dynamic phase and the friars were literally a movement. We have an excellent source about the enterprise since an eye witness, Jordan of Giano, put down the chronicle of his life. He was one of the group who came to Germany in 1221 and his chronicle was proven to be a reliable historic
source by historic researches. First they went in 1221 to Würzburg and Augsburg. In the following year the friars went to Mainz, Cologne, Worms, Speyer and Straßburg. By 1250 there was a settlement of the Franciscans in every urban center of the province of Germany.

“When I consider my own lowly state and that of my companions who were sent with me to Germany and when I consider the present state and glory of our order, I am dumbfounded and praise in my heart the divine mercy.” (Jordan of Giano, Prologue). Jordan of Giano’s astonishment at the phenomenal growth of the Franciscan Order as he dedicated in 1262 his recollections of the friar’s arrival in Germany, is readily comprehensible. In 1250, 30 years after the friar’s arrival, there were already 38 Dominican and more than 100 Franciscan Convents in Germany; by the end of the century there were approximately 200 Franciscan and 94 Dominican houses.

The founding of cities in Germany was belated compared to the rest of Europe. The Franciscans arrived at a moment in time which allowed them to take advantage of the proceeding urbanization in Germany. Only by becoming an integral part of the city in the 13th century, the Franciscans had been able to spread out with the urbanization.

What functions did the friars in the cities fulfill? It was rather the function of the Dominicans to function as a counterforce to heretic movements. The Franciscans brought along the work ethics for low labor and the proximity to the poor population in the city. Work was not only seen as a valuable device for the defeat of idleness. Francis wrote in his testament:

I use to work with my hands and I wish to work. And it is my firm wish that all the brothers work at some good and worthy occupation. Those who are not trained to one shall learn, not through desire to receive pay for their work, but for the example and to repel idleness. And when pay for labor is not given, we shall run to the table of the Lord, begging alms from door to door.59

To perform labor not for money but for the sake of working with your hands is something the citizens surely welcomed. Of course the service of the friars for the city went far beyond that. This was necessary since the church was suspicious about the cities because most of their prelates were recruited of the feudal aristocracy. Therefore it did not address the questions of urban ministry in the form of a contribution to the city life.

They were not personally inclined either to adapt Christian theology and morality, which had largely been formulated in opposition to the decadent, urban culture of the Roman Empire, to expand the parochial structure, which had been erected during the agrarian early Middle Ages, to meet the spiritual needs of the townspeople.60

Therefore the friars were urgently needed to fill this gap in pastoral care. Franciscans demonstrated to the new arriving people from the countryside that it was possible to lead a Christian life in a city. Naturally, the established clergy of the cities in which the friars settled were conspicuous about the Mendicants but the citizens welcomed the Franciscans and Dominicans. Franciscans naturally first found shelter in hospices and

59 Adolf Holl, 1980, p. 176
shelters for the lepers. The attitude towards monasteries is still reluctant as this answer of Jordan being questioned by the townspeople where to build a monastery shows:

Ich weiß gar nicht was ein Kloster ist. Baut uns ein Haus nur nahe am Wasser, damit wir zum Füßewaschen hineinsteigen können.61

Meanwhile the Dominicans settled in the cities with a distinct strategy. Franciscans, however, were more errant. From another eye witness of that time who reported the arrival of the friars in England, we know that the first shelters for the friars were shared places for the poor and other emergency shelters. The success of the friars was completely dependent on their spontaneity and their improvisation skills. Right from the start Franciscans were in close contact with the underprivileged citizens because they shared the shelters with them. When they had proven to the townspeople that their services were valuable, they were provided with better accommodations. The property was a donation of the city and consequently was given under certain conditions. It did happen that the city claimed back the property, therefore the friars had never the certainty of a place which would be their retreat. As Stüdeli shows in his research “Minoritenniederlassungen und mittelalterliche Stadt” they were often to become the inhabitants of the biggest structures in the city. They became such an integral part of the medieval city that a settlement of the Minorites became a status symbol among the cities. Especially newly founded cities were keen to have a settlement of the Franciscans or the Dominicans within their wall as soon as possible. Since the urbanization of Germany took place at the crucial moment, when the friars arrived, the movement could therefore take full advantage of that development. With the expansion of the city, the

---

61Wolfgang Schenkluh, 1985, p. 205: I do not know what a monastery is. Just built us a house close to the water that we can wash our feet in it.
Franciscans spread out over Northern Europe. Very often the newly build structures for the mendicants were an integral part of the defense system. The city wall was enforced or a geographically weak position like a valley was covered by the building. The city had the right to access, pass through, or take over the whole complex without any further complaints\textsuperscript{62} in a time of military conflict. The buildings were used to strengthen the corners of the fortifications, or to fortify the city gates. Stüdeli lists many examples:

Verstärkung der Stadttore und Überwachung der Zugangsstraßen durch Medikantenanlagen lassen sich gleichenfalls in Elms feststellen, wo das eine Tor durch die Burg der Wallseer und das zweite vom Minoritenkloster bewacht wird, während in Graz die Dominikaner- und Minoritenniederlassungen der Torsicherung dienen.\textsuperscript{63}

In these crucial locations the settlements became not only an integral part of the city but at the same time were significant to the appearance of the city for approaching people. The Jewish quarters which were as well located in outside of the city walls profited from their position in the trading between the city and the world outside the city walls. Many settlements of the Minorites were in the same mediating position, not in terms of trading but in terms of ethical questions.

The friars demonstrated to newcomers from the countryside that it was possible to lead a Christian life within the city and thus helped to prevent the spread of heretical ideas among the burghers whom the church otherwise neglected.\textsuperscript{64}

\textsuperscript{62} Stüdeli, Bernhard E. J. Stüdeli: Minoritenniederlassungen und mittelalterliche Stadt. Werlingen, 1969, p. 76.
\textsuperscript{63} Bernhard E. J. Stüdeli, 1969, p 78: Reinforcement of the city gates and watching over the access roads are realized in Elms. Here one gate is covered by the castle of the Waldseer and the second by monastery of the Minorites, meanwhile in Graz the settlements of the Dominicans and the Minorites serve to secure the gates.
\textsuperscript{64} John B. Freed, 1977, p.51.
Stüdeli mentions that in many documents of the medieval age the area of a Mendicant order is mentioned as the festival ground for the welcome of an emperor, king, prince or legations of any kind, furthermore for proclamations, or constituting gatherings. These locations were also used for ordinary council meetings, trials and notary recordings in public. The investigation of the old city maps shows that the settlements were indeed the biggest and therefore most suitable locations for public assemblies in a city. Especially since in those times a specific townhall as we understand it was not built in the city.\textsuperscript{65} The town government was the judicial trustee which protected the friars from the danger of breaking the vow of poverty. At the same as their part of the contract, the town had certain privileges to use the building not only during war times but as well during peace for assemblies and public festivities. The convents were therefore and at specific times on certain occasions 'public ground'. The convents of the Franciscans became a part of the city and the city became part of the convent of the friars. This was only possible through the Franciscan's ability to embrace the culture of the city. The philosophical researches of the Friars in the academic world, for example in the cities of Paris, Oxford, and Bologna, in which they established themselves at the same time, helped to propagate the urbanization. The study of Aristotle and his ideas of a "bene commune" legitimize the city state as the nucleus of a ethical society. Departing from the work of St. Augustinus, Dominican thinkers like Thomas of Aquinas were laying the fundament for the ethics of the city state.

\textsuperscript{65} Stüdeli, Bernhard E. J. Stüdeli, 1969, p. 21.
the pursuit of the common good provided by the city as an aid to the attainment of virtue and spiritual fulfillment on earth and hence to salvation. Thus in Thomist theology, the proper government and social organization of the city was seen not merely as a means to a spiritual end but as an end in itself, that of the pursuit of the common good.\textsuperscript{66}

The study of Aristotle was a focus of the academic studies in the 13th century since his work had just reemerged, handed down through Arabic translation. A great number of scientist were compelled by the mendicant orders.

All over Europe students, masters, and doctors began talking about the friars. Their rules were looked on as excitingly modern, free of the ponderousness of the "old Orders", with their long hours of common prayer and their vow of stability. Once we realize that in the Middle Ages all the professors (and the students too) with practically no exceptions had to be clerics, we can understand the attraction felt in academic circles for the Friars Minor: Entering the order guaranteed one a certain small amount of freedom.\textsuperscript{67}

Such philosophical and theological foundations allowed that the mendicant settlements could be more than a monastery in the city. Through their appearance as donations of the burghers and their fragmentation by privileges for the town council they became social centers and town halls for their quarters and neighborhoods.

Abgesehen von diesen juristischen Zusammenhängen zeigt sich aber in dieser Zulassung von privaten Geschäften und Rechtshandlungen eine Intensivierung der Verbindung der Minoritengemeinschaften mit dem Alltagsleben der Stadt, die ganz entscheidend zur historischen Wirkung des Ordens beigetragen haben dürfte. Wir meinen nämlich, daß den Angehörigen des mittelalterlichen

Gemeinwesen praktisch jeden Tag die Erlebnismöglichkeit geboten und der unwiderlegbare Beweis vor Augen geführt wurde, daß die Minoriten und im weiteren auch die anderen Mendikantengemeinschaften den alltäglichen Bedürfnissen der Gesamtbevölkerung in ihrem Wirken einen ebenbürtigen Platz einräumten. Sie hielten sich für deren Anliegen im wahrsten Sinne des Wortes jederzeit offen und zeigten sich gewillt, ihr Leben in jeder Hinsicht ununterbrochen mit ihnen zu teilen.68

The settlements of the Friars were therefore not only needed for the fortification of the city in a military sense but as well for the strengthening of the social environment. The Order developed such a deep symbiosis with the city that in the 15th century, preaching mendicants will use the image of the city as the structural metaphor to explain the spiritual battle of life.

In the late fifteenth century sermons of the San Domenico preacher and Salembeni, however, this metaphor is transformed to become an entire under threat from alien external forces. The former declares that the 'civitas de nostra anima' is fortified by God against the enemy. As cities must have walls and towers to guard against its enemies, so heaven provides defenses against the enemies of the spirit; as civic justice and peace must be protected from outside invaders, so must man's soul be defended against evil.69

Whereas Dominicans undertook their expansion more from the outside of society the Franciscans started at the low end of society. Their view 'from the pauper's eye' gave

68 Bernhard E. J. Stüdeli, 1969, p. 86: Beside juridical activities we see as well the admittance of private business and official acts which intensified the relation between the Minorites and the daily life of the town. This should have contributed significantly the historical impact of the Order. We have the opinion that the citizens of the medieval community were exposed to an every day experience and were demonstrated that the Minorites as well as the other Mendicants created an equal space for the needs of the whole population. The Mendicants were literally open at any time and were willing to share their lives with them continuously.
them tremendous impact on the masses, on what Wolfgang Braunfels calls the "industrial proletariat"\textsuperscript{70} of the 13th century. The third Order of the Franciscans shows their emphasis on the laymen. This ability to influence the masses made the mendicants interesting for everybody who had power. Men in power used the friars to \textit{arouse princely and popular furor}.\textsuperscript{71} They were used often on both sides of a political conflict. The contrary happened when friars gained in the 13th century, in some instances in the 13th century, political power in the city states because of their popularity and started to reform the administration of the government according to their ideals.

...so der Bruder Johann von Vicenza, ein Gegner des Kaisers, der sich erst in Bologna, dann in Verona aufhielt, wo man ihn als Herzog und Rektor ausrief, bis nach wenigen Monaten sein sozialutopischer Kommunismus zusammenbrach.\textsuperscript{72}

This shows as well how by entering the Order an individual person was able to break through the barriers of the guilds and reach higher positions.

But the most spectacular medieval success stories are provided by the careers of the Franciscans Henry Knoderer, the son of a baker or miller in Isny, who became bishop of Basel (1275-1286) and archbishop of Mainz (1286-1288), and Conrad Probus, the son of a blacksmith in Isny or Tübingen, who obtained the bishopric of Toul (1279-1296).\textsuperscript{73}

\textsuperscript{70} Wolfgang Braunfels: \textit{Abendländische Klosterbaukunst}. Köln, 1978, p. 179.
\textsuperscript{71} John B. Freed, 1977, p. 150.
\textsuperscript{72} Wolfgang Braunfels: \textit{Abendländische Klosterbaukunst}. Köln, 1978, p. 190: and the friar Johann of Vicenza, an opponent of the emperor, who was first in Bologna, then in Vicenza where he was proclaimed duke and rector, after a few months his social utopic communism broke down.
\textsuperscript{73} John B. Freed, 1977, p. 133.
In the expansion of the reformation the Franciscans had to play a schizophrenic role. On the one hand they held a key role in the propaganda against the reformation, on the other hand their convents were the location for the speakers who propagated the reformation. In many incidences the Friars lost their convents after a town had converted to Protestantism.

**The building style and typology of the Mendicants settlements**

After exploring the successful tactics of the mendicants to become one with the cities in which they settled, we are getting interested in how the actual architecture looked like. In this thesis there is no room to investigate all the different nuances of mendicant architecture. Since St. Francis was opposed to stone buildings the friars had nothing to refer to when they started to build. The chosen formal language derived from the ultimate surroundings. Two general hypotheses are supported. Braunfels writes that the friars, lacking any rules of how to build a monastery, simply operated in the existing scheme of monasteries and gradually altered the scheme.

Die Zellen gegenüber gewinnen die Gemeinschaftsräume wie Kapitelsaal, Refektorium und Kirche den Charakter öffentlicher oder halböffentlicher
The usual scheme of the monastery was opened up to the public. This is a very significant difference to the monasteries of the old Orders, which were only in some parts open to the public, meanwhile to the inner area where the monks lived no layman was allowed to go. Furthermore the Mendicant settlement no longer had to be self-sufficient but was dependent on the supply of the city. There was no separation between the houses of the laymen and the houses of the friars. At the same time the individual cell became important as the smallest unit for retreat and study. The city added on parts to the monastery and during that process the settlements became a maze far away from a layout of clarity, which had been significant for the monasteries of the Benedictinians or the Cisterciensiens. The structures became a city within a city. A certain secularization of the space of the church was pursued, meanwhile the chapter hall and the refectory became more sacral. Complemental to the skill of the Franciscans to preach to the masses the monasteries were endowed with frescos. This transformed the buildings into picture bibles. Schenkluhm takes the architecture of the hospices as an departure point for the language of Franciscan church architecture. The spaces of the mendicant churches resemble in their character the halls of the hospices. The multiple naves and their profane atmosphere imply the proximity to the typology of the hospice.

Das Eigentümliche des Hospitals beruht auf einer engen Verbindung von Spitalraum und Kapelle, um dem Spitalinsassen, "...insbesondere den Sterbenden, direkte teilnahme am Gottesdienst zu ermöglichen.75

74 Wolfgang Braunfels: Abendländische Klosterbaukunst. Köln, 1978, p. 190:
The personal relationship of the Friars and their professional activity in shelters and other places for the sick and expelled, make it very likely that they used the typological language of the hospice to create a more profane space for their worship, opposed to highly ritualistic spaces in the churches of the clergy.

Franciscan schizophrenia

They tried to build the unbuildable. A house which satisfied the needs of the city environment and an excuse to their founder Francis who never had permitted buildings. The Franciscans had to walk the thin line between betrayal of their founder and the task to create centers for urban ministry. By doing so they built themselves in such a way into the memory of the city that we still encounter Franciscan typology and communal strategies in our cities. How could they have been so effective? In my opinion Francis and his movement right from the start carried the questions of alienation from nature, alienation from agricultural life and eventually alienation from oneself along with themselves. Their imperative “to serve God as strangers and pilgrims on this earth” is still present in the collective sociological memory of our societies. All questions of alienation of the inhibitor of the city are foretold. This might be why Franciscans are still so intriguing to us.

75 Wolfgang Schenkluhn, 1985, p. 205: The peculiar about the hospice is about the close proximity of the hall of the hospice and the chapel. This made it possible for the patient in the hospice "...especially the dying to participate in the mess".

76 M. Christine Boyer: The City of Collective Memory. Cambridge, Massachusetts, 1994, p. 19: In the City of Collective Memory, we find that different layers of historical time superimposed on each other or different architectural strata (touching but not necessarily informing each other) no longer generate a structural form to the city but merely culminate in an experience of diversity.
The old melody reminds us of the violence we have done to ourselves in the name of reason, and as the price of our liberation from a life of indigence, at nature's mercy. That's why we can't forget Francis.\textsuperscript{77}

I want to add that Francis, as a son of the city who broke with his father and an alien to himself between nature and society, carried in himself the schizophrenia and the contradictions that the friars of his movement and we as inhibitors of our cities have to encounter. But at the same time he enacted possibilities to escape and endure the inner schizophrenia and contradiction.

The fall of the Order

After the Franciscans had left their original ideas and became involved in politics and power play, they struggled continuously through several reform movements. Their fall came with the exploration of the New World in which they played a key role in all stages of the colonization.


\textsuperscript{77} Adolf Holl, 1980, p. 240.
Franciscans made it possible for Columbus to suggest his ideas at the Spanish court in Cordoba. They supported him right from the start and wanted to be part of the enterprise. We see the tremendous Franciscan responsibility for the Conquista. On the other hand again, it were the Franciscans who put Columbus in chains after they experienced how the Conquista with its brutal executions went the wrong way. At this point of ultimate schizophrenia we leave the Franciscans and their medieval enterprise of Poverello.

---

78 Anton Rotzetter, et alii: Franz von Assisi. Köln, 1981, p.11: Agents of the Franciscan Order were involved right from the start, in the red of the shed blood and in the green of the starting hope. Without doubt the Franciscans were the strongest and pithy force of the first evangelization in the newly discovered continent. But right from the start they were in the fatal tension to have to serve God and the crown at the same time. This close connection between Spanish-Portuguese drive for expansion and the mission to evangelise of the catholic church had its price. Approximately seventy millions of Indians and as a consequence ten millions of black Africans had to pay this form of colonization to pay directly or indirectly (for example because of imported diseases) with their lives.

The History of Franciscan activities in the City of Boston

In 1862 the first Italian Franciscans arrived in Boston. They had moved out of Italy because of political upheavals during that period. Their task in Boston was to serve the Italian immigrants in the North End. In 1876, their first church St. Leonard was built. In 1892, the church was replaced by a bigger one because of the fast growing community. In 1902, they added the first Italian parochial school to be established in the Diocese. This church and the parish of St. Leonard has been in use up to now. At the moment they have five active friars at work. In 1905 Franciscan Conventuals from Poland founded a parish in order to serve the polish immigrants. Both Franciscan communities spread out and served in multiple communities. These communities were mostly distinguishable by the nationality of the immigrants. Although St. Leonard is very alive and the community has built several facilities including a little garden, the bigger Franciscan influence has come from a third group of Franciscans. The "Kulturkampf" in Germany provided the opportunity for the Franciscans in Fulda to send Friars to the USA. The Kulturkampf was a bitter struggle (c. 1871-87) on the part of the German chancellor Otto von Bismarck to subject the Roman Catholic church to state controls. During this troubled time, some Friars set off for America in anticipation of what might be feared from the "Kulturkampf". During that time the Province of the Holy Name was founded which includes all Franciscan settlements from New York to Boston. One big friary is located in Manhattan.

Our focus is on the friaries in Boston and Providence. The first house


of the Franciscans of the province was in Brookline Rawson Road. This house served up to 1994 as a retreat house. The friars started to hold masses in a little chapel on Devonshire Street in the middle of downtown Boston. The frequent commuting of the Friars from Brookline to Downtown became more and more a problem. Consequently they moved into a building in the center close to the chapel. After World War II, the Franciscans started to look for another place in the heart of the city where they could expand. Their choice of place where they wanted to built was based on the proximity to the subway node “Downtown”. The argument that cities do not change their subway system was the decisive factor in the choice of the site on which they built the St. Anthony Shrine. A site located across the street from the first building on Arch Street and close to the subway station would guarantee a constant flow of people. This thinking is comparable to the strategy of an entrepreneur. It is remarkable how the Franciscan activity since their first involvement in Boston followed the changing social structure in the city since their first involvement in Boston.

The St. Anthony’s Shrine

As already mentioned, the St. Anthony shrine is located in the heart of the city of Boston between the downtown shopping area and the financial district. The cornerstone was laid in October 1953 and the dedication followed in November 1955. The architect was a Franciscan with an office in New York, Brother Cajetan Baumann OFM. He was one of the Friars who immigrated from Germany. Trained as a cabinet maker and wood carver, he studied architecture at Columbia University and built during his pro-
fessional career churches, schools, colleges, hospitals, monastries and other public buildings. For an Franciscan it must have been easy to connect to the long Franciscan tradition of building up public places. The model for the Shrine was the friary in downtown New York. He received two Honorary Doctorate degrees. The placement of the building in the close neighborhood of a newspaper printing shop, the shopping area and the financial district had exactly the consequences the friars had had in mind when choosing this site. One should mention that this building was built at the same time as one of the most famous examples of monastery architecture of the 20th century, La Tourette, built by Le Corbusier. Whereas La Tourette is built outside of the town in the pleasant environment of the countryside in the south of France, the St. Anthony Shrine is placed in the ultimate urban context. But both buildings were built by mendicant orders. La Tourette is a Dominican monastery, St. Anthony a Franciscan friary.

The St. Anthony Shrine is designed for up to 60 friars. The program of the building was to create a urban ministry center. The center of the building is formed by four assembly halls. On the first floor is the St. Anthony's Worker's chapel, which has dark and rather mystical athmosphere. On the second floor is the 'Upper Church' which is a brightly lit space with a high ceiling and huge stained glass windows. The athmosphere is ceremonial and cheerful. Both halls hold approximately 750 persons each. They are connected by the big foyer which is unusual in its appearance as an entrance space for a church. The organic curvature of the two big flights of the staircase suggest the flow of heavy pedestrian traffic, which indeed occurred as we will see later. This character of the staircase space is borrowed from theaters or representative warehouses. Because of the
The proximity to the subway station is echoed in the layout for the pedestrian flow in the friary. In the basement is an auditorium for various purposes situated. It has the same size as the halls on the first and the second floor.

The beautiful Auditorium is ideal for the Third Order meetings, Communion Breakfast (up to 500), for a card party and dances. Its deep stage awaits the Thespian. The facilities include a stainless steel kitchen, coat room, lounges, and Baldwin Organ. Equipped with steam, exhaust fans and air conditioning units it is most comfortable in both winter and summer. With its roll away altar it may be pressed into service if the other Chapels cannot accommodate Sunday Mass attendance."

In the best times of the Shrine all three halls were used for masses simultaneously. Friars in the lobby led the way for the churchgoers who were streaming in to the floor on which the next service would start. Today only the two main churches are in service. Every half hour a new service starts. The actual schedule lists 15 services per day during the week and 14 on Sundays. In each of the churches there are 12 confessionals. The whole structure resembles a traffic construction than of a traditional sacral space. The multipurpose auditorium reminds of the variety of functions Franciscan settlements had always to fulfill in the fabric of the city. The steam, exhaust fans and air conditioning may have lost their magic but a roll away altar is still astonishing. On top of the three halls is the Community Chapel for the friars which is a very intimate and beautiful medium sized room. This chapel is restricted to the use of the Brothers. This stacking of church rooms is a recurrent theme in Franciscan architecture.
Located on the fifth floor directly above the other two chapels a similarity is seen between the monastery here in Boston and San Francesco in Assisi with its three churches one above the other.44

San Francesco in Assisi built immediately after the death of Francis, was in its time an unusual construction. One can argue that this stacking of churches does not necessarily contribute to an increase in holiness of the place. One goes to the church, not to the churches45. The main hall of a church or cathedral is a singular appearance accompanied by a subordinate crypt. The stacking of churches leads to a more profane experience of the nave. Again the building is more a facility than a holy ground.

Around the stacked churches, an eleven stories high angular brick structure rises, which houses the living quarters and facilities for the Friars. On top of that brick structure a roof promenade situated. In this roof promenade, which is shielded by a flying roof with big round openings, the Brothers can have a meditative rest with a view of the city. When the friar who showed me around the house was contemplating with me about the view on the roof promenade and the rapid appearance of skyscrapers around the Shrine, he mentioned the absence of trees and his regret that the house in Brookline, which had a green surrounding, was given up by the order. Then he concluded that this is what the Franciscans are about. The position in the middle of the city, now surrounded by huge skyscrapers. The house in Brookline had been the training center for the novices, which has now moved to the Friary in Providence, which we will investigate later in this thesis.

All the private rooms, the Refectory-Dining Room, the Recreation Room and the Mass Chapels were originally very simple. Nothing adorns the walls but the silver and gold crucifix46. The whole building evokes the spirit of the Modern Movement in its simplicity and
functionality. This differs from traditional catholic architecture like the Italian Franciscan church St. Leonard in the North End. The typical organic ornamentation and wall forms of the Fifties are quite subdued and simple and are restricted to the chapels and public areas.

The original St. Anthony Shrine is located in Padua. Anthony died on his way to Padua in the early 13th century. He was permitted by St. Francis to teach theology in Bologna and he had a tremendous for preaching. His preachings were a systematic and mystical at the same time. On Jan. 16, 1946, Pope Pius XII declared him a doctor of the church. Anthony had very good contact to the people on the streets. On the crucifix above the main entrance "Christ is represented as the living Christ speaking his last words to all those who are passing by ". The St. Anthony Shrine was built to be a place of continual preaching in the middle of the flow of the city dwellers. The funding worked parallel to the flow of people. After a few years the investment was paid off, not by a few who gave a million, but by a million each one giving a dollar. The shrine merged into one with the city context and its infrastructure. The Friars are a part of the city even if they wished to be out in the green. They live and work in a part of the city which has no housing anymore. The program of the Friars covers a wide range of pastoral care, from the Third Order laymen to the Anonymous Alcoholics. The friary ran for a certain time psychotherapeutic services and normal counseling services. In 1981 the Friars opened a breadline at the Shrine. Soon it was clear that this service had to be extended beyond providing food. For this reason they established the St. Francis House in 1984.

Section through all churches with the roof garden on the top of the building.

Floorplan second floor
The St. Francis house was designed “to give back to some the dignity they have apparently lost”\textsuperscript{8}, as Father Canino, the driving force behind the project, said. Maintained in the long run by laymen, the house should provide a variety of services and an address for homeless citizens. The site was chosen at 39 Boylston Street. The house at this site belonged to the Edison company as most of the houses in that block. The neighborhood is known as the combat zone. Therefore the milieu was that of red light bars and pornographic cinemas. It is slightly apart from the Boston Common, the icon of public ground and the oldest public park in the United States. After 12 years the spot developed into an interesting and very valuable social pocket in the city context. The building has eleven floors:

1. On the ground floor the lunch kitchen and the dining hall are placed. Everyday nearly 420 people receive a free lunch and breakfast.

2. On the second floor the day center is situated where the guests can stay during the day read books or magazines, play games. There they can also receive counseling or take part in an art program, or take English language lessons and get housing information.

3. On the third floor there are free health clinic with doctors and dentists. A distribution counter for clothing and showers.

4. The fourth floor is equipped with facilities for computer classes, meeting rooms and the "Move Ahead" program which gives people in recovery appropriate resources for entering back into the mainstream of society. A small meditation room is also located there.

5. The fifth floor is equipped with 100 beds. Here we find a night shelter which is run by the City of Boston and is not a part of the St. Francis house.

The sixth floor is a storage area for donated clothing.

Saint Francis House is renovating the top three floors of its building to create 42 single occupancy units. Each floor will have 13 units for guests plus one for a resident counselor, with shared kitchen, dining and living rooms, baths, and laundry facilities. The small groupings are designed to enhance peer support for the stabilization of the recovery process, the maintenance of permanent employment, and a sense of community within each floor.

These floors are still empty.

This rich variety of facilities demonstrates the success of the St. Francis House. The ultimate achievement would of course be the absence of a need for those facilities. The St. Francis House was started by the Franciscans and partly run by them. After a certain time they withdrew and remained only on the board of the house. All jobs are done by laymen which are employed or help as volunteers. Two Brothers are as well working in the house but they are not Franciscans. Most of the buildings in the block were recently torn down to give way for a not yet narrowed down project. This is part of the effort to erase the combat zone from the inner city. The location is interpreted as a hinge of the important quarters in the city. The possibility of St. Francis House not fitting into the development is very probable. After creating the lively social pocket between the Boston Common and China Town, the presence of the house is very strong. It is difficult to decide whether St. Francis House took advantage of an existing social hot spot or whether it created it. Again the connection of this Franciscan project to the urban fabric is very tight. The Friars used the fabric to enstage an event. The St. Francis House provides presently the largest day care program for poor and homeless in Boston.
The St. Francis Chapel and City Ministry Center in Providence, Rhode Island

After a visit of the just erected St. Anthony Shrine in Boston in 1953, the Chancellor and the Bishop of Providence invited the friars of Holy Name Province to establish and staff a “Chapel and Catholic Information Center” in downtown Providence. The concept successfully copied from Manhattan was now served for a settlement in Providence. The Friars found a location in the downtown area. The location proved to be very suitable due to its close proximity to the factory, retail, and financial districts. The actual building in which the friars moved in, was a three story furniture store. The renovations were planned by the Cajetan Baumann. The structure of the building was in bad shape and the replacement of the weak parts became very expensive. In June 1956, the chapel was dedicated. The chapel was first staffed by ten Friars. A library was opened at the same time which in 1983 reached twelve-thousand volumes. The Chapel was very successful. In 1982, it was estimated that each day approximately fifteen-hundred to two-thousand people visited the Chapel. Every day at 1 p.m. anyone who was poor and hungry could receive a brown bag containing two sandwiches. The Chapel was given up by the Friars because of the expansion of a nearby University which claimed the site. Several sites were available. All of them were former banks or commercial buildings. The new location was found further down the street. The Old Colony Bank Building built in 1936 met the requirements. It is situated across the street from the oldest shopping mall of the United States “The Arcade” in which the Friars run a bookstore. The location was chosen because of its position in the busy heart of the city. The building was changed to the new
requirements of a friary and counseling center and opened in 1994. In the same year, the Holy Name Province’s facility for the formation of novices was relocated from Boston, Brookline to Providence. The program of the Chapel has expanded. Now services such as evangelization, ministry of the alienated, adult education, spirituality focus sessions, health care and a comprehensive counseling center are offered. Due to the emphasis of this paper, the concern about the alienated is especially interesting. Pastoral care and programs for the sexually abused, HIV positive, alcohol and drug addicted, divorced, depressive, abused, and catholic “gay and lesbian” are provided. The friars welcome everybody no matter whether they are alienated from the Catholic Church or from themselves. A truly care for the weary in the city. Together with laymen the Friars try to encounter the alienation in the city. Additionally they started a program for the care of the spirit and body in which they offer free health examinations like eye examinations, blood sugar tests, nutrition counseling, cholesterol, blood pressure and cancer screening. “From the very beginning there was a holistic sense in St. Francis’s ministry”, says Father David “Look at the way he took care of the lepers. He was concerned about the person as a whole-not just the spiritual side, but the spiritual, the emotional, the psychological and physical.”

How do the Friars working in plush green rooms once occupied by banking officers relate to their new home? Is it not remarkable for an order which started out with an absolute vow to poverty to end up in a former bank with its plush environment? For the reporter of The Providence Journal-Bulletin the message is clear: “We are alive and making big changes.” Do the friars, which live in the three upper floors with a recreation room on a former lounge floor with a remarkable view of Providence, agree with him? Where before the tellers sat in a representative hall,
now church benches and confessionals are located. Three floors are rented out to lawyers. The attached parking lot functions as an additional fund raiser. The friary is completely interlocked with the social structure and the infrastructure of the city. The living quarters and the recreation area of the presently eighteen friars, including six novices, are very simply equipped. The offices rely on the representative bank atmosphere. The one part of the building gives the impression of an “ad hoc moving in” into a found but not exactly fitting shell whereas the laymen and lay women dwell on the original interior architecture. Contradiction and symbiosis shape the character of the building. The main entrance was shifted from the street to the side of the building where a little green yard is located. A sublime shift to a little garden in the city. The structure does not quite fit but the symbiosis is indissoluble. The take over of the building followed the historic lines of Franciscan tactics to take advantage of existing structures. The conversion of the bank has the spirit of a squatting campaign which disregards all typological assumptions and is more concerned about the conceptional connection to the city than its building style.
Brief orientation about the homeless and homeless facilities in Boston

In a newspaper article Jack Thomas stated in 1992 that a census in December counted 3893 homeless people in Boston. Half are single men, 37 percent are families, and 12 percent single women, according to a study by the National Conference of Mayors, and 48 percent are black, 23 percent are veterans, 40 percent are addicted to drugs, and 29 percent are mentally ill.94 Since 1950 the poor have become even poorer and the financial gap between rich and poor widened. In 1991 3422 shelter places were provided95, 3893 homeless persons were in the streets and shelters of Boston. The biggest overnight shelter is on Pine street. It provides 762 beds which represent 39% of the shelter beds in Boston. The atmosphere in the shelter is very tense and security is not always granted. In the article the reporter Jack Thomas, who lived for a while in the streets to write an article, carries on:

On the floor, the water trickling into the drain is stained with blood, and a resident cautions not to step on toxic waste. A man on crutches decides it’s easier to urinate in his trousers than struggle to the men’s room. Another is puking into a paper cup. A moment later, yet another old man, seated with his hands in his pockets, passes out and falls forward, his head hitting the floor like a melon, his brow splitting severely enough to require medical attention. Within three hours, because of injuries or fights, two ambulances are called as are two police cars.96

The art to set up an environment for a homeless shelter which supports a safe and pleasant environment is very difficult. The strain on the employees of the facilities is very high and their payment is very low97. The working ethics have to be robust to be able to

---

97 The policy of St. Francis House is for example to pay all employees the minimum wage according to their position.
prevent a "burn out" of the social workers and to counterweight the low income. It seems as if private foundations supported by a religious community have in that respect an advantage. The City of Boston is supporting the St. Francis House financially and with complemental services in the House itself. Although the Franciscans have all the responsibility for the building, staff costs are picked up by the city and the state because, as one observer commented, "Regular bureaucratic agencies could never act with the same sensitivity as this humanitarian group." The only goal for a support program for homeless people can be to attempt to give them a home in an apartment and to reintegrate them into society.

Social pockets in the urban fabric of Boston

Through the development of the program the commitment of the Franciscans created a very interesting intersection between life on the streets, a transient lifestyle and settled citizens. From the very first moment the provision of an address was an important part of the project. Around the St. Francis house and in the neighboring South corner of the Boston Common, as a resulting phenomenon, an intersection between homeless and homed Bostonians was enstaged. The benches and steps in the park and the little plaza of Boylston Square are occupied by poor people taking a rest, enjoying themselves in the sun or watching the street life. This environment is endangered since the block between Boylston and Avery Street was torn down to give way for a major investment. This social pocket around the day care center is framed on the one side by the possibilities of the Boston Common, the oldest park of the United States and, as its name indicates, the icon of publicness in Boston. With its varieties of plants, serves, follies, monuments and sport fields this refined part of nature serves as an internalized landscape stage set for public life. The other edge of the spot are the remainders of the Combat Zone and China town. The ambiguous character of this quarter is a contrast to the controlled consumer culture which prevails in most parts of the inner city. The Combat Zone produced homelessness and is a counterweight to the well-off society. It serves as a kind of twilight zone; the world of homelessness is as well a gray zone. The third boundary

of the spot is Washington Street with its warehouses and shops. The customers of these shopping facilities come from all social strata. This mass of people with money ready to spend it is an opportunity for panhandlers for the epiphytic profession. Finally there is the subway system which frames the spot with the Boylston Street station of the Green Line and Chinatown Station on the Orange line. Both stations are in ultimate proximity to the St. Francis House. The subway stations provide the homeless with transportation, warm sheltered public spaces and a constant flow of people for panhandling and selling of the “Spare Change” newspaper.

The program of the designed extension for St. Francis House

The assignment to design a facility which supports homeless persons has been a very popular in the last years at universities in Europe and the US. Most of the projects remained unarchived and can only referred to by word of mouth. One student project was published. “Balises de survivre” was a project by Paul Virlio with a University in Paris. It was published several times. In these projected “rescue boats”, counseling, mailboxes, facilities for communication, lockers, facilities to wash and mend clothing, showers and a sandwich bar as a meeting point to escape loneliness were supposed to be offered. These facilities are to support not only the homeless but as well nomads of the city, who supposedly live a concept which opposes the life of the settled and established towns people. This approach is tinted with a romanticizing view on homelessness. The ultimate goal for projects for homeless is to make it possible for them to find housing. Nonetheless some components of the program will be carries on in this design proposal. My second point of critique about the is the lack of concern about the people who run these “balises de survivre”, more specifically how they can be enabled to create a safe and positive environment without a personal burn out. While a lot of the requested facilities of the “rescue boats” can be found at St. Francis House together with the necessary guidance, the Franciscan facility lacks some things that the “balises de survivre” have: Public access without restrictions, lockers, free access to communication

99 A social pocket in an urban fabric is created by various factors which achieve a constant social environment at one spot. This environment might be continual or cyclical but it is not physical.
facilities and public appearance. The access to the St. Francis House is restricted to homeless people who are not drunk and carry no weapons, which are two reasonable preconditions for a good environment inside. On the other hand what happens to the rest of the people? The possibility for a market place of information, a forum for the homeless where they can socialize to avoid loneliness. This design proposal tries to take the best of both projects. Creating a space which is only controlled by the homeless themselves is an ambivalent enterprise because it could end in a dangerous place where no one wants to go. Therefore the program must be a hybrid one, crossed with an interesting aspect for everybody. This could be for example an compelling view point to the Boston Common or a memento\textsuperscript{100} of Franciscan history. Therefore it could create an acknowledged public value and would fall under public care. Another aspect of the program is to scandalize the existence of homelessness in order to enforce public action against it. At the same time it should provide the homeless with a visible reference point or an address which they can refer to.

The Program of the Facility consists of:

- The creation of a memento (opposed to a monument) of Franciscan history and interests
- A fully automatic Parking garage, with 200 parking places, which serves as a fund raiser for the St. Francis house and the Franciscarium.
- A ramp system moving upwards in the space of the former back street. The ramp is facilitated by several benches, with sheltering roofs lighting and sockets, and pin-up boards for flyers.
- Communication facilities as telephones, fax machines, answering machines and internet access.
- Several view points to enjoy the view on the city and the Boston Common with its adjacent tourist sites.

\textsuperscript{100} A memento is used as a concept opposed to the monument. A memento is liquid, the monument is frozen.
Several screens and advertisement panels which show off to the surrounding and the Boston common. These technical devices display partly pictures which are taken inside the structure with installed cameras.

The Position in the City

The site for the project is between the St. Francis House and the Boston Common. Here the facility takes advantage of both. Surrounded by two Subway stations, the facility is easy to reach by public transportation. In the development of the city this block has an important function since it could serve as a “hinge” between different parts of the city. Downtown, China Town, Backbay, Boston Common, they all meet each other in this spot. The expected big investment on the site will provide the St. Francis House and the extension with perfect conditions for a parasitic existence. Finally one of Boston “back streets” will be saved from extinction.

Applied Franciscan urban tactics

The facility functions as a place of gathering, sheltering, exchange of information and as a machine which emits images into the public realm. It survives through an epiphytic existence in which it is so tightly woven into the city fabric that to erase it would mean to destroy the urban fabric on that spot, not only in its physical existence but also in its sociological existence. It interrelates between different worlds as for example, the buildings and the garden or homeless and settled persons. It is the starting point for a memory in the city which can contact other similar facilities in other major cities in the United States of America.
01 Staircase in Concrete Structure
02 Lamps
03 Display Walls & Sheltered benches
04 Fully Automatic Parking Garage for 200 Cars
05 Ambulatorium
06 View Point/ Display/ Reference-Point
07 Communication Facilities and Lockers
08 Control Cockpit / Tourist Kodak Point
09 Sender
10 Public Adress System
11 Additional Textile Displays
12 Subway Exits
13 Boston Common
14 Saint Francis House
15 Extension Parking Garage
16 Synagoge
17 Tremont Street
18 Boylston Street
19 Big Investment
20 Window of the Site plan

Perspectival View Inside the Ambulatorium

Elevation of Cockpit and PA System on Tremont Street 1:250
The synopsis of the four fragments in this thesis is disturbing. Images, collected from the author's memory and found in various sources, are brought together in a meaningful or casual manner. Some of the images convey a meaning which is harder to capture in a written research. The collages are perceived in a different mode by the reader than a linear text. To perceive an image we do not necessarily have to think analytically. Memorized in that way they might stay longer with us. Paired with a vagueness which allows freedom to think, the collaged images allow a synopsis. For this synopsis, which allows the parallel perception of different entities, every reader has to find his or her own words.

The initial phase of the Franciscan movement was investigated to find the strategies of a Movement, which relied on absolute poverty and homelessness, to build up the supporting structure of an organization. This was done in the form of a historic research. It implied finding a linear time line of the movement's development. The reader has to be convinced by a conclusive and logic result. For the sake of creating a compelling argument, frictions and contradictions have to be smoothed out. Documented data is selected from a huge amount of available information; history is edited for historiography.

The format of the three case studies is more casual and the research is more immediate. It is a report. The images and brochures could be collected from the actual sites. Interviews were made by the author together with inhabitants of the reported buildings. These events are in process while they are documented. The possibility of a mutual influence, between observer and observed matter, is given. For the reader of the thesis
the case studies are rather unreliable because they depend on the personal observation of the author. On the other hand, the actual situation is reflected only through one mirror which is the observation and editing of the author. The images underline the actual situation on different sites.

The design proposal allowed an interconnection between the three preceding chapters. Since the design is presented in drawings, images, and text, all these media are read together. On the other hand the formation of a design argument is by its very nature a very subjective act. Since a design has to focus all available resources on the rendering of a possible reality, a design proposal merges very different parts together into one vision. When the design is build, the immediate physical presence of the artifact would allow different kind of readings without any mediation.

Each part is a fragment not only in its juxtaposition to the three other parts but as well in its incomplete result. The whole thesis is a collage consisting of pieces, which were extracted out of a context. Therefore one point of critique might be that four unfinished parts are presented instead of one complete. Since it is in the scope of the thesis to be critical towards the creation of a totality, this weakness is a strength. Another point of critique is that the four fragments are not distinct from each other and that the choice of the fragments should have covered a bigger variety to achieve a more effective juxtaposition. Each part is formed by its distinct research mode: Art, scientific research, report, and design. This set up represents a wide variety of research modes.

The model of research should be measured by the results it produced. This leads to the step which could be taken after this thesis. This could be an investigation of the use of models for the strategy of a research and its presentation. Models as a blueprint for thinking but also as scientific models and architectural presentation models. A model
works on the presumption that the model in use cannot hold the whole but is useful as long it produces results and enables the researcher to structure his or her observations and assumptions in a productive and clarifying way.

What are the results of this thesis and how does it clarify the raised issues? In this thesis, tactics of the Franciscans were traced to reveal their involvement in the city context. These tactics are helpful in a society in which alienation and nomadic lifestyle are important concerns. Alienation and reconciliation are the continuos topics of the Franciscans. The history of the movement has always been a struggle with ideals and reality in the urban context. One Franciscan published an article in 1984 with the bold title “Twisted Roots and Muddied Sources”\textsuperscript{101} in which the glorification of the first days of the movement is criticized. The encounter of the messy and unruly reality lead to an awareness of the own alienation from oneself, the world around us, God, and the continuos struggle for reconciliation. In this encounter the awareness of fragmentation and incompleteness of one’s own identity enables us to find a strategy or model to struggle for reconciliation with our hopes and desires.

In the “fioretti” a story narrates how Francis preached to a ferocious and man-eating wolf at Gubbio which was terrorizing the inhabitants. The wolf eventually agreed not to threaten the people and Francis promised that he will not be persecuted. Afterwards Francis went with the wolf into the village from which the villagers had observed everything. From that day on, the inhabitants fed the wolf, so that he did not suffer from hunger. Adolf Holl comments on this story: \textit{And so like the citizens of Gubbio, we follow after his frail figure (Francis) with our eyes, hoping that the wolf who threatens to devour us all may yet be tamed.\textsuperscript{102}} This story illustrates the awareness of

\textsuperscript{101} Colin Garvey, O.F.M.: \textit{Twisted Roots and Muddied Sources}, in The Cord, Nr.34, 1984.
\textsuperscript{102} Adolf Holl, 1980, p. 240.
the one's own alienation and the hope for reconciliation which is the legacy and action of the Franciscans.

This thesis strives to be a robust and whimsical approach to cope with the Vitruvian tensile test\textsuperscript{103}. Starting points for further investigations are given. The structural model of the thesis reveals ambiguity and clarity.

\textsuperscript{103} See Introduction, p. 10.


Vidler, Anthony: Agoraphobia: Spatial Estrangement in Georg Simmel and Siegfried Kracauer in New German Critique, #54, Fall 1991, p. 31-45.


Anonymous Source Texts:

The St. Francis And City Ministry C, Providence, Rhode Island. A celebration of Forty Years of Service to the Church of Providence 1956-1996.