The Determinants of Successful Partnerships:
A Case Study of the GrandFamilies Community, Boston, MA

by

Inés Soto

B.S. Human Development & Urban Studies
Wheelock College, 1996

SUBMITTED TO THE DEPARTMENT OF URBAN STUDIES AND PLANNING
IN PARTIAL FULLFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR DEGREE OF

MASTER IN CITY PLANNING
AT THE
MASSACHUSETTS INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY

JUNE 1999

© 1999 Inés Soto. All rights reserved.

The author hereby grants to MIT permission to reproduce
and to distribute publicly paper and electronic
copies of this thesis document in whole or in part.

Signature of Author: ____________________________

Department of Urban Studies and Planning
May 25, 1999

Certified by: ____________________________

Professor of Urban Studies and Planning
Thesis Supervisor

Accepted by: ____________________________

Chairman, Committee for Graduate Students
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS:

“Clama amí, y te responderé, y te ensanaré cosas grandes y dificultosas que tú no sabes.” Jeremias 33:3

I dedicate this thesis to my parents and siblings because without them I would not have made it this far. Thank you for always supporting me both emotionally and financially throughout my academic career. A mis padres-Everything I have accomplished I owe to your hard work as parents, for showing me to be proud of whom I am. Papi, gracias por ser un padre trabajador, y modesto. Te amo. Mamita linda, tu eres mi mejor amiga, te adoro. Gracias por todas las bendiciones que me has dado. Mis hermanos- Maribel, girl I am so proud of you, your hard work will pay off. I Love You Sis. Hector Jr. (a.k.a. pretty boy Pipi) Even though I can't help but treat you like my little brother, I want to let you know that I am so proud of you, congratulations high school graduate (HPHS!). I wish you the best of luck in your career. Nothing is accomplished without sacrifice and hard work. My babies, Jose (loco) and Eduardo. Thank you for being my brothers. I can't imagine not having you both in my life. Con mucho amor.

I want to acknowledge those who have inspired me and supported me throughout this process: My aunts Annie (I am still your baby) and Wanda (¡Ni toda via!). To the special people in my life: Betsy, Dazlee, Crazy Jasmin, Abuelita Juana (mi segunda mama) Sally, Val, and Zoraida (con mucho agradecimiento y cariño). The Felix, Palmarin, Garcia family & Cacique

Thanks to my homey Lang Keyes. I don't know how you put up with me some times. Thank you, Gracias, Gracias, for your patience and understanding. Lang, you are one of the reasons I survived this place. My hat off to you señor. Aixa, mi panita. Your smile always made me feel at ease. Thank you for your words of encouragement and listening to my stories. Girl, you have been blessed with Boricua Power!

A special shout out to the MCP past and present: The home boys of 440, I missed you this year! Shawn, your e-mails and calls will always be remembered. To Joelle, it is over! Jessica, remember to always cause trouble. To MCP1, I leave my favorite line, "Can I turn this in tomorrow?"

Thanks to the Boston Aging Concern-Young and Old United, Women's Institute of Housing and Economic Development and the Boston YWCA. A special thanks to the people involved in the GrandFamilies project; My internships at the YWCA, Patty McGonigle, for letting me ask questions and for her dedication to this project. A special thanks to BAC-YOU, especially Stephanie Chacker, your guidance and enthusiasm has made this project a special learning experience. Finally, for all the GrandFamilies your stories of sacrifice, love, and dedication are inspirational. Never be silent and alone. Always be heard together and stay strong.

The best has been saved for last. To my husband, My Jorge, Pa' there are no word that can explain how much I love you. You have been my main support. I appreciate our long talks. Thank you for putting up with my stress and outbursts. Only you know what I have truly been through. You have been my best teacher. Watching you work with the Boston communities, and how dedicated you are to change is one of the many things I admire in you. Te Amo.
The Determinants of Successful Partnerships: A Case Study of the GrandFamilies Community, Boston, MA

by

Inés Soto

Submitted to the Department of Urban Studies and Planning on May 25, 1999 in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of Master in City Planning

ABSTRACT

This case study analyzes the partnership of three non-profit agencies, Boston-Aging Concern-Young and Old United, The Women's Institute of Economic Development and the Boston, YWCA, who collaborated in a pilot project called the GrandFamilies House. The result was the first housing development in the country for grandparents raising their grandchildren. This case study is based on 8 interviews with key actors conducted between January and March 1999, a survey of 24 of the 26 residents conducted between March and May 1999, independent research, and participant observation as I interned in the project from January 1998 through May 1999.

In understanding the partnership, this case study analyzes the important elements needed when trying to serve this relatively new population. There are three components to this analysis; (1) a description of the target population; (2) a summation of the initial survey that was used to develop the GrandFamilies concept; (3) and a the follow-up survey, which was used to explore how theories of service and housing actually went into operation. Findings from the study suggest that GrandFamilies comprise a rather heterogeneous population. Their needs vary according to age and household or family situations. Taking into consideration those within-group differences is essential if we are to design more effective programs to serve them.

Thesis Supervisor: Langley Keyes
Title: Professor of Urban Studies and Planning
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

The Context

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION</th>
<th>6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 2: METHOD</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 3: EARLIER STUDY</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Factors Affecting Families</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family and Income</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Living Situation and Housing</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing and Service Preferences</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Major Findings</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 4: THE PARTNERSHIP</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BAC-YOU’S Response</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creating The Partnership</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GrandFamilies Section 8 Program</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Profile of Raising the Next Generation Section 8 Program</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Programmatic Elements and Assumptions</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Profile of GrandFamilies Residents</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 5: THE GAP BETWEEN THEORY AND PRACTICE</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Affordable Housing</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diversity Among Grandparents</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grandparents Living With Grandchildren</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Grandchildren’s Parents</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Children</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integration Into The Community</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 6: IMPLICATIONS FOR GRANDFAMILIES AND BEYOND</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX A: Funding Sources for the GrandFamilies House</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTERVIEWS</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLE OF FIGURES

Table 1: GrandFamilies Partnership Flow Chart 21

Figure 1: Greatest Service Needs 14
Figure 2: Prior Housing Conditions 27
Figure 3: GrandFamilies In Residence 28
Figure 4: Number of Rent Subsidies 28

Chart 1: Housing Preference 15
Chart 2: Interest in Housing-Related Services 16
Chart 3: Ages of GrandFamilies Residents 31
Chart 4: Three Types Of Grandparents 32
Chapter 1: Introduction

A Grandmother's Story

Nell Jones loved being a mother, but she was glad when her three children were grown. Grandchildren though-- that would be great. She'd have all the fun and few of the worries.

It didn't work out that way. When Nell's daughter, Mandy, was nineteen, problems began. Mandy went for walks and got lost. She got in fights. She even began hearing voices that weren't there. Mandy had mental illness, the doctor said. She also was pregnant. If Mandy knew who the father was, she wasn't telling.

Today Mandy's daughter, Olivia, is a lively three-year old, who's been raised since birth by Nell and her husband, Jim. Mandy lives in a halfway house for young adults with mental illness, and visits the family on weekends. Nell loves her granddaughter, but she gets so tired. Every day, she prays for strength.

"Sometimes I feel angry," says Nell. "We have so many worries, and money is so tight. We see other people our age who can relax and enjoy themselves, and it doesn't seem fair. But then I look at Olivia, and I'm thankful that we're able to do this. When we're gone, at least we'll have made a difference in Olivia's life."  

As we move closer to the year 2000, a trend has developed in the structure of American families. All across the country, the phenomenon of "grandparents as parents" is on the rise. The 1980's saw a dramatic increase in the number of grandparents serving as caregivers to their grandchildren and great grandchildren. By 1990, the estimated figure had tripled to more than three million children. Approximately 3.2 million U.S. children currently live with grandparents or other relatives. In approximately a third of these homes, neither parent is present (U.S.

---

Grandparents raising grandchildren are facing multiple problems as they take on the everyday responsibility of trying to provide adequate care for their grandchildren. The system currently in place does little to provide for this population because the trend of grandparents raising grandchildren is relatively new. Traditionally, grandparents have always assisted their children by caring for their grandchildren in a time of need (such as baby sitting so parents could go to work or school); also they have stepped in during emergencies and taken in their grandchildren temporarily. But, the trend we are seeing today is of grandparents having to take custody of their grandchildren for very different reasons, such as death of a parent from AIDS, drug addiction of parent, or abuse and neglect. One theory, which tries to explain this phenomenon is the eruption of the crack cocaine epidemic of the 1980's and HIV, as a result American grandparents have found themselves raising their children's children.

Grandparents face many challenges in raising these children. Children who were born drug addicted, born with HIV, or the victims of violence often times require specialized care. Grandparent's lives are interrupted at a stage when they are just beginning to enjoy their home without children. Many grandparents see themselves having to sacrifice careers to stay home and raise their grandchildren. Other grandparents find it extremely stressful as they try to understand their unexpected circumstances. Also, many of the grandparents themselves are fragile and ill so the task of raising children becomes extra hard for them.
Up until recently, a combination of government, non-profit agencies and programs provided services separately for the elderly and for children, but today they are faced with the struggle of trying to meet this populations’ needs simultaneously. The current children-care and senior services system in place makes it difficult for this population to thrive. Some of the difficulties grandparents are facing include inflexible policies in subsidized elderly housing, limited definitions of eligibility for family support programs and services, insufficient income, and a rigidly bureaucratic school system. One example is the educational system, grandparents have expressed frustration at the bureaucracy they confront to enlist their grandchildren in school because some do not have legal custody of their grandchildren. Another example of the challenges grandparents face is housing, many of the grandparents who live in senior housing face eviction because children are not allowed in their apartment complexes. Finally, grandparents as custodial parents deal with economic hardship because of the cost raising children. Especially younger children who require diapers, frequent doctors visits, etc. Many of these grandparents have taken on their children’s children in very informal circumstances with the hope that they would return home, thus making it difficult for grandparents to receive financial assistance. The family support system is not yet designed to serve grandparents raising their grandchildren.

According to the literature on grandparents raising their grandchildren: nationally the trend of grandparents raising their grandchildren continues to grow (Morrow-Knodos, Webber, Cooper, 1997). This trend is especially noticeable in large inner cities, where drugs and violence take a toll on families. A summary of data from the 1992-1994 National Survey of Families and Households (NSFH) indicates that
approximately 10 percent of the study sample of 3,477 grandparents had been the primary care givers for at least one grandchild for a period of 6 months or more at some point (Fuller-Thompson, Minkler, and Driver, 1997). In fact, the overwhelming majority (83 percent) had cared for grandchildren for over a year, with 40 percent serving as primary caregivers for five years. The study also found that single female, African-American and low-income grandparents were more likely to assume these care giving roles. Although the increase in grandparents’ care giving cuts across ethnic group lines, it has been particularly pronounced in the African American Community, where over 12% of the children live with grandparents, compared to 5.8% Hispanic and 3.6% of the White children (U.S. Bureau of Census, 1991).

Prior research has found that children raised by grandparents suffer a higher risk for emotional and other disability disorders. In a study by Solomon and Marx (1995), the authors found that most for these children have lower academic performances than those raised in traditional families. These children were more likely to have repeated a grade. However, there were no significant differences between them in terms of other health and behavioral dimensions.

**Conclusion**

In conclusion, grandparents today are permanently caring for their grandchildren and are in need of services tailored for their specific needs. Although grandparents have always been known to step in and assist in rearing their grandchildren, for the first time we are seeing a change in the demographics of families; grandparents are now the sole providers for their grandchildren.
This population faces many challenges as "non-traditional families". Currently, housing and social services are faced with trying to understand, and assist this population in successfully navigating the system. In Boston, for the first time in the country, there has been an attempt to alleviate some of the hardships faced by these special families.

This thesis examines the partnership created among three non-profit agencies, which came together to create the GrandFamilies House. The GrandFamilies House is the first housing development in the country for grandparents who are raising their grandchildren. This pilot project is also attempting to meet the social needs of GrandFamilies by providing on-site services. The purpose of the research is to investigate how these three organizations worked together to deliver the GrandFamilies House. Through my research I hope to answer the following three questions:

1. What were the programmatic elements and assumptions about the housing, the services and the role and character of both grandparents and children that went into creating the GrandFamilies partnership?

2. What were the barriers faced and opportunities taken during and implementation of the partnership?

3. What occurred when the theories of services and housing actually went into operation: i.e. the relationship between theory and practice

By analyzing the planning process, development and ongoing phases of this project I hope to gain understanding on the relationships needed when different organizational actors get together to deliver a combination of housing and human services for a targeted population. To answer the proposed questions, I will analyze
"Raising The Next generation: A study of Grandparents Raising Grandchildren in Boston." A study undertaken by Boston Aging Concern-Young and Old United. This research will be used as a guide to explain how theories of services were formulated during the planning stages of the GrandFamilies House. Finally, I will use my interviews with key actor and GrandFamilies residents to discuss the implications of the project after implementation.

Chapter 2: Methods

This study is a qualitative analysis of the GrandFamilies House. The data for this study were gathered through face to face semi-structured interviews of key actors, including program developers, staff and residents. GrandFamilies House will be used to illustrate and document the process and what occurs among actors within a partnership. I use an organizational case study approach to analyze the process of how GrandFamilies House came to be. My internships at the YWCA and BAC-YOU were instrumental in this process. As a BAC-YOU intern I conducted a resident survey for the agency and used the data from the face to face interviews to enrich my analysis of the project. The interviews with the organizational actors and major players were tape-recorded. A total of 8 interviews were conducted with the main actors involved in the project, as well as 24 grandparents (out of the population of 26 living in the development). The primary sources for my interviews were my contacts at the YWCA, where I interned on the GrandFamilies project for two semesters. The interviews began with the three major organizational actors: the vice president of the

3 Grandfamilies is a Registered Trademark owned by Boston Aging Concern Young and Old United.
YWCA contacted the other two major organizations involved in the process, BAC-YOU and the Women's Institute of Economic Development. I interviewed them and asked them to refer other people whom they networked with during the process. I discontinued my interviews when the information started to become redundant or when people referred me to participants I had already interviewed.

Chapter 3: The Earlier Study

In 1994, Boston Aging Concern -Young and Old United (BAC-YOU) undertook a research project to gain a greater understanding of how best to respond to the unique needs of these grandparents and their families. This research project was initiated by housing case workers in the housing resource service program who noticed an increasing number of grandparents who were in need of housing advocacy, on accounts of having custody of their grandchildren. The study identified some of the reasons why grandparents are raising their grandchildren. The primary reasons were: incarceration (20%) or death (34%) of parent, and parental substance abuse (54%). Other reasons included AIDS, teen pregnancy, child abuse, neglect, and/or abandonment.

The grandparents interviewed in the study ranged in age from 50 to 86 years old of which 48 were grandmothers and 2 were grandfathers. The research focused on the effects that raising grandchildren has on older grandparent caretakers, age 50 and over.

---

5 Ibid.
6 A note on terminology in this report: "Grandparents" is used throughout this report to refer to all interview subjects, including great-grandparents, great-aunts and great uncles. Similarly, "Grandchildren" refers to great-grandchildren, great-nieces and great-nephews in addition to actual grandchildren.
Children were not interviewed for this project. To recruit grandparents for the study outreach was conducted throughout Boston, a total of 118 organizations, including 68 service agencies and 50 churches. A questionnaire consisting of both open and close-ended questions was administered (face to face and two by phone).

The initial survey respondents ethnic identity was predominantly 42(84%) African-American, with 3(6%) Hispanic, 2(4%) White, 4 (8%) Other. Although the original survey intended to reach a diverse audience, most of the respondents came from the Dorchester 22(44%) and Roxbury 11(22%) area. The responsiveness in these neighborhoods is believed to be attributed to the relationship BAC-YOU has with the local agencies and the elderly population in these areas.

**Health Factors Affecting Families**

A significant number of respondents reported health problems, both for themselves and for grandchildren under their care.

- The study reported (66%) of the grandparents having at least one major health problem (Hypertension, Arthritis, Diabetes, Asthma, Stroke, Depression, and Glaucoma).
- 26% of the grandchildren were also reported to have health conditions (Asthma, born drug addicted, emotional disability, mental retardation, and HIV infection).

**Family and Income**

The age of the grandchildren ranged from 0-18 years of age. Most of the children were between 6 to 18 years of age, with the majority in the age range of 11-14 21(24%). The survey found housing and financial issues took priority for these

---

7 Other ethnic identity listed as African-American-Indian, Creole, and West Indian.
grandparents: 43(96%) were low income or very low income by federal standards, and only 2(4%) were moderate income, 58% reported financial deterioration since gaining custody of grandchildren. The source of income for most of the parents was 39(78%) received Social Security, 25(50%) SSI Disability, 21(42%) on AFDC/Welfare, 10 (20%) were employed, 6(12%) were living on Pensions, and 3 (6%) received income from DSS Foster Care.

**Living Situations and Housing**

The majority of the grandparents were renters 45(90%) compared to 5 (10%) who owned their own home (at the time if the study 2 out of the 5 had faced foreclosure due to financial burden). The study found that 74% of the grandparents lived in either Section 8 housing or elderly housing. In addition, grandparents were concerned about unmanageable housing costs, substandard housing conditions, and the threat of eviction.

As we can see from Figure 1, the two issues of concern identified by most respondents were financial and housing services. The other two services worth noting were health care and peer support.
Housing and Service Preferences

BAC-YOU was particularly interested in housing and services outcomes because as an agency they develop, manage and provide housing services. Grandparents were given an opportunity to select as many housing options as interested them. Chart 1 shows what the grandparents reported as housing preference. Out of the 50 grandparents interviewed, 50% preferred home ownership and grandparent housing, each option was selected by exactly half of the respondents.

The grandparents who expressed support of grandparents housing believed that this option could meet the needs of their families for variety of reasons. Among are the reasons expressed for selecting grandparent housing were:

- Affordability
- Adequate number of bedrooms and living space
- On-site child care with a measure of affordability
- Regular day care and babysitting services
- Increased privacy and independence
- Community support, peer support and companionship; decrease of social isolation for grandparent caretaker
- Benefits for children who share similar circumstances
- Building security/neighborhood safety; place for children to play safely
Finally, Grandparents who chose grandparent housing were also asked to choose from the options given what housing related services interested them. Most of the grandparents (48%) chose a child care program, followed by 44% rental assistance, by on-site social services, housing retention, and tenant rights information. Only 16% reported a preference for no on-site services.

**Major Findings**

While healthcare, child care, and peer support were raised as major concerns they were surpassed by Housing and Financial issues.

- 67% cited financial security as a primary concern
- 74% cited decent and affordable housing as a primary concern

When asked about housing preferences and on-site service grandparents reported:

- Home ownership and grandparent housing were equally selected by the respondents

---

8 Grandparent Housing was defined in the BAC-YOU study as housing developed specifically for older people raising grandchildren.
Of those interested in grandparent housing, 68% selected rental assistance and 60% selected on-site child care and social services as specific needs.

Although 50% of the grandparents chose home ownership as a desirable, this was considered for most grandparents to be less feasible because of their age and income.

The following were BAC-YOU's recommendations based on the findings from their 1994 study:

- Integrate approach to serving grandparent-headed families; approach issues or children's issues; envision solutions to problems and delivery of services as a cooperative effort by public and private agencies serving both the elderly and youth.

- Address concrete needs: housing, legal, and economic; health care, education, home care and child care; develop creative approaches specifically designed for the needs of the families.

- Develop new programs and policies that focus on this growing segment of the population: kinship care policies, benefits policies, creative housing options, grandparent support networks, children’s and youth programs.

Conclusion

In conclusion, this study confirmed BAC-YOU's impressions that grandparents were facing many challenges as caretakers, in Boston, MA. The study also gave BAC-YOU a better understanding of GrandFamilies most pressing needs. In response to the research, BAC-YOU decided to take steps to address the needs of Boston's GrandFamilies. In my next chapter, I will discuss why and how BAC-YOU tried to meet this population's need. It is important to note that this was the first time in the country that an agency had conducted a targeted needs assessment and attempted to deliver services to grandparents raising grandchildren.
Chapter 4: The Partnership

BAC-YOU’s Response

The data from the 1993 study resulted in BAC-YOU taking the leading role of developing housing for Boston’s GrandFamilies. BAC-YOU’s mission is to “provide the highest quality of intergenerational housing and related services to assist people in need, especially elders.” Operating in Boston for twenty years, since 1979 BAC-YOU has developed and continues to manage 175 units of intergenerational housing in seven residences in the city. Thus it is clear to all observers that BAC-YOU has extensive experience in elders and housing related services.

In thinking about how to approach the GrandFamilies project, the organization recognized that it was dealing with a kind of intergenerational housing with which it had never worked. In the study grandparents had cited their greatest need being affordable housing and financial stability. While BAC-YOU had the capacity to tackle the housing piece of the project, the organization’s experience has been single room occupancy of elders and young adults. This was a “first time” for dealing with elders and children in the same household.

BAC-YOU knew that the project was going to take services it had not provided before. To deal with children’s services issues, BAC-YOU made the policy decision to create partnerships with other organizations that had long time experience with such programmatic needs.
Creating the Partnership

As the GrandFamilies project reached momentum, the director Janet Van Zandt, was trying to locate a site for the development. She knew of the building owned by the YWCA located in Dorchester, MA. Aware of the building being a former nursing home, she thought it would be an appropriate site because the building had an elevator and other amenities that would meet the needs of elders. Ms. Van Zandt said, “I identified the YWCA to do the children’s piece, BAC-YOU got two things it needed at the time, a site and a partner.”

The YWCA had acquired the building from the city in the early eighties with the intentions of running youth services out of the building. But with the economic recession and the lack of funding the building was never renovated and was abandoned until BAC-YOU offered to purchase it. At the same time the YWCA was exploring possibility of redeveloping the site or letting someone else develop the site. So the GrandFamilies project came at an opportune moment for both agencies.

Women’s Institute of Housing and Economic Development (WIHED), after reading their study, approached BAC-YOU and joined forces in June 1995. At the time BAC-YOU was in need of a housing director, and had other development projects, which resulted in the delay of GrandFamilies project, again. But, by this time, BAC-YOU had gained another partner to assist in the GrandFamilies Project. The WIHED brought to the

---

9 Source: BAC-YOU’s 1998 Annual Report
10 Interview Executive Director of BAC-YOU, February 1999.
project technical assistance and financial expertise in developing the low-income housing.\textsuperscript{11}

Since 1994, BAC-YOU, the Boston YWCA, and the Women’s Institute for Housing and Economic Development have worked collaboratively to develop a 26 unit housing complex called GrandFamilies House. Each organization bringing its unique expertise in the community to bear on its respective roles in the project: BAC-YOU in elderly and grandparents services, and the YWCA in children and senior services, the Women’s Institute in housing development. (see partnership flow chart)

\textsuperscript{11} Refer to Appendix A, for Funding Sources.
The GrandFamilies Partnership

Intergenerational Housing and Housing Services

Boston Aging Concern Young and Old United

Financing and Assistance in Housing Development

Women's Institute of Housing and Economic Development

Children, Adolescent and Senior Programs

Young Women's Christian Association (YWCA)

GrandFamilies
**GrandFamilies Section 8 program**

One of the outstanding things this partnership has done is work together to advocate for GrandFamilies, especially low-income GrandFamilies. As the initial study showed, 96% of the grandparents surveyed were low-income. It is important to note that although there was an equal amount of response between grandparent housing and home ownership as housing preferences, BAC-YOU made the decision to build affordable housing because this seemed to be both an essential concern for grandparents and feasible in the long term.

A GrandFamilies task force was created during the planning stages of the housing development to get the grandparents involved in every aspect of the project. The GrandFamilies Task Force is comprised of local grandparents raising their grandchildren, along with community activist and service providers. These grandparents are often the pillars of their families and communities. As they provide stability to their grandchildren, they represent strong role models to younger families and contribute to the health of the larger community. In the forum of the Task Force, they educate themselves on the issues, design effective advocacy strategies and support each other. From attending heated community meetings to marching down to the zoning board in support of the GrandFamilies House, from organizing field trips to helping to construct the playground, the Task Force members have worked tirelessly to represent GrandFamilies' concerns.

One of the greatest achievements by the Grandfamilies Task Force and the GrandFamilies project itself are the Section 8 Certificates that were allocated to the
project. The GrandFamilies Task Force, along with Roots to Wings, and Generations Raising Our Next Generation, advocated for these certificates for grandparents raising their grandchildren. In fact, Boston is the first in leading a new demonstration program of subsidies in a city/state (50 from city 50 state) for GrandFamilies.

BAC-YOU was instrumental in the creation of an unprecedented program by the State and City of Boston, which had earmarked 100 tenant based Section 8 Certificates especially for GrandFamilies, including those in the GrandFamilies House. To implement this initiative they hired a person to manage outreach; screening and placement of grandparent headed family applicants for this pool of 100 subsidies. The subsidies cover up to 70 percent of the rent, and are the primary source of income for many residents. BAC-YOU conducts all the outreach and initial screening for applicants. Residents must meet income eligibility requirements and grandchildren must be 18 or younger.

As a result of this project many grandparents were organizing to support the partnerships efforts. BAC-YOU being the lead agency worked diligently to make the GrandFamilies House a reality. As the site was being redeveloped the BAC-YOU staff worked on screening the grandparents who applied for the Section 8 Certificates. In this next section, a profile of the grandparents who participated in this process is given, then in the discussion we will revisit the initial survey, who applied to the program, and move on to the residents that actually now reside at the GrandFamilies House.

---

12 All are grandparents support groups.
Profile of Raising the Next Generation Section 8 Program

Of the 50 section eight certificates\(^1\) allocated to BAC-YOU, 42 (84%) of the applicants were grandmothers, and 8 (16%) were couples; there were no grandfathers. The reason for applying were 27 (54%) Rent Burdened, 13 (26%) substandard housing, 7 (14%) involuntary displacement, and 3 (6%) were homeless\(^2\).

The racial composition of the grandparents was 36 (72%) Black, 10 (20%) were White and 4 (8%) were Hispanic. At the time of the application 34 (68%) came from Boston, with the majority of the applicants from Dorchester 23 (67%), and Roxbury 4 (3%). The other 16 (32%) of the applicants were from outside of Boston, with the majority coming from Chelsea 3 (19%), and 2 (12.5%) from Everette and Quincy respectively.

The average and median age of the grandparents was 61 years of age. Most of the grandparents 24 (48%) were in the age range of 60-69. 18 (36%) of the applicants were between the ages of 50-59, and 8 (16%) were in the 70-79 age range, with the oldest being 74 years of age. The ages of the children ranged from 0-17 years of age, with most of the children in the age range of 6-12 43 (52%), then between 13-17 years of age with 22 (26%), and 18 (22%) between the ages of 0-5. Most of the grandparents 27 (53%) only one child at home, 17 (33%) averaged two children at home.

Of the 50 grandparents, 18 (36%) were placed at the Grandfamilies House. The other 32 applicants at the time of the data collection, 6 (12%) relocated to other private market housing, another 6 (12%) stayed in their residence, 13 (26%) were actively seeking and 7 (14%) had just been issued a certificate.

---

\(^1\) As of date the city has yet to allocate their 50 certificates.
In conclusion, there is a trend that is emerging in this study. There are more African American grandparents than any other group, most are low-income and female heads of household. 18 of these grandparents were given certificates to move into the GrandFamilies House. During this process the YWCA had been working parallel to BAC-YOU and WIHED on developing the concept for the GrandFamilies House.

**Programmatic Elements and Assumptions**

Since BAC-YOU knew from the initial study that grandparents were interested in and needed on-site services, the YWCA’s role was to develop a concept for its programming and find funding for their services. BAC-YOU agreed to lease a four thousand square feet space in the development’s basement to the YWCA to run its on-site programs. The programs the YWCA would bring to the GrandFamilies House were enhancement programs, such as senior strength, an exercise class for the grandparents; and educational programs for the children, a preschool and an after-school program. For example, the exercise program for the grandparents would offer the grandparents an opportunity to get out of their apartments and improve their health by minimizing stress and providing the tenants with an opportunity to interact with each other while the children were in school. The approach the YWCA took in developing these programs was a comprehensive approach. Thus out of this approach evolved the Generations Learning Together planning committee.

Generations Learning Together (GLT) concept was both a result of taking the opportunity of an ideal situation to carry out such programming and also, as a result an

---

14 Presenting housing issues (Federal Housing preference). Substandard housing includes code violations, overcrowding, and inaccessibility.
opportunity to meet the needs of the resident grandparents. The planning process for the GLT reflected a wide range of individual and groups who were invested in this new and innovative program. Led by the YWCA Boston, the planning committee included various stakeholders from the GrandFamilies Task Force, GrandFamilies Partner organization BAC-YOU, and numerous other community groups, from the MO Vaughn Youth Services to the Urban League of Eastern Massachusetts. Some of the Stakeholders were grandparents, and people who had been raised by grandparents. The committee placed high priority on the input of Dorchester residents and neighbors.

Generations Learning Together was to provide children ages six to twelve with a safe, nurturing, and fun environment in which to complete homework and improve academic performance. *Young and old would join together in a life long process of learning, as children have opportunity to learn from and with their grandparents through individual and small group tutorials which pair seniors with seasoned teachers and college interns.*

The goals of the preschool and after school program were the following:

- In addition to using seniors creatively to enrich children's learning, this program will address grandparents' own needs in helping their grandchildren to thrive in school.

- Generations Learning Together will ensure a high-quality learning experience for children while also providing experienced teachers to coach and build confidence in seniors.

- Ultimately, we expect this program to increase the children's self-esteem, as they perform better in school and receive individual attention from adults, as well as the grandparents' self-esteem as they feel increasingly needed, valuable, and capable.

- Develop programming for senior services

- Identify resources for adolescents
In conclusion, the GLT programs were designed to help grandparents with their grandchildren’s education. This model of grandparents and children would create a community where both would learn from each other. Also, this model would allow for others outside of the community and educational institutions to come to the GrandFamilies House to learn and engage in the programs. As a result of the study’s recommendations, BAC-YOU thought grandparent housing would be an ideal place to have intergenerational programming. Thus, the concept of intergenerational learning was motivated by the fact that within the house you would bring together grandparents and children allowing for this kind of interaction.

**Profile of the GrandFamilies Residents**

Of the total number of applicants for the GrandFamilies House 26 are in residence, 19 withdrew after submitting application, 14 were ineligible/rejected, and 35 are on a waiting list. Out of the 26 GrandFamilies, 21 are single heads of household and 5 are dual heads of household (or couples). The reasons the residents chose to apply to the GrandFamilies were varied including: (see Figure 2) of the 26 families 6(19%) were homeless, another 6 (19%) had health

---

16 Ibid.
limitations, 9(28%) lived under substandard housing conditions, 11(34%) were rent burdened.17

The racial make-up of the residents is the following (see Figure 2): Of the 26 residents 24 (92%) are Black, 1(4%) Hispanic, and 1(4%) White. Prior to moving to the GrandFamilies House 18 of the families were from Dorchester, 4 from Roxbury, 3 from Mattapan and 1 from Brockton.

The total number of residents including children is 84 with 49 (53%) of those being children, and 4 other adults. The average age of the children is 8 years of age. The age range being 1-17 years of age. Of the children the majority or 30 of the children are in the age range of 6-12 years old, 11 are from the age of 0-5 and 8 of the children between the ages of 13-17 years of age.

Of the residents currently living at the development 24 are on rent subsidies. Of the 24 subsidies, 18 of the grandparents obtained Raising the Next Generation section 8 certificates, 6 from other section 8 certificates and 2 have no certificates.

---

17 Homeless includes temporary housing, health limitations includes architectural challenges due to stairs or other physical features, rent burden (paying more than 50% of income for rent), and substandard housing includes unsafe, unsanitary and overcrowded.
Chapter 5: The Gap Between Theory and Practice

In this chapter I will discuss the how the theories of service and housing actually went into operation. I will compare results of the initial study to the results of the survey I administered after implementation of the project i.e. when the development was occupied by residents.

In examining the responses from resident at the GrandFamilies House to my survey I found both similarities and differences with the initial BAC-YOU study. In all cases a more complex picture emerged that had not been originally conceptualized.

During the planning process many assumptions were made when developing the physical and programmatic concepts for the GrandFamilies House. For the purpose of the comparison between the original assumptions and the findings of my survey I have broken the comparison into three major categories.

* By developing grandparent housing, the affordable housing would both alleviate some of the grandparent’s financial burden and create a support system among its residents because they share the same circumstances.

* The critical demographics fact was familial: i.e. grandparents living with their children

* Children would benefit from being with other children being raised by grandparents.

Affordable Housing

This is an area in which there was almost universal connection between the expectations of what affordable housing would do as a benefit and reality. When
interviewing the grandparents I found that those who had been rent burdened were relieved their housing issue had been resolved. For example, many grandparents had financial difficulties before moving to the GrandFamilies House. Making rent affordable provided options for other expenditures. During, the interview one of the grandmother’s with two teenage daughters said, "I like to reward them. Before I felt so frustrated because I could not give them money even for them to spend in the school cafeteria. My girls are good students, now when they come home with good grades I can spare some money, we go to the movies, I can rent movies for them to watch here with their friends."\textsuperscript{18} Also, other grandparents reported that now they are able to save their money for emergency situations, "I am very sick, so this extra money, I spend on those medicines that my Medicare won't cover."\textsuperscript{19} Their financial situations have gotten better now that they have affordable housing.

These grandparents feel that moving into the GrandFamilies House has allowed them to do with money what they could not do before. Others reported that they could manage the rent, but having to also pay utilities was difficult and it came before other necessities. For example one grandmother described how she managed to provide for her family, "Every month I got the checks, I paid rent, phone, light, gas, two days later I was at the food shelter with my grandchildren getting food, because we had no money."\textsuperscript{20} The GrandFamilies House resident's currently only pay 30% of their income and utilities are included. Thus, this allows for grandparents to have more flexibility with how they spend their money.

\textsuperscript{18} Grandparent Interview, March 1999.

\textsuperscript{19} Grandparent Interview, March 1999.
Diversity Among Grandparents

During my follow-up survey of the residents I noticed that there were three different kind of grandparents. In the initial survey it was made clear that grandparents were raising grandchildren for various reasons, but what the survey failed to discuss was the oversimplified perception that we have of grandparents. Throughout this planning process we have spoken of this population as if their ages (the fact that they are seniors) made them a homogenous group. In reality the initial survey showed that the age range of the grandparents interviewed was between 50-86. Although, people who are the ages of 50-61 are not considered elderly seniors, this project’s definition of elderly was 50 years and over. As we will see in the next section, the disparity in ages makes this even more complex when analyzing their relationship towards each other and the services provided in the house.

A significant difference was found when comparing the ages of the grandparents in the initial survey and those who actually moved into the development. When examining the age range of the grandparents of the GrandFamilies House, Chart 3 shows that most of the Grandparents range from 60-69 years of age. In analyzing the data I found that the age range when looking at the entire group to be surprising, the

---

20 Grandparent Interview, March 1999.
grandparents ranged in age, from 50-74 years of age. The topics of the residents age in important to note because as services were created for grandparents their ages were never the center of discussion. The perceptions of grandparents during the planning process was that they were in need of services targeted to their group not their ages. This disparity in ages thus deserved a more careful analysis of what kinds of programs the residents would benefit from.

During my follow-up survey of the residents I noticed that there were three different type of Grandparents. (See Chart 4 below).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Three Types of Grandparents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Service-Needy A</td>
<td>Private-Seeking B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Activist C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A: Grandparents in need of a variety of services for their family.  
B: Grandparent somewhat involved in GrandFamilies house or community activities.  
C: Grandparents, often able to seek other resources, stable family, and activist.

**Service-Needy Grandparents**

A: Tend to be the grandparents who are physically ill, and are having great difficulty raising their grandchildren. These grandparents are in need of outside support because of their health limitations. In some cases I found that the older grandparents had a hard time keeping up with the every day demands of child rearing. These grandparents rely on the assistance of the other grandparents to help with childcare, house chores or just emotional support. Most of these grandparents do not actively participate in GrandFamilies House mainly because they live very complex lives; some have life threatening illnesses, and at the same time rear children with special needs.
B: The second types of grandparents that reside in the development are grandparents who tend to be private. When asked how involved they were with residents at the house they usually helped other residents if needed, but they said that, they would never leave their children with other grandparents for childcare. I found that these grandparents had a strong familial support system. Many times their children are the ones who assist them with their grandchildren. These grandparents also relied on support services outside the home, such as church services, like youth groups, bible studies etc. The grandparents who fit in this group also tended to be married couples. These grandparents tend to have an organized and busy schedule. They are also involved in their grandchildren’s education.

C: The grandparents in Category C are the activists in the building. There is about a hand full of these grandparents. Most of them are part of the GrandFamilies Task Force or other grandparent support groups. They are involved in the community and tend to advocate for grandparent’s rights. Other residents view these grandparents as the leaders of the house who often are able to seek their own resources and often inform other grandparents of services available in the area. These grandparents are involved in maintaining the house a pleasant place to live. At times this becomes a problem because people associate these tenants with management because they have a working relationship with BAC-YOU. During the interviews, I learned that this group at times becomes overwhelmed because others rely on them for services and guidance. The activist complain of having their own lives, and of not having time to be residents’ social workers.
In conclusion, the grandparents age disparity shows that people are in different life stages and thus function differently with in the GrandFamilies House. The relationship between the grandparents is much more complicated than assumed during the planning process. Thus, grandparents within the house are just as complex as individual and families who reside in other housing developments. The assumption that grandparents would create a natural bond was incorrect, because although grandparents share the same life experience of raising their grandchildren, their needs vary and how they interact with one another depends on what “type” of grandparent they are.

**Grandparents Living With Grandchildren**

During the initial planning of the programs for the grandparents house the intergenerational housing concept was used to develop the Generations Learning Together enrichment programs. The vision that drove this concept was that the GrandFamilies was the ideal place to do intergenerational programming. In the initial survey grandparents had cited that they needed more educational services to assist them in helping with their grandchildren’s education. However, in the survey I found that the YWCA programs had not been fully implemented in the development. The preschool and the after school program was to become a place where young and old would come together in to engage and the world learning. However, the on-site day care center which is licensed for 20 children by the Office For Child Care Services, currently only has 10 enrolled in the childcare program. Out of those enrolled 9 live in the development. The process of getting the children enrolled has been delayed due to the lack of affordable
slots. The after school program has just began operating in May of 1999, most of the residents have been in the development since September.

During the interviews the grandparent’s responses were mixed when asked if they would participate in the intergenerational programs. I found that the answers varied for grandparents depending on their health, and how well children get along with their grandparents. For example, during an interview a grandmother admits to having her son arrested because he was selling drugs out of her home. At the time her son was the sole provider and caretaker of her grandson. Today, she has custody of his 13 year old son and she reported that they can’t get along. She also reported that his father had told him that she placed him in jail and the grandmother had not denied doing so. This example reflects how complex grandparent’s relationship can be with their grandchildren. Another example is of a grandmother of a 7 years old girl with Attention Deficit Disorder and during the interview admitted to disciplining her granddaughter by placing her in the closet. Clearly, this family in not ready to engage in enhancement programs but rather in need of therapeutic services. These two examples show how complex the relationship of a grandparent and a child can be. Thus, in order to have intergenerational programs, even before thinking about the lack of funding, the complexities of the relationships between the grandparents and their grandchildren need to be addressed.
The Grandchildren’s Parents

An issue which arose during conversation with grandparents on how they were dealing with raising their grandchildren, was that many parents are still a part of the children lives. This situation is more complicated than it appears at first glance; while grandparents are already struggling to provide for their children, the continuing (or even sporadic) presence of drug-addicted parents in the families’ lives further problematizes the situation.

In the original survey the topic of parents reentering their children’s lives was never discussed. The other side of this issue is that in one of the interviews I found out that a daughter had given custody of her children to her mother so that she could apply for the Section 8 certificate to the GrandFamilies House. The daughter had was working two jobs and still did not make enough money to support children and pay the rent. These cases again, show that although grandparents are the sole providers of many of these children, the fact remains that parents are still part of these children’s lives, in many instances causing suspicion within the neighbors of who is following the lease and who is not.

In conclusion, as the concept of intergenerational housing was being developed the discussion of the resident’s situations was never expected to be this complex. But, the obvious cases such as this service needy population should not be overlooked. The fact that these children are living with their grandparents should tell us that somewhere along the way something happened for this family to be in this situation. Thus, when thinking about GrandFamilies we should never assume that parents are not present in the children’s and grandparents’ lives, and even residing with them.
The Children

The original survey did not deal with the issue of children as a "problem". But in fact the grandparents who I described earlier as Category A are fed up with the amount of noise in the apartment complex. They complain about the management not doing enough to discipline the tenants. These grandparents at times have met in House meeting and the topic has caused tension between the tenants. This tension is partly due to the grandparents blaming other and not taking a closer look at how they may be contributing to the problem.

The Grandparents in Category B are not really bothered by this. There response has been the following, " We all knew that children where going to be living in this development. This is not a nursing home. People need to be considerate of each other."

Their attitude is if we all try hard enough we can make it better."21

The ones in Category C are upset with both grandparents and the management. They believe more services are needed to keep the kids busy. These grandparents blame the lack of coordination of activities. They would like to see and help the GrandFamilies House become more of a community. In these grandparents' eyes, if people get to know each other then they will respect one another and the place will be for all to live in peace. At the same time this group more than the others understand the complexities of family circumstances and how this contributes to how the families function and why the children behave the way they do.

This example show that although all of the grandparents share similar circumstances many of the grandparents do not perceive their grandchildren's interaction with other

---

21 Grandparent Interview, March 1999
Residents children as a positive experience. They often discuss how other grandparents do not have control of their children, because some of the children are special needs and require special kinds of intervention, this becomes and issue between the grandparents. Many grandparents question other grandparent's ways of disciplining their grandchildren.

**Integration Into the Community**

In this survey was it was discovered that on-site childcare with measure of affordability is a key problem there is space but not enough vouchers. During the development process the YWCA and the GrandFamilies task Force worked very hard to include the surrounding neighborhood in the process. The GrandFamilies house was to become a place where other grandparents and parents could also participate from the on-site services. In reality, today there are very few outside residents that receive services from the programs provided by the YWCA.

Recently, the residents have been having difficulties with the neighborhood children coming into the GrandFamilies' play ground and causing problems with the residents and their children. This issue has started some conversation among the elders on how the neighborhood feels about the GrandFamilies House. Some grandparents during their interview expressed safety concerns for their grandchildren. As one grandmother said, "I moved here looking for peace and quiet. Where I lived before there was always gunfire and gangs." The situations these grandparents are experiencing are making them feel uncomfortable in his neighborhood. They also expressed concerns about wanting a 24-hour security guard.

---

22 Grandparent Interview, April 1999.
As of today, the security is something that the residents and the management continue to discuss. BAC-YOU hired a house manager, and his job is to be available 24 hours a day for emergencies. Currently, the grandparents have expressed some sense of relief because the house manager makes his presence known, at night he does floor rounds, and tries to minimize noise in the building. Grandparents reported that his presence has put some of the residents at ease. Others are still pushing for paid security, because summer is approaching. These grandparents have associated summer with this trouble. When asked why they were so afraid of the Summer time they replied, "that is when everybody is out."\textsuperscript{23} Meaning that it gets "hot", more young people are engaged in illegal activities gang fights, music and noise tends to escalate. Many have even discussed sending their children away for the summer to keep them out of trouble.

In conclusion, in this section I discussed the implications of the housing and service component created by the partnership after implementation.

\textbf{Chapter 6: Implications for GrandFamilies of Boston and Beyond}

\textbf{Conclusion}

The work that initially led to this thesis began with what seemed like simple straightforward questions: What were the programmatic elements and assumptions about housing, the services and the role and character of both grandparents and children that went into creating the GrandFamilies? What were the barriers faced and opportunities taken during and implementation of the partnership? Finally, what occurred when theories of services and housing actually went into operation?

\textsuperscript{23} Grandparent Interview, May 1999
My earlier experience with this project was as an intern. During my internship with the YWCA, I participated in the planning committee for the Generations Learning Together program. This semester I interned with the lead agency BAC-YOU where I was able spend time with the GrandFamilies House residents.

The GrandFamilies House has successfully addressed the housing needs of this population by providing low-income housing especially design for to meet elders and children’s needs. Among the most interesting findings three themes emerged from study:

1. The affordability of housing is a pressing issue for these families—both because of their fixed and limited incomes, and because they are new families, composition precludes them for qualifying for more traditional housing.
2. This is a story that is not just about age; personal resources (or support system) are very important for the viability of GrandFamilies.
3. Grandparents’ families often times see their resources strained by the re-appearance and dependence of their own children.

Knowing what I know now about meeting the needs of GrandFamilies, I would recommend that we start looking at this group as a heterogeneous one. The GrandFamilies Housing is just like any other housing development. Grandparents are different and just because they share a commonality among them does not necessary imply that there will be a bond.

In general, grandparent families are more likely to be poor, on fixed incomes, with a female head of family, and with special health needs. Another thing makes them vulnerable is when their children reenter the picture and also make demands on
this group’s already limited resources. These are the kinds of stressors, unique to this population that can be addressed through targeted casework.
## APPENDIX A:

### Sources of Funding for Housing Development

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Boston's Development of Neighborhood Development's CDBG funds</td>
<td>350,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Federal home Loan Bank Affordable Housing program</td>
<td>150,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MA Dept. of Housing and Community Development's Housing Innovations Fund</td>
<td>250,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MA Dept. of Housing and Community Development's HOME Funds</td>
<td>700,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tax credit equity via the National Equity Fund</td>
<td>2,160,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Massachusetts Housing Partnership</td>
<td>433,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foundation</td>
<td>84,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>4,127,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Permanent Mortgage:** Massachusetts Housing Partnership  
**Construction Loan:** Boston private Bank and Trust Co.  
**Tax Credit Syndication:** LISC's National Equity Fund  
**Architect:** Chisholm/Washington Architects  
**Contractor:** Built-Rite Construction  
**Finance Consultants:** Housing Investments  
**Pro Bono Legal** Goodwin, Procter & Hoar  
**Pre-Development Funding** Local Initiative Support Corporation Community Economic Development Assistance Corporation
Appendix B:

Interviews (in the order Conducted)
1. Ruth Irving-Parham  
   Vice-President of Operations  
   YWCA, Boston

2. Pat Morris  
   Grandparent Advocate  
   BAC-YOU

3. Patty McGonigle  
   Director of Youth Services  
   YWCA, Boston

4. Janet Van Zandt  
   Executive Director  
   Boston Aging Concern-Young and Old United

5. Ann Gelspan  
   Project Manager  
   Women’s Institute of Housing and Economic Development

6. Suzan Niego  
   Housing Director  
   Boston Aging Concern –Young and Old United

7. Deitra Hall  
   Consultant  
   YWCA For Generations Learning Together

8. Stephanie Chacker  
   Director of Housing Resources  
   Boston Aging Concern-Young and Old United

9. 24 GrandFamilies House Residents all names have been concealed for confidentiality.
Bibliography

Books, Reports, and Articles


