1T-TaS as a quantum spin liquid

The MIT Faculty has made this article openly available. Please share how this access benefits you. Your story matters.
1T-TaS\textsubscript{2} as a quantum spin liquid

K. T. Law\textsuperscript{*} and Patrick A. Lee\textsuperscript{b,1}

\textsuperscript{*}Department of Physics, Hong Kong University of Science and Technology, Hong Kong, China; and \textsuperscript{b}Department of Physics, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Cambridge MA 02139

Contributed by Patrick A. Lee, May 26, 2017 (sent for review April 24, 2017; reviewed by Steven A. Kivelson and N. Phuan Ong)

1T-TaS\textsubscript{2} is unique among transition metal dichalcogenides in that it is understood to be a correlation-driven insulator, where the unpaired electron in a 13-site cluster experiences enough correlation to form a Mott insulator. We argue, based on existing data, that this well-known material should be considered as a quantum spin liquid, either a fully gapped Z2 spin liquid or a Dirac spin liquid. We discuss the exotic states that emerge upon doping and propose further experimental probes.

spin liquid | Mott insulator | transition metal dichalcogenide

The transition metal dichalcogenide (TMD) is an old subject that has enjoyed a revival recently due to the interests in its topological properties and unusual superconductivity. The layer structure is easy to cleave or intercalate and can exist in single-layer form (1, 2). This material was studied intensively in the 1970s and 1980s and was considered the prototypical example of a charge density wave (CDW) system (3). Due to imperfect nesting in two dimensions, in most of these materials, the onset of CDW gaps out only part of the Fermi surface, leaving behind a metallic state that often becomes superconducting. Conventional band theory and electron–phonon coupling appear to account for the qualitative behavior (3). There is, however, one notable exception, namely 1T-TaS\textsubscript{2}. The Ta forms a triangular lattice, sandwiched between two triangular layers of S, forming an ABC-type stacking. As a result, the Ta is surrounded by S, forming an approximate octahedron. In contrast, the 2H-TaS\textsubscript{2} forms an ABA-type stacking, and the Ta is surrounded by S, forming a trigonal prism. In a single layer, inversion symmetry is broken in 2H structure. The system is a good metal below the CDW onset around 90 K, and, eventually, the spin–orbit coupling gives rise to a special kind of superconductivity called Ising superconductivity (4–6). In 1T-TaS\textsubscript{2}, inversion symmetry is preserved. The system undergoes a CDW transition at about 350 K with a jump in the resistivity. It is known that this transition is driven by an incommensurate triple-Q CDW (ICDW). A similar transition is seen in 1T-TaSe\textsubscript{2} at 470 K. However, whereas TaSe\textsubscript{2} stays metallic below this transition, 1T-TaS\textsubscript{2} exhibits a further resistivity jump around 200 K that is hysteretic, indicative of the first-order nature of this transition. These transitions are also visible in the spin susceptibility data shown in Fig. 2. In early samples, the resistivity rises only by about a factor of 10 as the temperature is lowered from 200 K to 2 K and, below that, obeys Mott hopping law (log resistivity goes as $T^{-1/2}$) (7). More recent samples show better insulating behavior, and it is generally agreed that the ground state is insulating. The 200 K transition is accompanied by a lock-in to a commensurate CDW (CCDW), forming a $\sqrt{3} \times \sqrt{3}$ structure. As shown in Fig. 1, this structure is described as clusters of stars of David where the sites of the stars move inward toward the site in the middle. The stars of David are packed in such a way that they form a triangular lattice. Thus, the unit cell is enlarged to have 13 Ta sites. The formal valence of Ta is 4+, and each Ta site has a single 5$d$ electron. We have an odd number of electrons per unit cell. (We first restrict ourselves to a single layer. Interlayer effects will be discussed later in this section.) According to band theory, the ground state must be metallic. The only option for an insulating ground state in the pure material is a correlation driven Mott insulator. This fact was pointed out by Fazekas and Tosatti (8) in 1976. Band calculations show that band folding creates a cluster of bands near the Fermi surface. Rossnagel and Smith (9) found that, due to spin–orbit interaction, a very narrow band is split off, which crosses the Fermi level with a 0.1- to 0.2-eV gap to the other subbands. The narrow bandwidth means that a weak residual repulsion is sufficient to form a Mott insulator, thus supporting the proposal of Fazekas and Tosatti, and distinguishes 1T-TaS\textsubscript{2} from other TMD. Apparently, the formation of the commensurate clusters is essential for the strong correlation behavior in these 4$d$ and 5$d$ systems. Currently, the assignment of cluster Mott insulator to the undoped 1T-TaS\textsubscript{2} ground state is widely accepted. A band about 0.2 eV below the Fermi energy has been interpreted as the lower Hubbard band in angle-resolved photo-emission spectroscopy (ARPES) (10, 11), and the electronic-driven nature of the 200 K transition has been confirmed by time-dependent ARPES on the basis of the fast relaxation time of the spectra (12).

Surprisingly, with a few exceptions, the issue of magnetism associated with the Mott insulator has not been discussed in the literature. In the standard picture of a Mott insulator, the spins form local moments, which then form an antiferromagnetic (AF) ground state due to exchange coupling. No such AF ordering has been reported in 1T-TaS\textsubscript{2}. There is not even any sign of the local moment formation, which usually appears as a rise in the spin susceptibility with decreasing temperature, following a Curie–Weiss law. As seen in Fig. 2, the magnetic susceptibility drops at the CDW transitions, but remains almost flat below 200 K (3). (The small rise below 50 K can be attributed to $5 \times 10^{-4}$ impurity spin per Ta.) This serious discrepancy from the Mott picture did not escape the attention of Fazekas and Tosatti (8); they attempted to explain this by arguing that the $g$ factor is very small due to spin–orbit coupling. However, their argument depends sensitively on the assumption of a cubic environment for the Ta atoms, which is now known not to be true. In fact, Rossnagel and Smith (9) claim that a single band crosses the Fermi level that is mainly made up of $xy$ and $x^2 - y^2$ orbitals. This picture suggests

Significance

In solids with an odd number of electrons per unit cell, band theory requires that they are metals, but strong interaction can turn them into insulators, called Mott insulators. In this case, the electrons form local moments that, in turn, form an antiferromagnetic ground state. In 1973, P. W. Anderson proposed that, in certain cases, quantum fluctuations may prevent magnetic order and result in a paramagnetic ground state called a quantum spin liquid. After many years of searching, a few examples have been discovered in the past several years. We point out that a well-studied material, TaS\textsubscript{2}, may be a spin liquid candidate. We propose further experiments that probe the exotic properties of this new state of matter.

Author contributions: K.T.L. and P.A.L. performed research; and P.A.L. wrote the paper.

Reviewers: S.A.K., Stanford University; and N.P.O., Princeton University.

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

Freely available online through the PNAS open access option.

1To whom correspondence should be addressed. Email: palee@mit.edu.
that the low-energy physics can be described by a single-band Hubbard model. Due to the strong spin–orbit coupling, spin is not a good quantum number, but there is a pseudospin made up of Kramers pair to describe the degeneracy of each band in the presence of inversion symmetry. Throughout this paper, spin will refer to this pseudospin. In general, there is no $SU(2)$ symmetry for the pseudospin, and we expect a nonzero and anisotropic $g$ factor. Thus, we believe we cannot rely on the Fazekas–Tosatti proposal to explain the absence of Curie Weiss behavior.

A more recent discussion on magnetism came in 2005, when Perfetti et al. (10) proposed the existence of a fluctuating spin density wave (SDW) to explain certain features in their ARPES data. In the CCDW phase, they reported a band about 0.15 eV below the Fermi energy, which has a small upward dispersion. In addition, they reported spectral weight above this band, consistent with a back-folded band with a downward dispersion, which is greatly smeared. They compared this observation with the dispersion calculated for a triple-$Q$ SDW and argued that their observation supports some kind of incipient SDW order. The spin density of this SDW is smoothly connected to that of the three-sublattice 120° spin order of local moments expected for the Heisenberg model on a triangular lattice. Presumably, the SDW fails to order due to quantum fluctuation. If so, the picture presented in ref. 10 is smoothly connected to a spin liquid state formed out of local moments, even though there is no sign of local moments from the SDW picture. It should be pointed out, however, that the more recent ARPES data, although equally broad in energy, do not seem to show this downward dispersing feature (11).

In the past 10 y, there have been great advances in the study of spin liquids. (For a review, see refs. 13 and 14.) Originally, Anderson (15) and Fazekas and Anderson (16) proposed a spin liquid state for the triangular lattice due to frustration. Now we have strong evidence to support the spin liquid state in at least two cases: the organic compounds close to the Mott transition and in certain Kagome lattices. In light of our recent experience, we can say that existing data are pointing strongly toward a quantum spin liquid state for the 1T-TaS$_2$ Mott insulator. Due to the rather low value of the sheet resistance, it is generally believed that disorder effects in the undoped samples are small enough that we can rule out an insulator due to Anderson localization. There has been no report of further lattice distortion or phase transition below 200 K, but, in principle, long-range order could set in immediately at 200 K. However, a long-range ordered SDW at wave vector $Q$ will induce a charge density wave order at 2$Q$, but these new diffraction spots have not been seen. Furthermore, the ARPES should show clearly the back-folded band instead of a broad smear (10, 11). Finally, since the initial submission of this paper, we have learned that NMR and $\mu$SR (spin resonance) data indeed rule out static magnetic moments (17, 18). We therefore believe long-range AF or SDW is unlikely. Instead, 1T-TaS$_2$ may be an example of the elusive quantum spin liquid.

There is, however, one remaining caveat. Up to now, we have not discussed the issue of interlayer coupling, which can introduce complications for our interpretations. Above 200 K, the ICCD are stacked in an ABC pattern, leading to a tripling of the unit cell in the $c$ direction. However, below 200 K, the stars of David are stacked directly on top of each other to form bilayers. These bilayers are stacked randomly or in an incommensurate fashion (18, 19). The doubling of the unit in the bilayer means that we now have an even number of electrons per unit cell, and a spin liquid ground state may or may not survive, depending on which of the following two options are realized. The first option is for the spins to form singlets between the unit cells. This state no longer fits the definition of a spin liquid, because it is topologically trivial and is smoothly connected to an ordinary band insulator. It is more analogous to ladder compounds, which are still interesting in their own right (20). Indeed, a number of papers (21) have even suggested that the interlayer hopping dominates over the intralayer hopping and the system forms one-dimensional metals. This point of view is supported by recent ARPES data. In the CCDW phase, they reported a band about 0.15 eV above this band, consistent with a back-folded band with a downward dispersion, which is greatly smeared. They compared this observation with the dispersion calculated for a triple-$Q$ SDW and argued that their observation supports some kind of incipient SDW order. The spin density of this SDW is smoothly connected to that of the three-sublattice 120° spin order of local moments expected for the Heisenberg model on a triangular lattice. Presumably, the SDW fails to order due to quantum fluctuation. If so, the picture presented in ref. 10 is smoothly connected to a spin liquid state formed out of local moments, even though there is no sign of local moments from the SDW picture. It should be pointed out, however, that the more recent ARPES data, although equally broad in energy, do not seem to show this downward dispersing feature (11).

In the past 10 y, there have been great advances in the study of spin liquids. (For a review, see refs. 13 and 14.) Originally, Anderson (15) and Fazekas and Anderson (16) proposed a spin liquid state for the triangular lattice due to frustration. Now we have strong evidence to support the spin liquid state in at least two cases: the organic compounds close to the Mott transition and in certain Kagome lattices. In light of our recent experience, we can say that existing data are pointing strongly toward a quantum spin liquid state for the 1T-TaS$_2$ Mott insulator. Due to the rather low value of the sheet resistance, it is generally believed that disorder effects in the undoped samples are small enough that we can rule out an insulator due to Anderson localization. There has been no report of further lattice distortion or phase transition below 200 K, but, in principle, long-range order could set in immediately at 200 K. However, a long-range ordered SDW at wave vector $Q$ will induce a charge density wave order at 2$Q$, but these new diffraction spots have not been seen. Furthermore, the ARPES should show clearly the back-folded band instead of a broad smear (10, 11). Finally, since the initial submission of this paper, we have learned that NMR and $\mu$SR (spin resonance) data indeed rule out static magnetic moments (17, 18). We therefore believe long-range AF or SDW is unlikely. Instead, 1T-TaS$_2$ may be an example of the elusive quantum spin liquid.

There is, however, one remaining caveat. Up to now, we have not discussed the issue of interlayer coupling, which can introduce complications for our interpretations. Above 200 K, the ICCD are stacked in an ABC pattern, leading to a tripling of the unit cell in the $c$ direction. However, below 200 K, the stars of David are stacked directly on top of each other to form bilayers. These bilayers are stacked randomly or in an incommensurate fashion (18, 19). The doubling of the unit in the bilayer means that we now have an even number of electrons per unit cell, and a spin liquid ground state may or may not survive, depending on which of the following two options are realized. The first option is for the spins to form singlets between the unit cells. This state no longer fits the definition of a spin liquid, because it is topologically trivial and is smoothly connected to an ordinary band insulator. It is more analogous to ladder compounds, which are still interesting in their own right (20). Indeed, a number of papers (21) have even suggested that the interlayer hopping dominates over the intralayer hopping and the system forms one-dimensional metals. This point of view is supported by the LDA+ $U$ calculation. However, we find this scenario unlikely, in view of the conclusion by Rossnagel and Smith (9) that the split-off bands are mainly $xy$ and $x^2 − y^2$ orbitals, which, unlike the $z$ orbital, have weak interlayer overlap. In contrast, Durancet et al. (21) first ignore spin–orbit coupling and split off an isolated band at the Fermi surface using the LDA+ $U$ approximation. The $z$ orbital is strongly admixed and gives a strong interlayer hopping. We believe it is more appropriate to first construct the best single-particle orbital including spin–orbit coupling before turning on $U$ and that the conclusion of Durancet et al. (21) may be an artifact of the LDA+ $U$ approximation.

It is important to remark that having a paramagnetic ground state with an odd number of electrons per unit cell is a sufficient but not necessary condition for a spin liquid. The reason is that a second option (other than interlayer singlet formation) is
Possible Spin Liquid States in TaS$_2$

A key feature of spin liquid is the appearance of “fractionalized” excitations, such as particles that carry spin 1/2 but not charge. These particles have been called spinons (15). The spinons can be fermions or bosons. Spin liquids can be divided into two broad classes, gapped or gapless. The gapless spin liquids generally have fermionic spinons, which may form a Fermi surface or Dirac nodes (23). The spinon Fermi surface is characterized by a mass corresponding to a hopping matrix element of order $J$, the exchange energy. A linear term in the heat capacity with coefficient $\gamma$ given by this mass has been seen experimentally (24). Theoretically, gauge fluctuation is predicted to convert the linear term to $T^{5/3}$ power, but it has proven difficult to distinguish between the two over the limited temperature range available in the experiment so far. A second key signature is a linear $T$ term in the thermal conductivity, which is usually observed only in a metal (25). It is widely believed that the spin liquid observed in the organics belongs to this type (13, 14). Interestingly, the heat capacity of 1T-TaS$_2$ shows a linear intercept with small upturn at low temperatures (26). Nevertheless, we believe this observation does not constitute evidence for a spinon Fermi surface for the following reason. The coefficient of this linear term is about 2 mJ/mol K$^2$, about 4 times that of copper. This coefficient corresponds to a Fermi energy of about 0.16 eV; we note that the bandwidth of the band at the Fermi level, from band theory, is quite large to support some form of spin liquid. Possible Spin Liquid States in TaS$_2$

Possible Spin Liquid States in TaS$_2$

A second kind of gapless spin liquid is the Dirac spin liquid. Here the spinons are gapless at certain nodal points and follow a linear spectrum around these points. There are two versions of Dirac spin liquid, U(1) or Z$_2$, depending on whether there exists gapless gauge fields or not. In the latter case, the density of states is linear in energy, giving rise to $T^2$ heat capacity and NMR relaxation rate $1/T_1$. In the former case, gauge fluctuations may lead to some modifications of these power laws. As noted earlier, the NMR data seem to point to the Dirac spin liquid over a finite temperature range.

Next we come to the gapped spin liquids. In mean field theory, the most common description is one with gapped bosonic spinons (27) together with gapped visons (28); these are called Z$_2$ spin liquids, and the visons are the “vortices” of the Z$_2$ gauge fields. We note that, in two dimensions, U(1) gapped spin liquid is not allowed, because the compact U(1) gauge field would lead to confinement. A fermionic mean field theory can also lead to a Z$_2$ state with fermionic spinons (29, 30). However, this state is smoothly connected to the one with bosonic spinons, because a bosonic spinon can bind with a vison to form a fermionic spinon, and it is a question of energetics as to whether the low-energy spinons are fermions or bosons. There are more exotic possibilities, but our expectation is that, without further breaking of symmetry, the Z$_2$ gapped spin liquid is likely the only common possibility. This state is characterized by low-energy excitations that are gapped spinons (fermions or bosons) and visons. To explain the spin susceptibility data, we will have to argue that the background subtraction in Fig. 2 is such that the susceptibility has dropped to a small value below the first-order transition at 200 K; this means that the spin gap and the exchange scale $J$ are above 200 K. This argument will allow us to get around the issue of the absence of the Curie–Weiss law due to local moments.

One more possibility of a gapped spin liquid that has been widely discussed for triangular lattice, and that is the chiral spin liquid (31). This state spontaneously breaks time-reversal symmetry. There should be an easily detected Ising-type transition at a finite temperature, but one could argue that it is not accessible because its temperature scale is above the first-order transition at 200 K. The chiral spin liquid has many observable consequences that have been widely discussed, including Kerr rotation, chiral spin edge modes, and spontaneous quantized thermal Hall conductivity. The absence of signatures of time-reversal symmetry breaking in the $\mu$SR data makes this possibility unlikely.

We note that recent numerical work using density matrix renormalization group (DMRG) and variational Monte Carlo methods supports the existence of a region of spin liquid in a $J_1 - J_2$ Heisenberg model on a triangular lattice where the next nearest neighbor (NNN) $J_2$ is in the range $0.08 < J_2 / J_1 < 0.15$ (32–36). Furthermore, many groups find it difficult to distinguish between the Z$_2$ spin liquid, the chiral spin liquid, and the U(1) Dirac spin liquid. These states seem to have very similar energetics. It is also important to remember that our system has strong spin–orbit coupling. Consequently, there is no SU(2) symmetry for the pseudospin, and the Heisenberg model is not a good starting model. We expect anisotropic exchange terms. We also expect ring exchange terms, because the system appears to be quite close to the Mott transition. Thus, the phase space may be quite large to support some form of spin liquid.

Effect of Doping or Pressure and Further Experimental Consequences

Next we discuss what is known experimentally when the system is doped or when pressure is applied. It has been reported that 1% Fe doping destroys the CCDW state (37). A Fermi surface appears near the $\Gamma$ point above this doping level (11), and superconductivity with about 3 K T appearance. Further doping creates Anderson localization and kills the superconductivity. With a small amount of pressure of 1 GPa, the CCDW is destroyed and replaced by the ICDW, which is, in turn, destroyed with a pressure of 7 GPa (38). The state is metallic and superconducting, with $T_c$ about 5 K everywhere above 4 GPa. We summarize the low-temperature state in the pressure and doping concentration plane in Fig. 3.
It is worth noting that 1% Fe doping is actually a rather large doping in our effective Hubbard model of clusters, because it corresponds to 13% doping per cluster. Thus, it is not surprising that the state looks like a conventional Fermi liquid, with a small and round Fermi surface near the 1T point that presumably obeys the Luttinger volume (11). (Strictly speaking, there is no Luttinger theorem for an incommensurate state, but we can use the nearby commensurate approximate of \( \sqrt[13]{3} \times \sqrt[13]{3} \) state to estimate the Fermi surface volume.) The observed superconductivity seems to grow out of this state and extend beyond a pressure where the ICDW is destroyed. Thus, we think this superconductivity may be quite conventional. From the point of view of seeking exotic physics, the most interesting region is the small lower left corner in Fig. 3 where the ICDW order is present. Unfortunately, we are not aware of doping data below 1% carrier per Ta. This region of low dopant density is prone to Anderson localization. Thus, doping by substitution in the plane is likely to create too much disorder. It will be good to attempt doping by intercalation or, even better, by gate in a thin sample. (Focusing on monolayer or trilayer will also help us get around the issue of interlayer coupling.) Indeed, limited data in the very lightly doping range showing metallic-like behavior have been reported by gate doping (39). Here we describe the possible states that result from doping without disorder, and discuss some experimental consequences. Soon after the introduction of the concept on spinons (40) that carry spin and no charge, Kivelson et al. (29) pointed out that an analogous situation may obtain for the doped spin liquid. (40) pointed out that, if the spin liquid Mott insulator is used as the insulator barrier between two conventional superconductors or magnets (45, 46). For example, Senthil and Fisher (45) pointed out that, if the spin liquid Mott insulator is used as the insulator barrier between two conventional superconductors in an S-I-S structure, this structure may exhibit a charge Josephson effect. The requirement is that the spatial transition between the superconductor and the spin liquid has to be smooth enough to avoid confinement at the interface. Ordinarily, this is a tall order. However, the 1T-TaS\(_2\) offers a special opportunity in that the superconductors can be created by doping; this can be achieved by gating, which can produce a smooth transition between the superconducting state and the insulating state. In summary, we believe existing experimental data strongly point to 1T-TaS\(_2\) as an example of a spin liquid state, formed out of a cluster Mott insulator. The lightly doped state is likely an

---

**Fig. 3.** Schematic phase diagram of the low-temperature state in the pressure-\( P \) and the doping concentration (\( x \) per Ta) plane. Red dashed line marks a first-order phase transition separating a CCDW and an ICDW. The solid red line marks the undoped spin liquid state formed out of the cluster Mott insulator, the cluster being the star of David shown in Fig. 1. The solid black line separates the ICDW phase and a normal metal phase. The CCDW phase is a Fermi liquid (FL) metal satisfying the Luttinger volume of approximately \( \frac{1}{\sqrt{13}} + \frac{x}{3} \) of the original Brillouin zone volume. Dotted black line marks the onset of Anderson localization due to dopant disorder and is highly schematic. The yellow region denotes superconducting ground state with \( T_c \) of \( \sim 3 \) K to 5 K.
exotic metal with unusual experimental consequences, some of which we discussed. Ultrathin samples are particularly attractive, because they help avoid the complications of interlayer coupling and can be doped by gating to minimize disorder.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS. We thank Debajan Chowdhury for bringing several key experimental papers to our attention, and he and T. Senthil for discussions and review of theoretical ideas. After the initial submission of this paper, we became aware of unpublished data shown in refs. 17 and 18 that have been incorporated in the final version. We thank these authors for sharing their data and insight with us. P.A.L. acknowledges the National Science Foundation for support under Grant DMR-1522575. K.T.L. acknowledges the support of the Research Grant Council and the Croucher Foundation through HKUST/CRF13G, C06026-16W, 16324216, and a Croucher Innovation Grant.