Stability analysis of a phase-field model of gravity-driven unsaturated flow through porous media

The MIT Faculty has made this article openly available. Please share how this access benefits you. Your story matters.
Stability analysis of a phase-field model of gravity-driven unsaturated flow through porous media

Luis Cueto-Felgueroso and Ruben Juanes*
Massachusetts Institute of Technology, 77 Massachusetts Avenue, Building 48-319, Cambridge, Massachusetts 02139, USA
(Received 14 November 2008; published 9 March 2009)

The formation of preferential flow paths during infiltration of water into homogeneous, dry soil is an important phenomenon whose explanation and prediction have remained elusive under the standard theories of multiphase flow in porous media. We have recently proposed a macroscopic phase-field model of unsaturated flow in porous media, which explains why such fingering occurs [L. Cueto-Felgueroso and R. Juanes, Phys. Rev. Lett. 101, 244504 (2008)]. Here we present a linear stability analysis of the proposed model for constant-flux infiltration, which allows a quantitative description of the wetting front instability. The present analysis stresses the critical role of the initial water saturation and applied flux ratio in the asymptotic stability of the system, as well as in the transient growth of perturbations, which is consistent with the experimental evidence. The trends in the frequency and growth factor of the most unstable modes predicted by our analysis are also in quantitative agreement with experimental measurements.

DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevE.79.036301 PACS number(s): 47.56.+r, 47.54.—r, 47.20.—k, 05.60.—k

I. INTRODUCTION

Gravity-driven infiltration of water into a homogeneous layer of soil is a simple and relevant example of pattern formation in multiphase flow through porous media. Rather than a compact infiltration front, the flow is often unstable and the water invasion takes the form of preferential flow paths (fingers). Intense experimental and theoretical work on the wetting front instability was initiated in the 1970s [1–3] and has been followed by numerous measurements of finger formation and unstable gravity-driven infiltration (see, for example, [4–11]).

Despite overwhelming experimental evidence, the description of gravity-driven unsaturated flow using macroscopic mathematical models (continuum balance laws) has remained elusive. The traditional model, known as Richards' equation [12], is a mass balance equation in which the water flux is modeled by a straightforward extension of Darcy's law to unsaturated media. It accounts for gravity, capillarity, and the fact that the permeability to water is reduced because the porous medium is only partially saturated with water.

The inability of Richards' equation to explain fingered flow was explicitly conjectured, with the support of strong numerical evidence, by Eliassi and Glass [13], considering typical constitutive relations and hysteretic effects. This conjecture has been confirmed by the successive refinement of theoretical and numerical stability analysis of unsaturated flow [8,14–20]. After the most recent theoretical results [18–20], the stability of the standard model is no longer a matter of controversy: Richards' equation is unconditionally stable under both infinitesimal and finite perturbations, which includes both asymptotic (modal) and transient (non-modal) growth effects. The relevant pattern-forming physical mechanisms are therefore missing in the classical model of unsaturated flow in porous media.

Many authors have approached the wetting front instability by drawing an analogy with the two-fluid system in a Hele-Shaw cell [21], and their analyses have led to kinematic models that reproduce trends observed in the experiments, such as relations between finger width and finger tip velocity with the flow rate through the finger [3,5,22–24]. Simulation of unstable gravity flows has also been performed with modified invasion-percolation models at the pore scale [25,26].

More recently, in light of the complexity of the problem and the growing perception that the classical mathematical model is incomplete, special attention has been paid to one-dimensional (1D) experiments, aiming at an understanding of several distinctive features of the wetting front instability, most notably the observed saturation overshoot near the tip of the fingers and the critical relevance of the injected flux ratio and initial moisture content of the soil [27–30].

Several alternatives to Richards' equation have been proposed over the last decade, and most of them rely on extensions of the concepts of saturation [31,32] and macroscopic capillary pressure [19,20,32–37]. The dynamics of an invading fluid front in disordered media has also been the subject of considerable interest within the statistical physics community [38–40]. Particularly notable in the present context is the use of the phase-field framework to simulate spontaneous imbibition processes [40]. The relevant idea behind these models is the incorporation of nonlocal capillary effects in the macroscopic model. A fundamental drawback of these approaches is the assumption that the porous medium is either completely dry or fully saturated by water, which is not acceptable in practice.

We have recently proposed a model of unsaturated flow that captures the relevant features of gravity fingering during infiltration [41]. Our model is derived following a phase-field methodology, which extends Richards' equation with an additional term that is formally equivalent to an apparent surface tension at the wetting front. The model predicts a saturation overshoot at the tip of the fingers, a feature that is believed to be essential for the formation of fingers. Our model is similar to that describing the flow of thin films [42,43] and to phase-field models of epitaxial growth of surfaces, binary transitions, and solidification [40,44–47].

This paper presents a linear stability analysis of the proposed phase-field model. The starting point is similar to the...
one adopted in the context of thin film flows [43,48–50]. In a more general context, our analysis follows the recent trends in generalized hydrodynamic stability analysis, considering both modal and nonmodal effects [51–53]. The model equation is conditionally stable under infinitesimal perturbations, and the nonnormality of the linearized operator induces, for certain relevant points in parameter space, an intense transient growth of perturbations to the traveling wave solutions of the model problem. The transient growth is conjectured to play a critical role in the velocity and width of the fingers. This transient growth is, on the other hand, limited to the initial stages in the evolution of the perturbation, which suggests that the long-time finger dynamics might be well represented by the wavelengths and growth factors obtained in the eigenvalue analysis of the linearized problem. The present study predicts the observed critical role of the initial moisture content of the soil, as well as the role of the applied flux ratio on the onset of the stability, width, and velocity of the fingers. In accordance with experimental evidence (and intuition) is also the suppression of the instability induced by capillary diffusion.

The paper is organized as follows. Section II presents the mathematical model and its nondimensional form. The base solutions about which the model equation will be linearized are traveling waves, whose shape and parameter dependence is shown in Sec. III. Section IV introduces the linearized problem and its discretization as an instrumental step towards the analysis of the propagator. Finally, Sec. V presents the results of the modal and nonmodal stability analysis, and in Sec. VI we summarize the main conclusions of the present study.

II. MATHEMATICAL MODEL

Consider constant-flux infiltration into a porous medium (Fig. 1). The evolution of the system is characterized in terms of the water saturation $S \in [0,1]$—that is, the locally averaged fraction of the pore space occupied by water. It is assumed that the initial water saturation $S_0$ is uniform and that the infiltration rate $R_F$ is uniformly distributed and constant in time. The $x$-spatial coordinate points downwards, in the direction of gravity (acceleration $g$). The water density and dynamic viscosity are $\rho$ and $\mu$. The relevant macroscopic parameters concerning the porous medium are its intrinsic permeability $k$ and its porosity $\phi$. The permeability of the medium is often expressed as a saturated hydraulic conductivity $K_s = k \phi g / \mu$, which equals the gravity-driven flux under full saturation. Hence, the infiltration rate $R_F$ may be expressed as a flux ratio $R_F = k \phi g / K_s$, with $R_F \in [0,1]$. When this idealized flow scenario is simulated experimentally, the stability of the wetting front seems to be controlled by the flux ratio, initial saturation, and material nonlinearities [36]. A saturation overshoot is observed at the tip of the fingers, which grow as traveling waves, advancing with constant velocity [54]. The formation of fingers appears as a winners-takes-all process, by which the fastest-growing fingers in the initial unstable front channelize most of the infiltrating fluid and inhibit the growth of other incipient fingers [5,54]. The initial moisture content plays a critical role in the fingering instability: even relatively low saturations lead to a compact, downward-moving wetting front [55]. Stable fronts are also observed in dry media when the infiltration rate is either very small or approaches the saturated conductivity. In general, larger infiltration rates produce faster, thicker fingers [5].

A. Phase-field model of unsaturated flow

Water mass conservation leads to an evolution equation for the water saturation $S$:

$$\frac{\partial (\rho dS)}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot J = 0,$$

where $J$ is the water mass flux. We adopt a gradient flow formulation (see, e.g., [47]),

$$J = - \rho k \nabla \Phi,$$

where $\lambda$ is the water mobility and $\Phi$ is the flow potential. The water mobility includes the effect of reduced permeability to water due to partial saturation and takes the form

$$\lambda = \frac{k}{\mu},$$

where $k_r$ is the relative permeability to water—an increasing and typically convex function of water saturation [12,56].

Under unsaturated conditions (water saturation strictly less than 1), it is well justified to make two assumptions [56,57]. First, air is infinitely mobile compared to water and,
as a result, the air pressure remains constant and equal to atmospheric pressure. The water pressure is then equal to the negative suction (or capillary pressure):

\[ P_{\text{water}} = \frac{P_{\text{air}} - P_0(S)}{\rho} \]

(4)

The capillary pressure is a monotonically decreasing but nonconvex function of water saturation [56]. The second assumption is that the compressibility of water and rock are negligible compared to that of air and, therefore, the water density \( \rho \) and the porosity \( \phi \) are constant.

Under these conditions, we write the free energy per unit volume of the system as

\[ \mathcal{E} = \mathcal{E}_{\text{gr}} + \mathcal{E}_{\text{cap}} + \mathcal{E}_{\text{nl}} = -\rho g S x + \Psi(S) + \frac{1}{2} \Gamma |\nabla S|^2, \]

(5)

which comprises the gravitational (\( \mathcal{E}_{\text{gr}} \)) and capillary pressure (\( \mathcal{E}_{\text{cap}} \)) energy potentials, as well as a nonlocal energy potential (\( \mathcal{E}_{\text{nl}} \)). The capillary pressure function is derived from the capillary potential:

\[ P_0(S) = -\frac{d\Psi}{dS}. \]

(6)

The nonlocal term models the extra energetic cost associated with the displacement of water-air interfaces in areas of large saturation gradients. The coefficient \( \Gamma \) plays the role of an apparent surface tension associated with the wetting front [23, 24, 42].

The flow potential \( \Phi \) is the variational derivative of the free energy:

\[ \Phi = \frac{\partial \mathcal{E}}{\partial S} = \frac{\partial \mathcal{E}}{dS} - \nabla \cdot \left( \frac{\partial \mathcal{E}}{\partial \nabla S} \right) = -\rho g x - P_0(S) - \Gamma \Delta S. \]

(7)

Combining Eqs. (1), (2), and (7) and the unsaturated flow assumptions of constant water density and porosity, we arrive at the proposed model equation

\[ \frac{\partial S}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot \left[ k \frac{\rho g}{\mu} k_r(S) \left( \nabla x + \frac{1}{\rho g} \nabla P_0(S) + \frac{\Gamma}{\rho g} \nabla (\Delta S) \right) \right] = 0. \]

(8)

Our model is similar to that describing the flow of thin films [42, 43] and to phase-field models of epitaxial growth of surfaces and binary transitions [40, 47]. The traditional Richards’ equation can be recovered by neglecting the nonlocal energy term in Eq. (8).

B. Nondimensional form of the equations

We nondimensionalize the model by selecting an arbitrary length scale \( L \) and a characteristic time \( T = \phi L^2/(\rho g k) = \phi L^2 / K_r \). The capillary pressure is expressed as

\[ P_0(S) = \rho g h_{\text{cap}} J(S), \]

(9)

where \( J(S) \) is a dimensionless capillary pressure function and \( h_{\text{cap}} \) is the capillary rise, whose dependence on the system parameters is given by the Leverett scaling [58]:

\[ h_{\text{cap}} \sim \frac{\gamma \cos \theta}{\rho g k}, \]

(10)

where \( \gamma \) is the surface tension between the fluids and \( \theta \) is the contact angle between the air-water interface and the solid surface [59].

We define the following two nondimensional groups:

\[ N_{\text{gr}} = \frac{L}{h_{\text{cap}}} \quad \text{(gravity number),} \]

(11)

\[ N_{\text{nl}} = \frac{\Gamma}{\rho g L^3} \quad \text{(nonlocal number).} \]

(12)

With these definitions and understanding the space and time coordinates \( (x, t) \) as their dimensionless counterparts, the model reads

\[ \frac{\partial u}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot \left[ k_r(u)[\nabla x + N_{\text{gr}}^2 \nabla J(u) + N_{\text{nl}} \nabla (\Delta u)] \right] = 0, \]

(13)

where we have used \( u = S \) to emphasize that the problem is expressed in nondimensional form. The functional forms of the relative permeability and capillary pressure constitutive relations are chosen to fit experimental data from quasistatic experiments. In the following, we adopt the van Genuchten-Mualem model [60, 61]:

\[ k_r(u) = \sqrt{u[1 - (1 - u^{1/n})^m]^2}, \]

(14)

\[ J(u) = (u^{1/m} - 1)^{1/n}, \]

(15)

where \( m = 1 - 1/n \). This model introduces the material parameter \( n \), which depends on how well sorted the porous medium is [61]. These functions are plotted in Fig. 2 for different values of \( n \).

III. BASE SOLUTIONS AND PARAMETER DEPENDENCE

A. Traveling wave solutions

The basic states for the stability analysis of constant-flux infiltration are traveling wave solutions to (13) of the form

\[ u(x, y, z, t) = u(x) = u(x - ct), \]

(16)

whose mere existence we conjecture, subject to the conditions at infinity:
The wave speed \( c \) is given by
\[
    c = \frac{k_s(u^-) - k_s(u^+)}{u^- - u^+}.
\]
(18)

Let us assume that all the derivatives of the traveling waves vanish as \( \xi \to \pm \infty \). With gravity acting along the x axis, the traveling wave solutions satisfy the ordinary differential equation (ODE)
\[
    -c \frac{du}{d\xi} + \left( k_s(u) + N_{nl}^{-1} k_s(u) J' \frac{du}{d\xi} + N_{nl} j_s(u) \frac{d^3 u}{d\xi^3} \right) = 0.
\]
(19)

Integrating once and imposing the necessary conditions at infinity, we arrive at
\[
    -c(u - u^-) + k_s(u^-) - k_s(u^+) + N_{nl}^{-1} k_s(u) J' \frac{du}{d\xi} + N_{nl} j_s(u) \frac{d^3 u}{d\xi^3} = 0,
\]
(20)

with boundary conditions
\[
    u|_{\xi \to \pm \infty} = u^- , \quad u|_{\xi \to \pm \infty} = u^+ , \quad \frac{du}{d\xi} \bigg|_{\xi \to \pm \infty} = 0.
\]
(21)

In practical applications, the asymptotic left state \( u^- \) is expressed as a flux ratio \( R_s = k_s(u^-) \) and the asymptotic right state \( u^+ \) denotes an initial water saturation of the porous medium, \( S_0 \). The nonlinear boundary-value problem (20) and (21) may be solved numerically on a suitably large domain, to obtain the 1D profiles of the base states for our stability analysis, \( u_0 \). In the present study the numerical algorithm is a rational pseudospectral method with adaptively transformed Chebyshev nodes [62,63].

B. Sample traveling wave solutions and parameter dependence

The traveling wave solutions satisfying (20) and (21) represent water saturation profiles of compact infiltration fronts. Their most salient feature is a pronounced, low-frequency overshoot upstream of the wetting front and a smaller undershoot immediately downstream. This saturation overshoot has been consistently found in experimental observations [3,30] and is believed to play a critical role in the onset of fingering instabilities. Figure 3 shows a typical traveling wave, computed using \( N_{nl} = 1, N_{gr} = 0.1, u^- = 0.6, u^+ = 0.001 \), and \( n = 10 \). The small undershoot downstream of the wetting front poses a challenge from the numerical perspective of the stability analysis, since capturing this subtle feature is essential to determine the spectral properties of the linearized operator.

As \( N_{nl} \) is increased, the characteristic length scale of the overshoot also increases, accompanied by an asymptotically vanishing growth of the maximum saturation at the tip [Fig. 4(a)]. The height-to-width ratio of the bump correlates with the stability properties of the infiltration front.

The initial water saturation \( u^+ \) has been identified as a critical parameter for the onset and suppression of the fingering instability, as even small initial water contents lead to compact infiltration fronts. From the perspective of the traveling waves, the size of the overshoot reduces drastically as the initial saturation is increased, as depicted in Fig. 4(b).

The amount of capillary diffusion also affects the stability of the wetting front. Accordingly, higher values of \( N_{gr} = 1 \) lead to less pronounced overshoots [Fig. 4(c)]. Finally, the infiltrating flux ratio \( R_s \), measured here in terms of the corresponding asymptotic left state of the water saturation \( u^- \), \( R_s = k_s(u^-) \), also has a strong influence on the saturation overshoot near the wetting front. More specifically, the overshoot vanishes as \( R_s \to 0 \) [Fig. 4(d)]. Intense saturation at the front

Fig. 4. (a) Influence of \( N_{nl} \) on the traveling waves. The other parameters are fixed: \( N_{gr} = 0.1, u^- = 0.6, u^+ = 0.001 \), and \( n = 10 \). (b) Influence of the initial water saturation \( u^+ \) on the traveling waves. The other parameters are fixed: \( N_{nl} = 1, N_{gr} = 0.1, u^- = 0.6 \), and \( n = 10 \). (c) Influence of the gravity number \( N_{gr} \) on the traveling waves. The other parameters are fixed: \( N_{nl} = 1, u^- = 0.6, u^+ = 0.001 \), and \( n = 10 \). (d) Influence of the flux ratio \( R_s = k_s(u^-) \) on the traveling waves. The other parameters are fixed: \( N_{nl} = 1, N_{gr} = 1, n = 10, \) and \( u^+ = 0.001 \).
The above expressions can be rearranged as

\[ T_1 = N_{g,r}^{-1} \left[ g \left( \frac{d}{dx} \left( k_r J' \frac{du_0}{dx} + k'_r J' \frac{du_0}{dx} \right) \right) + \left( \frac{d}{dx} (k_r J') + k_r J' \frac{du_0}{dx} + k'_r J' \frac{du_0}{dx} \right) \frac{\partial g}{\partial x} + k_r J' \Delta g \right] \]

(27)

and

\[ T_2 = N_{n_l} \left[ g \left( \frac{d}{dx} \left( k_r J' \frac{du_0}{dx} + k'_r J' \frac{du_0}{dx} \right) \right) + \left( \frac{d}{dx} (k_r J') + k_r J' \frac{du_0}{dx} + k'_r J' \frac{du_0}{dx} \right) \frac{\partial g}{\partial x} + k_r J' \frac{\partial^2 G}{\partial x^2} + 2 \frac{\partial^2 G}{\partial x \partial y^2} \right] \]

(28)

Within the aforementioned reference frame and transforming to Fourier space in the \( y \) direction, the evolution equation for the \( y \)-transformed perturbation \( G(x, \omega, t) \) is given by

\[ \frac{\partial G}{\partial t} + G \frac{d k_r'}{dx} \frac{\partial G}{\partial x} + \frac{\partial G}{\partial x} (k_r' - c) + \hat{T}_1 + \hat{T}_2 = 0, \]

(29)

where

\[ \hat{T}_1 = N_{g,r}^{-1} \left[ \frac{d}{dx} \left( k_r J' \frac{du_0}{dx} + k'_r J' \frac{du_0}{dx} \right) \right. \]

\[ + \left. \left( \frac{d}{dx} (k_r J') + k_r J' \frac{du_0}{dx} + k'_r J' \frac{du_0}{dx} \right) \frac{\partial g}{\partial x} + k_r J' \frac{\partial^2 G}{\partial x^2} \right] \]

(30)

and

\[ \hat{T}_2 = N_{n_l} \left[ \frac{d}{dx} \left( k_r J' \frac{du_0}{dx} + k'_r J' \frac{du_0}{dx} \right) \right. \]

\[ + \left. \left( \frac{d}{dx} (k_r J') + k_r J' \frac{du_0}{dx} + k'_r J' \frac{du_0}{dx} \right) \frac{\partial g}{\partial x} + k_r J' \frac{\partial^2 G}{\partial x^2} - \omega^2 k_r J' G \right) \]

(31)

Rearranging (29), we finally arrive at the linear evolution problem

\[ \frac{\partial G}{\partial t} + A_1 \frac{\partial^2 G}{\partial x^2} + A_2 \frac{\partial^2 G}{\partial x^2} + A_3 \frac{\partial^2 G}{\partial x^2} + A_4 \frac{\partial G}{\partial x} + A_5 G = 0, \]

(32)

where

\[ A_0 = \frac{d}{dx} \left[ k_r J' + N_{g,r}^{-1} \left( k_r J' \frac{du_0}{dx} + k'_r J' \frac{du_0}{dx} \right) + N_{n_l} k_r J' \frac{du_0}{dx} \right] \]

\[- N_{g,r}^{-1} \omega^2 k_r J' + N_{n_l} \omega^2 k_r, \]

(33)
\[ A_1 = (k'_r - c) + N_a^{-1} \left( \frac{d}{dx}(k_r J'_r) + k_r J'_r \frac{d^2 u_0}{dx^2} + k'_r J_r \frac{d u_0}{dx} \right) + N_a \left( k'_r \frac{d^3 u_0}{dx^3} - \omega^2 \frac{dk_r}{dx} \right). \]  
\[ A_2 = N_a^{-1} k_r J'_r - 2N_a \omega^2 k_r, \]  
\[ A_3 = N_a \frac{d k_r}{dx}, \]  
\[ A_4 = N_a k_r. \]  

B. Discretization: Asymptotic and transient growth

1. Discrete operators

The properties of the linear operator in Eq. (32) determine the evolution of infinitesimal perturbations of the base traveling wave solutions \( u_0 \). The evolution equation (32) can be discretized in the coordinate direction \( x \) and their entries result from the evaluation of the perturbation can be compactly written as

\[ G(x, \alpha, 0) = G_0(x, \alpha) - \text{i} \epsilon \rho \mathbf{G}(0). \]

Asymptotically, the behavior of the system is driven by the eigenvalues of \( \mathbf{M} \). More precisely,

\[ \lim_{t \to \infty} t^{-1} \ln \| \epsilon^\mathbf{M} \| = \alpha(\mathbf{M}). \]

In terms of transient growth, an eigenvalue (modal) analysis provides just a lower bound, as

\[ \sup_{(\epsilon, \mathbf{M})} \| \epsilon^\mathbf{M} \| \geq \alpha(\mathbf{M}) \epsilon \quad \forall \epsilon > 0. \]

The above inequality states that, even when \( \alpha(\mathbf{M}) \leq 0 \), in which case the system would be diagnosed as stable from a modal perspective, a nonmodal study may reveal intense transient growth if the \( \epsilon \)-pseudospectra contours protrude significantly into the right half of the complex plane.

V. MODAL AND NONMODAL STABILITY ANALYSIS: ONSET AND SUPPRESSION OF THE FINGERING INSTABILITY

A. Eigenvalues and asymptotic growth

We start with a classical modal stability analysis. Therefore the relevant parameter to be considered at this point is the spectral abscissa of the linear operator \( \mathbf{M} \). Under this perspective and for a perturbation with wave number \( \omega \), the dynamical system is said to be unstable if \( \alpha(\mathbf{M}(\omega)) > 0 \), which implies asymptotic exponential growth, and stable if \( \alpha(\mathbf{M}(\omega)) < 0 \), which dictates asymptotic exponential decay. This approach does not consider transient growth effects due to interactions between nonorthogonal eigenmodes.
the model parameters. As the gravity number is decreased ($N_{gr} \to 0$), the traveling waves are unstable for a smaller range of lower frequencies and with smaller associated growth factors [Fig. 6(c)]. This simply reflects the stabilizing effect of capillary diffusion. From the perspective of characterizing the incipient fingers, this can be interpreted as the formation of thicker, slower fingers as $N_{gr} \to 0$. Increases in $N_{al}$ over the range $N_{al} \in [0.01, 1]$ [Fig. 6(a)] show a similar trend, but now the damping of high frequencies is much more pronounced for large $N_{al}$, in accordance with the powerful dissipation properties of the fourth-order term. Consistent with experimental observations, the initial water saturation has a critical effect on the instability [Fig. 6(b)]. Also in agreement with experiments, smaller flux ratios [Fig. 6(d)] give rise to thinner, slower-moving fingers. Eventually, for a sufficiently small flux ratio, the instability is suppressed. The standard Richards' model is recovered in the limit $N_{al} \to 0$. This limit corresponds also with stability of the system, as illustrated in Fig. 7, and in accordance with numerous numerical and theoretical studies of Richards' equation [18–20].

**B. Pseudospectra and transient growth**

The nonnormality of the linearized operator $M$ in (42) can be illustrated with a simple example (Fig. 8). The model parameters are $N_{al}=10^{-3}$, $N_{gr}^{-1}=0.1$, $u^{-}=0.6$, $u^{+}=0.001$, and $n=10$. An eigenvalue analysis suggests conditional stability, with unstable modes in the range $\omega \in [0, 8.7]$ [Fig. 8(a)]. However, the norm of the propagator $\|\exp(t M)\|$ for $\omega = 5.4$ (nearly most unstable mode) and $\omega = 9$ (asymptotically stable) reveals that, even though the asymptotic behavior is in accordance with the eigenvalue predictions, there is considerable transient growth which is not predicted by the modal analysis. Notably, the transient growth associated to the “stable” mode $\omega = 9$ is similar to that of the nearly most unstable one [Fig. 8(b)]. The existence of intense transient

![Fig. 6](image-url)  

**FIG. 6.** Growth factor $\beta = \alpha(M(\omega))$, as a function of $\omega$. (a) Influence of the nonlocal number $N_{al}$. (b) Influence of the initial water saturation $u^{+}$. (c) Influence of the gravity number $N_{gr}$. (d) Influence of the flux ratio $R_s = k_i(u^{-})$. The default parameters are $N_{al}=0.01$, $N_{gr}^{-1}=0.1$, $u^{-}=0.6$, $u^{+}=0.001$, and $n=10$.

![Fig. 7](image-url)  

**FIG. 7.** Suppression of the instability in the limit $N_{al} \to 0$. The other parameters are $N_{gr}^{-1}=0.1$, $u^{-}=0.6$, $u^{+}=0.001$, and $n=10$.

![Fig. 8](image-url)  

**FIG. 8.** Non-normal behavior of the linearized operator and transient growth. The parameters are $N_{al}=10^{-3}$, $N_{gr}^{-1}=0.1$, $u^{-}=0.6$, $u^{+}=0.001$, and $n=10$. (a) Dispersion curve showing the growth factors associated to an asymptotically unstable mode ($\omega = 5.4$) and an asymptotically stable mode ($\omega = 9$). The transient growth of these asymptotically unstable and stable modes is nearly identical (b), which can be better understood considering their associated $\epsilon$-pseudospectra [(c) and (d), respectively]. In the pseudospectra we plot the eigenvalues (●), as well as the contours $\epsilon = 10^{-1}, 10^{-1.5}, \ldots, 10^{-8}$.
FIG. 9. (a) Influence of $N_{nl}$ on the transient growth of perturbations of the base state. The other parameters are fixed: $N_{gr} = 0.1$, $u^+ = 0.6$, $u^- = 0.001$, and $n = 10$. (d) Influence of the initial water saturation $u^*$ on the transient growth of perturbations of the base state. The other parameters are fixed: $N_{gr} = 0.01$, $N_{nl} = 0.1$, $u^+ = 0.6$, and $n = 10$. (c) Influence of the gravity number $N_{gr}$ on the transient growth of perturbations of the base state. The other parameters are fixed: $N_{nl} = 0.01$, $N_{gr} = 0.1$, $u^+ = 0.001$, and $n = 10$. (b) Influence of the flux ratio (expressed in terms of $u^*$) on the transient growth of perturbations of the base state. The other parameters are fixed: $N_{nl} = 0.01$, $N_{gr} = 0.1$, $u^+ = 0.001$, and $n = 10$.

growth may suggest that the conclusions derived from an asymptotic analysis of the linearized problem are somewhat misleading, as the powerful initial transients could invalidate the linearization about the basic solution.

This transient growth behavior of the propagator can be understood by looking at the pseudospectra of $\mathbf{M}(\omega)$ [Figs. 8(c) and 8(d)]. For $\omega = 5.4$ [Fig. 8(c)], both the largest eigenvalue and the $\epsilon$ contours protrude significantly into the right half of the complex plane, which explains both the transient and asymptotic growth. For $\omega = 9$ [Fig. 8(d)], while the largest eigenvalue has a negative real part, indicating asymptotic decay, the $\epsilon$ contours advance well into the positive half plane, indicating transient growth of the perturbations.

Figure 9 shows the transient growth behavior in terms of the system parameters. While the gravity number $N_{gr}$ and the nonlocal number $N_{nl}$ have a relatively modest influence on transient growth [Figs. 9(c) and 9(a), respectively], suggesting that capillary diffusion is less critical in the early stages of the perturbation growth, the initial water saturation [Fig. 9(b)] and applied flux ratio [Fig. 9(d)] seem to be fundamental parameters in the initial growth of perturbations. The approximate scaling with $(u^*)^{-1}$ is consistent with the stability of thin film flows [43]. Experimental measurements have stressed the central role of $u^+$ and $u^-$ in the fingering instability.

FIG. 10. Suppression of the instability as $N_{nl} \to 0$. (a) Evolution of $\|\exp(M(t))\|$ for different values of $N_{nl}$ (most unstable modes). e-pseudospectra for $N_{nl} = 10^{-6}$ (b), $N_{nl} = 10^{-5}$ (c), and $N_{nl} = 10^{-4}$ (d). In the pseudospectra we plot the eigenvalues (●) as well as the contours $\epsilon = 10^{-1} , 10^{-2}, \ldots , 10^{-5}$.

The return to normality of the operator is obtained when the macroscopic interface effects are neglected, $N_{nl} \to 0$, which corresponds to the traditional Richards’ equation (Fig. 10). As $N_{nl}$ is reduced, not only does the largest eigenvalue become smaller, and eventually negative, but also the nature of the linearized operator changes, from a typical non-normal pattern to a nearly normal behavior. Therefore, going back to the standard Richard equation implies asymptotic stability and negligible transient growth, which is consistent with recent theoretical analysis that remark the strong stability of the Richards’ model and its inability to capture fingering phenomena [13,18].

C. Optimal perturbations and eigenmodes

The disturbance at $t=0$ that elicits a final state at time $t$ with maximal growth can be determined within the linearized theory from the singular-value decomposition (SVD) of the propagator [52] according to $\exp(M(t)) = U \Sigma V^*$. The optimal initial disturbance is the first column of $V$, whereas the final evolved state is the first column of $U$. The amplification factor of the optimal disturbance is the first (maximum) singular value in $\Sigma$, in the sense that $\sigma_{\text{max}} = \|\exp(M(t))\|$. The normalized shape of the maximal evolved disturbance for late times is given by the eigenmode associated to eigenvalue that gives the spectral abscissa of $M$.

For the present study, we focus on the influence of the initial moisture content of the soil, $u^*$, on the shape of the optimal perturbations. Figure 11 depicts the normalized eigenmodes associated to increasing initial saturations—
The other parameters are $N_{G1}=1$, $N_{G2}=0.1$, $u^*=0.6$, and $n=10$. The results are again consistent with the fact that fingering is observed only in wetting fronts infiltrating into sufficiently dry media. The apparent wetting front acts as an amplifier (this effect has also been observed in contact lines [43]) and in such a way that for very low initial moisture contents even small perturbations ahead of the front are intensely amplified. For initially wet soils, on the other hand, the wetting front is destabilized only by significantly larger perturbations that extend over larger regions and grow more slowly, thus reducing the likelihood of fingered flow.

VI. Stability along $N_{nl}=N_{Gr}^{-3}$

In [41], we proposed to express the dimensionless group $N_{nl}$ in terms of the already considered system parameters,
thus avoiding the introduction of new independent parameters with respect to Richards’ equation. The introduction of the nonlocal (gradient) term in the energy potential raises the question about the definition of the dimensionless group $N_{nl}$, which is formally equivalent to an apparent surface tension at the wetting front. While it is legitimate to postulate its dependence on additional intrinsic properties of the system, the idea of a nonlocal interface is fundamentally a macroscopic construct, which should depend only on the already considered basic parameters. Dimensional analysis then leads to the scaling $N_{nl} \sim N_{gr}^{-3}$, and we propose the simple relation

$$N_{nl} = N_{gr}^{-3}. \quad (48)$$

As a consequence of Eq. (48), the gravity number $N_{gr}$ sets the intrinsic scale of the problem and the proposed model (13) contains a new term, but not a new independent parameter.

In terms of the stability of the system, the relevance of this choice becomes clear by looking at the wave number $N_{gr}$ leads to the scaling $N_{nl} \sim N_{gr}^{-3}$, which is consistent with the arbitrariness of the choice of reference length $L$. The specific location of this transition (not its slope) is determined by the system parameters $R_s$, $S_0$, and $n$. This critical region cannot be crossed when $N_{gr}$ moves along $N_{nl}=N_{gr}^{-3}$, and therefore changes in the gravity number do not induce regime transition. Under the scaling $N_{nl}=N_{gr}^{-3}$, $\omega_{\max}$ and $\beta_{\max}$ are linear functions of $N_{gr}$ (Fig. 14) and nonlinear functions of $S_0$, $R_s$, and $n$. In other words, the scale of the flow is determined by the gravity number and its nonlinear dynamics is controlled by the flux ratio, initial saturation, and constitutive relations. This linear dependence on $N_{gr}$ is illustrated in Fig. 14.

The nonlinear dependence of the scale-invariant frequencies and growth factors, $\omega_{\max}/N_{gr}$ [Fig. 13(c)] and $\beta_{\max}/N_{gr}$ [Fig. 13(d)], on the flux ratio, initial saturation, and material nonlinearity, is shown in Figs. 15–17, respectively. They are indicative of the early dynamics of the perturbed flow and the properties of the emerging fingers. The onset of preferential flow paths in the unstable wetting front is more intense for larger flux ratios and smaller initial saturations [Fig. 13(d)]. For very dry media the size of the incipient fingers decreases with the flux ratio. In general, however, for each value of the initial saturation there is a critical flux ratio beyond which smaller fluxes lead to larger finger sizes [Fig. 13(c)]. The growth factor and frequency of the most unstable mode decay exponentially as the initial saturation decreases again. This abrupt decay agrees with experimental observations, which have suggested the existence of critical values of $S_0$ for the suppression of the instability [55].

VII. DISCUSSION

We have proposed a phase-field model of unsaturated flow in porous media. The fundamental phenomenological characteristics of the fingering instability in gravity-driven unsaturated infiltrating flow in homogeneous porous media can be understood and quantified from a linear stability analysis of the model. We draw two general conclusions from our analysis.

(i) The instability is an intrinsic feature of the infiltrating wetting front. The fingering instability will develop, for suitable points in the parameter space, even for infinitesimal perturbations of a steady-state base flow within a homogeneous porous medium.

(ii) The instability is an intrinsic feature of unsaturated flow. Thus, it is arbitrary to assume that the wetting front has to be fully saturated in order to develop instabilities. Transient growth is fundamental in the onset of the fingering instability. In this sense, transient growth can only be relevant if small perturbations are amplified up to levels $O(1)$ within a short period of time. The maximum transient amplification depends strongly on the initial saturation of the porous medium $u^*$ and the applied flux ratio $R_s=R_s(u^*)$ and somewhat weakly on mild variations of other parameters like...
the gravity number $N_{Gr}$ and the nonlocal number $N_{nl}$. This is in accordance with strong experimental evidence pointing towards the critical role of the initial saturation and flux ratio on the observed saturation overshoot and finger development. As the initial saturation increases, the amount of transient growth is reduced in such a way that only large perturbations can achieve significant amplification. Under these conditions, capillary diffusion will effectively damp perturbations, suppressing the onset of the instability. As a consequence, even relatively small initial saturations are likely to prevent the appearance of fingers for realistic values of the gravity number $N_{Gr}$.

Transient growth occurs within a short period of time, which precedes the transition to the asymptotic growth behavior, governed by the eigenvalues of the linearized system. Therefore, and in spite of possible nonlinear effects due to the interaction of nonorthogonal modes during the transient growth, is

\[ \beta_{max} \text{ and } \omega_{max} \text{ with the gravity number } N_{Gr}. \]

\[ \text{(a) Dispersive curves, plotting growth factor } \beta / N_{Gr} \text{ versus frequency of the perturbations } \omega / N_{Gr}. \text{ (b) Transient growth of asymptotically unstable perturbations.} \]

\[ \beta_{max} \text{ and } \omega_{max} \text{ with the gravity number } N_{Gr}. \]

\[ \text{(c) Initial saturation } \mu^*. \]

\[ \text{(d) and (f) Flux ratio } R_{e} = k_{u}(\mu^*). \]

\[ \text{(e) Initial saturation } \mu^*. \]

\[ \text{(f) Flux ratio } R_{e} = k_{u}(\mu^*). \]

\[ \text{(g) Initial saturation } \mu^*. \]

\[ \text{(h) Flux ratio } R_{e} = k_{u}(\mu^*). \]

\[ \text{(i) Initial saturation } \mu^*. \]

\[ \text{(j) Flux ratio } R_{e} = k_{u}(\mu^*). \]

\[ \text{(k) Initial saturation } \mu^*. \]

\[ \text{(l) Flux ratio } R_{e} = k_{u}(\mu^*). \]

\[ \text{(m) Initial saturation } \mu^*. \]

\[ \text{(n) Flux ratio } R_{e} = k_{u}(\mu^*). \]

\[ \text{(o) Initial saturation } \mu^*. \]

\[ \text{(p) Flux ratio } R_{e} = k_{u}(\mu^*). \]

\[ \text{(q) Initial saturation } \mu^*. \]

\[ \text{(r) Flux ratio } R_{e} = k_{u}(\mu^*). \]

\[ \text{(s) Initial saturation } \mu^*. \]

\[ \text{(t) Flux ratio } R_{e} = k_{u}(\mu^*). \]

\[ \text{(u) Initial saturation } \mu^*. \]

\[ \text{(v) Flux ratio } R_{e} = k_{u}(\mu^*). \]
growth, the modal analysis seems to be adequate to predict the most relevant features of the late-time fingering phenomenon. This conclusion is also reinforced by the phenomenological fact that, for homogeneous, initially dry media, the instability of the wetting front adopts the form of persistent and distinctive patterns (fingers), whose width and tip velocity can be correlated to basic experimental parameters, notably the flux ratio, nonlinearity of the material, and initial moisture content. Using dimensional analysis, these correlations can be predicted through the analysis of the wavelength and growth factor of the most unstable mode for each particular point in parameter space. The predictions agree with experimental observations [41].

The key ingredient of the proposed model is the introduction of a nonlinear fourth-order term, which is formally the flux ratio, nonlinearity of the material, and initial moisture content. Using dimensional analysis, these correlations can be predicted through the analysis of the wavelength and growth factor of the most unstable mode for each particular point in parameter space. The predictions agree with experimental observations [41].

The introduction of this term constitutes a departure from the classical Richards’ equation. In addition to modeling physical mechanisms that are missing in the classical model and from a mathematical perspective, the new term in the proposed model introduces a new mechanism in the dynamics of the system: a significant degree of non-normality. Thus, in addition to the mere existence of asymptotically unstable modes, the transient growth of perturbations can be very intense depending on the parameter values and, in particular, for very dry media. We believe that this transient growth is the fundamental element to explain the appearance of fingers in practice, while a modal analysis can be used to quantitatively predict some long-time features of the developed patterns, such as finger width and finger tip velocity [41].

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We gratefully acknowledge funding for this research, provided by Eni under the Multiscale Reservoir Science project, and by the ARCO Chair in Energy Studies.