Metadata-driven comparative analysis tool for sequences (meta-CATS): An automated process for identifying significant sequence variations that correlate with virus attributes.

Metadata-driven comparative analysis tool for sequences (meta-CATS): An automated process for identifying significant sequence variations that correlate with virus attributes


a J. Craig Venter Institute, 10335 Science Center Drive, San Diego, CA 92121, USA
b Department of Pathology, University of Texas Southwestern Medical Center, 5323 Harry Hines Boulevard, Dallas, TX 75290-9072, USA
c Department of Statistical Science, Southern Methodist University, 6425 Boaz Lane, Dallas, TX 75205, USA
d Northrop Grumman Health Solutions, 2101 Gaither Road, Rockville, MD 20850, USA
e Vecna Technologies, 6404 Ivy Lane Suite 500, Greenbelt, MD 20770, USA
f Institute for Medical Engineering and Science, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, MIT Building E24-406, 77 Massachusetts Avenue, Cambridge, MA 02139, USA

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:
Received 20 June 2013
Returned to author for revisions 18 July 2013
Accepted 19 August 2013
Available online 14 September 2013

Keywords:
Dengue
DENV
Bioinformatics
Virology
Comparative genomics
Statistical comparison
Virus
Database

ABSTRACT

The Virus Pathogen Resource (ViPR; www.viprbrc.org) and Influenza Research Database (IRD; www.fludb.org) have developed a metadata-driven Comparative Analysis Tool for Sequences (meta-CATS), which performs statistical comparative analyses of nucleotide and amino acid sequence data to identify correlations between sequence variations and virus attributes (metadata). Meta-CATS guides users through: selecting a set of nucleotide or protein sequences; dividing them into multiple groups based on any associated metadata attribute (e.g. isolation location, host species); performing a statistical test at each aligned position; and identifying all residues that significantly differ between the groups. As proofs of concept, we have used meta-CATS to identify sequence biomarkers associated with dengue viruses isolated from different hemispheres, and to identify variations in the NS1 protein that are unique to each of the 4 dengue serotypes. Meta-CATS is made freely available to virology researchers to identify genotype-phenotype correlations for development of improved vaccines, diagnostics, and therapeutics.

© 2013 Elsevier Inc. All rights reserved.

Introduction

The symbiotic relationship between traditional wet-bench research and bioinformatics is being fueled by a large amount of available sequence data and the need to analyze and interpret such a wealth of information. To aid in the analysis of this data deluge, it is imperative that standardized annotations describing the characteristics of the isolated strains (metadata) are recorded, reported and associated with the corresponding sequence record. For example, interrogations into the emergence and seasonality of new infectious disease outbreaks can be conducted only if metadata describing the time and place of isolation is available (Bloomberg et al., 2013; Patel et al., 2013); identification of sequence substitutions that correlate with host specificity requires pathogen species information (Shi and Hu, 2008); and investigations of sequence biomarkers that contribute to pathogen virulence and drug resistance can only be performed if the host’s health status and medical history are available (Ansari et al., 2013; Kaminski et al., 2013; Schvoerer et al., 2013). Access to additional metadata will lead to increased data exploration and hypothesis generation that can then be subjected to ‘wet lab’ experiments to validate the observations, biochemically identify the mechanism of actions and...

Available online 14 September 2013

Article info

E-mail addresses: bpickett@jcvi.org (B.E. Pickett), mengyasmsou@gmail.com (M. Liu), eva.sadan@yahoo.com (E.L. Sadat), richard.squires@nih.gov (R.B. Squires), jyothi.noronha@gmail.com (J.M. Noronha), tanguxe.he@ngc.com (S. He), wenzhe@ngc.com (W. Jen), Sam.Zaremba@ngc.com (S. Zaremba), zhiping.gu@ngc.com (Z. Gu), Liwei.Zhou@ngc.com (L. Zhou), clarsen@vecna.com (C.N. Larsen), ibosch@mit.edu (I. Bosch), lgehrke@mit.edu (L. Gehrke), mmgee@smu.edu (M. McGee), EdKlem@ngc.com (E.B. Klem), rscheuermann@jcvi.org (R.H. Scheuermann).

1 Brookhaven College, 3939 Valley View Ln, Farmers Branch, TX 75244, USA
2 Bioinformatics and Computational Biosciences Branch, National Institute of Allergy and Infectious Diseases, National Institutes of Health, 31 Center Drive, Room 3JB2E, Bethesda, MD 20892, USA
3 Canara Bank Colony, Nagarabhavi Rd, Bangalore, India 560 072

CrossMark
augment the existing existing base of the systems being studied.

To anticipate the magnitude of data produced by modern experimentation, the National Institute of Allergy and Infectious Diseases (NIAID) currently supports five Bioinformatics Resource Centers (BRC) for Infectious Diseases, each of which is charged with storing and integrating various types of data about human pathogens and disease vectors from multiple resources, and providing them to the research communities in intuitive ways. The Virus Pathogen Database and Analysis Resource (ViPR, www.viprbrc.org) contains information for viruses categorized as either select agents or as public health threats belonging to the Areviridae, Bunyaviridae, Caliciviridae, Coronaviridae, Flaviviridae, Filoviridae, Hepenidae, Herpesviridae, Paramyxoviridae, Picornaviridae, Reoviridae, Rhabdoviridae, and Togaviridae families (Pickett et al., 2012). Similarly, the Influenza Research Database (IRD, www.fludb.org) contains information relating specifically to influenza viruses (Squires et al., 2012). The data, together with the integrated analytical and visualization tools are made freely available to the scientific community to support both hypothesis generation and data mining to enable the research and development of diagnostics, prophylactics, vaccines and therapeutics against the supported viruses.

Dengue virus (DENV), a member of the Flaviviridae family, has emerged as a significant public health threat. DENV is transmitted among humans by the Aedes aegypti mosquito vector (Vasilakis and Weaver, 2008), and is responsible for approximately 50–100 million human infections every year (Weaver and Vasilakis, 2009). DENV is now endemic in more than 100 tropical and subtropical countries, putting more than 1/3 of the world population at risk of infection with disease incidence and severity increasing over the past few decades. There are currently 4 antigenically distinct serotypes of DENV, with each serotype further subdivided into multiple genotypes. Although multiple serotypes and genotypes can co-circulate in the same geographic area, introduction of a new serotype or genotype into an immunologically ‘naïve’ area can result in a new disease outbreak, accompanied by the establishment of a new genetic lineage with limited sequence diversity, termed a ‘founder effect’ (Allicock et al., 2012; Lee et al., 2010). In contrast to viruses like influenza that are capable of direct human-to-human transmission, the introduction of new DENV lineages in geographically dispersed regions would be expected to be relatively rare due to the vector transmission requirement.

In order to quickly and reliably identify viral sequence variations that are associated with differences in virus or host attributes, we developed the metadata-driven Comparative Analysis Tool for Sequences (meta-CATS), which segregates genomic or protein sequences into groups based on associated metadata, performs a multiple sequence alignment of all sequences (if they are not already aligned), and then calculates a chi-squared statistic for each aligned position to identify amino acids or nucleotides that significantly differ between the defined sequence groups. Here we report the application of the meta-CATS pipeline to identify statistically significant sequence biomarkers of distinct DENV geographic lineages and serotypes.

Methods

Meta-CATS method

The underlying statistical algorithm for the meta-CATS method was written in the R programming language (R Development Core Team, 2010) and consists of: (1) identifying and segregating the sequence records of interest based on the associated metadata annotations through the search interface available in ViPR or IRD; (2) performing a multiple sequence alignment (if necessary) using the Multiple Sequence Comparison by Log-Expectation (MUSCLE) and UCLUST algorithms (Edgar, 2004, 2010); (3) performing the chi-square test of independence and Pearson’s chi-square test in tandem to calculate a p-value; (4) displaying the results for the positions identified as statistically significant in a webpage; (5) permitting additional validation and orthogonal analyses using the suite of additional analysis tools integrated into the ViPR and IRD systems.

To facilitate ease-of-use for all researchers employing this statistical workflow, we designed the meta-CATS analytical pipeline to be fully automated following the segregation of the sequence records. The tabular report that is generated from a meta-CATS analysis allows fast browsing of the results according to aligned position, chi-square value, degrees of freedom, and residue diversity between groups. When protein sequences are being analyzed, links to the characterized biological function (s) that overlap with the significant residue(s) are also displayed in the results table in taxa where sequence features have been defined (Noronha et al., 2012).

Sequence data

The sequence data, together with the associated metadata, used throughout this study were obtained from the NIAID Virus Pathogen Database and Analysis Resource system (ViPR, www.viprbrc.org). The ViPR system parses GenBank records to capture sequence data and extract semi-structured metadata available in the structured comments fields. These metadata are then translated and parsed into structured database tables in the ViPR database and associated with the extracted sequence data. Searches involving host species, country of origin, virus type, year of isolation, sample source, clinical diagnosis and other criteria can then be used to retrieve and group relevant sequences for subsequent analysis with the meta-CATS analytical tool.

DENV sequence sets examined in the current study include: (1) 364 total polyprotein amino acid sequences comprised of 267 strains from the Western hemisphere and 97 strains from the Eastern hemisphere isolated between 2001 and 2010 (Supplementary Table 1) and (2) all ViPR-annotated NS1 amino acid sequences available as of January 2012. Upon further examination, groups of sequences that were 100% identical across the region being analyzed in the latter dataset were identified. All but one representative strain from each of these groups were removed from the original dataset to reduce statistical bias due to phylogenetic relatedness and over-sampling. After this process, 700 strains remained for analysis (259 DENV1, 238 DENV 2, 163 DENV 3 and 40 DENV 4) (Supplementary Table 2). In addition to the automated meta-CATS pipeline, manual edits and exploration of the multiple sequence alignment as well as verification of the reported sequence variations were performed using the ViPR implementation of Jalview (Waterhouse et al., 2009). The Immune Epitope Database (IEDB) was used to determine all regions that correspond to a curated immune epitope record (Kim et al., 2012).

Results

We set out to develop a universally applicable, freely available, automated tool that could be used to identify residues that have significant variation between groups of nucleotide or amino acid sequences. Meta-CATS fulfills this goal through an easy-to-navigate web-based user interface in both ViPR and IRD. The process begins by taking sequence input either from: (1) a database query, (2) existing working sets of sequences, (3) an uploaded file containing custom sequences, or a combination of these options. After selecting the desired sequences the user either divides them into 2 to 5 groups
sequences assigned to only two groups will be identical with the sequence variation observed for each group at that position, in a groups since positions found to have significant variation between group assignment and the nucleotide or amino acid pairs. If gaps are present at a particular position in the alignment, then it is counted as a "5th" base in the calculations. If the input sequences are at the amino acid level, then only the residues that are observed across all sequences at that position are taken into account to determine the correct degrees of freedom for the analysis—due to the additional biological constraints that exist at the protein level. At each position where the null hypothesis is rejected (i.e. there exists statistical evidence of the dependence of the group assignment on the nucleotide or amino acid residue at that position) the data are subsequently subjected to a pairwise chi-square calculation to determine which pairs of user-defined groups contribute to the statistically significant result. In this second step, the null hypothesis being tested is that no relationship exists between group assignment and the nucleotide or amino acid residue composition at each position. Logically, the second chi-square calculation is helpful only if sequences are assigned to three or more groups since positions found to have significant variation between sequences assigned to only two groups will be identical with the results from the chi-square test of independence. In the case where three or more groups are included in the analysis, a significant result from the pairwise Pearson's chi-square test suggests that the group assignments and sequence composition are dependent. The results from the various statistical tests are then summarized, together with the sequence variation observed for each group at that position, in a tabular form within a webpage and are made available for download in comma-separated value (csv) format (Fig. 1).

Once meta-CATS development was completed, we validated the automated pipeline by using a dataset comprised of Hepatitis C virus sequences that had been subjected to a similar statistical analysis after being divided into two groups based on phylogenetic topology (Pickett et al., 2010). Meta-CATS identified the same nucleotide positions as those that were published from the original analysis. Genotypic differences in DENV-3 genomes isolated from different hemispheres

Phylogenetic analysis of DENV sequences derived from strains isolated from around the world has provided evidence that a combination of founder effect and geographic barriers have contributed to the establishment of distinct DENV lineages (Araujo et al., 2009; Schmidt et al., 2011). We applied the meta-CATS pipeline to a dataset of DENV type 3 (DENV-3) sequences to determine if sequence-based biomarkers could be identified that could distinguish these geographic lineages. All available DENV-3 protein sequences in the ViPR database were assigned to either the Eastern hemisphere group or Western hemisphere group based on the geographical location of virus isolation metadata associated with the respective sequence records, and the sequence and group assignments submitted to the meta-CATS statistical tool.

The chi-squared analysis performed by meta-CATS identified 70 amino acid positions within the polyprotein which displayed statistically significant variation between isolates from both the Eastern and Western hemispheres (Supplementary Table 3, Fig. 2A). Bonferroni-adjusted probabilities from the chi-squared analysis for these positions ranged from $3.32 \times 10^{-75}$ to $4.20 \times 10^{-4}$ reflecting the tremendous variation in the composition of residues found in sequences isolated from both hemispheres (Bonferroni, 1936). When these amino acid positions were mapped back to the respective polyprotein cleavage products, at least one significant amino acid position was identified within each of the mature proteins, with the highest number of counts located in the NS5, E, and NS3 proteins (Fig. 2B). When normalized for length, the NS2B and NS4B proteins had the lowest number of observed sequence differences between viruses isolated from the two hemispheres. This suggests that functional constraints may limit the available amino acid substitutions in these two proteins (Fig. 2C). A majority of statistically significant positions (43 of 70) were also found to have positive log-odds scores from the BLOSUM62 matrix (Fig. 2D), indicating that the necessary physicochemical properties of each position are preserved. This result would be expected for lineage variants that are maintained over time (Henikoff and Henikoff, 1992).

While inspecting the group-specific amino acid composition in each aligned position, many were found to have incomplete residue segregation—particularly within the sequences isolated from the Eastern hemisphere. The multiple sequence alignment was examined to determine whether the same sequences were consistently responsible for the segregation anomaly across multiple columns. After examination, we identified two Eastern hemisphere isolates that possessed amino acid sequences characteristic of isolates from the Western hemisphere at the vast majority of the significantly different positions. The strains responsible for this effect are: GZ1D3 isolated from Guanzhoun, China in August 2009 (GenBank accession GU363549), and SGEHI(D3)0235Y07 isolated from Singapore in May 2007 (GenBank accession GU370053). When a phylogenetic tree was constructed, these isolates from the Eastern hemisphere were found in the same clade as the Western hemisphere isolates, although they form a distinct sub-clade that branches off earlier than the rest of the Western hemisphere sequences (Figure S3, Supplementary Fig. 1). This implies that the two sequences are closely related to the most recent common ancestor (MRCA) for extant sequences in the two hemispheres.

Such a pattern, in which “outlier” sequences lie between two well-defined clades in a phylogenetic tree, has been attributed to genomic recombination in some cases (Pickett and Lefkowitz, 2009; Wang et al., 2010). However, the fact that the relevant amino acid variations were distributed across the entire polyprotein suggests that it is unlikely that recombination would be the cause of the topological discordance for a Western Hemisphere genotype being isolated in the Eastern Hemisphere. Indeed, an in silico recombination analysis performed using the Recombination Detection Program 3 (RDP3) (Martin et al., 2010) provided no evidence for a recombination event (data not shown).

The most likely explanation is that these “outlier” sequences are due to one or more international transmission events that occurred from the transport of either an infected host or vector between hemispheres. Given that the GZ1D3 sequence was taken from a patient living in China who had no history of recent international travel, at least two possible explanations exist: (i) a separate lineage, which is an ancestor of “Western” strains, is co-circulating with extant “Eastern” viruses in Asia, or (ii) a virus from the Western hemisphere was transferred to the Eastern hemisphere more recently and subsequently infected the patient of origin.

Further, the amount of DENV-3 sequence data currently available from this region of the world is insufficient to determine: (i) whether these sequences are direct descendants of either the virus that was originally transferred or a more direct descendant of the MRCA, (ii) whether these sequences were isolated at a point in time close to the primary transmission event, or iii) what the ancestral virus sequence might have been.
Additional sequences will assist in determining which of these possibilities is most probable.

**NS1 amino acid residue variations correlating with DENV serotypes**

In a subsequent study, we used the meta-CATS pipeline to identify NS1 amino acid positions that significantly vary between all four DENV serotypes. The intent of this analysis was to identify serotype-specific NS1 peptides that could then be used to produce serotype-specific antibodies and reagents for use in a rapid clinical test. While determining the serotype responsible for a given infection will not directly affect patient treatment, subsequent infection by a different serotype can increase the risk of clinical severity, thus making it important to capture this information. In addition, multiple serotypes may be co-circulating in a given area, but only one of the serotypes will be the cause of an outbreak. Knowing the serotype in this case will support epidemiology studies and aid in tracking. The NS1 protein was selected as the target for this analysis because of its presence in the host serum, making rapid detection by early immunological tests possible. Such tests would be complementary to current and more expensive nucleic acid methodologies that require isolation of nucleic acid followed by enzymatic expansion of the viral genome using either PCR or a similar amplification method. The detection of genome copies in a clinical sample is a technically difficult process due to the

---

**Fig. 1. Screenshots of the meta-CATS tool.** This diagram shows how to navigate the workflow for a meta-CATS analysis in ViPR (or IRD). The user begins by searching for sequences by their associated metadata, selecting sequences to include in the analysis, specifying the number of groups and a probability cutoff value, assigning sequences to groups, and viewing the results.
instability of RNA genomes in whole blood or serum and storage of the sample using a cold chain until later analysis. In addition, sophisticated laboratory equipment and expertise in data interpretation are also currently required to distinguish the specific virus serotype in the infected individual.

Detection of NS1 using either immunological methods or aptamers that are both specific and sensitive to each serotype in a point-of-care setting could not only improve early detection of dengue fever but also contribute to better control measures of dengue epidemics. To perform this NS1 comparative analysis using the ViPR meta-CATS implementation, we first assigned 700 non-redundant NS1 protein sequences (259 serotype 1, 238 serotype 2, 163 serotype 3 and 40 serotype 4) to four separate groups, based on their serotype classification. Analysis of the results revealed 165 amino acid residues that were dependent on group assignment; however, only 19 of these residues had significant variation existing between all possible pairwise combinations of the 4 serotypes when the Pearson chi-squared test was applied (Table 1).

To determine if any of these positions were located in any known immune epitopes, we compared the list of 19 significant positions against information about experimentally determined immune epitopes characterized using various serotypes. Two of these significant positions, located at NS1 positions 124 and 128, were found within 2 separate curated B-cell epitope regions (IEDB ID 2246 and 13267) (Falconar, 2007). The remaining significant position is located within a MHC-binding epitope at NS1 position 191 (IEDB ID 29978) (Lund et al., 2011). Experimentation is currently underway to determine if peptides containing these residues can be used to develop serotype-specific reagents for serology-based diagnostics.

Discussion

In this work, we report the development of an online publicly available analysis pipeline called the metadata-driven Comparative Analysis Tool for Sequences (meta-CATS), hosted by the ViPR and IRD Bioinformatics Resource Centers, for use by the virus research community. Through the use of this tool, we have identified multiple positions located throughout the DENV-3 viral polyprotein that differ between viruses isolated in the Eastern and Western hemispheres. We also identified two sequences most likely representing at least one case of trans-continental transmission of dengue. We identified multiple positions in the DENV NS1 mature protein that significantly differ between the four virus serotypes, for potential use in the future development of a serotype-specific diagnostic tool or product.

Incorporating this web-based meta-CATS tool into a comparative genomics analytical workflow allows researchers to perform complex bioinformatics genotype–phenotype correlation analyses regardless of their training or background, and without the need to develop their own customized code. A few examples of metadata that could be used to segregate sequence groups include: clinical severity of disease, measures of anti-viral drug resistance, host source, tissue tropism, geospatial point of isolation, time of isolation, virus protein binding affinity, antibody avidity, association with an epidemic, phylogenetic clade assignment, other taxonomic assignments (subtype, serotype, genotype, genogroup), etc. We anticipate the virology research community will use tools such as meta-CATS with increased frequency as the amount of sequence data and metadata continues to increase.

Meta-CATS is a data exploration and hypothesis generation tool. However, as is the case with all statistical analyses, the results are highly dependent on the quality of the data that are used as
input. For this reason, we align the sequences used as input (if necessary) with the MUSCLE alignment algorithm as the default since it provides a balance between speed and accuracy with viral sequences. However, if a user pre-aligns the input sequences with a different alignment algorithm, then the chi-square statistical analysis will proceed directly without the alignment step. Additionally, it is extremely difficult for current statistical methods to account for all possible causes of sequence variations such as: co-variation, codon bias, taxonomic relationships, sampling bias, etc. while simultaneously ensuring that the underlying assumptions for the statistical test(s) are met. Consequently, users should not only educate themselves about any anomalies in the data to avoid statistical bias that could give rise to false-positive results, but they should also subject the results from any statistical analysis, including meta-CATS, to more in-depth orthogonal analyses and 'wet-lab' experimentation for validation.

The biological meaning of the statistical output from the meta-CATS pipeline will be dependent on at least two criteria: (1) the biological relevance of the defined groups, and (2) the sequence variation present between those groups. If insufficient sequence variation is present due either to sampling bias or viral biological constraints, the number of residues identified as divergent between the groups will be minimal or nonexistent. An increase in the number of sequences, and the relevant metadata, available in GenBank will improve the predictive ability of bioinformatics tools such as meta-CATS.

In this study, group assignments were used to assess the variation-between-hemispheres based strictly on geography. The observed scattering of DENV-3 positions that were identified as significantly different between hemispheres throughout the viral polyprotein is expected. This result could reflect a founder effect in which distinct viruses established independent lineages in each hemisphere, with many of their lineage-specific sequence differences maintained over time. However, our work also identified two sequences arising from at least one occurrence of transcontinental disease transmission between the Western and Eastern hemispheres, perhaps reflecting the ease and rapidity of long-distance travel that is currently possible. Since only two such sequences have been isolated to date, it is likely that this event happened in the not-too-distant past, when transportation of the infected host could have occurred, while viral titers were sufficiently high to continue the virus transmission cycle after arriving at the new location. As additional sequence data becomes available for this group of 'transplanted' viruses, the evolution of the virus in both hemispheres and its ability to compete with the original endemic lineage can be better understood.

The second scientific use case described in this work, which addresses divergence in the NS1 protein between serotypes, demonstrates the application of meta-CATS to a problem with direct clinical relevance. Combining meta-CATS with other publicly available data, including 3D protein structures and immune epitope information, has helped to further refine the results and identify regions potentially capable of producing serotype-specific NS1 antibodies for use in diagnostic assays. Thus as existing computational and bioinformatics analyses move to incorporate meta-CATS into their workflows, the amount of effort required for downstream validation of the predicted high confidence "hits" will be reduced.

The amalgam between biology, statistics, and computer science to perform bioinformatics analyses contributes to an ever-growing knowledge base for scientific research. The meta-CATS tool can assist researchers in performing metadata-driven comparative genomics statistical analyses on any virus sequences within the multiple viral taxa supported by ViPR and IRD. Although we chose to explore the more obvious genetic differences existing between DENV geographic clades and serologic types as a proof-of-concept, we expect that meta-CATS can also be applied to identify more subtle genotype-phenotype correlations. Indeed, one of the main advantages of meta-CATS is that it provides a finer degree of granularity (individual residues within a sequence) than that derived from traditional phylogenetic analysis alone (average across an entire sequence). Thus the results obtained from meta-CATS can be used to generate hypotheses and optimize candidate identification prior to applying such knowledge to the development of novel diagnostics, prophylactics, and therapeutics.

**Acknowledgments**

We thank the primary data providers for the sequence data that was used throughout this study, notably the Genome Resources in Dengue (GRID) consortium. We appreciate
discussions with Fuchun Zhang regarding the patient history behind the GZ1D3 strain. We acknowledge Dr. Alison Yao for expert oversight of the BRC program. ViPR is wholly supported with federal funds from the National Institute of Allergy and Infectious Diseases, National Institutes of Health, Department of Health and Human Services, under Contract no. HHSN27200900041C. The funding source had no involvement in the design, analysis, or interpretation of this work.

Appendix A. Supporting information

Supplementary data associated with this article can be found in the online version at http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.virol.2013.08.021.

References