

## MIT Open Access Articles

*The transfer of bomb radiocarbon and anthropogenic lead to the deep North Atlantic Ocean observed from a deep sea coral*

The MIT Faculty has made this article openly available. **Please share** how this access benefits you. Your story matters.

**Citation:** Lee, Jong-Mi et al. "The Transfer of Bomb Radiocarbon and Anthropogenic Lead to the Deep North Atlantic Ocean Observed from a Deep Sea Coral." *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* 458 (January 2017): 223–232 © 2016 Elsevier B.V.

**As Published:** <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2016.10.049>

**Publisher:** Elsevier

**Persistent URL:** <http://hdl.handle.net/1721.1/120471>

**Version:** Author's final manuscript: final author's manuscript post peer review, without publisher's formatting or copy editing

**Terms of use:** Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivs License



1 **The transfer of bomb radiocarbon and anthropogenic Pb to the deep North Atlantic Ocean**  
2 **observed from a deep sea coral**

3

4 Jong-Mi Lee<sup>1,2\*</sup>, Selene F. Eltgroth<sup>3</sup>, Edward A. Boyle<sup>1</sup>, Jess F. Adkins<sup>3</sup>

5

6

7 <sup>1</sup>Department of Earth, Atmospheric, and Planetary Sciences, Massachusetts Institute of  
8 Technology, Cambridge, Massachusetts, USA.

9 <sup>2</sup>Department of Ocean Sciences, University of California Santa Cruz, Santa Cruz, California,  
10 USA

11 <sup>3</sup>Division of Geological and Planetary Sciences, California Institute of Technology, Pasadena,  
12 California, USA

13

14

15

16

17 [Submitted to Earth and Planetary Science Letters, Aug. 1, 2016](#)

18 \*Corresponding author: 1156 High St, Santa Cruz, CA 95064, USA. Tel: +1 831 459 4789; Fax: +1 831  
19 459 4882; Email address: jm\_lee@ucsc.edu.

20 **Abstract**

21 Deep-ocean,  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$ , Pb concentrations, and Pb isotopes were reconstructed from a deep-  
22 sea coral *Enallopsammia rostrata* from 1410 meters depth off of Bermuda. Our high-resolution  
23 time series is created from closely spaced radial cross sections, with samples taken from the  
24 center of concentric coral growth bands that we show to be oldest portion of the section.  
25 Prebomb radiocarbon ages from the coral demonstrate that the vertical growth rate of the coral is  
26 linear, and the age of the coral is estimated to be 560-630 years old based on the growth rate.  
27 Using this age model to reconstruct  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  in deep seawater, we first detect bomb radiocarbon at  
28 the coral growth site around 1980, and show that  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  increased from  $-80 \pm 1\text{‰}$  (average 1930-  
29 1979) to a plateau at  $-39 \pm 3 \text{‰}$  (1999-2001). Pb/Ca of the coral ranges between 1.1-4.5  
30 nmol/mol during the 16th and 17th centuries, and Pb isotope ratios ( $^{206}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb} = 1.21$ ,  
31  $^{208}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb} = 2.495$ ) in this period agree with pre-anthropogenic values found in the pelagic  
32 sediments of this basin. Coral Pb/Ca is slightly elevated to  $6.2 \pm 0.9$  nmol/mol between the 1740s  
33 and the 1850s and then increases to  $25.1 \pm 0.2$  nmol/mol in the 1990s. The increase in coral  
34 Pb/Ca is accompanied by a decrease in coral  $^{206}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb}$  and  $^{208}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb}$ , indicating that that the  
35 increase was caused by the infiltration of anthropogenic Pb to the coral growth site. Comparing  
36 our data to the surface coral  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  and Pb records from Bermuda reveals time scales of tracer  
37 transport from the surface ocean to the coral growth site. Some characteristic features, e.g., the  
38 bomb-derived  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  increase, appear in the deep ocean approximately 25 years later than the  
39 surface, but the overall increase of  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  and Pb in the deep ocean is smaller and slower than the  
40 surface, showing the importance of mixing during the transport of these tracers.

41

42 **Keywords:** deep-sea coral, time-series, lead, lead isotopes, radiocarbon, anthropogenic

43 **1. Introduction**

44 Fluctuations in the atmospheric radiocarbon and Pb over the past century have been  
45 dominated by anthropogenic perturbations, radiocarbon mainly by fossil fuel combustion and  
46 nuclear weapon testing (Stuiver and Quay, 1981; Nydal and Lovseth, 1983) and Pb by leaded  
47 gasoline combustion and high-temperature industrial activities (Wolff and Peel, 1985; Shotyk et  
48 al., 1998). As ~~the~~ atmospheric radiocarbon and Pb transfer into the ocean, their oceanic  
49 distributions have been altered with time as well. The eEvolution of radiocarbon and Pb in the  
50 surface ocean has been documented by many studies through direct analysis of surface seawater  
51 samples (Linick, 1980; Schaule and Patterson, 1981; Broecker et al., 1985; Boyle et al., 1986;  
52 Wu and Boyle, 1997; Key et al., 2004) or indirectly by analyzing these tracers in annually  
53 banded surface corals (Druffel and Linick, 1978; Druffel and Suess, 1983; Druffel, 1989; Shen  
54 and Boyle, 1987; Guilderson et al., 1998; Inoue and Tanimizu, 2008; Kelly et al., 2009).

55 Because of their transient characteristics, monitoring the changes of radiocarbon and Pb  
56 in the ocean reservoir provides a large-scale geophysical experiment to understand the time  
57 scales of surface water ventilation, inter-basin mixing of water, and dispersal of anthropogenic  
58 inputs in the ocean interior. Moreover, knowing their oceanic distribution and evolution is  
59 necessary to assess the inventory of bomb radiocarbon and anthropogenic Pb in the modern  
60 ocean. Compared to the surface ocean, however, less is known about temporal changes of  
61 radiocarbon and Pb in deep ocean. Direct measurements of radiocarbon in the deep ocean began  
62 in the late 1950s (Broecker et al., 1960). Ocean-wide-scale surveys like GEOSECS, TTO,  
63 WOCE, and GEOTRACES provide deep ocean radiocarbon data with good spatial coverage  
64 over discrete time intervals, but high resolution records spanning the gaps in time between the  
65 surveys do not yet exist. Deep-ocean Pb data are even scarcer than radiocarbon because reliable

66 measurement of Pb in deep seawater became available only recently, i.e., Pb concentrations in  
67 the late 1970s (Schaule and Patterson, 1981; 1983; Flegal and Patterson, 1983), and Pb isotopes  
68 in the mid-1980s (Flegal et al., 1986; Shen and Boyle, 1988a). In the western North Atlantic  
69 Ocean, only limited Pb isotope data (Shen and Boyle, 1988b; Reuer, 2002) existed for the waters  
70 below 1000m prior to a recent US GEOTRACES survey in 2012 (Noble et al., 2015). The lack  
71 of long, continuous data on the changes in deep ocean limits our understanding on the infiltration  
72 of bomb radiocarbon and anthropogenic Pb to the ocean interior and associated oceanic  
73 processes.

74         It may be possible to reconstruct changes of radiocarbon and Pb in the deep ocean on  
75 decadal to centennial time scales using deep-sea corals. Recently, deep-sea corals have shown to  
76 be important archives of past ocean variability. Fossil deep-sea corals have been successfully  
77 used to reconstruct changes of the ocean circulation over the last glacial and deglacial times  
78 (Adkins et al., 1997; 1998; Goldstein et al., 2001; Schroder-Ritzrau et al., 2003), and their  
79 potential use as deep-sea biogeochemical (e.g., nutrient and temperature) proxies are being  
80 investigated (Smith et al., 2000; Weinbauer et al., 2000; Shirai et al., 2005; Cohen and Gaetani,  
81 2006). It was shown that dissolved inorganic carbon in the ambient seawater is the primary  
82 source of carbon used for skeletogenesis for calcareous deep-sea corals, including *Corallium*  
83 *niobe* (Griffin and Druffel, 1989), *Corallium secundum* (Roark et al., 2006), bamboo corals  
84 (Roark et al., 2005), *Desmophyllum cristagalli* (Goldstein et al. 2001; Adkins et al., 2002), and  
85 *Lophelia pertusa* (Frank et al., 2004). The source of Pb in deep-sea coral skeletons is unknown,  
86 but given that their surface relatives preserve the record of dissolved Pb in the ambient seawater,  
87 deep-sea corals might also be able to generate time series of Pb and Pb isotopes in the deep  
88 ocean.

89 In this study we reconstructed deep-ocean, radiocarbon, Pb, and Pb isotope histories at  
90 high resolution using a modern deep-sea coral. A coral specimen *Enallopsamia ~~Rostrata-rostrata~~*  
91 (Pourtalès, 1878) that was collected alive from the deep North Atlantic Ocean was used for the  
92 study. *E. ~~Rostrata-rostrata~~* is regarded as a major structure-forming species and has been found  
93 world-wide at depths between ~200m to ~2000m (Freiwald et al., 2004). It has been also found  
94 to live longer compared to other deep-sea coral species like *Desmophyllum dianthus* (Adkins et  
95 al., 2004), which allows us to attain geochemical records of several hundreds of years. One of the  
96 challenges in using deep-sea corals as a paleoceanographic tracer is in estimating growth rate and  
97 age of the corals. As the banding of deep-sea corals is not necessarily controlled by the annual  
98 cycle for most species, the age of the corals is often estimated by absolute radiometric methods  
99 such as radiocarbon (Druffel et al., 1995; Adkins et al., 2002; Roark et al., 2005; 2006), <sup>210</sup>Pb  
100 (Druffel et al., 1990; Adkins et al., 2004), and <sup>234</sup>U-<sup>230</sup>Th (Adkins et al., 1998; Cheng et al., 2000;  
101 Goldstein et al., 2001). In this study, we found that our coral has grown with a constant vertical  
102 growth rate. Using this growth rate, the coral was found to be ~560 years old based on a vertical  
103 length of the coral, and radiocarbon, Pb/Ca, and Pb isotopes were also measured along the  
104 vertical growth axis of the coral to generate time-series. Radiocarbon has been previously  
105 measured in modern deep-sea corals in several studies (e.g., Roark et al., 2005; 2006), but these  
106 studies used bomb radiocarbon signals to constrain ages of the corals (e.g., assigning a certain  
107 year to the peak of  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  in the coral) and did not focus on reconstructing the past ocean <sup>14</sup>C  
108 variability.

109

## 110 2. Sampling and analytical methods

### 111 2.1. Coral sampling

112 An *Enallopsammia rostrata* specimen (ALV-3701-8) was collected alive in September  
113 2001 with the DSV Alvin from a depth of 1410m on the north slope of Bermuda (64°W 32°N)  
114 (Fig. 1). After collection, exterior contamination on the coral was mechanically cleaned with a  
115 Dremel tool and a diamond abrasion wheel, and sediment trapped inside the coral and the septa  
116 was removed with deionized water and a toothbrush (Adkins et al., 2004).

117 Before cutting the coral,  $^{14}\text{C}$  ages were measured in 5 different corallite tips in order to  
118 find a branch with the longest history. The result showed that the Tip 1 at the apex of the largest  
119 branch is the youngest one (Fig. 2). The excess  $^{210}\text{Pb}$  results of Adkins et al. (2004) likewise  
120 showed that the corallite tip at the end of the same branch, adjacent to Tip 1, was the most  
121 recently precipitated. Based on these results, we focused our time series analysis on the branch  
122 that terminates at Tip 1 because it is most likely to contain the deep ocean interval recording  
123 bomb radiocarbon and anthropogenic Pb infiltration.

124 From this branch, radial discs were cut perpendicular to the direction of coral growth in  
125 3-5 mm intervals (Fig. 2). From each radial disc, concentric bands were identified under UV  
126 light. The banding in the radial sections was found to be asymmetric with the center of the  
127 concentric bands located close to the polyp side of the coral, as previously observed in other *E.*  
128 *Rostrata* specimens (e.g., Houlbrèque et al., 2010). As a preliminary study, we measured  $^{14}\text{C}$   
129 ages from transects of three radial sections, from the center to the edge of each section along the  
130 longest possible transect (10-16 mm). In all three sections, the maximum  $^{14}\text{C}$  age (the oldest age)  
131 was found within 1–4mm of the section center, and the  $^{14}\text{C}$  age decreased linearly with radial  
132 distance outside of the center, corresponding to the linear radial growth rate of 20–30  $\mu\text{m yr}^{-1}$   
133 (Fig. 3). Based on this result, samples used for time series construction were cut from the central  
134 part of each radial disc (Fig. 2b). A sample mass of 11-44 mg was first cut from each radial disc

135 and used for  $^{14}\text{C}$  analysis, and the rest was used for Pb and Pb isotope analysis. Radial discs with  
136 younger ages often had limited amount of samples as the branch is thinner. The tip of the branch  
137 was analyzed for  $^{14}\text{C}$  only, and a single Pb and Pb isotope measurement was made for most of  
138 these samples. For older samples (thicker branch), 2-3 replicate Pb and Pb isotope measurements  
139 were made with a sample mass of  $\sim 30$  mg for each measurement.

140 Previous studies on modern deep-sea corals analyzed tracers along the radial section of  
141 the coral's thick base (e.g, Roark et al., 2006), while our time series reconstruction is based on  
142 the distribution of  $^{14}\text{C}$  and Pb along the coral's vertical growth axis. Our sampling strategy  
143 provides two advantages over the previous approach. First, as the coral's vertical growth rate is  
144 more than an order of magnitude greater than the radial growth rate, it is easier to obtain samples  
145 with higher resolution when sampled along the vertical axis. Second, samples taken along the  
146 vertical axis are more likely to include recently precipitated coral skeleton given the growth  
147 pattern of *E. rostrata*. In the five *E. rostrata* specimens collected from the Central Pacific,  
148 Houlbrèque et al. (2010) found that the outermost parts of the coral bases are  $\sim 30$  to 140 years  
149 old, although their ages are expected to be near zero if the corals have been continuously grown  
150 to the radial direction. On the other hand, the age of an actively growing polyp at the end of a  
151 branch was found to be  $6 \pm 5$  years (U/Th age). Thus, Houlbrèque et al. suggested that *E.*  
152 *Rostrata* stops calcifying at the base as the base becomes remote from the polyps (i.e., active  
153 areas of calcification), but keeps growing in its upper parts. Their observation also supports the  
154 assumption in our age model that the tip of our coral was recently precipitated in the year of  
155 coral collection (section 3.1). Such age model cannot be used if the time series reconstruction is  
156 made from the radial section of the coral base.

157



158 2.2. Coral <sup>14</sup>C analysis

159 Cut coral samples were cleaned, leached, and graphitized prior to <sup>14</sup>C analysis following  
160 the method described in Eltgroth et al. (2005). At least 24% of each sample was leached away,  
161 sufficient to remove contaminating sources of modern <sup>14</sup>C outside of the aragonite lattice  
162 (Adkins et al., 2002). Our conventional <sup>14</sup>C ages (Stuiver and Polach, 1977) were measured at  
163 the UC Irvine Keck Carbon Cycle Accelerator Mass Spectrometry Laboratory using an inorganic  
164 calcite blank to account for the background signal from the graphitization and the AMS  
165 measurement. Deep-Sea  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  was calculated from these measurements according to:

166 
$$\Delta^{14}\text{C} = \left( \frac{e^{-\frac{^{14}\text{C Age}}{\text{Libby Mean Life}}}}{e^{-\frac{\text{Calendar Age}}{\text{True Mean Life}}}} - 1 \right) \times 1000\text{‰} \quad (1)$$

167 where the conventional <sup>14</sup>C age is a measure of <sup>14</sup>C/<sup>12</sup>C of the present day sample, and the  
168 calendar age serves to correct the <sup>14</sup>C/<sup>12</sup>C for radiocarbon decay back to the original  
169 concentration at the time of coral skeleton precipitation. The calendar age of each coral sample  
170 was determined from a coral age model derived from the preindustrial, prenuclear <sup>14</sup>C results for  
171 our coral specimen with the youngest tip of the coral fixed at the date of coral collection. The  
172 details of our age model are discussed in section 3.1.

173

174 2.3. Coral Pb/Ca and Pb isotopes analysis

175 Cut samples were crushed to 2-4 mm size and cleaned using a method described in Reuer  
176 (2002) and Shen and Boyle (1988b), which includes cleaning using distilled water, H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>-NaOH,  
177 and HNO<sub>3</sub>. Then the samples were further crushed to 280-700µm size and divided into 1-3  
178 subsamples so that each sample has approximately 30 mg of coral mass. These samples went

179 through another round of cleaning using distilled water, H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>-NaOH, HNO<sub>3</sub>, and a reducing  
180 agent that is a mixture of ammonia, hydrazine, and citric acid.

181 Cleaned corals were dissolved in strong HNO<sub>3</sub>, and the Pb/Ca ratio was analyzed from an  
182 small aliquot withdrawn from that of the solution. The Pb concentration was analyzed on this  
183 aliquot by isotope dilution quadrupole ICP-MS (VG PlasmaQuad 2+) after spiking the aliquots  
184 ~~samples~~ with a <sup>204</sup>Pb enriched spike (Oak Ridge National Laboratory; calibrated with a  
185 gravimetric Pb concentration standard). The Ca concentration was measured by flame AAS  
186 (Perkin-Elmer 403) for Pb/Ca ratios. The average standard deviation for the coral Pb/Ca  
187 replicates was 0.9 nmol/mol for the samples with Pb/Ca lower than 15 nmol/mol, and 2.7  
188 nmol/mol for samples with Pb/Ca higher than 15 nmol/mol. These deviations are mainly  
189 considered as natural variability of Pb/Ca within subsamples rather than analytical uncertainties.  
190 A coral disc cut in 3-5 mm vertical interval contains coral skeletons that grew for a few years,  
191 which can result in variability in Pb/Ca ratios among its subsamples. Moreover, if a sample cut  
192 from the radial disc erroneously includes an area outside of the growth center, the age variance  
193 within its subsamples will be greater. Indeed, a larger standard deviation among the replicates are  
194 often found in the samples from curved areas of the branch, where it is likely that our sample  
195 cutting does not follow the exact growth axis.

196 The rest of the dissolved coral samples were used to determine Pb isotope ratios. Samples  
197 were first purified by HBr-HCl anion exchange chromatography, and the sample solutions ran  
198 through columns were dried down on a clean hot plate and re-dissolved in dilute HNO<sub>3</sub>. After  
199 spiking the samples with Tl, stable Pb isotopes (<sup>206</sup>Pb, <sup>207</sup>Pb, and <sup>208</sup>Pb) in the samples were  
200 determined by multiple collector ICP-MS (Micromass/GV IsoProbe). Pb isotope measurement  
201 standards (NBS SRM-981 and an independent internal lab standard) were also prepared by

202 adding Tl, and were measured at the beginning and the end of each session. Data were processed  
203 and corrected as in Boyle et al. (2012), which is modified from Reuer et al. (2003). This includes  
204 exponential “beta” mass fractionation correction normalized with a  $^{205}\text{Tl}/^{203}\text{Tl}$  spike, tailing  
205 correction derived from a curve fit to  $^{209}\text{Bi}$  at half-mass interval, on-peak-zero corrections for  
206 instrumental hardware blanks using  $\text{HNO}_3$  (for Tl isotopes) and Tl-spiked  $\text{HNO}_3$  (for Hg and Pb  
207 isotopes), and final renormalization to the absolute values reported for NBS SRM-981 (Galer and  
208 Abouchami, 1998; [Thirlwall, 2002](#); Baker et al., 2004). Procedural column blanks were  
209 determined by analyzing 1-2 column blanks every 18-25 samples. The isotope ratio of the  
210 column blanks could not be accurately determined due to low signal intensity ( $10^{-3}$ - $10^{-4}$  V).  
211 Thus, we assumed that if any Pb was added to the sample during the column procedure, the Pb  
212 would have the isotope ratio of Pb typically used in U.S., which is approximated by our internal  
213 lab standard BAB3deg ( $^{206}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb} = 1.1910 \pm 0.0003$ ;  $^{208}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb} = 2.4743 \pm 0.0005$ ), and  
214 subtracted the averaged values from the sample data based on the  $^{208}\text{Pb}$  signal intensity of the  
215 column blanks. These column blanks averaged 6.5 pg of Pb, and correction for these procedural  
216 column blanks made only slight differences to the final data relative to the raw data. External  
217 reproducibility of a Pb standard that has Pb signal intensities comparable to samples was 0.2 per  
218 mil for  $^{206}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb}$  and 0.3 per mil for  $^{208}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb}$  ( $1\sigma$ ,  $n=25$ , measured on 6 different days). The  
219 samples were not measured repeatedly, but reproducibility of the samples should be on the same  
220 magnitude as those of the standard, although samples with lower signal intensities may have  
221 higher errors due to the [resistor Johnson noise and](#) uncertainties in the blank correction.

### 223 3. Results

#### 224 3.1. $^{14}\text{C}$ time series and age model

225 Our  $^{14}\text{C}$  results show 2 different regions of behaviour: the results from the lower part of  
226 the coral (0-52.6 cm) trace a straight line, but the results from the upper part of the coral (53.1-55  
227 cm) show a rapid decrease in  $^{14}\text{C}$  age that is independent of the growth curve (Fig. 4). This is  
228 consistent with a linear growth rate of the coral that is obscured by the invasion of radiocarbon-  
229 enriched water to the coral growth site at the 53.1 cm mark. These results may also be used to  
230 estimate the vertical growth rate of the coral. Using a linear least-squares fit to the data up  
231 through 52.6 cm, the vertical growth rate is  $0.87 \text{ mm yr}^{-1}$ , which we consider as the lower bound  
232 for the vertical growth rate (Fig. 4). If we exclude the scattered data in 45-52.6cm and use the  
233 lowest (oldest) 7 points, the best-fit growth rate is estimated to be  $0.98 \text{ mm yr}^{-1}$ . Based on these  
234 growth rates, the coral lived for 560-630 yr given its length (55.3 cm). This estimate agrees with  
235 the result of  $^{226}\text{Ra}$ - $^{210}\text{Pb}$  study on our deep sea coral (Adkins et al., 2004), where they suggested a  
236 vertical growth rate slower than  $5 \text{ mm yr}^{-1}$  and a coral longevity of at least 110 years. Our  
237 vertical growth rate is also in agreement with those established for the five different *E. rostrata*  
238 specimens from the Equatorial Pacific based on U-series dating (ranging  $0.6$ - $1.9 \text{ mm yr}^{-1}$ )  
239 (Houlbrèque et al., 2010) and for other deep-sea coral species, which range from  $0.1$  to  $9.4 \text{ mm}$   
240  $\text{yr}^{-1}$  (Druffel et al., 1990; Cheng et al., 2000; Mortensen et al., 2001; Risk et al., 2002).

241 We set the age at the top end of the Tip 1 to September 2001, the known date of coral  
242 collection, and calculated the calendar ages of the other coral samples based on the distance of  
243 each sample from the top end of the branch and the estimated growth rate. We used the  $0.98 \text{ mm}$   
244  $\text{yr}^{-1}$  growth rate for time series reconstruction in this paper, considering that the lowest (oldest)  
245 part of the coral is least affected by anthropogenic radiocarbon and is likely to reflect the true  
246 growth rate of the coral. The calendar age estimate based on the lower ( $0.87 \text{ mm yr}^{-1}$ ) growth  
247 rate is also shown in Tables 1 and 2.

248           There might be uncertainties in the age estimate associated with sample preparation.

249   Despite our effort to cut samples as much as possible from the center of the coral discs, the cut

250   samples may include an area wider than the center of growth, incorporating a younger part of the

251   coral than what was estimated by the age model. This should not be a problem for the samples

252   without replicates, including all  $^{14}\text{C}$  samples, and their age estimates. However, such errors may

253   have occurred to the Pb samples that were measured in triplicate~~s~~ because larger (~100mg) size

254   of the samples was cut out from the disc. Pb samples that have higher relative standard deviation

255   within their triplicate Pb/Ca results possibly have these errors because coral skeletons with

256   younger ages likely have different Pb contents as well. Uncertainties in the age estimates of these

257   samples are difficult to quantify, however, because exact size of the cut coral pieces and width of

258   the central area were not monitored for each coral sample. If a coral sample was cut within 4 mm

259   from the center of a radial disc where its true central part was 3 mm wide, this sample would be

260   ~18 years younger than its estimated age given the radial growth rate ( $20\text{--}30\ \mu\text{m yr}^{-1}$ ) of this

261   coral, but this should be taken as a high end of the uncertainties in the age estimates. These

262   uncertainties could be better estimated and corrected if  $^{14}\text{C}$  ages of these samples were known.

263   However, in this study,  $^{14}\text{C}$  and Pb were not both measured in all samples, and although they

264   were from the same position in the coral, their ages may not be exactly identical as samples for

265    $^{14}\text{C}$  and Pb were taken separately (i.e., from different subsamples). For Pb/Ca and Pb isotopes,

266   we made replicate or triplicate measurements in order to monitor possible Pb contamination

267   during analytical procedure. However, a single measurement may be more appropriate for deep-

268   sea corals, which have low growth rates in general, to decrease the potential errors derived from

269   sampling. These should be considered for any deep-ocean time series reconstructions using deep-

270   sea corals in the future.

271

### 272 3.2. Pb/Ca and Pb isotope ratios

273 Pb/Ca and Pb isotope ratios analyzed from the deep-sea coral are presented in Fig. 5.  
274 Low Pb/Ca ranging from 1.1-4.5 nmol/mol are found between the 1500s and mid-1700s, and  
275 during this time period, relatively high  $^{206}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb}$  and  $^{208}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb}$  ratios appear between 1.207-  
276 1.210 and 2.495-2.508, respectively. These Pb isotope ratios fall in the range of those found in  
277 the Quaternary marine sediments and ferromanganese nodules in this basin (average of 16  
278 samples excluding one anomalous sample are  $^{206}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb} = 1.210 \pm 0.072$ ,  $^{208}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb} = 2.509 \pm$   
279  $0.014$ ; Chow and Patterson, 1962), and thus, we consider the Pb in this period as pre-  
280 anthropogenic (natural). A slightly increased Pb/Ca is found in the mid-1700s, and the Pb/Ca  
281 around 6 nmol/mol remains relatively constant until 1854-1858. Coral Pb/Ca increases rapidly  
282 from 1854-1858 until it reaches a peak (28.7 nmol/mol) around 1980, and then decreases slightly  
283 afterward. Lower  $^{206}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb}$  and  $^{208}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb}$  ratios compared to the pre-anthropogenic values are  
284 found in the mid-1700s, and as the Pb/Ca ratio increases, the isotope ratios further decrease to  
285  $^{206}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb} = 1.19$ ,  $^{208}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb} = 2.46$  in ~1914. The Pb isotope ratios remain rather constant for a  
286 few decades until the late 1970s, and then rapidly drop to  $^{206}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb} = 1.185$  and  $^{208}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb} =$   
287  $2.450$  in 1995.

288 No seawater Pb isotopes were measured from the coral growth site during the period that  
289 the coral lived, but the Pb isotope ratios of a seawater ( $^{206}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb} = 1.184 \pm 0.002$ ,  $^{208}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb} =$   
290  $2.451 \pm 0.005$ ) collected at ~600 km east of the coral site in 1998 (1490m, 33°42'N, 57°49'W)  
291 (Reuer, 2002) agrees with the coral Pb isotope ratios found in 1997. Along with the fact that the  
292 coral Pb isotopic ratios prior to the mid-1700s agree with the pre-anthropogenic Pb isotope  
293 values, this result implies that the Pb in this deep sea coral was precipitated from the ambient

294 seawater without significant isotope fractionation, and thus the observed variance in the coral Pb  
295 isotopes reflects the changes in deep ocean Pb isotope ratios.

296

## 297 **4. Discussion**

### 298 4.1. Deep-sea $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$ time series

299 The reconstructed  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  in deep seawater shows a stable  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  up to the early 1970s with a  
300 value of  $-80 \pm 1 \text{‰}$  (Fig. 6). We detect the first influence of bomb radiocarbon with the slight  
301 rise in  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  starting around 1980.  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  then increases by 41‰ to plateau at  $-39 \pm 3 \text{‰}$  (1999-  
302 2001). At first glance, the nearest isopycnal ( $\sigma_\theta$ ) matched GEOSECS, TTO, and WOCE station  
303  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  data appear to disagree with the coral results, but a close look reveals that the prebomb  
304  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  in the southern stations agree with our pre-bomb record and the more northern stations in  
305 the late 1990s agree with the end of our  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  record. Comparing to the GEOSECS data of the  
306 North Atlantic from 1972-1973, the more southern station ( $-76 \pm 4 \text{‰}$ ) agrees with our prebomb  
307 value of  $-80 \pm 1 \text{‰}$ . The four stations from TTO in 1981 show that the bomb pool has reached  
308 the more northern stations ( $-45 \pm 4\text{‰}$ ,  $-51 \pm 4\text{‰}$ ), but  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  in our record (approx.  $-75 \pm 4\text{‰}$ ) is  
309 just beginning to rise and is in line with the  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  observations from the more southern stations ( $-$   
310  $69 \pm 4\text{‰}$ ,  $-79 \pm 4\text{‰}$ ). Because the more northern WOCE stations from the late 1990s ( $-34 \pm 4\text{‰}$ ,  
311  $-33 \pm 4\text{‰}$ ) agree with our coral result ( $-39 \pm 3\text{‰}$ ), we conclude that this deep ocean site was  
312 fully engulfed in the bomb radiocarbon pool by the late 1990s and that the  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  of this site began  
313 to level off from then. In contrast, the WOCE station that is just south of Bermuda (from 1997)  
314 has a lower  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  value than our coral result, showing this site had not yet been nearly engulfed  
315 in the bomb radiocarbon pool yet.

316

317 4.2. Deep-sea Pb and Pb isotopes time series

318 Pb/Ca of the deep-sea coral starts to rise clearly from the 1860s (Fig. 5). This is  
319 consistent with the increase in Pb concentrations in the Bermuda surface coral around 1850-1860  
320 (Kelly et al., 2009) and river sediments from the northeastern United States around 1830 (Lima  
321 et al., 2005), which was caused by the increased coal combustion and Upper Mississippi Valley  
322 ore smelting in the United States. This trend also agrees with the increased anthropogenic Pb  
323 emission from the western Europe around the 1840s (Shotyk et al., 1998). The decrease in coral  
324  $^{206}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb}$  and  $^{208}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb}$  ratios occurring in accordance with the Pb/Ca increase (Fig. 5)  
325 supports that this increase is the result of the penetration of anthropogenic Pb into the coral  
326 growth site. The anthropogenic Pb found in the surface of the western North Atlantic Ocean in  
327 the past two centuries show lower  $^{206}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb}$  and  $^{208}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb}$  ratios than the natural values  
328 ( $^{206}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb} = 1.210 \pm 0.072$ ,  $^{208}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb} = 2.509 \pm 0.014$ ) (see Fig. 7, for example) (Shen and  
329 Boyle, 1988a; Veron et al., 1994; Hamelin et al., 1997; Kelly et al., 2009). The  $^{206}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb}$  and  
330  $^{208}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb}$  ratios of the anthropogenic Pb found in the surface of the eastern North Atlantic  
331 Ocean are even lower than the western North Atlantic Ocean because of the low isotope ratios  
332 (e.g.,  $^{206}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb}$  ranging 1.06-1.16) of the Pb emitted from western Europe (Veron et al., 1994;  
333 Weiss et al., 2003).

334 ~~The Seawater-Pb concentration of seawater at 1430m depth in 1984 at 32°12'N, 64°30'W~~  
335 ~~(near the coral growth site) was measured to be 53 pmol kg<sup>-1</sup> at 1430m depth close to the coral~~  
336 ~~growth site (32°12'N, 64°30'W) in 1984~~ (Boyle et al., 1986). Comparing this seawater value to  
337 the coral Pb/Ca from 1984 (26.85 nmol/mol), the partition coefficient of Pb ( $D_p =$   
338  $(\text{Pb}/\text{Ca})_{\text{coral}}/(\text{Pb}/\text{Ca})_{\text{seawater}}$ ) for this coral is ~~calculated estimated as to be~~ 5.2. Two other Pb  
339 measurements were made from the northwest (34°15'N, 66°17'W; 77 pmol kg<sup>-1</sup> at 1470m)



340 (Schaule and Patterson, 1981) and the east (33°42'N, 57°49'W; 57.3 pmol kg<sup>-1</sup> at 1490m) (Reuer,  
341 2002) of the coral growth site in 1979 and 1998, respectively, and  $D_p$  of Pb derived from these  
342 concentrations are 3.5 and 4.5. These  $D_p$  estimates (ranging 3.5-5.2) all fall in the range of  $D_p$  in  
343 other deep-sea corals derived from <sup>210</sup>Pb, e.g., 3-20 in *Desmophyllum cristagalli* (Adkins et al.,  
344 2004) and a maximum of ~8 in *Corrallium niobe* (Druffel et al., 1990).

345 One should note that these  $D_p$  estimates have intrinsic errors because they are calculated  
346 based on a single seawater Pb datum that does not represent a long-term averaged Pb value,  
347 whereas the Pb/Ca ratio measured from a few-mm thick coral discs is an average of the Pb  
348 values of several years. Moreover, for surface growing corals, it was found that  $D_p$  of some  
349 minor elements can be variable in a single coral due to kinetic artifacts (Devilliers et al., 1994;  
350 1995; Cohen et al., 2001), and fine-scale fluctuations have been found within a skeletal structure  
351 both in surface and deep-sea corals (Cohen and McConnaughey, 2003; Sinclair, 2005; Robinson  
352 et al., 2006; Gagnon et al., 2007). These errors are expected to be small in our data because 1)  
353 the deep-sea coral used in this study is considered to have grown at a constant rate, and 2) we  
354 tried to collect coral samples from the same location (near the centre of growth) in the coral discs.  
355 More importantly, the fractional kinetic and structural artifacts should be smaller than the order  
356 of magnitude range of Pb/Ca variations ~~nee~~ caused by anthropogenic Pb inputs.

357 Considering the spatial variability of Pb in the ocean, we used  $D_p = 5.2$  for seawater Pb  
358 reconstruction in this paper, as this is based on the seawater data collected most closely to the  
359 coral growth site. Applying  $D_p = 5.2$  to the coral Pb/Ca ratios earlier than 1700s assuming  $D_p$  was  
360 constant during the growth of coral, pre-anthropogenic seawater Pb concentrations in deep sea is  
361 estimated to be approximately 3-11 pmol kg<sup>-1</sup> (Fig. 5). This value is similar to or lower than the  
362 pre-anthropogenic Pb concentration estimated for the western North Atlantic surface waters (15

363 pmol kg<sup>-1</sup>) based on Bermuda coral Pb/Ca (Kelly et al., 2009). This might be the result of [sinking](#)  
364 particle scavenging of Pb at depth, which is often observed in Pb and <sup>210</sup>Pb vertical profiles in the  
365 modern ocean (Craig et al., 1973; Bacon et al., 1976; Cochran et al., 1990; Schaule and Patterson,  
366 1981). The deep-sea Pb concentration gradually increases from the 1860s, and the maximum Pb  
367 concentrations at 54 pmol kg<sup>-1</sup> appear in 1980-1987.

368

#### 369 4.3. Comparison to surface $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$ and Pb time series

370 A comparison of the deep-ocean  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  record to the coral record from the surface  
371 ocean near Bermuda (Druffel, 1989) and the atmospheric record (Manning and Melhuish,  
372 1994; Nydal and Lovseth, 1996; Stuiver et al., 1998) shows the movement of  
373 atmospheric  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  to the surface and deep ocean reservoirs (Fig. 6). The atmosphere and the  
374 surface ocean  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  begin to increase at nearly the same time (1955–1958), but  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  in the deep  
375 ocean begins to rise 22-25 years later, around 1980. The northern hemisphere atmosphere peaks  
376 at 1000‰ in 1963 and the surface ocean at Bermuda plateaus at 150‰ 10 years later in 1973-  
377 1974. The maximum  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  in the deep ocean is also reached in ~25 years later than the surface  
378 ocean, which implies 22-25 years of transit time from the surface to the coral growth site.

379 A similar result is observed when we compared our deep-sea coral Pb isotope record to  
380 the surface-ocean Pb isotope record reconstructed from Bermuda corals (Kelly et al., 2009). The  
381 most noticeable similarity in the two records is the decrease in <sup>206</sup>Pb/<sup>207</sup>Pb and <sup>208</sup>Pb/<sup>207</sup>Pb ratios  
382 that occurs in 1951-1952 in surface water and around 1976 in the deep ocean (Fig. 7) and  
383 relatively constant Pb isotope ratios (<sup>206</sup>Pb/<sup>207</sup>Pb = 1.19 and <sup>208</sup>Pb/<sup>207</sup>Pb = 2.46) that are  
384 maintained for a few decades before the decrease occurs. Other Pb isotope features appeared in  
385 the surface water prior to the 1950s, e.g. a peak in Pb isotope ratios around 1880 and the

386 following decrease, are not shown clearly in the deep sea record because of the relatively low  
387 surface-ocean Pb concentrations during that period, as the surface features are easily erased  
388 during transport by mixing. Surface water Pb concentrations increase rapidly after ~1950, and  
389 thus the surface Pb isotope feature (decreasing  $^{206}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb}$  and  $^{208}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb}$ ) in 1951-1952  
390 probably has resulted in the decrease in deep-sea Pb isotope ratios observed around 1976. The  
391 ~25 years of delay in the appearance of Pb isotopic features between the surface and deep sea is  
392 consistent with the observation from  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$ , and based on these results, one may conclude that it  
393 takes approximately 25 years for  $^{14}\text{C}$  and Pb to be transported from surface to the deep ocean  
394 north of Bermuda.

395 Another difference between the surface and deep-sea coral records is that the increases in  
396 deep-sea  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  and Pb are much smaller and slower than those at the surface. Bomb radiocarbon  
397 causes ~100‰ increase of  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  in the surface ocean (Druffel, 1989), whereas deep-sea  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$   
398 increases by ~40‰ by the intrusion of bomb radiocarbon (Fig. 6). Similarly, the Pb  
399 concentration in the surface ocean near Bermuda increases ~12.5 fold from 1850-1860 to ~1976  
400 (Kelly et al., 2009) (Fig. 7), while the Pb concentration in deep sea increases approximately 5  
401 fold during the same period. The smaller increase of  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  and Pb in deep sea indicates that  
402 during their transport these tracers were rigorously mixed with the waters with less  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  and Pb  
403 contents, i.e., less contaminated waters, that is probably older than the surface seawater. For Pb,  
404 particle scavenging at depth may also have played a role in decreasing the impact of  
405 anthropogenic Pb in the deep sea.

406 To construct a simple model of this penetration and mixing, we assume that the  
407 radiocarbon at the surface ocean that evolves as in the Bermuda coral is pushed down to the  
408 deep-sea coral site along a pipe that has no thickness, with a speed of  $u=3000\text{ km}/25\text{ yr}$ . The

409 3000km is an approximate distance from the winter outcropping region of the  $\sigma_\theta = 27.6$   
410 isopycnal to the deep-sea coral site, and 25 yr is the time scale of the radiocarbon transfer when  
411 the flow is assumed to be dominated by advection. We further assume that during the transfer,  
412 ~~the~~ surface radiocarbon is mixed with ambient seawater that is characterized by a constant  $^{14}\text{C}$   
413 concentration ( $C_B$ ), and ~~the~~ mixing is represented by a mixing time scale,  $\tau$  (yr). The “mixing” is  
414 used as a general term here, describing any process that allows exchange of  $^{14}\text{C}$  between the tube  
415 and the ambient seawater. Then, the governing equation for the evolution of radiocarbon in the  
416 flow is

$$\frac{dC}{dt} = -u \frac{\partial C}{\partial x} - \frac{C - C_B}{\tau} \quad (2)$$

418 where  $C(x, t) = ^{14}\text{C}$  concentration in the tube and  $C_B$  is the  $^{14}\text{C}$  concentration in the ocean interior.

419 ~~R~~~~The~~ radioactive decay is ignored in this equation because ~~the radioactive decay flux~~ is small  
420 compared to the ~~others-other terms~~ over an  $\sim 50$  yr time scale. We assume  $C_B$  as the  $^{14}\text{C}$   
421 concentration equivalent to  $\Delta^{14}\text{C} = -80\%$  as this is the best fit to the pre-bomb  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  estimates  
422 from the old deep-sea coral data and water column measurements. For the surface  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  time  
423 series, we subtracted 33‰ from the Bermuda coral  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  record to make the pre-bomb  
424 surface coral  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  ( $-47 \pm 4$ ; average of the data in 1950.8-1957.8) overlap with the older deep-  
425 sea coral data. The offset between the pre-bomb  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  between the surface and deep ocean is the  
426 result of surface-deep exchange and water mass mixing (e.g., contribution of AAIW), but we  
427 assume these processes were constant in time. Then, using the equation above, we modeled the  
428 evolution of  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  at the deep-sea coral site with a wide range of  $\tau$  and found the  $\tau$  that best fits  
429 the observed coral data. The mixing time scale that best reproduces the deep-sea coral  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  data  
430 is 17 yr (Figure 6), which yields a Peclet number ( $Pe = u \cdot \tau / L$ ;  $L$  is the length scale of the system)  
431 around 0.7. This means that mixing is more important than advection in the transport of

Formatted: Subscript

432 radiocarbon in this system. Jenkins (1988) showed the distribution of tritium-<sup>3</sup>He in the upper  
433 thermocline of the subtropical North Atlantic was found to be most comparable to the Peclet  
434 number of 1 or less using a one-dimensional advection-diffusion model. Similar results (Pe  
435 around 1) were inferred from the tracer distributions in the upper 500m of the BATS site  
436 (Stanley et al., 2012) and the subpolar North Atlantic Ocean (Waugh et al., 2004) using a  
437 different modelling approach. The Peclet number obtained from our model is comparable to  
438 these results, although it is noteworthy that our estimate is derived from a decadal-scale time-  
439 series of a tracer at one location, whereas these estimates are based on tracer distribution in the  
440 water column at a certain time, so they represent integration of different time and space scales.

441 Our model assumes that radiocarbon is transported by constant  $u$  and  $\tau$ , which is  
442 probably unrealistic in the ocean where advective-diffusive mixing is prevalent (Haine et al.,  
443 1998; Haine and Hall, 2002). Recent studies have pointed out that water in the ocean interior  
444 have a continuous distribution of transit times since its last contact with a surface (Holzer and  
445 Hall, 2000; Khatiwala et al., 2001; Haine and Hall, 2002). This distribution is a fundamental  
446 property of the water and thus is independent of any characteristics of a particular tracer. In this  
447 scenario, a deep ocean tracer at a given location is ~~a~~the sum of the ~~tracers~~tracer concentrations  
448 in the surface source waters that have mixed into that location, whose relative proportions are set  
449 by the distribution of transit times. Thus, in order to interpret our joint tracer data, a more  
450 sophisticated approach such as Transit Time distributions (TTD) model (e.g., Waugh et al., 2004)  
451 may be required. Such attempt will need a more careful set up of the surface boundary conditions  
452 for the tracers, especially for Pb and Pb isotopes. Because of a shorter residence time of Pb in the  
453 atmosphere and the surface ocean, the distribution of Pb and Pb isotopes in the surface North  
454 Atlantic Ocean exhibit a larger spatial variance than radiocarbon, depending on prevailing winds,

455 distance from main sources, and surface ocean currents (Hamelin et al., 1997; Helmers and ~~y~~van  
456 der ~~L~~oeff, 1993; Veron et al., 1994; Weiss et al., 2003). Moreover, the spatial variance itself has  
457 changed greatly as the dominant Pb emitting sources change over time (e.g., Weiss et al., 2003).  
458 Thus, the surface boundary condition for Pb and Pb isotopes that evolves both in time and space  
459 will be necessary to model the evolution of deep-sea Pb and Pb isotopes.

460

## 461 5. Conclusion

462 We used a modern deep-sea coral collected from ~1400m deep off Bermuda to  
463 reconstruct time series of radiocarbon, Pb, and Pb isotopes. By analyzing these tracers along the  
464 coral's vertical growth axis, we were able to ~~show-derive~~ high-resolution (sub-centennial)  $^{14}\text{C}$   
465 and Pb records for the last 560-650 years. The reconstructed time series shows the intrusion of  
466 bomb radiocarbon and anthropogenic Pb into the deep North Atlantic Ocean. ~~The d~~Deep-ocean  
467  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  time series shows ~~the~~ bomb radiocarbon first moving to the coral growth site in ~1980, and  
468  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  increases from  $-80 \pm 1\%$  (average 1930-1979) to  $-39 \pm 3 \%$  (average 1999-2001). The  
469 ~~c~~Coral Pb/Ca ratio starts to increase rapidly from the mid-1850s until 1980 due to the intrusion  
470 of anthropogenic Pb into the deep sea, which is accompanied by a decrease in  $^{206}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb}$  and  
471  $^{208}\text{Pb}/^{207}\text{Pb}$  ratios. A transit time of ~25 years is estimated when comparing the timing of bomb-  
472 derived  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  increase and Pb-isotope-ratio decrease between the deep-sea and surface coral  
473 records, assuming advection-dominated transport of these tracers. However, the increase of  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$   
474 and Pb in the deep sea is lower than the surface, representing these tracers were mixed with  
475 seawater with low  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  and Pb during the transport. Indeed, a simple advection-mixing model  
476 using the radiocarbon data shows that mixing may be more important than advection in the  
477 transport of radiocarbon from the surface to the deep-sea coral site. Overall, this study shows the

478 potential of using deep-sea corals as a recorder of radiocarbon, Pb, and Pb isotope variability in  
479 deep sea on a decadal to centurial time scale, which is the time scale that cannot be studied by  
480 direct seawater observation or by using other deep-ocean proxy archives like sediment cores. The  
481 time series obtained from the deep-sea coral provides useful information on the processes  
482 delivering the tracers from the surface to the ocean interior.

483

484

485 **Acknowledgement**

486 We thank the WHOI Alvin group and the crew of the Atlantis for recovering sample ALV 3701-  
487 8. We also thank Rick Kayser for maintaining the PQ2+ ICP-MS for Pb analysis. This work was  
488 supported by NSF grant OCE-0926197.

**Commented [EB1]:** Presumably Jess will also have a grant number to add.

489 **References**

- 490 Adkins, J. F., Boyle, E. A., Keigwin, L., Cortijo, E. 1997. Variability of the North Atlantic  
491 thermohaline circulation during the last interglacial period. *Nature* 390(6656), 154-156.
- 492 Adkins, J. F., Cheng, H., Boyle, E. A., Druffel, E. R. M., Edwards, R. L. 1998. Deep-sea coral  
493 evidence for rapid change in ventilation of the deep North Atlantic 15,400 years ago.  
494 *Science* 280(5364), 725-728.
- 495 Adkins, J. F., Henderson, G. M., Wang, S. L., O'Shea, S., Mokadem, F. 2004. Growth rates of  
496 the deep-sea scleractinia *Desmophyllum cristagalli* and *Enallopsammia rostrata*. *Earth*  
497 *Planet. Sc. Lett.* 227(3-4), 481-490.
- 498 Adkins, J. F., Griffin, S., Kashgarian, M., Cheng, H., Druffel, E. R. M., Boyle, E. A., Edwards R.  
499 L., Shen, C. C. 2002. Radiocarbon dating of deep-sea corals. *Radiocarbon* 44(2), 567-580.
- 500 Bacon, M. P., Spencer, D. W., Brewer, P. G. 1976. Pb-210-Ra-226 and Po-210-Pb-210  
501 Disequilibria in Seawater and Suspended Particulate Matter. *Earth Planet. Sc. Lett.* 32(2),  
502 277-296.
- 503 Baker, J., Peate, D., Waight, T., Meyzen, C. 2004. Pb isotopic analysis of standards and samples  
504 using a Pb-207-Pb-204 double spike and thallium to correct for mass bias with a double-  
505 focusing MC-ICP-MS. *Chem. Geol.* 211(3-4), 275-303.
- 506 Boyle, E. A., Chapnick, S. D., Shen, G. T., Bacon, M. P. 1986. Temporal Variability of Lead in  
507 the Western North-Atlantic. *J. Geophys. Res.-Oceans* 91(C7), 8573-8593.
- 508 Boyle, E. A., et al. 2012. GEOTRACES IC1(BATS) contamination-prone trace element isotopes  
509 Cd, Fe, Pb, Zn, Cu, and Mo Intercalibration. *Lim. Oceanogr.- Methods* 10, 653-665.
- 510 Broecker, W. S., Gerard, R., Ewing, M., Heezen, B. C. 1960. Natural radiocarbon in the Atlantic  
511 Ocean. *J. Geophys. Res.* 65(9), 2903-2931.
- 512 Broecker, W. S., Peng, T. H., Ostlund, G., Stuiver, M. 1985. The Distribution of Bomb  
513 Radiocarbon in the Ocean. *J. Geophys. Res.-Oceans* 90(C4), 6953-6970.
- 514 Cheng, H., Adkins, J., Edwards, R. L., Boyle, E. A. 2000. U-Th dating of deep-sea corals.  
515 *Geochim. Cosmochim. Ac.* 64(14), 2401-2416.
- 516 Chow, T. J., Patterson, C. C. 1962. The Occurrence and Significance of Lead Isotopes in Pelagic  
517 Sediments. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Ac.* 26, 263-308.



518 Cochran, J. K., Mckibbinvaughan, T., Dornblaser, M. M., Hirschberg, D., Livingston, H. D.,  
519 Buesseler, K. O. 1990. Pb-210 Scavenging in the North-Atlantic and North Pacific  
520 Oceans. *Earth Planet. Sc. Lett.* 97(3-4), 332-352.

521 Cohen, A. L., Gaetani, G. A. 2006. Compositional variability in the cold-water coral *Lophelia*  
522 *pertusa* is driven by temperature and aragonite precipitation "efficiency". *Geochim.*  
523 *Cosmochim. Ac.* 70(18), A107-A107.

524 Cohen, A. L., McConnaughey, M. A. 2003. Geochemical perspectives on coral mineralization.  
525 *Rev. Mineral Geochem.* 54, 151-187.

526 Cohen, A. L., Layne, G. D., Hart, S. R., Lobel, P. S. 2001. Kinetic control of skeletal Sr/Ca in a  
527 symbiotic coral: Implications for the paleotemperature proxy. *Paleoceanography* 16(1),  
528 20-26.

529 Craig, H., Krishnaswami, S., Somayajulu, B. L. K. 1973. Pb-210 - Ra-226 Radioactive  
530 Disequilibrium in Deep-Sea. *Earth Planet. Sc. Lett.* 17(2), 295-305.

531 Devilliers, S., Shen, G. T., Nelson, B. K. 1994. The Sr/Ca-Temperature Relationship in Coralline  
532 Aragonite - Influence of Variability in (Sr/Ca)Seawater and Skeletal Growth-Parameters.  
533 *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 58(1), 197-208.

534 Devilliers, S., Nelson, B. K., Chivas, A. R. 1995. Biological-Controls on Coral Sr/Ca and Delta-  
535 O-18 Reconstructions of Sea-Surface Temperatures. *Science* 269(5228), 1247-1249.

536 Druffel, E. M., Linick, T. W. 1978. Radiocarbon in annual coral rings of Florida. *Geophys. Res.*  
537 *Lett.* 5(11), 913-916.

538 Druffel, E. M., Suess, H. E. 1983. On the radiocarbon record in banded corals: Exchange  
539 parameters and net transport of  $^{14}\text{CO}_2$  between atmosphere and surface ocean. *J.*  
540 *Geophys. Res.* 88(C2), 1271-1280.

541 Druffel, E. R. M. 1989. Decade Time Scale Variability of Ventilation in the North-Atlantic -  
542 High-Precision Measurements of Bomb Radiocarbon in Banded Corals. *J. Geophys. Res.-*  
543 *Oceans* 94(C3), 3271-3285.

544 Druffel, E. R. M., King, L. L., Belostock, R. A., Buesseler, K. O. 1990. Growth rate of a deep-  
545 sea coral using Pb-210 and other isotopes. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 54(5), 1493-1500.

546 Druffel, E. R. M., Griffin, S., Witter, A., Nelson, E., Southon, J., Kashgarian, M., Vogel, J. 1995.  
547 Gerardia: Bristlecone pine of the deep-sea? *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 59(23), 5031-  
548 5036.

549 Eltgroth, S. F., Adkins, J. F., Robinson, L. F., Michael, K., Southon, J. 2005. A deep-sea coral  
550 record of North Atlantic radiocarbon through the Younger Dryas: Evidence for  
551 intermediate/deep water reorganization. *Paleoceanography* 21, PA4207.

552 Frank, N., Paterne, M., Ayliffe, L., van Weering, T., Henriot, J. P., Blamart, D. 2004. Eastern  
553 North Atlantic deep-sea corals: tracing upper intermediate water  $\Delta^{14}\text{C}$  during the  
554 Holocene. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 219, 297-309.

555 Flegal, A. R., Patterson, C. C. 1983. Vertical concentration profiles of lead in the Central Pacific  
556 at 15°N and 20°S. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 64, 19-32.

557 Flegal, A. R., Ito, K., Patterson, C. C., Wong, C. S. 1986. Vertical profile of lead isotopic  
558 compositions in the north-east Pacific. *Nature* 321, 689-690.

559 Freiwald, A., Fossa J. H., Grehan, A., Koslow, T., Roberts, M. 2004. *Cold-water Coral Reefs*.  
560 UNEP-WCMC, Cambridge, UK. Pp. 86.

561 Gagnon, A. C., Adkins, J. F., Fernandez, D. P., Robinson, L. F. 2007. Sr/Ca and Mg/Ca vital  
562 effects correlated with skeletal architecture in a scleractinian deep-sea coral and the role  
563 of Rayleigh fractionation. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 261(1-2), 280-295.

564 Galer, S. J. G., Abouchami, W. 1998. Practical application of lead triple spiking for correction of  
565 instrumental mass discrimination. *Mineral. Mag.* 62A, 491-492.

566 Goldstein, S. J., Lea, D. W., Chakraborty, S., Kashgarian, M., Murrell, M. T. 2001. Uranium  
567 series and radiocarbon geochronology of deep-sea corals: implications for Southern  
568 Ocean ventilation rates and the oceanic carbon cycle. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 193, 167-  
569 182.

570 Griffin, S., Druffel, E.R.M. 1989. Sources of carbon to deep-sea corals. *Radiocarbon.* 55, 533-  
571 542.

572 Guilderson, T. P., Schrag, D. P., Kashgarian, M., Southon, J. 1998. Radiocarbon variability in  
573 the western equatorial Pacific inferred from a high-resolution coral record Nauru Island. *J.*  
574 *Geophys. Res.* 103(C11), 24641-24650.

575 Haine, T. W. N., Watson, A. J., Liddicoat, M. I., Dickson, R. R. 1998. The flow of Antarctic  
576 bottom water to the southwest Indian Ocean estimated using CFCs. *J. Geophys. Res.* 103,  
577 27637-27653.

578 Haine, T. W. N., Hall, T. M. 2002. A generalized transport theory: Water-mass composition and  
579 age. *J. Phys. Oceanogr.* 32(6), 1932-1946.

580 Hamelin, B., Ferrand, J. L., Alleman, L., Nicolas, E., Veron, A. 1997. Isotopic evidence of  
581 pollutant lead transport from North America to the subtropical North Atlantic gyre.  
582 *Geochim. Cosmochim. Ac.* 61(20), 4423-4428.

583 Helmers, E., Van der Loeff, M. M. R. 1993. Lead and Aluminum in Atlantic Surface Waters  
584 (50-Degrees-N to 50-Degrees-S) Reflecting Anthropogenic and Natural Sources in the  
585 Eolian Transport. *J. Geophys. Res.-Oceans* 98(C11), 20261-20273.

586 Holzer, M., Hall, T. M. 2000. Transit-time and tracer-age distributions in geophysical flows. *J.*  
587 *Atmos. Sci.* 57(21), 3539-3558.

588 Houlbrèque, F., McCulloch, M., Roark, B., Guilderson, T., Meibom, A., Kimball, J., Mortimer,  
589 G., Cuif, J.-P., Dunbar, R. 2010. Uranium-series dating and growth characteristics of the  
590 deep-sea scleractinian coral: *Enallopsammia rostrata* from the Equatorial Pacific.  
591 *Geochim. Cosmochim. Ac.* 74, 2380-2395.

592 Inoue, M., Tanimizu, M. 2008. Anthropogenic lead inputs to the western Pacific during the 20th  
593 century. *Sci. Total Environ.* 406(1-2), 123-130.

594 Kelly, A. E., Reuer, M. K., Goodkin, N. F., Boyle, E. A. 2009. Lead concentrations and isotopes  
595 in corals and water near Bermuda, 1780-2000. *Earth Planet. Sc. Lett.* 283(1-4), 93-100.

596 Key, R. M., Kozyr, A., Sabine, C. L., Lee, K., Wanninkhor, R., Bullister, J. L., Feely, R. A.,  
597 Millero, F. J., Mordy, C., Peng, T. H. 2004. A global ocean carbon climatology: Results  
598 from Global Data Analysis Project (GLODAP). *Global Biogeochem. Cy.* 18, GB4031.

599 Khatiwala, S., Visbeck, M., Schlosser, P. 2001. Age tracers in an ocean GCM. *Deep-Sea Res. Pt.*  
600 *I*, 48(6), 1423-1441.

601 Lima, A. L., Bergquist, B. A., Boyle, E. A., Reuer, M. K., Dudas, F. O., Reddy, C. M., Eglinton,  
602 T. I. 2005. High-resolution historical records from Pettaquamscutt River basin sediments:

603 2. Pb isotopes reveal a potential new stratigraphic marker. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Ac.*  
604 69(7), 1813-1824.

605 Linick, T. W. 1980. Bomb-produced carbon-14 in the surface water of the Pacific Ocean.  
606 *Radiocarbon* 22, 599-606.

607 Manning, M. R., Melhuish, W. H. 1994. Atmospheric <sup>14</sup>C record from Wellington. In *Trends: A*  
608 *Compendium of Data on Global Change*, edited by C. D. I. A. Center. Oak Ridge: Oak  
609 Ridge National Laboratory.

610 Mortensen, P. B., Hovland, T., Helge Fossa J., Furevik, D. M. 2001. Distribution, abundance and  
611 size of *Lophelia pertusa* coral reefs in mid-Norway in relation to seabed characteristics. *J.*  
612 *Mar. Assoc. UK* 81(4), 581-597.

613 Noble A. E., Echegoyen-Sanz, Y., Boyle, E. A., Ohnemus, D. C., Lam, P. J., Kayser, R., Reuer,  
614 M., Wu, J., Smethie, W. 2015. Dynamic variability of dissolved Pb and Pb isotope  
615 composition from the U.S. north Atlantic GEOTRACES transect. *Deep-Sea Res. Pt. II* 116,  
616 208-225.

617 Nydal, R., Lovseth, K. 1983. Tracing bomb <sup>14</sup>C in the atmosphere 1962-1980. *J. Geophys. Res.*  
618 88(C6), 3621-3642.

619 Nydal, R., Lovseth, K. 1996. Carbon-14 measurements in atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> from northern and  
620 southern hemisphere sites, 1962-1993, edited by C. D. I. A. Center. Oak Ridge: Oak  
621 Ridge National Laboratory.

622 Pourtalès, L. F. 1878. Report on the corals of the “Blake” expedition. *Bull. Mus. Comp. Zool.*  
623 *Harvard Univ.* 5, 197-212.

624 Reuer, M. K. 2002. Centennial-Scale Elemental and Isotopic Variability in the Tropical and  
625 Subtropical North Atlantic Ocean, PhD thesis, Massachusetts Institute of Technology.

626 Reuer, M. K., Boyle, E. A., Grant, B. C. 2003. Lead isotope analysis of marine carbonates and  
627 seawater by multiple collector ICP-MS. *Chem. Geol.* 200(1-2), 137-153.

628 Risk, M. J., Heikoop, J. M., Snow, M. G., Beukens, R. 2002. Lifespans and growth patterns of  
629 two deep-sea corals: *Primnoa resedaeformis* and *Desmophyllum cristagalli*.  
630 *Hydrobiologia* 471, 125-131.

631 Roark, E. B., Guilderson, T. P., Dunbar, R. B., Ingram, B. L. 2006. Radiocarbon-based ages and  
632 growth rates of Hawaiian deep-sea corals. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* 327, 1-14.

633 Roark, E. B., Guilderson, T. P., Flood-Page, S. R., Dunbar, R. B., Ingram B. L., Fallon, S. J.,  
634 McCulloch, M. T. 2005. Radiocarbon-based ages and growth rates for bamboo corals  
635 from the Gulf of Alaska. *Geophys. Res. Lett.* 32, L04606.

636 Robinson, L. F., Adkins, J. F., Fernandez, D. P., Burnett, D. S., Wang, S. L., Gagnon, A. C.,  
637 Krakauer, N. 2006. Primary U distribution in scleractinian corals and its implications for  
638 U series dating. *Geochem. Geophys. Geosy.* 7(5), Q05022, ISSN: 1525-2027.

639 Schaule, B. K., Patterson, C. C. 1981. Lead Concentrations in the Northeast Pacific - Evidence  
640 for Global Anthropogenic Perturbations. *Earth Planet. Sc. Lett.* 54(1), 97-116.

641 Schaule, B. K., Patterson, C. C. 1983. Perturbations of the natural lead profile in the Sargasso  
642 Sea by industrial lead, in *Trace Metals in Sea Water*, edited by C. S. Wong, Plenum, New  
643 York, pp. 487-504.

644 Schroder-Ritzrau, C., Mangini, A., Lomitschka, M. 2003. Deep-sea corals evidence periodic  
645 reduced ventilation in the North Atlantic during the LGM/Holocene transition. *Earth  
646 Planet. Sci. Lett.* 216, 399-410.

647 Shen, G. T., Boyle, E. A. 1987. Lead in Corals - Reconstruction of Historical Industrial Fluxes to  
648 the Surface Ocean. *Earth Planet. Sc. Lett.* 82(3-4), 289-304.

649 Shen, G. T., Boyle, E. A. 1988a. Thermocline Ventilation of Anthropogenic Lead in the Western  
650 North-Atlantic. *J. Geophys. Res.-Oceans* 93(C12), 15715-15732.

651 Shen, G. T., Boyle, E. A. 1988b. Determination of Lead, Cadmium and Other Trace-Metals in  
652 Annually-Banded Corals. *Chem. Geol.* 67(1-2), 47-62.

653 Shirai, K., Kusakabe, M., Nakai, S., Ishii, T., Watanabe, T., Hiyagon, H., Sano, Y. 2005. Deep-  
654 sea coral geochemistry: Implication for the vital effect. *Chem. Geol.* 224(4), 212-222.

655 Shotyk, W., Weiss, D., Appleby, P. G., Cheburkin, A. K., Frei, R., Gloor, M., Kramers, J. D.,  
656 Reese, S., Van der Knaap, W. O. 1998. History of atmospheric lead deposition since  
657 12,370 C-14 yr BP from a peat bog, Jura Mountains, Switzerland. *Science*, 281(5383),  
658 1635-1640.

- 659 Sinclair, D. J. 2005. Correlated trace element "vital effects" in tropical corals: A new  
660 geochemical tool for probing biomineralization. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Ac.* 69(13),  
661 3265-3284.
- 662 Smith, J. E., Schwarcz, H. P., Risk, M. J., McConnaughey, T. A., Keller, N. 2000.  
663 Paleotemperatures from deep-sea corals: overcoming 'vital effect'. *Palaios* 15(1), 25-32.
- 664 Stanley, R. H. R., Doney, S. C., Jenkins, W. J., and Lott, D. E. 2012. Apparent oxygen utilization  
665 rates calculated from tritium and helium-3 profiles at the Bermuda Atlantic Time-series  
666 Study site, *Biogeosciences*, 9(6), 1969-1983.
- 667 Stuiver, M., Polach, H. A. 1977. Reporting of C-14 data – Discussion. *Radiocarbon* 19(3), 355-  
668 363.
- 669 Stuiver, M., Quay, P. D. 1981. Atmospheric <sup>14</sup>C changes resulting from fossil fuel CO<sub>2</sub> release  
670 and cosmic ray flux variability. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 53(2), 349-362.
- 671 Stuiver, M., Reimer, P. J., Braziunas, T. F. 1998. High-precision radiocarbon age calibration for  
672 terrestrial and marine samples. *Radiocarbon* 40(3), 1127-1151.
- 673 [Thirlwall, M.F. 2002. Multicollector ICP-MS analysis of Pb isotopes using a <sup>207</sup>Pb-<sup>204</sup>Pb double  
674 spike demonstrates up to 400 ppm/amu systematic errors in Tl-normalization. \*Chem.  
675 Geol.\* 184, 255–279](#)
- 676 Veron, A. J., Church, T. M., Patterson, C. C., Flegal, A. R. 1994. Use of Stable Lead Isotopes to  
677 Characterize the Sources of Anthropogenic Lead in North-Atlantic Surface Waters.  
678 *Geochim. Cosmochim. Ac.* 58(15), 3199-3206.
- 679 Waugh, D. W., Hall, T. M., Haine, T. W. N. 2003. Relationships among tracer ages. *J. Geophys.*  
680 *Res.-Oceans* 108(C5) doi: 10.1029/2002JC001325.
- 681 Waugh, D. W., Haine, T. W. N., Hall, T. M. 2004. Transport times and anthropogenic carbon in  
682 the subpolar North Atlantic Ocean. *Deep-Sea Res. Pt I* 51(11), 1475-1491.
- 683 Weinbauer, M. G., Brandstatter, F., Velimirov, B. 2000. On the potential use of magnesium and  
684 strontium concentrations as ecological indicators in the calcite skeleton of the red coral  
685 (*Corallium rubrum*). *Mar. Biol.* 137, 801-809.

Formatted: Superscript

Formatted: Superscript

- 686 Weiss, D., Boyle, E. A., Wu, J. F., Chavagnac, V., Michel, A., Reuer M. K. 2003. Spatial and  
687 temporal evolution of lead isotope ratios in the North Atlantic Ocean between 1981 and  
688 1989. *J. Geophys. Res.-Oceans* 108(C10), doi: 10.1029/2000JC000762.
- 689 Wolff, E. W., Peel, D. A. 1985. The record of global pollution in polar snow and ice. *Nature* 313,  
690 535-540.
- 691 Wu, J. F., Boyle, E. A. 1997. Lead in the western North Atlantic Ocean: Completed response to  
692 leaded gasoline phaseout. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Ac.* 61(15), 3279-3283.