ORGANIC CITIES
AND THE CASE OF PATRICK GEDDES IN DHAKA

by Zulfiquar Hyder

Bachelor of Architecture
Bangladesh University of Engineering and Technology
Dhaka, Bangladesh
March, 1987

Submitted to the Department of Architecture
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Degree of
Master of Science

at the MASSACHUSETTS INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY
May, 1994

© 1994 Zulfiquar Hyder. All rights reserved.

The author hereby grants to M. I. T. the permission to
reproduce and to distribute publicly paper and electronic copies
of this thesis document in whole or in part.

Signature of Author: ________________________________
Zulfiquar Hyder
Department of Architecture
May 06, 1994

Certified by: ____________________________________________
Julian Beinart
Professor of Architecture
Thesis Supervisor

Accepted by: ____________________________________________
Julian Beinart, Chairman
Departmental Committee for Graduate Students

ARCHIVES
MASSACHUSETTS INSTITUTE
OF TECHNOLOGY

JUL 14 1994
Organic Cities and the Case of Patrick Geddes in Dhaka

by Zulfiquar Hyder

Submitted to the Department of Architecture on May 06, 1994
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Science

Abstract

Looking at the city of Dhaka, anyone in the first instance may feel he is perceiving a chaotic construct. But amazingly this city lives and sustains millions of people living in it. Chaos may be perceived in the very form of the city and in the way it functions. The situation of Dhaka today has grown into a very complex reality, but in the beginning of this century when the city was metamorphosing to become what it happened to become today, an western town planner came to the city to give a master plan to the city. It was almost like the ordaining of an order in the Indian tradition of founding of a city. Patrick Geddes the Scottish town planner came with a huge enthusiasm to work in India. On his eastern sojourn he came to Dhaka to produce a master plan for the city. He perceived a regenerative organic dimension in the cities form and function, instead of chaos. His work here also raises questions as to how successful or appropriate it has been in the context of Dhaka. If he was an intruder or an interpreter in a context so opposite to his industrial background?

This thesis will look into all these questions and postulate a position to interpret it based on the hypothesis presented by the proposal and the situation that exist today in the city.

Thesis Supervisor : Julian Beinart
Title : Professor of Architecture
Acknowledgments

The making of this thesis goes back to a long way in the history, when a simple photography class project made me realize the single slices of the time and image of the city revealed to me a very different picture than what I was used to see and remember, by being a boy from the city. It was the question of interpretation of cities which has brought me to what I now embarked into in this thesis. It was the enthusiasm of Archt. Abdul Mohaimen, which led me to try to understand the city in the essence when he decided to translate the report of Geddes in Bengali, and I decided to help him in every possible way. In those days the historian Dr. Muntasir Mamun started feeding us with more and more enthusiasm with his vast knowledge in the history of the city of Dhaka.

At MIT, Prof. Julian Beinart helped me formulate the approach that I should be seeking in dealing with the issue. And also for his encouragement as he sometimes puts it in phrase, “to boost up the morale”, I would remember him for much of that. Prof. Bill Porter on the other hand always kept me on my heel by critically reviewing my development of the thesis time to time. He is also the one who encouraged me to do this thesis here at Cambridge.

Prof. Masood Khan has been a constant source of inspiration in matters too many to mention.

I am also grateful to numerous people whose list I cannot finish in this short premise.

Last of all thanks goes to The Aga Khan Program at Harvard and MIT, whose generosity has made the last two year of my life the most fruitful one.
Content

1. Introduction
   1.1 Preamble of the Thesis
   1.2 Geddes and his planning philosophy
   1.3 Geddes in India
   1.4 Indian cities and their formation

2. Geddes in Dhaka
   2.1 Dhaka the ancient city and old capital of Bengal
   2.2 The Geddes proposal
      2.2.1 The extent of the Diagnostic Survey done in Dhaka
      2.2.2 Exploiting the waterways in Dhaka
      2.2.3 The social environment of Dhaka
      2.2.4 Identifying the advantageous aspects in Dhaka
      2.2.5 The quarters in Dhaka
      2.2.6 Directions for further extension
      2.2.7 Open spaces as city amenity
      2.2.8 Setting the goal for industrial development

3. Geddes the Interpreter or the Intruder
   3.1 Rebirth of Dhaka as a colonial city
   3.2 Assessments made by Geddes in his proposal
   3.3 Dhaka after Geddes
   3.4 Merits and demerits of the Proposal and its reflections today

4. Conclusion

5. Appendix
   5.1 Bibliography
   5.2 Annotated Bibliography
Introduction
1.1 Preamble of the Thesis

The imagery that Dhaka city offers is that of a disorganized, mismanaged and disorderly city. ‘Chaos’\(^1\) is the appropriate word to explain the whole imagery. But what about the living aspect of the city which is vibrant and active in its pulsation? After all a system can be perceived beyond the apparently outer chaotic imagery of the city.

Metaphors are convenient devises to explain these phenomena and notions. Probably, the ecosystem could be an appropriate metaphor to judge and comprehend a city. But even then as Kevin Lynch argues, “Ecological systems are made up of unthinking organisms, not conscious of their fatal involvement in the system and its consequences, unable to modify it in any fundamental way.”\(^{10}\) When man forms community, the concept of society makes a point of departure. If forming community is in essence the purpose of society then cities are the images of these constructs. Kevin Lynch continues his argument on ecological systems, “the inner experiences of the organisms --- their purposes and images --- are irrelevant; only their outward behavior matters.”\(^{10}\) Based on such a premise the effort to construct a comprehensible metaphor of a city would be, as Kevin Lynch points out “An evolving, learning ecology......”\(^{10}\)

The very dynamics of this construct according to Lynch’s metaphor of ecosystem

---

All footnotes refer to the corresponding number in the bibliography

\(^1\) Chaos here refers to the term used in ‘chaos theory.’

\(^{10}\) Lynch, Kevin ; A Theory of Good City Form, 1981 p. 12-14

\(^{10}\) Ibid.

\(^{10}\) Ibid
is that "The dominant animal consciously restructures materials and switches the paths of energy flow".  

To verify and judge this premise, I would consider Dhaka city where the effort to comprehend the apparent chaos has a precedent in the early part of this century --- Patrick Geddes formulating a plan proposal for the extension and maintenance of the city of Dhaka.

In his systematic approach to an organic theory of city form, Patrick Geddes made several interesting observations. He criticized the attitude of the colonial planners for their overt emphasis towards the mere physical instead of the dynamic living one. In his global approach towards planning Geddes pointed out the inherent problem in the western approaches in general. He was concerned by the emphasis on the mechanism of living devised by man, particularly the rise of the machine age, and how that takes so many other noble concerns out of the premise of a thought for a city. He iterates, "It is due to the lack of harmony between the advancing phases of western 'science'. Each of the various specialists remains too closely concentrated upon his single specialism, too little awake to those of others. Each sees clearly and seizes firmly one petal of the six-lobed flower of life and tears it apart from the whole."  

He continues, "The transition in an Indian city, from narrow lanes and earthen dwellings to small streets, great streets and buildings of high importance and architectural beauty, form an inseparably interwoven structure. Once this is understood, the city plan ceases to appear as an involved network of thoroughfares dividing masses of building blocks, but appears instead as a great

---

10 Ibid.
14 Geddes, Patrick; Patrick Geddes in India, Ed. Jacqueline Trywhitt p. vi

p. 12-14
chessboard on which the manifold game of life is in active progress." 14

Now after so many years when there is a global concern for the maintenance and reinvigoration of the ecosystem, Patrick Geddes's approach requires a fresh look.

This thesis will look into these questions, examining a particular part of the city of Dhaka. The area around Dhaka University traditionally called 'Ramna' --- a garden (Persian), came about as an outcome of Patrick Geddes's plan proposal. The proposal was never implemented in a formal way, but the influence of the guidelines that it chalked out is very prominently evident in this area. The later developments all over the city failed to continue in this direction as much. But this influence was, evident in some other towns around Bengal, built by the British colonizers in the early part of the century. These towns were older urban habitations. The colonizers built facilities and urban infra-structure to help serve their purpose. These were predominantly administrative centers. Recent urbanization in the country is in the swinging position of trying to modernize and at the same time trying to fit everything in a sustainable environment.

A fresh look into Patrick Geddes's recommendations will give us a better understanding of the recommendations that can be formulated. The method of the research will take into consideration Kevin Lynch's performance dimension to read the city and the area under consideration. The complexity that this city has grown into, after all these years from the day of Patrick Geddes's visit to the city, requires understanding of a different nature at the same time. The researcher's own life spent in this city and particularly in the Dhaka University

14 Geddes, Patrick; Patrick Geddes in India p. vii
area might come as an extra input into the research.

Apart from its objective reasonings and rationale for the nature of the work that was done by Geddes in Dhaka, it is also very important to note the nature of the cross-cultural dimension that it brings into question. Geddes after all worked on cities those are very different from his own and cities which belongs to such circumstances upon which his role, even if unrecognized by himself, is one of a dominating one. Geddes was aware of the fact and all throughout his work in India he consciously recognized this role and acted in such a way so that his proposals don't show any sign of biasness as such. An elaboration is required on this issue.

London, "Is the raw, dark, dirty middle of the world, where there is not structure in space or in time that enables men to know one another or even to familiarize themselves with inanimate objects," 1 --- Joseph Conrad in the "Secret Agent". In contrast, "Bhaktapur" is also at the middle of the world, but a polar world to Conrad's structureless turn-of-the-century London. In Bhaktapur space is created and made use of to enable the city’s inhabitants to know one another and to know --- in fact, to animate --- objects", --- Robert Levy in "Mesocosm".1 In the first instance, here is a notion we are taking for granted, when imagining our cities. A notion in which we don't question 'why does man have to form communities?' But we observe an instinctive response when that cogent reality

1 Levy, Robert ; Mesocosm p. 149
2 Bhaktapur is a small Newari Town in Nepal. Robert Levy concentrated his research on Indian Hindu towns. This town was found to be the most suitable.
3 Mesocosm is the term used by Robert Levy in his book by the same title. The middle ground in Indian Hindu philosophy is the earthly life of a man in his journey to and from earth through incarnation.

1 Ibid. p. 149
is lost, especially in the voices of the poets and writers, as in T.S. Elliot’s “The Wasteland”. The rapid and growing days of industrialization of the British society, makes its most sensitive part cry out warnings through novels and poetry. The concern over losing this circumstances overwhelms its component population so much that the rationale for the existence of community is never asked. Is it because the losing reality that is being lost has been there for time immemorial?

The fact that strikes us most in this comparison is that there are two different societies being taken into consideration, two cities with different socio-economic, cultural and political fore-bearings. Turn-of-the-19th century London was a city still being built and which already had been the center of immense economic activity, not only within Great Britain but on a global scale, the center of a thriving and rapidly growing industrial society. In contrast, “Bhaktapur” lies in one of the remote mountainous regions of Nepal --- Newar, a city serving as a center to the surrounding agrarian societies, and which itself has grown and survives, based upon transactions of the surrounding farm growers.

London sits in the middle of its hinterland upholding its ‘myth’ of well-being that it holds for its population. In the story of the celebrated Lord Mayor of London, we observe, how the little boy who later becomes the three time Lord Mayor of London, leaves his country home, in search of a better life in the city. To him the myth of London stood for even more absurdity. He hoped to fetch gold lying in the streets of London. Once in the city he then faced the striking and pathetic reality. In the consecutive course of events his good fortune takes him to a turn in his life. Eventually he became the Lord Mayor of London, not only once but thrice. He accumulated wealth in the amount he never dreamt of. The city here is a middle ground, non-structured, but dynamic, and holds a myth of
good fortune and well-being for the population in the surrounding hinterland. Bhaktapur in contrast, is a structured ‘Mesocosm’ of the Newari society. Its structure and order portray the stability and continuity that the population seeks in their city. It upholds more of a protector’s role than a dynamic one. It is interesting to note the structure of this society as described in the findings of Robert Levy, in his book ‘Mesocosm’. His hypothesis and findings in Bhaktapur portray well the nature and myths of cities in South Asia. The general theme states that the ‘Significant’ is manifested in a symbolic order. It is then borrowed around the land. The founding of villages, towns and cities as symbolic structures are ancient and ubiquitous in South Asia.

The two examples that we are considering here are at the two extremes of a scale of societal progress in terms of social and economic development; one industrially developed, the other lying in an agrarian economic condition. The reason we are looking at these two extremes is that they are clues to our search into a particular city which stands in the fringe of these two realities, a city which is in the middle of a process of transformation. The destiny that it seeks is found in the first model and the trace that it tries to leave behind is evident in the other. Starting in the 17th century mankind took to the path of gradual industrialization, led very much by the European nations. Technological innovation and a changing socio-philosophical reality helped this progress to take place. This dynamic influx became the source of turbulation for this quiet and small Indian town lying in the center of a deltaic plain in Bengal.

Our focus is on Dhaka, --- a middle context, lying in the center of an agrarian society. Yet beginning in the 19th century this city became the center of a transforming society under European colonization. The British industrial progress
found its reflection in these colonized lands. The hereditary myth seems to have been replaced by the myth of industrial progress. It portrayed a march forward from agrarianism to industrialization. For Dhaka, it was a case of immense complexity and a push forward to a new dimension. How the city encompasses such a trauma is interesting. The case in Dhaka is not an unique one, and many similar examples can be found all over the Third World today. The choice of Dhaka was based on my own first hand experience and its significance in planning history that this city inherited for its development under colonialism. This milestone which is the most interesting input in this whole context is the plan proposal produced by Patrick Geddes. His proposal was an informal document, -- a sketchy guideline for the future development of the city. It never met with formal recognition, but the growth of the city right after his proposal encompasses his recommendations. His proposal is lost in the labyrinth of history but it reverberates even today in the notions and ideas cultured by the local authorities, without recognition.

What is the intrinsic quality that made the sketchy plan live for so many years? Is it that the very premise on which Patrick Geddes has put his arguments has made it possible for the idea to survive? Geddes argued that, "Town Planning is not something which can be done from above, on general principles which can be learned in one place and imitated in another; it is the development of local life,..." 2

The socio-cultural background in which Patrick Geddes came to work here was a significant time in the history of the people of the land. For India there are always two aspects of the influence of the British colonialism, one grossly negative

---

2 Patrick Geddes Heritage Trail p. 15
to the overall condition of the nation, while the other, more positive. This second category is what most scholars argue that emancipated the Hindu religion itself. In this respect the history of the Bengal Renaissance holds a strong significance.

We will dig into the labyrinth of resources in history to put forward the argument why in this age of ‘Sustainable Environment’ and ‘Recycling of Resources’ at the very end of the 20th century, Patrick Geddes's should be considered in a new perspective. Is it also an indication of why this man, who championed the town planning movement, has been so much misunderstood? Or was that a time when his ideas found no relevance to the politics of the day?

There are many different ways to understand the city and also to draft its future in the form of a town planning proposal (report). There are always several sets of objectives that are listed down in any master plan for a city, aiming at certain goals that the planners want to achieve. In general the very base of industrialization and machination of production, planners also showed a growing tendency towards sterilization of the planning and to create objects and spaces which are neutral in social and cultural aspects. The growing concern for democratization may have been the reason for this. But it was fallacious in its very foundation. Thus coming towards the end of the century we see again a return to de sterilization and creations based on authenticity. New terminology are emerging and notions and concepts which were deliberately forgotten are resurfacing. This new tradition is aimed at synthesizing the decades of knowledge and experience that man has gained so far. But sometimes it is needed to dissect the concepts in its basic foundation otherwise they fail to affirm themselves in the new setting. Also the premise they were considered in has to be taken in their entirety.
It doesn't mean that the entire premise has to be simulated in the new setting. Because after all in the new setting many of its 'tools' and 'features' has changed. Then the essence of the premise will be the most important thing to take into consideration. Patrick Geddes's work in India can be taken as an ideal example in this instance. Geddes worked in more than fifty cities in India, but produced final plan proposals for eighteen only. The methodology and philosophical constructs of these proposals serves us with wonderful lessons and examples so as to formulate our own 'standards' in dealing with similar issues.

Certainly the new setting will give us a much different array of materials and tools to deal with. Our goal in this process is to achieve what traditionally experts and philosophers have failed to achieve.

Here we are looking at the particular plan proposal produced by Geddes for the city of Dhaka. Geddes produced the proposal after a week long visit to the city. He mentions the inadequacy of his own 'diagnostic survey' in Dhaka, because of the time constraint. But he showed the way to deal with particular aspects of the city, and proposed that further survey should be conducted in the same line to complete the process of diagnostic survey and subsequently to produce a more authentic master plan for the city. According to Geddes's philosophy, the master plan of a city should be subsequently enriched by the input of surveyors as they go into the depth of the cities problems by diagnostic surveys.

To understand the nature of the work that Geddes did in Dhaka, we have to look into three different aspects at the same time,

a. An analytical look into Patrick Geddes's own thoughts and research into
his biographical background to understand the factors which led to his
development as a town planner.

b. The tradition of town planning on India
c. An examination of the geographical and sociological background of Dhaka.

The primary source document for this thesis is the “Report On Dhaka City Planning 1917”, that Patrick Geddes proposed after a very short visit and survey of the city of Dhaka in 1916. A copy of the report is located in the archives of the India Office Library in London. The report contains the contemporary map that Geddes also used for his own work. This map was published by the city council of Dhaka in 1916.

The India Office Library also contains most of the source materials in the form of government documents, amateur writers writing on Dhaka and Bengal, survey documents, list of possible locations of artifacts and art objects, etc. This library needs to be researched thoroughly to construct a picture of the reality that Patrick Geddes worked in. It is necessary for the understanding of the rationale that Geddes's work contains.

To understand Geddes and his work his biographers provide us with a wealth of information on him. Some of his own works are published. Those books are also very good sources for the research. But for the unpublished sources, most of which are in the National Library of Scotland in Edinburgh, needs to be searched into.

Once we set the background and the context of the work in Dhaka, then we
will be able to analyze each of the particular details of the proposal and analyze its merits and demerits. For our purpose we will bring out those aspects of the proposal into light which holds a direct relation to our reality today. The overall merit of the proposal certainly holds a tremendous lesson for us. To bring them into focus for a greater awareness of the present society would be only a reinvigoration of an "old thought" but that very "thought" holds for us a great promise for the future.
1.2 Geddes and his Planning Philosophy

A short introduction of some aspects of Geddes's planning philosophy will put into light the premises and methodology he used to deal with planning problems in India and other places. This turn of the century predicament was not new to Geddes. In his educating years Geddes sought certain notions which reflected these concerns in his thought. His background in biology and learning about evolutionary theory of Darwin. But becoming skeptical about the exigencies of T.H. Huxley and learning all about Comte through the Comtevist church and finally being introduced to social philosophy by Herbert Spencer, he still remained unsettled. He kept broadening his horizon of knowledge, looking at every possible resource to seek the truth that is in the back of his head. As Helen Meller writes, "He never lost sight of his initial objective, to discover the forces in social evolution." 4

But his approach took him away from his first teacher in the theory of evolution, at least based on his religious orientation, and Helen Meller again writes, "Geddes had to be Prophet and Priest as well, if he wanted to be a 'practical' social evolutionist." 4 Hobhouse wrote about the role of the sociologist, like the botanist who studies plants, so "does the sociologist with the human species; he treats it as something that has evolved and is evolving, and he seeks to discover what further developments it holds in germ. In this way, the study of growth, human evolution, is the humanitarian spirit, what botany is to the gardener,..." 4

But Geddes always believed that he was working in the right direction. He tried

---

4 Sennet, Richard; *The conscience of the Eye.* p. 41-50
4 Ibid. p. 41-50
4 Ibid. p. 41-50
to combine thought with action. Action was necessary both to understand the mechanism and also to try out his own thoughts. But like a religious man, Geddes would claim, “the link was sometimes sustained more by faith than fact.” 4

Through his eccentric viewpoint, Geddes showed a peculiar way of dealing with issues. Helen Meller wrote, “Geddes added to this his own personal response, part eccentric, part building on a wider experience of the possibilities of the regional concept. Eccentricity was foremost when, in 1883, he became fascinated by the ‘golden age’ of Edinburgh University,...” 4 Edinburgh University was celebrating its tercentenary that year. Geddes searched for how Edinburgh University became the ‘Athens of the North.’ Taking the path of his teacher Thomas Huxley, he imagined a regional particularity about the issue, like how a flora or fauna would grow better in a particular regional environment. But Geddes, like in all of his other pursuits, looked for answers in the question of faith and fact through the French philosophers Auguste Comte and Frederic Le Play. He came to know about Le Play while he was in Paris. Again we see the overwhelming curiosity of Geddes to seek the truth. Le Play not only was critical about Comte, but his approach of exaggerated scientific approach and an aloofness toward the idealistic quality of life stands in strong contrast to what we see in Geddes’s later life. But since the man was a truth seeker he not only collected in his bag what he could from Le Play, he also made a decisive approach in his further pursuit of knowledge based on Le Play’s strategy. He found in Le Play’s thought some similarity to his own; “he was one of the first people to emphasize the gap between technical and moral progress.” 3

---

4 Sennet, Richard; The Conscience of the Eye p. 51-53
4 Ibid. p. 51 - 53
3 Kitchen, Paddy; A Most Unsettling Person
Play also longed for social peace, especially at a time in Europe when war and hatred provided a prime means for hoarding material gains out of the political arena.

Geddes finds a unique strategy to cope with his own problem from Le Play’s theory of social change which is comprised of six elements:

“a deep pessimism about human nature, a study of the influence of custom and informal leadership, the conflict of security and freedom, the determination of the route of change by technical and economic factors, the concepts of cohesion, the cyclical view of history.”

Two aspects of Le Play’s work interested Geddes. The first was Le Play’s application of the methods of scientific research to the study of society itself, and the second was his prolific gathering of facts on the early development of the social sciences. Among the six elements of Le Play’s strategy, the first one certainly opposed Geddes’s viewpoint. In his idealistic viewpoint Geddes was always optimistic about human nature. Thus, Geddes naturally made a modification in Le Play’s formula of analyzing society:---Lieu---Travaille---Famille---Place---Work---Folk to Folk---Work---Place, which he interpreted as environment, function and organism. In an extension of Darwin’s thought he added that since man has will, he need not be as mechanically determined like the rest of the biological world, and mentions, “Having chosen their work, they can fashion the place; they can mold the environment in harmony with their ideals.”

Geddes gradually arrives into the solution that he was so eagerly searching for. His initial question: “Why had the University helped Edinburgh become, in the late eighteenth century, the ‘Athens of the North’?…” was answered thus:

---

3 Kitchen, Paddy; A Most Unsettling Person p.
3 Ibid. p.
“Since many of Edinburgh’s greatest scholars had been drawn from different areas of Scotland, Geddes began to develop the idea of the special nature of particular regions, and then to relate the region with the city. He began to feel his way toward the idea that a city and its region were intimately related and to understand one, it was necessary to understand the other. If the city was an organism, its region was its habitat. The basic idea behind Regional Survey was born.” 4 By now Geddes had been able to perceive the birth of the “idea of Social Reconstruction which was to become his mission as his ideas on ‘civics: an applied sociology’ crystallized.” Geddes then continued and “pursued his interest in the geographical region as a key element in his socio-biological approach.” 4 For this he took ideas from Elisee Reclus, the French geographer, who was at the time preaching ‘Regional Sociology,’ or ‘Regionalism’.

His efforts to tie this issue with the issue of the environment of habitation for human society -- the city was again the victim of his eccentricity. The question of the housing for the poor in Britain came under a great debate in the 1880’s. The state powers which were already expanding, intervened by the installation of a Royal Commission in 1886 and thereafter sought recommendations from the experts. The debate was divided into the moralists and the environmentalists, though it seems Geddes found his quest more in conformity with the latter. He also believed like the environmentalists that, “the poor were poor because of their hostile urban environment.” 4 He could not agree with the entire recommendations given by Miss Octavia Hill, who was a protagonist of the environmentalists and a social worker who worked for the improvement of the slum dwellers of London. But Geddes showed enthusiasm in her work especially

---

4 Sennet, Richard; The Conscience of the Eye p. 51-53
4 Ibid. p. 51-53
4 Ibid. p. 51-53
“since it contained the promise of individual development with a close consideration of environment.” 4 His immediate response was to establish the Environmental Society in Edinburgh. Their aim was to improve the decaying parts of the old city by beautification. In this respect, Geddes showed some of his sensibility toward architecture. He also was making an effort toward a hypothesis which took almost a hundred years for man to realize properly. In his efforts to create cost efficient and primarily low-cost improvements of the old neighborhoods, which will be carried upon by the voluntary labor of the inhabitants, he spoke clearly of an “adaptive reuse” and “sustainable environment”, words coined in the late twentieth century, especially applied to third world situations. Helen Meller writes, “He learnt by experience the techniques of reviving a run-down area, which he was to use again and again in his town planning reports. He found that revival was a slow, piecemeal activity, requiring constant attention, but mostly relatively low-cost. However, it was essential for success to involve the inhabitants and other volunteers in this ceaseless activity. Geddes, always trying to link theory with practice, was to seize on this as an indication of a pattern of social evolution, organism interacting with environment. It was to become a major plank of his planning philosophy.” 4 These exercises are more prevalent in his works in India and the Mid-East. Geddes at this point came across the “Arts and Crafts Movement.” But he could not reconcile himself with William Morris's 'Social Revolution'. "His revolution was to be socio-biological, a natural scientist's approach to the future. Not politics, but a proper use of resources was the Geddesian key to a better world.” 4

4 Sennet, Richard; The Conscience of the Eye p. 51-53
4 Ibid. p. 51-53
4 Ibid. p. 51-53
He was interested about the will of man in play, in deciding about his own environment. In his approach a dynamism is observable. He was more interested in the ‘improvement’ rather than the concern for ‘place’, like in an approach to “straight forward conservation and rational planning for the future.” Helen Meller writes, “Not content with his concern for ‘place’, as a true evolutionist he saw improvement in terms of ‘higher and higher’ individuation.”

Coming back to his regional survey, he pushed forward this ideal in his first city’s improvement efforts in Edinburgh, and second in his city planning efforts in India and the Mid-East. The Establishment of his regional and ‘civic’ museum, “The Outlook Tower”, is a testimony to his efforts to take action. The efforts in regional survey were not easy tasks and required time consuming and tedious work to be performed in a consistent manner. His consistent complaint about the inadequacy of the industrial revolution of his time, which was more concerned with quantity, rather than quality, could not have been the kind of work ethic he was looking for. But he was very successful in this effort. The founding of the Regional Survey Association in 1914 is testimony to that fact.

---

4 Sennet, Richard; *The Conscience of the Eye* p. 51-53
4 Ibid.
1.3 GEDDES IN INDIA

There are certain features which need mention in Geddes's city planning principles. 'Conservative Surgery' is a term applied to the renewal and revival of older parts of cities. In his own time this was the most economically viable method of sustaining old cities. He had to apply this method quite often since many of his works were in reviving old and run-down cities. While "Regional Survey" technique was aimed at surveying a place and city in the most sensitive way, 'Conservative Surgery' method called for a sensitive approach to the implementation of his ideas. His own home town Edinburgh was an old decaying town at the time when he was employing 'Diagnostic Survey' and 'Conservative Surgery' upon the city. But he found in this town all the ingredients to try out his noble ventures and experimentation in his own brand of social evolution principles. But for the very reason his biographers tended to call him an eccentric, he kept pursuing in every venture he undertook. A good example is shown in his remarks about the Insurrection in Dublin in 1916. He was confident that he could have averted the insurrection if only he had devoted more time, energy and resources to his "socio-biological activities improving the physical, social and cultural environment of the poor in Dublin". 4 This actually testifies to the fact that in his construct of social evolution, the political and economic factors were not so important. The participation of individuals in his schemes of environmental improvements were considered an important part of the social evolution of cities. This in turn provided us with the link between his International Summer School activities and the 'Outlook Tower' museum, the Dunfermline Report, the Cities and Town Planning Exhibition. All of these were in a way serving to help achieving a particular objective. He waited within himself until he found

4 Sennet, Richard; *The Conscience of the Eye* p. 59
a reasonable answer to the question.

At the beginning of the 20th Century, Geddes began working extensively on the Town Planning profession. In 1904 he worked on the Dunfermline project, and in 1910 organized the Cities and Town planning exhibition. Here he makes use of all his scattered strings of thoughts to construct a complete whole out of it. His first colonial experience begins in Dublin, where he was invited by the Viceroy to make proposals on the improvement of the city. Though not so far from home and rather similar in context to home, he still found it interesting to try out his ventures. But one had to wait until Geddes came to India, to see him produce some of his pioneering ideas in town planning. In his Indian experience we observe that he failed to achieve certain expectations. Dennis Hardy writes, “Unlike many of his planning contemporaries, Geddes was not to leave a legacy in the form of buildings and plans; rather, his legacy was one of ideas”. But India certainly meant a final pilgrimage. Since the day he embarked on the quest for the search for a social evolutionary process in these Cities, he knew his next stop would be in an ancient civilization, looking for a theme hidden in the intrinsic quality of its city building tradition. Helen Meller continues: “What tempted him in his prospect was the possibility it held for exploring the evolutionary patterns of Indian cities formed by totally different, alien cultural traditions”. She continues: “India, politically and economically underdeveloped, offered him a chance that his socio-biological approach to urban problems might find a more fertile response than he had found even in Dublin”. India also provided him an opportunity to shun his advocacy. The problem in Indian cities at that time as he observed, were in its: “New cities using

---

8  Hardy, Dennis ;  Book Review.  p. 223
4  Sennet, Richard ;  The Conscience of the Eye  p. 59-63
4  Ibid.
Western urban forms, particularly the addition of military and civil lines to older Indian cities”. 4

Geddes was invited by concerned administrators, not only out of philanthropic considerations, but also out of necessity; “But urban problems such as mounting traffic congestion and deteriorating standards of public health (the plague could not be completely confined to native quarters) had awakened governors and municipalities to the need for new measures”. 4 Though he employed conventional measures for the reading of the city but he himself recognized that, “Cities had to be viewed as ‘whole’ organisms and it was essential to preserve the best of the old features and traditions as it was to introduce new ones. Great respect must be given to cultural influences as these were crucial evolutionary factors, and for social evolution to be progressive, the best must survive and thrive”. 4 Geddes then employed his Regional Survey method to understand the city and where necessary recommended his ‘conservative surgery’.

The problems he saw in Indian cities were three kinds, “the problems of public health in a hot climate; congestion and over-crowding in central areas; and the layout of new areas for urban growth.” 4 But these were only the visible facts in Indian Cities. He may not have been so much interested in it. He actually found what he was looking for: “The temple cities of the south, the bazaar towns of the north, the carefully planned capital cities of the native states, gave Geddes patterns of Indian Urbanization, which were rooted in history.” 4

---

4 Sennet, Richard; *The Conscience of the Eye* p. 59-63
4 Ibid. p. 59-63
4 Ibid. p. 59-63
4 Ibid. p. 59-63
4 Ibid. p. 59-63
Based on his understanding, he thought he could do something like this: “One of his most important contributions was to try to open the eyes of the educated Indian and Briton alike to this precious legacy. Another was his expertise in renovating and beautifying the urban environment”. And this is what he did, “Alongside his schemes for repairing the houses and streets of old quarters were schemes for gardens, parks, even in the case of Lucknow and Indore, of zoological gardens to enhance the beauty of the town and to offer better recreational facilities”.  

This Indian experience must have saddened him. His experience in the tormented 19th Century Britain led him to believe, that cultural and natural development had fallen out of favor: “the great challenge of the 20th Century was to create a new harmony.”

Patrick Geddes worked in Dhaka as part of his task that he came to achieve in India. Dhaka, being in Bengal and in the middle of a deltaic plain held some characteristics that Geddes thought could be exploited to the advantage of human habitation and city form. What Geddes came up with as a result of his approach to the town planning problem is very interesting. Since now in the waning days of the overwhelming force of the wave of Industrial Revolution is being seen with some skepticism, and instead "Sustainable Environment" and "Recycling of Resources" are taken as the most appropriate mode. Especially since the last decade it is becoming clearer that the availability of resources are after all not unlimited. The energy sources of this planet have recycled so that it does not abruptly comes to a diminishing end. Scientists always looks back to

---

4 Sennet, Richard; *The Conscience of the Eye* p. 59-63
4 Ibid. p. 59-63
8 Hardy, Dennis; *Book Review.* p. 223
nature in pursuit of this fact.

While working in Dhaka and in India in general, Geddes demonstrated his sincerity not only to the geography of the place but also to its sociological characteristics. His mode of Organic City Planning found its best ground in Dhaka, as he himself claimed in his proposal.

What we will be interested in, is the background from which Patrick Geddes himself comes from. His intentions were unique not only in the case of Dhaka. In his life long devotion to scientific and sociological development of the day he spent much of his own time in the propagation of the Darwinian "Evolution of the species", thus the "Theory of Evolution". He extended this theory to the analysis of the human society. But again he restlessly tried to search for an appropriate solution to the question of habitation for man, which to him stood as the physical attribution of a society.

His work in Dhaka thus became unique because of the premises he worked in. A most scientific mind, while probing into the nature of a society and its town planning principles, at the same time recognized the cultural and traditional notions of the people and tried to combine them to his town planning proposal. Our aim will be to find out how his work exemplified what we now call an "appropriate" approach to the town planning problem. And here is also a case of cross-cultural nature. This is a dimension which modern societies always have to come across. The older relationship of domination and exploitation may not be so much obvious any more, but the growth of information exchange necessitates societies to resolve the issue of cross cultural exchanges. When viewed in this respect Patrick Geddes's work holds some interest for us. This thesis
will examine Patrick Geddes's work in Dhaka in the light of all these issues. At the same time it must be noted that most of these issues are also very much contemporary in nature.
The Indian tradition in the development of the notion of cities is a complex and overwhelming one. So many cross currents has blown through the land throughout history that now the whole itself may be considered a 'Myth'. "The old traditions in India included a number of typical plans for the layout of towns, but few traces were to be seen in any existing city. There are several reasons for this. In the first place, these traditions, which were probably more than 2000 years old, had gradually lapsed, since a settled unity in India was the exception rather than the rule." 14 Starting in the Vedic time the general rules for the founding of a city was based on a rigorous social custom which was directly related to the strict caste system that the gentry of Indian societies created so long ago, and which still is intact in every social realm of the Hindu man. Out of this concern came a very strong form making process. The layout of the Indian city was done on a very strict order. But coming to the notion of order, it seems it is pre-Vedic. According to Joseph Rykwert, "Certainly, the earliest documents relating to limitations and orientation rituals are post-Vedic, inevitably. Nevertheless, wheat and barley were cultivated on artificially irrigated and ploughed land in India long before the arrival of the Vedic invaders, and orientation was practiced there on a vast scale." 12 But the strong influence of the order seems to have come later, "While the rituals which we know as Indian are definitely part of the Hindu tradition, therefore, there is no evidence about whether they did or did not have any connection with earlier practices." 12

14 Geddes, Patrick; *Patrick Geddes in India*

12 Rykwert, Joseph; The Idea of a Town; The Anthropology of Urban Form in Rome, Italy p. 166
12 Ibid. p. 166
the Indian architectural practices the four axial orientations are represented by the mythological construct of the *manda[4]. Mandala* in Sanskrit means the circle with the 'center' and the 'circumference'.[12] The square is inscribed into the concentric maze of the circular diagram. The relationship of the square to this diagram is to provide for an axial reference. But the iconic *manda[la* has been worked upon many different variations and its use is not only limited to temple planning but also to the use in city layouts. The basic idea being to create an axial orientation of the cities layout. Rykwert explains, "In Hindu tradition, however, the complexity of the foundation rite was carried into the actual occupation of the town. The *vastupurushamandal[5],* which varied in attributing different quarters and 'houses' to different gods, was the basis of the use and caste zoning of the town or village. But even in the description of the fire-altar ritual, as it is set down in the *Satapatha Brahman[6],* there is a clear contrast between the built object and the *manda[la*: as the *manda[la* functions from the edge inwards, so the building proper functions from the centre outwards --."[12] This relationship of the axial order and the town plan prevailed through a long period of Indian history. Most Indian cities which are ancient and founded by Hindus therefore will have this element in built in it. The social implication of this ordering principle is related to the caste system of the Hindu tradition. And thus related to the stable and animated reality of the Hindu tradition. "The relation

---

4 The circle with 'center' and 'circumference' is the iconic representation of the universe. In architecture this represented by the square.

12 Rykwert, Joseph; *The Idea Of a Town: The Anthropology of Urban Form in Rome Italy.* p. 166

5 This is the representation of the universe in the architectural idiom with the equilibrium of the man set in the middle. This diagram is the most strongest form of architectural representation of the Hindu Universe.

6 The book on ethical guidance for the Brahmin or the highest caste among the Hindus.

12 Ibid. p. 166
templum-maze-mandala, though perhaps less evident, is established by the way in which the templum, like the mandala becomes a 'prophecy' of the building or town, while at the same time it guarantees its stability, its immovability in the uncertain world. This strict order is so well adhered that, "A thoughtful Indian, even obscurely aware of the terminology of yoga, can, by looking at a temple, infer the vastupurushamandala from it, and identify his body, limb by limb, with its different parts and so with the whole universe which it represented. Geddes always looked for the evidence of any such ordering principle in his survey of the Indian towns. In most other Indian towns he found traces of it. In Dhaka there was no evidence of such an ordering element. It could be the result of the ever changing nature of the deltaic plains. But Geddes instead looked for the other reason for the origin of Dhaka as a city. And that is in this case the river. He inferred that in such cases the driving force behind the origination of these towns is the relationship of the river to the ridgeway that comes to a halt on the river bank if it could not find any means of crossing the river. Dhaka seems to have fallen into the second category. The faint traces of the axial orientation in the case of Dhaka might have been parallel to the river.

---

7 The idea of the temple and the mandala according to Roman and Hindu philosophy, as mentioned by Joseph Rykwert in his book, The Idea of a Town: The Anthropology of Urban form in Rome, Italy.

12 Ibid.
12 Rykwert, Joseph; The Idea of a Town: The Anthropology of Urban Form in Rome, Italy, p. 166
Geddes in Dhaka
Copy of the map of Dhaka that accompanied Geddes’s proposal for Dhaka.
2.1 Dhaka the Ancient City and Old Capital of Bengal

It is an interesting idea always to see where the history of a place begin. For a town planner looking at the history of a town is always associated with looking at the meaning of the existence of the town or how it came about. To him a town is part of an ongoing process. Because his intentions are very explicit. He looks at the historical facts of a city in order to understand the reason that a city has been found on a particular site or what might have been the criteria set by people at particular times in history, for the efficient planning and growth of their cities. There are always many different ways to look at the history of a town or city. Patrick Geddes looked at the history of town with the eye of a planner. To him every bit of facts from the past held some meaning to the being of the city. We here will try to look at the history of Dhaka in such a way, so that our understanding of Geddes's proposal can be complimented by that.

It is not known how and when the city was founded in the site where the old core of Dhaka stands today. Some historians argue that in the beginning it was not a city proper, instead a trading post serving the surrounding region by the river. The site is located in the tip of a triangular shaped deltaic plain, which is surrounded by three rivers running down from the north to the south. The site provided the surrounding region with the convenient location of a port and trading town. But the capitals of Bengal, which never stood in one site for too long, had three locations close to the Dhaka city. Bikrampur is known to be the oldest known capital of Bengal, belonging to the Vedic period. This capital of Bengal stood in that site for the longest period of time. Then during the Muslim

\[^{8}\] Vedic relates to the time period in Indian history during the early days of the Aryan migration in India.
Sultani\textsuperscript{9} periods the two sites those were adorned as the capital of Bengal were Bhawoal in the north and Sonargaon in the south. Somehow all these locations suggest that, though the foundation of a township in Dhaka has taken place long ago but the rulers never decided to make it the capital. One observation though makes it clear that the site must have been prone to annual flooding. Thus the earlier muslim rulers hesitated to build their capital in Dhaka. The Mughals first decided to establish their headquarters in Dhaka. The first Mughal\textsuperscript{10} General Man Singh pitched his tent in Dhaka instead of in the traditional capitals of Bengal. His attraction was, as some historians put it, the prime location of the site in the confluence of the three rivers. The site provided protection from sudden attacks from the enemies, and also easy access to the surrounding region through the river system. The Mughals by this time started developing their river fleet. This Mughal recognition of the city is the first beginning of the site as a city. This was in the year 1602 A.D. But not more than as a Mughal garrison. Finally in 1608 A.D. Shaista Khan, the Mughal Subedar\textsuperscript{11} (Governor) removed his capital from Rajmahal to Dhaka. As an administrative center the place began to develop into a full-fledged city. Before the Mughal recognition the city was functioning as the center for trade and commerce. The inhabitants of the city were mainly different professional and skilled craftsmen. The pragmatic Mughals encouraged the further development of these professional groups and they also brought in some other professional groups to

\textsuperscript{9} Sultani is the time period in Indian History especially Bengal when it was ruled by The Muslim rulers. Until the Mughals created the Imperial power in India this is the term used to denote the other dynasties.

\textsuperscript{10} The Dynasty in India established by Babur, in 1526. The last Mughal was Bahadur Shah, who was defeated by the British during the Mutiny of 1858.

\textsuperscript{11} Subedar is the term used by the Mughals to denote their governors of the Provinces.
the city maze. Like the Shakharis\textsuperscript{12} and the Tantis\textsuperscript{13}. Thus the two neighborhoods, Shakharibazar and Tantibazar. Geddes did not mention about any strict order in the form of the city, like it is found in any Hindu city, but he mentioned about the segregated neighborhoods all over the city comprising of the different castes of the Hindus. All these segregated castes at the same time represented the different professional groups. The Hindu caste system is basically based on the different professional and skilled craftsmen and artisans. This very segregation is still very much identifiable in the old sections of the city. The earlier garrisons were brought under a fortified wall and that became the first fort of Dhaka. Shaista Khan, started building the formal fort of Dhaka, the Lalbagh Fort. But before he could finish he had to leave Bengal and this new fort was never completed. However, the first fort close to which the traditional Chowk\textsuperscript{14} area kept developing, which is basically a market place also provided a strict approach to the matter. This means that in the absence of an order the Mughals provided a new order to the city. This order is very much Islamic in nature. Because close to the market place was situated the mosque. It fulfilled all criteria of a Muslim cities commercial center. The Mughals understood about the flooding problem of Dhaka, and they excavated the canal, the Dolai Khal all around the city. This served as a military strategic element and also drained out the annual flood before it could reach the city.

Under the Mughals the city developed into a prosperous one. But in the beginning of eighteenth century, the capital of Bengal was shifted to Mushidabad. Thus Dhaka lost its status once again. Before any more revival the city remained in this status of oblivion for the next two hundred years. In

\textsuperscript{12} Hindu community of craftsmen who work on 'Shakhas' or conch shells.

\textsuperscript{13} Hindu community of craftsmen who work on textile.

\textsuperscript{14} The urban space in a Muslim town. The main function in the space is the market. Other city amenities also are assembled. The mosque, Quazi's Office, etc.
between, Bengal and subsequently India, went under British colonial rule. So historically Dhaka endured the rigors of time as an unknown and obscured place. Under the colonial rule the city only saw some development work for the city taking place, fitting the provincial and colonial cities which are abundant in India. The first revival that it began to witness is in 1905 when the colonial government decided to make Dhaka the capital of the divided Eastern Bengal. This was a political hoax, so it didn’t last very long. In 1911, the decision to divide Bengal was annulled and the city again lost its status and importance. But this time the colonial government decided to make an University City out of Dhaka. And at this stage of the cities life Sir Patrick Geddes, came to provide a master plan proposal for the city. Of which we will learn more in this article.
2.2 The Geddes Proposal

2.2.1 The Extent of the Diagnostic Survey done in Dhaka

As a practice Geddes started his "diagnostic survey"\(^{15}\) in looking at the whole city and then starting at a point which most likely exerted influence in the origin and growth of the city. In Dhaka Geddes identified the river as the most important element in the origin of the city and also its subsequent growth. Dhaka after all belongs to a geographic region which is a deltaic plain. Towns and cities in deltaic plains are established with the economic aim of serving as a trading post, strategically located to be able to serve the widest extent of the region around it. So the regional trading town, which was established in the ancient times, went through its days of rise and decline in importance. The identification of the site as the most strategically suitable location for a fort town by the Mughals in the early 17th Century finally gave Dhaka a social and economic status, which is still true today. At the same time many other towns and cities were given such status by the Mughals, and the regional distribution of towns in Bengal remains the same as in those days.

Geography always played an important role in the initial selection of a site for a township. These river routes in a deltaic plain are the most important factors both in military strategic terms and in economic terms.

Geddes identified this factor quite correctly. And in his usual way drew parallel with the Marsey River basin study done in England, in talking about the river systems of Bengal. The very nature of Bengal rivers shifting its course periodically, if not every year, is very unpredictable and since the habitations on the river

\(^{15}\) The term used by Geddes in his survey of Edinburgh. With old cities, Geddes proposed that the survey should be able to identify the problems of the city.
banks are built with the prime consideration of the river as its source of sustenance. The river banks are comprised of muddy embankment, and the habitations are built on loose soil with bamboo platforms to hold the main structure of the house, and ancillaries built around it. In rainy seasons and during flood, which occurs almost every year, these muddy embankments most often collapse. Making these habitations quite temporary. The economic structure of the population living in these temporary habitats was and is still, a very important factor to take into consideration. These are mostly homeless people who have lost their landed property due to natural and man made reasons, and they come from all over the country to converge upon big cities, which provides them with an imagery of job availability and security. Land is inundated or collapsing into the river every now and then. Thus the class structure of the society is constantly in a flux of change. This is true for the general mass of the people. The elites were always protected by the ruler on top, thus the loss of his land in such circumstances ensured him to get another piece of land somewhere else. The general people may sometimes lose land due to the change of the ownership of the land from one Zamindar\(^{16}\) to the other. People are evicted by the new owner by use of force. These homeless people then become the migration population coming to the cities, where the social consideration of citizenship is the capability to work. The undelineated lands belonging to the rulers becomes the usual habitations of the homeless. The ruler is not interested in these pieces of lands since they are so temporary in their nature due to the changing river course. But the use of the workforce that comes with this migratory population is always viewed as useful by the ruler and thus most often an unwritten and recognized agreement comes into effect between the two. Before the British introduced the permanent land ownership act in India within their colonial

\(^{16}\) The landholder in the context of Bengal. Usually the land comprises of an estate.
framework, the land and property ownership in Bengal existed in a different manner. The general population was granted habitation in a region by its owner or proprietor, based on how much land he will be cultivating and what will be the profit shared between the owner and cultivator. This was an agreement whose existence depended on the recognition of the ruling class. Since in Bengal this ruling class was for most of the time a foreign invader and the change of these rulers occurred quite often, and drastic, that the general population never had a permanent address in any particular region. Continuous mobility was the inherent character of these economic class of people. This structure is also reflected in the old towns of Bengal. But after the permanent land ownership act this structure of the society started changing. The contemporary development of the middle class in Europe also had its influence in Bengal and India in general. The rulers property in the city gradually became public property. Since the British population living on the land could never claim ownership of the land, the only way it was appropriated, was by the introduction of the "government" in place of the ruler. But the population fabric didn't change so abruptly by this changing of the guard. Only in some instances the ownership of these habitations are proclaimed by the colonial government, thus making them permanent residents of the area. And subsequently engineering had to develop to protect those lands from erosion or complete obliteration by the floods and river bank collapse. But the process of this inmigration to the city remained a constant and a new name was coined to denote these people; "squatters".

Geddes, on remarking on this aspect, said that this social and town fabric is to be found generally all across India. Bengal, being on a deltaic plain has the most widest examples and thus a large portion of its population was always in state of mobility.
Since in the deltaic plain water was available all year round, the earlier rulers found it more appropriate to develop the waterways than to put their efforts into developing roadways. The fact that too many rivers had to be crossed whenever a small section of a road is constructed, prevented any massive expansion of roadways. These man-made waterways called *Khals*\(^{17}\) also provides potential contexts for these kinds of settlements to develop. In Dhaka, the khal that was dug all around the then demarcation of the town was intended as a military security cordon, built by the Mughals. Dhaka was always under the threat of pirates coming from the eastern part of the country. These pirates were actually the *Mong*\(^{18}\) tribal people. These pirates were patronized by their king, in an effort to keep a military offensive ready, against any expansionist schemes of Bengal Rulers or the Mughals. This khal provided the same kind of context for inmigration to the city to build their settlement on. To Geddes these stood as the authentic and the indigenous. He looked into them to find out about the origin and growth of settlements in deltaic Bengal.

Geddes noticed that the inappropriate treatment of manure leaves many settlements in a grossly unhygienic condition. Taking into account the flow of water in the rivers and khals most of these settlements would use these waterways as the natural drainage of their sewer. This is done in an unplanned way by the inhabitants themselves. These most often leads to the spread of a killer epidemic in the settlements. Geddes wondered why the Chinese method of manure treatment and use in agriculture is not followed by these people. The Chinese method was followed by the

\(^{17}\) The khal is the equivalent of the canal in English.

\(^{18}\) These tribal people come from the mountains in the southern part of the country. During the Mughal period Bengal was regularly attacked by these people.
Romans and eventually all of Europe came to learn about it and use it to their own benefit.

The settlements had a very authentic feature in them. Their pattern was always a matter of curious investigation as to how they came about and developed. In deltaic plains roadways are actually constructed on ridgeways. These ridgeways divide the landscape into parts. The settlements follow the pattern created by these ridgeways. The ridgeways follow the terrain and the topography of the region in consideration and thus are quite undulated and never follow a strict geometric form. Therefore their chaotic form is the result of the geography of the region, and not the result of man made and animated ideologies, such as found in great cities all over the world. This feature appealed to Geddes as one of the primary features and aspects of organic cities. When considered in terms of the whole region these ridgeways also demarcated the distribution of urban settlement on a regional scale. As an example he cited the very condition where a ridgeway comes to a point where it has to cross a river. Since the building of a pool or bridge requires community effort and a huge amount of money, and also access to technology, most often these rivers were crossed by boats and ferries. At these points the origin of a town is made possible by the coming together of people from the surrounding region. In the beginning these settlements features small huts for the shops and surrounded by huts in the traditional manner all around the core market area. A noticeable aspect in all these settlements is that the activities of settlement growth and expansion is most often limited to one side of the river or waterway. The same thing is evident in all the cities in Bengal, as in Dhaka. The reason may be attributed to the inability to connect the two sides by a bridge, for economic and technological reasons. This whole event of the creation of an urban settlement and the origination of its form
in time might lose the obvious reason for which it came about, like the change of a river course, or the transposition of a settlement from one to another because of a killer epidemic. But this whole picture remains a very interesting mystery for future generations. It is an interesting feature added upon the bare reality of a city. Geddes found this to be one of the best features of organic cities.

In light of this fact, Geddes proposed that a relief model be created for each city. Once the geographical elements are assembled on this map, the social survey findings can be updated on this basic foundation. Since the history of a place is the most important factor in the future planning of the place, Geddes thought that this relief map will be able to depict the whole series both physically and socially. This is the most important tool that is necessary for future town planning. The constant updating of information of the city both physical and social, is needed for effective and appropriate future development. Since it is the sanitation and the engineer who are involved in the effective implementation of all the development work in the city, it is extremely important that they be guided by these updates information on the city. A new professional, "The Town Planner", will be able to perform this task most appropriately. In this respect he iterated the importance of the town planning movement. "The town Planning Movement is on this side a revolt of the peasant and the gardener, as on the other of the citizen, and these united by the geographer, from their domination by the engineer." 26

This is the relationship which became a matter of the inner politics within a society throughout the whole 20th Century. The question of domination or the balance of power by each of these participating groups has left a legacy of

---

26 Geddes, Sir Patrick; *Town Planning for Dhaka* p. 6
ineffective planning and implementation. It is interesting to see even though they were made aware that they had to work in harmony for the best possible results, these words ended up falling upon deaf ears. Geddes stated his concern in the most articulate manner by saying, "Only when the mechanical energies of the Engineer are brought into line with all other aspects of the city, and these reunited in the service of life, can he change from blundering giant into helpful Hercules;" 26 he was correct to predict how the engineers role might become, if not properly guided by the total scenario of the city. He also envisioned how the evil circle of the politics can be deactivated by the democratic force of the participants and users in the whole process. Every single individual is responsible for playing his or her role in the process of city building. Throughout the whole twentieth century most countries in the third world, as in Bangladesh, have witnessed how pervasively tyrannical national political reality has subdued most other participants and put engineers and some related professionals into the key role playing mode in such matters. This has grossly effected the societies and left them paralyzed. The subtle politics later became a matter of struggle between the participants. Now in the end of the 20th Century the more democratically oriented governments are emerging in these countries and it is expected that the earlier visions of Geddes can now be fully realized, given that the democratic condition prevails.

Geddes viewed the interaction between the contributors to the objective of the development of the town as the most appropriate model. He considered city development and city building as a collective work. The co-operation should be between citizens, municipality and state. He elaborated on this aspect in his Report on Town Planning for the City of Indore.

26 Ibid.  

p. 12

44
Geddes pointed out the beginning of the form making in Indian towns by the identification of the Brahmin\textsuperscript{19} lane in the center of the town with a temple at one farthest end and the other ending on the river bank with the bathing gh\textsuperscript{a}t, constructed and with unique architectural feature. Flanking this Brahmin lane are the menial settlements on two parallel sides of the lane. Whatever the reason--- religious, commercial, secular or military, the Indian town is most often ordained by this rigorous order. The strict hierarchy in the social caste system is reflected in the form and structure of the town. Indore was a religious town, a resting point for pilgrims on their way to a site up north. Like the "macrocosm" of Hindu philosophy, the natural and geographic features around the town are attached with some religious significance. Indore stood on the way between the holy city of Ujjain and the sacred river Narbudda. The pilgrimage route is dotted with significant religious attributes, Indore being one of them. To a plain unthinking eye these geographical features may not hold any meaning at all. The history and social significance that the inhabitants of the place attribute to it is the most important aspect in this creation of the macrocosm, that is why along with a physical survey, social and cultural surveys are also needed for a better understanding of the facts of a city.

Not only the form of the city is dictated by the social hierarchy of the Hindu caste system, the management of the city is also controlled by this order. Everybody in the society has his particular task and place in the hierarchy. The shared responsibilities of every member of the society makes it possible to collectively run the affairs of the city. This arrangement may not befit the modern notion of society, not even in India, but the arrangement is a good example of how collective efforts can make a city possible and efficient. When the first

\textsuperscript{19} The highest caste among the Hindus. In ancient time they are the only one who had privilege to have education. An elite class. They perform the worship in community contexts.
Muslims invaded Indore, they settled in the periphery of the old city of Indore. The center of the city shifted in that direction within a few years, but the older structure and form was left intact. The Muslim rule turned the city into a militarily important center. But the old hierarchy and management system was followed in the same way and in the new settlements. With the coming of the colonialists the society found new definitions. Citizen, Municipality, and State are the parties, now involved in the new foundation of towns and the supervision of old ones. Geddes sought a middle ground where the old value is continued in the new context. He felt that this arrangement would safeguard the proper growth and sustenance of the cities.

When it comes to growth and sustenance of cities, Geddes formulated a set of notions on the question of 'Regionalism,' and he looked for those aspects in Dhaka. Geddes held an eccentric viewpoint on the case of a cities relationship to its region. Helen Meller, his biographer writes, "Geddes added to this his own personal response, part eccentric, part building on a wider experience of the possibilities of the regional concept. Eccentricity was foremost when, in 1883, he became fascinated by the 'golden age' of Edinburgh university, .." 4 Geddes remarked about this during the celebration of the tercentenary of Edinburgh University. He was searching for the truth as to how the University became the "Athens of the North." He concluded in his own fashion with the point of view of a botanist that human excellence also improves depending on the quality of the region they come from. In a way he saw a regional particularity in the whole issue. In this issue we could see how Geddes used his lesson learned from Frederic Le Play. Although from Auguste Comte, Geddes learned about the idealistic quality of life, he found it more akin to his own thought what Le Play preaching.

4 Sennet, Richard ; THE Conscience of the eye. p. 51-53
Le Play was very critical of Auguste Comte and believed in an exaggerated scientific approach to the social development of man. He found in Le Play's teaching some similarity to his own; "he was one of the first people to emphasize the gap between technical and moral progress." ³

This is where he drew the difference between the biological world and the human society. The biological world grows and develops in a mechanically determined manner, while human society has free will to shape its future as he mentions, "Having chosen their work, they can fashion the place; they can mold the environment in harmony with their ideals." ³

This is how he arrives at the solution of his regional issue in the case of Edinburgh University. In answer to the question he states, "Why had the University helped Edinburgh become, in the late eighteenth century, the Athens of the North?...", he ends up finding, "Since many of Edinburgh's greatest scholars had been drawn from different areas of Scotland, Geddes began to develop the idea of the special nature of particular regions, and then to relate the region with the city. He began to feel his way toward the idea that city and its region were intimately related and to understand the other. If the city was an organism, its region was its habitat. The basic idea behind Regional survey was born." ⁴

Geddes's gradual shift from botanist to Sociologist and then to Town Planning can be explained in this context. Geddes had been able to perceive the birth of the "idea of Social Reconstruction which was to become his mission as his ideas

---

³ Kiychen, Paddy; *A Most Unsettling Person.*
³ Ibid
⁴ Sennet, Richard; *The Conscience of the Eye* p. 51-53
on 'civics': an applied sociology' crystallized." 4 Geddes continued and "pursued his interest in the geographical region as a key element in his socio-biological approach." 4 Here his attention was driven towards the works of Elisee Reclus, the French geographer, who was at the time preaching "Regional Sociology' or Regionalism."

Dhaka was and still is a city in the center of all the trading that takes place in the regions around the city. In Bengal, as discussed earlier the development of roadways was stalled by the numerous riverways. So the waterways were used as an alternate and efficient channel for trade. But there is a limitation in this means, for one, it is a slow mean, and the second was that waterways are natural and as a result put a huge limitation to the way it can be used. So regions developed very distinctively in Bengal with its own center located conveniently in its central location. These regions are so distinctively different that apart from the geographical features which are natural, there are diversity in the languages, in its accents. The cultures are very subtly different from one another, the societies remained uniquely segregated from one another even when the whole region came under some kind of imperial rule from time to time. Geddes employed his understanding of Elisee Reclus's Regional Sociology or 'Regionalism'.

The greater understanding of the regional sociology also have to take into account the historical facts of a region and its city. This fact is quite important for Dhaka and it is fascinating to observe how the city depended on the social importance imbued to it by subsequent rulers of Bengal. Whenever it was made

---

4 Sennet, Richard; The Conscience of the Eye p. 51-53
4 Ibid. p. 51-53
the capital of Bengal or the Province of Bengal according to its imperial overlords, the city flourished. Industries, trade and commerce developed.

The population grew immensely. The city provided a new dimension to the development of the region around it. This whole growth process came to a halt as soon as the capital was shifted somewhere else. The industries died out. Commerce and trade gradually shifted to other centers. What is most important is that a psychological impasse, similar to a depression sets in among the whole population.

The last one being within the colonial context. It happened within only a few years and the impact was remarkable. In 1905 the colonial government decided to divide the province of Bengal in two separate regions based on their religious orientation. The eastern part comprising of the region of Eastern Bengal and Assam were united under one province and Dhaka was named as its capital. This became a new beginning for Dhaka. Since the British Colonialists defeated the Bengal Nabab in 1757, they gradually started shifting the administrative offices from Murshidabad\textsuperscript{20} to Calcutta. The puppet regime was placed under custody in the old palace in Dhaka. Mushidabad died out as a city, and Dhaka survived as a dying entity, with the presence of Bengal's last Nababs. After the Indian Mutiny\textsuperscript{21} in 1858 the last Nabab lost all favors with the colonialists, and India came under British Imperial rule. Calcutta became the capital of this new Empire in India. Dhaka lost all its remaining importance and survived as one of those small administrative cities which exist all over India.

\textsuperscript{20} The last capital of Bengal before the British colonial power was established in Bengal. The war that took place between the British colonialists and all the princes of India. The local Princes use to call it the War of Independence, and the British termed it as Mutiny against their loyal forces.
The decision to confer upon Dhaka the status of a capital of the Province of Bengal and Assam gave a new life to the city. New areas were brought under the dimension of the city and building activities started with a new pace. With this started the importation of new ideas that was developing in Europe and Britain, but never found its way into the colonies. The whole social set up in the colonies was based on difference and discrimination in Dhaka we see the reflection of some of the contemporary thoughts of the colonialists. That is also very much molded by the acts of certain individuals, in this case Lord Curzon, the governor-general of India during that period. Though he is blamed by historians as the progenitor of the idea of the division of Bengal based on its religious constituent, he was also the same man to inspire the synthesis of Eastern and Western thought, and cultural dimensions, like architecture, literature, painting and others. Some of the remarkable buildings and architectural complexes built during this time period reflect such synthesis of thoughts and ideas. This kind of synthesis always occurred in the Indian cultural and architectural scene; but Lord Curzon, in his efforts to quell political upheavals used this idea of synthesis as an effective tool. Under whatever political circumstances this idea took birth, and faced immense skepticism on both sides. This whole enterprise stood as the first stepping stone for the colonialists to look at the cultures and traditions of the colonies with tolerance and respect. It is the beginning of a new tradition in that the colonialists themselves tried to be more compassionate to the cultural and social norms of the colonies. Geddes came to India as a result of such endeavors. The governor of Madras Lord Pentland was well acquainted with the works of Geddes in Edinburgh. He recommended that an invitation be extended to Geddes to come to India and work on the town planning proposal of some towns and cities in Madras. He argued that Geddes's sensitive approach to detail and his all-encompassing city survey
methods would be the most appropriate in trying to comprehend the Indian notions and traditions in similar matters. This became a new beginning in the tradition of cross cultural assimilation. But all these activities came to a halt when the division of Bengal was annulled in 1911. Dhaka fell into another stage of its depression in the city activities.

When Geddes was invited to Dhaka the aim was to let Geddes formulate a future plan for the city which the colonial government of the time decided to establish as a university city. Though the reason behind this decision was very much political, the result entitles it to be called one of the best thing that could have happened to the city. Geddes also realized the fact and in his proposal called for a complete, self-sufficient and self-sustained city to be built here. He found all the ingredients for this kind of development to be present in this city and its region. Thus in his proposal he called for a proper city development scheme instead of just planning for the new extensions of the city belonging to the university. At that time the area demarcated for the university development was slightly more than the area of the city itself. Geddes found the effort of the government to establish a University town to be insufficient to the renewal of the city. He noted how through the ages the city suffered urban depression, and agricultural depression also sets in, since, cities are the centers of trading and agricultural development in a region dependent on these trading. In a declining situation, the urban depression gives birth to mental depression of the population to set up new ones. Old industries die out and there is not enough entrepreneurship left among the population to set up new ones. The decaying social condition of the city gives birth to vicious circles and city neighborhoods deteriorate to conditions similar to ghettos. Dhaka faced a similar situation after the sudden loss of its status as capital in 1911. Thus Geddes proposed that
alongside the development of the new quarters in Dhaka the old parts also have to be renewed or their activities rejuvenated otherwise the efforts of the government would not be successful in making the city a whole.

In dealing with this old part of the city, which is demarcated distinctively by the canal starting at one point on the river and ending at another, Geddes pointed out the way urban renewal can be approached in this context. He himself carried out similar efforts in Edinburgh and redeveloped some of the oldest quarters in Edinburgh in Ramsey Gardens. His model worked quite well in Edinburgh and the city in fact developed many of its quarters with the same approach in mind.

The most important element in this urban renewal approach is to create a historiographic map of the old cities. Geddes tried to acquire as much knowledge as possible in this respect on Dhaka. But he agreed upon the amount of information he could gather in his given short span of time he spent in Dhaka, and he made the proposal following that line of thinking. He also recommended further investigation in this respect and called upon scholars to build up a stronger knowledge base on this subject matter.

In his approach to this matter Geddes stressed the proliferation of this information among the functionaries of the cities and also at the same time the inhabitants of the city, who are the participants in the affairs of the city. His concern in this respect was upon the rejuvenation of the depressed population of the city. The only way these people could be brought back into the affairs of the city was by rekindling their pride and aspirations and by creating a competitive attitude among the separate neighborhoods of the city.
2.2.2 Exploiting the waterways in Dhaka

In the beginning of the proposal Geddes identified the importance of the river and the waterways in the reality of Dhaka and other cities in Bengal. Rivers play an important role in the origination of a city. It acts as the trade route for cities and its regions, because in a deltaic plain land routes are numerous criss-crossed by rivers or waterways thus making land routes a cumbersome means of communication. These rivers and waterways also sustain the habitats that grow up on its banks. The process of the growth of these habitations has already been described in the earlier part of this thesis. Geddes called for due consideration of these rivers and waterways and called for proper survey of their course and regular updating of information, so that a continuous process of reorganization of the region and the cities can be taken care of before these matters get out of hand, like forecasting trade routes and the shifting of habitations. Geddes thought about the model that had been built for the study of Marsey River basin in England. He proposed the construction of a similar model in Bengal river systems, since he found this river system to be one of the most fascinating one in terms of its mobility and reorganization after each flood. According to his own model this constant change made it almost impossible to give way to comfortable human habitation. But then he saw, in Bengal and also around Dhaka, how people survive against miserable odds in their life. He immediately looked at it as a lesson he learned and called for organized forecasting and predicting capabilities so that the misery could be minimized, at least, if not eliminated entirely. This model was later built by the government of Bangladesh when it established the River Research Institute, for the constant study of the rivers in the country. The model needs to be made more interactive to be employed properly for prediction and forecasting. But at least Geddes's
initial idea has been finally realized in whatever crude form it now survives.

Since in the origin of some cities the 'ridge ways' and "pathways" play an important role, especially at the point where the "ridgeways" or "pathways" come to cross a river or water way is where the cities takes origin. The city then grows up with the support of the river or waterway. Therefore, later on in the life of the city the rivers or waterways makes a permanent mark upon the bearing of the city. In the future growth of the city, it is more appropriate to consider the positive use of the rivers or waterways, instead of negating it. We know now how Dhaka has been deprived of its river by its northward expansion, and also know of the negation of the natural drainage system which is closely related to the rivers or waterways which surround the city. Very recently a tyrannical ruler commissioned the building of a dam all around the city. This huge project involving a close to 100 mile long dam, was not the right solution, because it keeps the water away from the city, and also fails to properly drain the water that is already inside the dam, due to excessive rainfall or any probable breach in the dam. Instead of a dam it should have been excavated as a canal, like Dolai Khal, to facilitate the drainage of flood water before it could inundate the city areas. In Dhaka this kind of a canal is the most suitable form of flood protection. Because in flood season, all three of the major rivers which surround Dhaka and drains down excessive amount of water from the north to the south, sometimes cannot be drained out by the usual channel of the river course. As a result the whole region gets inundated and the city though in a high plain becomes a victim of the flood because of the flood water that submerge everything all around it. This canal could become a source of attraction for park improvement, agricultural development on the two adjoining regions, and also this water way can work as a peripheral circulation route for the city, especially
for goods handling, and these waters can also be used as pisciculture development.

As for the development of the communication route on this kind of canal, Geddes pointed out the adverse effect of the inner politics that can take place in it. Like he mentioned about the very instance of the development of the larger communications between Dhaka and Narayanganj and how this communication was effected by the politics between the long concentration of governing minds and of the commercial leaderships. However, he did not go into any more details, because his planning proposal was in nature a very sketchy one and intended as a catalyst for future action in planning proposal formulation instead of aggravating conflict between different parties. But as we know the fate that his proposal was put into soon afterwards it was produced. Even his off-hand remarks might have upset many people, which had repercussions in not being recognized in official-dome. However, Geddes correctly pointed out that, in consideration of the growth of commerce, and domestic marketing etc., the canal ports can be improved and more may be built to serve key points of the city. This will happen in conjunction with the improvement of the town's markets, and of vegetables, grains, etc. Geddes compared this canal system to the one which was planned in the Netherlands. He remarked that it is always a common tendency in England and India to destroy the canal banks with the building of a railway on them. Geddes strongly suggested that these canal routes should instead be developed as water parks. In the later part of the twentieth century waterways in cities were more utilized for wonderful park development. Geddes envisioned this in his proposal in Dhaka, "Yet this outlook and landscape is not a purely utilitarian one. On the contrary, here is a Park system of the rarest extent and beauty, a water park unparalleled
elsewhere, and on which, after the reasonable improvement for which we are pleading, a new recreative life would arise; and this for University and City alike." 26
2.2.3 The Social Environment of Dhaka

The social environment in Dhaka at the time when Geddes came to visit the city was harmonious. Like in any other cities founded by the Hindus, an unique ordering principle was not present in Dhaka. Even if it had existed in the long forgotten and untraceable past, it could not be recognized any more. As Geddes pointed out in Indore, the main street, ran between the temple to the Ghat on the river bank, and was flanked by the menial quarters on the two sides of this central axis. This type of ordering principle is generally found in many cities all around India. But in Dhaka there is no such axial ordering element in the city layout. The only major thoroughfare that runs parallel to the river is the most significant element in the city from which the rest of the city order generated. But even this thoroughfare did not exist during the Hindu period, it was built by the Mughal rulers when they founded the capital of Bengal in Dhaka. The river bank in Dhaka was and still is dotted with old palaces; in one portion where most of the Hindu zamindars had their houses built, we see Ghats\textsuperscript{22} coming down to the river from the houses. May be all of the river bank was jotted with such houses in the Hindu period of the city. Which is akin to the pilgrimage cities in India, like Kashi, Benares, etc. In Dhaka the river keeps shifting its course all the time. This happens because of the annual heavy rainfall and subsequent flash floods. Added to that, the river banks mainly composed of muddy clay, breaks into the river every now and then, thus making the course of the river change according to the natural cleavage on the soil. The buildings built on the river bank during the colonial time were more permanent in nature and care was taken for their firmness by building embankments on the waters edge of the buildings. In the

\textsuperscript{22} This is the traditional embankment on the river or any water body. Usually the Ghat is used for bathing, washing, river transport, etc.
late Nineteenth Century the citizens of the city built a permanent embankment on the river bank by their own monetary contribution. The purpose that it was supposed to serve was a permanent delineation of the river and more importantly an afternoon promenading place for the citizen of the town. This was one of the most important pass-time in the afternoon hours for most Bengalis, urban or rural.

But apart from these few features there is nothing to strongly suggest the older order of the Hindu city. Thus the older section of the town before the Mughal ascension was confined within a very small area. When the Mughals started to build the town, and make it their capital of Bengal, they first started digging the Dolai Khal (the canal around Dhaka). Within the area of this khal in the west were built all of the Muslim quarters, some were in the north-east. But immediately after that the influx of a huge muslim population in Dhaka required new areas to be developed. The development of new muslim settlements followed the same direction. In most Indian cities which were formerly Hindu cities we see this phenomenon happening when the muslim population moves into the city. Most often the muslim settlements are built outside the hir.du care without disturbing the older order. In Dhaka we see the same thing happening. The muslim settlements developed in the west and north-west directions. The development to the east was stalled up to the Dolai Khal. Only after the mid-nineteenth century did the area in the east begin to develop as city area. The early twentieth century was a time in the life of the city when it began to expand enormously. It gained in status as a political and administrative center, and the population began to grow enormously. But the segregation based on religion remained in the city. Geddes found this segregation all over India, and proposed that if the social coercion existing in the society prefers the choice of
this segregation, then town planners have to acknowledge this choice. In Dhaka this situation was in its own way quite harmonious and Geddes envisioned that the rebirth of the city as a University City will facilitate a broader perspective among the inhabitants and a mutual respect for each others existence and growth. Geddes claimed Dhaka to be a post-industrial city, therefore he thought that the city had already overcome the social inhibitions of the past and could charge into a more dynamic future. He found many historical and religious relics of the past spread all over the city, which belonged to all the representative religions and are mostly in a state of decay. He proposed that all these relics should be renovated so that in the overall fabric of the city we will find a representation of each cultural phase and religious group in the city from the past to the present. This would create a harmonizing situation for all the communities living in it. Thus the respect and encouragement of each others growth will be enhanced and the natural drive among men for the repression of the other will be largely diffused.

The post-industrial dimension that Geddes observed in Dhaka actually can be analyzed in a different way. Since the Hindu caste system is mainly based on the occupation of a particular man, the Hindu philosophical tradition for the ordering of society took that dimension more into account than anything else. The segregated quarters of the city held a particular professional group in it. Thus the market economy also represented each quarter of the city as the source for the availability of particular products. When Geddes talked about the industrial towns he proposed that they be provided garden village neighborhoods for their residences, which should be adjacent to the industry itself, but not built in the manner of a "cooley line" or a "By law lane."23 His

---

23 Since huge number of factory workers started coming to the city in the early
concern was about the emerging new class structure of the society where religious and other social tenets from the past will not be so much represented in urban form, and the comfort and harmony of social living will be a more important factor to the planning of cities. Dhaka inherited this character in its layout from its past as a Hindu city. Even today this character remains intact especially in the segregated businesses and manufactories. In modern planning principles these criteria are given important consideration. After the establishment of Dhaka as the capital of East Pakistan, the city development efforts were brought under some institutional formalities. The establishment of the "Dhaka Improvement Trust" was one of these efforts. The independence in 1947 also brought about a huge migration of refugees from across the border. To deal with the housing and settlement needs of these refugees the new government established a parallel institution called the "Housing and Settlement Directorate." New areas were acquired and developed for settlement purposes. Thus this step was another effort towards creating a new enclave for further extension of the city. The refugee population had a different language and they were not Bengalis, therefore their new enclave became another segregated part of the city. All this happened long after Geddes produced his proposal for Dhaka. His proposal was completely ignored and segregated enclaves were founded by city institutions themselves. The higher status of a capital city could inspire the city gentry to think about an even broader perspective than that of University City. Their failure at that point left a mark on the cities future. But after 1971 this refugee population again migrated out of the city, and to the West Pakistan, thus leaving those segments of the city to be taken up by the new immigration from the rural areas of Bangladesh itself. With this the segregated nature of these
settlement areas began to change and the same area looked more integrated into the total city fabric.

2.2.4 Identifying the Advantageous Aspects in Dhaka

As discussed earlier, the waterways and khals have strong influence on the origin of towns and cities. Even after the birth of the city the khals keep exerting influence on its form, and its future growth and decay. In Bengal most khals were natural. The excess water from the river overflow always found new cleavages in the ground to flow through. Sometimes local rulers would dig up a connecting khal from the river to make natural khals all year round. In Dhaka the Dolai Khal looks more like a moat like structure, protecting the city from militaristic point view. But this khal also worked as a natural drainage. The three rivers coming down from the north and flowing south all around the city was a major concern for Dhaka. Since these rivers always overflowed during flood and the excess water washed out the city annually. The Mughals, knowing this, dug the canal all around the city, thus ensuring that the excess water is drained out before reaching the city. The canal that was dug around Dhaka, seems according to Geddes to be one of the blessing for the city. Because, he observed, these incoming water will replenish the canal all year round. As mentioned earlier, Geddes found this element of the city to be one of the most important and interesting elements of the city, which should be exploited to its end. There are many tanks and pools spread all over Dhaka. These were dug by communities or sometimes by wealthy families for the purpose of domestic use. These tanks held water for domestic washing and other purposes. But since these tanks are not maintained very well and sometimes the banks of these tanks are occupied by homeless people migrating to the city, shambles are
strewn all around them. Geddes proposed that these tanks can be excavated and its banks cleared of the shambles and instead lined with pavement and trees, thus creating a sort of park in the city fabric. Even if the tanks are sometimes beyond repair and have to be filled up, then the area that is reclaimed by this process could be used for similar park like purposes.

Talking about the fabric and the urban pattern that existed in Dhaka, Geddes looked into the origin of the fabric that then existed in Dhaka. Since Dhaka lies in a Deltaic plain, the general topography in and around Dhaka are flood plains. The ancient means of connecting one place to the other are the 'Ridgeways' or 'pathways' built by the soil excavated on the both sides of these raised ridgeways. So the landscape becomes a mixture of highgrounds and potted water reservoirs. The habitations are built along the directions that these ridgeways delineated. Gradually these habitations make up a village or a whole city. Since these ridgeways or pathways follow the natural terrain, especially in terms of flood drainage, they don't have any strong geographical form, which can be interpreted as the city fabric. Thus the fabric is rather chaotic, and free flowing. The other dimensions that make this fabric even more organic in nature is the social factors that influence it. This social dimension is what makes the urban fabric more organic in nature. Geddes's appreciation of this fabric reflects his interest in looking for the appropriate dimensions, those of which comprise the making of an organic city form. The social dimensions are some of these important factors which make the city form to become organic in nature. The basic difference that this organic form has with the man made (animated) grid form is that the social hierarchy in the society where this organic form is being created is very well represented in the form of the city. In its place the grid form denotes a more equal and democratic norm. Geddes held a very
particular attitude about politics in general. He believed in a more democratic norm rather than a socialistic one, but then he believed that the social hierarchies are the most appropriate mechanism for social order, and he believed in the ancient tradition that survived in India. In Dhaka he found the similar situation existing and in his proposal made suggestions that the future growth should take into account the existing social structure, and maintain the organic way of the urban growth. But he also called for the town planners attention to the matter, that some sort of order must also be set in the master plan prior to new development of a place, especially in terms of communications and improvements. In Dhaka the large old fort area lying in the middle of the old city was transformed into a Jail by the colonial government. When Geddes started working in Dhaka, the colonial government has already started thinking about shifting the Jail from this inner city location to a suburban, remote site. Geddes pointed out in his report what possibilities this shift might hold for the city, and also help in the overall circumstances of the city. In his own words, "For here is the situation, the only large one, and the best possible, for a substantial improvement of communications and amenities together, and of designing something worthy of the historic and developing city, worthy of the regional metropolis it has always been, and of the university and residential city it is becoming." 26

In the overall redevelopment scheme of the city, the proposal for a university town has rekindled a new spirit to the city inhabitants. The city can now grow into an universal community with appropriate respect being paid to all the participating religions, the identification and renovation of the old relics of all

26  Geddes, Sir Patrick ;  Town Planning for Dhaka
religions. The new fabric of the city will be highlighted with these landmarks. An unique example of social harmony and mutual co-operation. Somehow Geddes learned that the Bengali mind is traditionally a very peace loving and poetic mind. In his usual way as a sociologist he attributed this fact to social and environmental factors.  

In harmonizing and creating an unique social and physical environment the university played an immense role. What Geddes proposed has been followed to some extent, and as a result Dhaka got a whole quarter of it which exemplifies the use of a garden city model in the urban fabric. It was unique in Dhaka because the whole area housed only University buildings and residential quarters for the people who served there and they are spread all over a garden environment. The whole area is served by commercial services in its adjoining peripheries, and in fact in all sides. Because of the location of commercial activities around it, the whole university area was traversed by these traffic participating in the activities of the real city. Geddes himself thought this to be the best model for the city, because by this combination the real city will revive completely and sustain the university not as an isolated entity but as an integral part of city life. While the university will hold within the city a unique garden environment, serving academia and residences. But for all these Geddes had no formal and geometrical delineation of the spaces being created. He expected an organic growth of the area by the influence of physical features of the terrain and the social factors that leads it to the urban pattern and fabric that it gradually becomes.

___________________________

26 Geddes, Sir Patrick; *Town Planning for Dhaka*
The proximity of all the other institutions around the university fitted exactly the way Geddes wanted them. Since the city itself was growing at the same time, and as a city it needed all the new amenities. Geddes found this to be the right opportunity for the city and university to compliment each other in their growth. Once the Medical College, Dental College, Teacher’s Training College, Arts and Crafts College, etc. are built, the in-between areas can then be developed as residential and commercial areas; thus the amenities of the city will gradually give it a completeness. Much of this model envisioned by Geddes came into being in Dhaka afterwards, but since Geddes’s proposal never found a place in any formal institution, the ideas were gradually forgotten and lost. New development came in without any consideration for the overall well being of the city.

Geddes then pointed out that there are quite a substantial number of open spaces available in the old city, and he also called for a search for more such open spaces. These spaces can be turned into gardens, parks or esplanades, or to similar uses. The old fabric of the city needs these spaces. Geddes also pointed out that the planner can invent new spaces for these kind of purposes. For instance the river front could be exclusively developed as a park and recreational space, but then the commercial use of the river bank has to be relocated suitably. He appreciated the embankment that was already built by the residents themselves and hoped that the rest of it would be completed up to the city limit by another such effort. Along with this the river itself can provide for some recreational facilities, like boat racing and boat riding in the afternoon, both of which are very much traditional in Bengal. Geddes stressed the point that though these things are only being observed and performed occasionally, the city can make them regular and permanent events, thus reviving the health
of the city. Another feature that Geddes thought could be used for such purposes is the island on the river. This island has a historical value attached to it, because of the exiled Nababs of Bengal and their families were put under custody in the palace that used to stand in the middle of the island. The palace does not exist anymore, but there are some remains and given the natural growth of the vegetation the whole place remains in a jungle like state. This island can be developed as a park and garden for the citizen to enjoy afternoon promenades and holiday picnicking. Another element Geddes could be integrated as an entertainment amenity to the city were the graveyards. Instead of being just some expendable spaces associated with death, they can be turned into gardens with trees and plants spread all over the place and in between graves. Since Muslims have a habit of visiting the graves of their relatives, they will find it to be enjoyable to visit the grave, like being in a garden. Thus a simple effort can make a city amenity serve a function of the city.

Geddes proposed that the large public tanks in Dhaka can be recognized as important city elements and they can be redeveloped by removing the 'bustis' which has gathered around the tanks. As Geddes described in his proposal that the embankment of any kind of waterways and rivers are the probable grounds for the poor migrants to build their habitations. These embankments are most often "no man's land." Thus these floating and mobile population finds it convenient for them to keep resettling on new grounds, whenever the old one collapses into the river. Sometimes the banks of large tanks are considered for such use. In Dhaka most of these large tanks are surrounded by bustis. Geddes called for appropriate relocation of these bustis and for the

---

24 The land beside the road is the best example of this type of government land. Any Other such land is used by land less people for their habitation.
25 The english equivalent of this term is Ghetto.
development of the tanks and its surroundings as parks. Geddes also proposed that the bustis should be improved. The use of the indigenous material in the bustis is one of the most important aspects, since it would not burden the busti dwellers with an unnecessary cost of living, and also make it possible to bring about by affordable materials. These bustis would work as model villages. These villages can be lined with khals and canals and gardens around it.

The element of having the khals and canals around a village, a neighborhood or a city is the most fascinating element that should be utilized wherever possible. Geddes based his argument on the facts he observed in Bengal. In a Delta plain he found adequate water in the khals and canals all year round. Moreover, the landscape in Bengal is traversed by numerous rivers and water drainage systems. Thus habitats grow up conveniently on the banks of these rivers and the waterways become the means of communication for these habitats. In his observations in Dhaka Geddes pointed out all the advantages that Dolai Khal was exerting on the functioning of the city. Even in the tradition of formal landscaping and gardening the water system has been playing quite a significant role. But the whole tradition of gardening and landscaping and along with it the development of irrigation systems, was heralded by the Mughals, beginning with Babur. Babur showed amazement at the possibility that the Indian landscape provided for good gardening. But at the same time he was disappointed by the indifference that was shown by the previous rulers towards this aspect. Thus Babur had to work on many things related to gardening right from the beginning, especially on irrigation. But Babur was working in Northern India, close to Delhi and Agra, which are semi-arid regions. His later generation had the opportunity to work in Bengal and they found the possibilities in Bengal to be immense. They exploited these to the fullest extent.
They also adapted to the local conditions where necessary. For architectural materials they used brick and lime concrete instead of stone and other naturally permanent materials. They also used to put lime-plaster on brick buildings to make it look like a stone built structure. In Bengal the Mughals fulfilled all their dreams of creating good gardens. The availability of water and the natural condition of the environment supportive to the growth of so many diverse floras and faunas has provided them with an immense possibility of choice.

The Mughals also had a poetic dimension added to their gardening. In Bengal they found the landscape to be providing them with such circumstances and also the poetic psyche of Bengali people. It helped them in enhancing their novel thoughts about the matter. In gardening and in landscape treatment these collaborations has left some of the most important gardens scattered around Bengal. Geddes also recognized that fact and his proposal contains such exuberant dreams of creating the most beautiful haven on earth. But his dreams were not only limited to gardens. He talked about the whole of Bengali towns and cities. With the attributes those Geddes found in Dhaka, he imagined the whole University town to look like an entire garden. This very part of the proposal was inscribed into the mind of the people of Bengal. Thus the notion of making Dhaka a garden haven keeps recurring to the mind of the Bengali people even today. Geddes showed how efficiently with the help of modern technologies and their advanced possibilities the same city can be turned into a beautiful place. The poetic psyche of Bengali people would be an added advantage in this case. And according to Geddes, the collaboration of the painter's eye with the planter's hand will bring about the most promising feature for the city; he wrote, "It is not a question of any great expense, but merely of that appreciative and constructive collaboration in
which the painter's eye goes with the planter's hand." 26 About Dhaka Geddes held a particular interest in the further development of the city into an organic one, "In summary then, it is only common truth to say that among the many cities I have now studied in India, I have found only one or two others which might be as easily, simply and inexpensively provided with a park system; and this upon an extent and with an effect not only rivaling that of great cities, but surpassing most of them. True, the temples, ghats and other monumental adornments, which beautify such areas in other cities, are not here present; but the landscapes are the main thing; and the rest would be provided by that incipient renewal of religion upon the modern plane of which the current awakening of civic feeling, with its desire for improvements, its zeal towards public health and sanitation, are everywhere becoming such conspicuous beginnings."15

We know now that the climate and soil condition in the Bengal region is one that is very fertile and capable of giving new regeneration. The high fertility of the species in Bengal is now a proven fact and applies to human being at the same time. Geddes felt this fact could be used towards the advantage of the city. This would be quite an innovation, because the reason for which the fertility rate of Bengal always come to scholars minds is because of the immense problem that the country now faces with its huge population and which is growing at a steady pace. But to Geddes the population of the cities in Bengal stood for conscious communities concerned about their habitation and their environments. In his own words, "As regards population village conditions and

26 Geddes, Sir Patrick; *Town Planning for Dhaka*

15 Benevolo, L.; *The History of the City*
traditions survive throughout the greater part of Dacca, so that gardening space, however wasted, plainly exists".26

All these facts and the existing preconditions convinced Geddes that Dhaka could be turned into a wonderful organic city. He wrote, "After looking at some forty cities and always with this quest on in my mind, I answer unhesitatingly---where better than in Dacca? --- and this as regards population and place alike." 26 Geddes didn't only stop in his observations, he looked for ways to improve the city's condition, by the use of these positive preconditions that exist in the region. He proposed that the premises of the schools in the city should be grown as a garden, thus providing a cool and shaded and clean environment for the children to grow in to healthy individuals. This was quite unusual and at the same time was considered an unique improvement in the schools in Dhaka city. In all these Geddes actually showed his concern for the existing norms of the people concerned in this context. It seems people in Bengal who migrate from the village to the suburbs of the city bring with them habits from the village. Since in the village environment the households are always surrounded by trees and plants, it becomes hard for them to completely discard these elements from their household when they come to the city. Many of the plants that are grown in these households are vegetable and fruit plants. This serves two purposes, creating a shaded environment and also produces from the plants which they could consume as food. This habit is profitable sometimes, since some fruit trees give out so much fruit that they can sell out in the market and make some profit. So instead of turning the suburbs of the cities into unproductive and sterile

26 Geddes, Sir Patrick; Town Planning for Dhaka

26 Ibid.
habitations, these inhabitants, turn them into productive enterprises. Geddes identified this as a positive nature of the population and suggested further improvement on these ventures if possible. This is quite contrary to what we have seen in many town planning efforts throughout the twentieth century when planners turned their planned environments into sterile and stagnant propositions.

When Geddes worked on planning proposals in India he paid attention to the fact that the cities must have an efficient natural drainage system. Planners must pay attention to the fact that the planning of the city should take into consideration the topographic condition of the site and draw the urban design proposal with fact being taken into consideration. So the Town Planning survey should at the same time be paying utmost importance to the drainage Survey of the site. In traditional Indian cities this facts has always been evident. The Mughals, who were masters in irrigation engineering always thought about natural drainage in the cities as the most important factor to be considered in the founding of a city. To them this drainage study included an over all understanding of the regional situation on the drainage issue, and thus the necessity for regional surveys. And in their decision to choose a site for a city they would give this the top priority in drainage, while selecting their site. In Bengal the problem was even more immense, because Bengal was a flood prone area and cities had to be constructed on the highest ground available. When this natural drainage needed supplemental drainage for excess water during flooding, the Mughals excavated khals and canals. Most of the regional set up and regional towns and cities were engineered and organized by the Mughals before Geddes came to Bengal. Therefore what Geddes saw in those existing cities were the reflection of the work done by the Mughals. Many of these Khals and
canals were filled up with siltation from the floods without any repair or excavation, and became ineffective in drainage purposes. Geddes found the task of excavation to be serving two purposes; one is to clear up the storm drainage way and the second is to use the silt coming out of the canal beds to be used in cultivation lands. These silts are naturally very fertile; and can be used to boost the agricultural growth of the farmers land.
Dhaka grew into a city from its old settlements. Always the older historical parts are arranged in a succession of layers. Geddes started by pointing out these historical layering in the city. Dealing with Dhaka city means dealing with all its historical layering. Since Geddes had to propose a master plan with the University in consideration, he proposed that all the historical layering of old Dhaka be given adequate significance in the renewal project, thus exemplifying the different social, religious and cultural bearings of the city. After all, the old city of Dhaka went through four significant stages; the early Vedic, Buddhist, Hind and finally the Muslim phase. When Geddes began working it was already taking the shape of a colonial city. In Dhaka what is interesting is that each of these time "periods are also represented in the segregated quarters of the old city. Especially the Hindu and Muslim periods are quite distinctive.

Geddes took up each of these quarters of the city and after thorough observation made some proposal about the way they can further be modified or even without modification, how they can be connected to the new reality of a University Town. Unfortunately Geddes could not take too many of the quarters into consideration for his survey or proposal, because of the lack of time. But in the few examples he mentions in his proposal he showed the way they can be dealt with. He also mentioned that survey and observations have to be conducted even deeper than the extent he had been able to work in.

a) Wari:

Geddes's short acquaintance with Dhaka made his choice of examples for "diagnostic survey" quite difficult and uncertain. He admired Wari. It was the result of a man whose intimacy with the town was long enough to gain a much better understanding of the mechanism of the society and culture and thus
reflect appropriately in city improvement and town planning. Since Geddes was always interested in the social and cultural aspect of the environment of man he believed that the attachment to a place is much more important for anybody to understand the inner mechanism of a place than the outsider who perceives every thing in the abstract and seeks solutions in the same manner. In Wari he observed a rather contemporary effort in city neighborhood creation. When it comes to the expansion of these neighborhoods, it is even more interesting to see how the society takes each of these new models for the future developments, and how the model is even improved upon. Geddes pointed out that this is an unique model among men to pick up something that can be worked upon, and which is most visibly and prominently showing every sign of future prospect.

b. Thana W. C. Area

This area is quite opposite to Wari. It is a dilapidated and ruined area. People live here in a miserable condition. The need here Geddes pointed out is to make "experimental sounding". In a way to arouse the citizenry. It is interesting how he envisions only the co-operative improvement ventures. And no imposing ideas of economic improvement. But as an immediate remedy he proposes the implementation of street-improvements.

c. Main Street

The east-west main street required immediate improvement. A tramway would have been a wise idea for the commuting purposes. But the city could not afford it. So even if a bus is provided it would help the situation immensely. The problem in this dense city fabric is that the widening of the street would not be so easy. Since this widening effort has to take into consideration the property rights of
Individual owners. So the city had to embark on a gradual improvement effort. According to Geddes these are the parts of the social concerns which make up the city, and their coercive influences give shape to the city form.

d. **Esplanade**

As the river esplanade was developed by the generous contribution of one person, so the old main street can be widened and an esplanade created to create city activities and rejuvenate the area. The point is to create "city pride".

e. **Shakharibazar**

Geddes blamed the residents here for their own fate. It is up to them to change their circumstances. The reason for this kind of bold remark coming from Geddes goes back to the history of the area. When the Mughals first founded their capital of Bengal in Dhaka, they brought in many professional castes among the Hindus to settle in Dhaka, and thus to give Dhaka a much more diversified representation of the different social religious and cultural groups. These *Shakharis*, as the people of caste are called, used to build very small houses, and worked on the *Shakha’s* - the conch shells in their ground floor workshops. They lived in that area for three hundred years. And without expansion of their areas in the city context they had to expand vertically. So the families expanded and they lived in the same building in an effort to remain together. But there was a limit and as a final outcome they turned out to be what Geddes saw in the time he survey the area. Even today in the late twentieth century we don’t see anything much different, but rather worse than before. In this respect Geddes compared the two situations one of institutional bearing and the other resting on free will. The difference is prominent. What is to be observed here is that Geddes did not mean that free will of men to be the criterion for organic
growth. But organic growth is actually the coercion exercised by men living in communities and societies. Compared against Shakaribazar, Geddes saw in the development of adjacent areas a very appreciative characteristic, that of the "grouping of institutions, governmental and municipal, educational and religious; and all," 26 which he thinks will make a better city environment for its inhabitants.

These two areas are situated so close to each other that they come out prominently to any observer's eye. Geddes appreciated the quality of the new development; where the grouping of the institutions are an unique example. He was impressed and expressed his excitement about that, as we see in his own words, "On no town-plan in the world can I recall a better example of the grouping of institutions, governmental and municipal, educational and religious; and all, to the best of my knowledge and sincere belief, bent with unblemished devotion, upon their respective dispensing of justice, goodness and truth." 26

Coming back to the issue of Shakaribazar, Geddes was skeptical about his role in the improvement of the area. He was only just a passing visitor and in a week had to observe the whole city, thus denying him any deeper search or understanding of the social mechanism of the area.

Geddes showed his concern about himself being an outsider, "How natural then, that administrator and vacill, city councillor and official, educationalist and missionary, mournfully admitting their unsuccess in dealing with these evils beside them, should shake experienced heads over any sanguine new-comer's suggestions of improvements." 26 He was also in doubt about his own abilities, "How can the adjacent squalor, the filth and foetor of over crowding, with all its

26 Geddes, Sir Patrick; *Town Planning for Dhaka*

26 Ibid.
26 Ibid.
attendant evils, which have not only resisted their endeavours, but grown even worse instead of better within their memory, be helped by a passing visitor, with his talk about town-planning?" 26

The new development adjacent to Shakharibazar not only just point out about the sorry state of Shakharibazar; it also has upset the role of a main axis played by the Shakharibazar Road. This road found its role diminished when the British imposed the North-South axis leading from the river to the Dacca College, which was also built by the British. With this development grew the Municipal offices, Colleges, Schools and Missions around this esplanade (the central area). This brought about a new hub to the old Dhaka. This whole mater was explained by Geddes, thus, "In a town as in a fluid any variation of pressure soon makes itself felt from center to circumference, imperfect though the fluidity may be." 26 A new road connection between the New Market proposed on the north side of the Dolai Khal and the adjacent neighborhoods was a priority. 26 Geddes then elaborates on the way the congestion can be resolved, "In any case, we should thus have a useful street, connecting existing Bazaar Streets and new Markets, and attractive to shopkeepers, etc., accordingly, as well as for houses. Local congestion will thus be diminished." 26 Geddes pointed out the way this congestion can be even more diminished. Parallel to the road on the west of the thana, another road access should be built to connect Panitola, thus relieving congestion. Coming to the question of congestion due to density of the built fabric Geddes suggested that the tank east of this road will be filled up to make way for a municipal playground. In general, Geddes preferred that the water

26 Geddes, Patrick; Town Planning for Dhaka
26 Ibid.
26 Ibid.
26 Geddes, Patrick; Town Planning for Dhaka

77
bodies be kept the way they are, and a park with trees should be developed all around it. Thus it will not only serve the recreational purposes but also bring in a cool breeze to the old city fabric. Here in this case the feasibility must have proved to be too expensive for the excavation of the silted tank. Therefore in such circumstances Geddes thought that it was wiser to fill up the tank and use the reclaimed space as a park and garden. Geddes also proposed the building of a pedestrian street, which he thought would revive a pedestrian bazaar, which had been forgotten by the inhabitants, due to the congestion of too many people in the Shakharibazar area.

In Geddes's time there was talk going on about the removal of Jagannath College. Since this college campus stands between Shakharibazar and the city center on the north of the area, Geddes proposed that a road connection be built using some of the area from the collage compound. These were some of the measures that Geddes proposed for the relief of the congestion in Shakharibazar. Geddes thought that there was a lot to do in each of these small quarters of the city but he regretted his own lack of time to be able to work on any more of the quarters.

There were two town improvement projects that took place in the eastward direction across the Dolai Khal. Both of these developed as industrial areas. One was Shara'fatganj and the other Dhalkarnagar. The reason these two areas were selected as industrial areas are plain and simple, depending on geographical feature of adjoining areas and the benefit of the accessibility provided by the Dolai Khal and the river. Geddes thought further study should be carried out to make the proposition more suitable.
The question of the workers housing at that time was very sensitive in the western world. Along with the development of the two industrial areas, the workers housing areas had to be developed. What Geddes observed in general in India, the Bylaw Streets or the Cooley Line, could not be recommended. He proposed garden villages to be designed for the workers housing. What already was experienced in Europe should not be repeated in India. Geddes considered Dhaka to be a post-industrial city. Therefore these considerations for Dhaka is most important.

On the other side of the river the suburbs didn't grow properly, because the building of a bridge across the river was financially unfeasible at that time. Usually any such bridge would create a transpontine suburb across the bridge. Dhaka recently commissioned a bridge across the river further down river in the east. It is interesting to observe how fast the price of land went up in the transpontine suburbs across the bridge. The bridge has now given rise to a new development on the southern side of the river, that is the other side of the river opposite to Dhaka city.

The island is across a wide portion of the river. Therefore crossing the river will only be feasible if something economically viable is built on this island. Earlier in this thesis it was mentioned that Geddes envisioned a garden to be built on this island. This island has historical significance and an old ruined palace in the middle of it. The development of a park along with the added historical value already attached to it will give the place additional significance. The shifting of the river further south of Lalbagh has created a possibility for new land reclamation in that area. Geddes proposed that if the area can be reclaimed and developed with the given condition that it can generate its own economy.
for this development, only then the project will be feasible. Most often in
countries like these the cost benefit analysis of a project is not weighed against its
self-sustaining capability. That is why many of the projects fail to survive.
Geddes warned about such projects and advised an early consideration of the
facts and figures, so that the project can be successfully implemented with self-
sustained support. He actually was talking about the housing and
development projects which we now see happening everywhere in the world.

f. Chowk Area

This area is the old center of Dhaka. It is as Geddes puts it “an intensely urban
area.” 26 Like in any traditional Indian city, under the main gateway of the fort
grows all the commercial activities. The same thing happened in Dhaka. The
central commercial trading post developed in this area. The ‘Chowk’ is a very
traditional element of a muslim city, with a mosque as a central element in the
total urban context of a ‘Chowk’. The combination in Dhaka somehow proved
to be one, that is very perfect. The fort wall providing the enclosure for the
‘Chowk’. Then the commercial neighborhood developing around this core, and
eventually the whole area topped by a mosque, thus an intensely active area
in the city milieu.

26 Geddes, Patrick ; Town Planning for Dhaka
Geddes pointed out the future extension of the city, by the observed facts. He appreciated the north-eastward development and the setting up of two industrial neighborhoods, Dhalkarnagar and Sharafatganj.

The extension of the suburbs in Geddes's time seems to have taken up an western internationalist tendency. This for the rest of the century even until now has become the imagined reality of enlightenment and comfort for the population later on. It is not understandable why people did not look for new approaches, based on traditions and heritage.

Since the development of the university was the prime concern for Geddes he discussed at length the development of the area under the university. The historical relics of different religious communities can be highlighted in the urban fabric and thus create a harmonizing situation for all the communities living in it and never be worried about the repression of the other. He stressed on how the presence of the university can enhance that fact, "The fitness of these schemes, adjacent with the University --- which naturally not only respects each historic tradition, but seeks to continue each, and at its highest." 26

The university area was selected to be occupying the north west expansion of the city across the Dolai Khal. Geddes pointed out that while some of the planning and development activities in the growing university area were appropriate others are grossly inadequate and inappropriate. The most important contribution of Geddes in this proposal is the future development scheme that he proposed for the University area. Geddes identified that the area of the University in Dhaka is one of the largest --- a clear indication that the
University is the prime motivator of the city. He observed that in size and scale Oxford and Cambridge is very much dwarfed in this respect. The whole area of the University had to be developed from scratch, and Geddes found in it the possibility of reviving the health of the whole city. Geddes talked about the phenomenon of "Eurasthania," in his proposal for Town Planning for Indore. This phenomenon as Geddes has pointed out, leaves segments of a town or the whole town, in a state of paralyzed syndrome, once some life giving characteristic of the place is removed from it. In Dhaka the removal of the administrative function left the city in a state of sudden shock and the political inactivity of the population in this situation actually left the city in a state which closely resembles a sort of melancholic state. But Geddes believed that the rekindled spirit that has come about with the proposal of building up a University Town must be taken to its successful execution. Geddes also felt that if a "University Town" is to be founded then the city should focus on unification of the city and the University in its functionality. When the city encroaches into the University as if they are separate entities and the two are in constant strife then the circumstances are quite injurious to both.

Geddes strongly suggested that the Engineering College and the Medical College be close to the University. The students in the Engineering college will learn about arts and sciences in the university, so that a harmonious bonding takes place. He argued that the cost of amenities can be cut down by this proximate location. For a growing university this was very important. As a result all three being intertwined and knit so closely together that a vast portion of the city fell under their jurisdiction. The hospital and the residences of the students, he proposed should be all knit together. In fact it is not clear how but the three amenities in Dhaka came out to be knit together. It enriched the whole area as such. Instead of remoteness now they belong to the same family, in terms of city
location.
The training college also was proposed a closer location to the University. Geddes saw in these the probable city amenities while the residential areas he thought will grow in between and then the city will take its shape. Geddes also warned about adequate space allocation for future extension. Adequate space from the city should be taken for the purposes, before the usual growth of the city creates congestion.
The municipality in Geddes's own time was filling up many waste places to create gardens, parks, esplanades, etc. Geddes congratulated the initiators of the projects. Dhaka was always potted with numerous tanks and pools. They were sometimes owned by the community and sometimes by the landowner themselves. The introduction of the water works made many of these tanks and pools redundant. On top of that these were also beginning to get filled up due to improper maintenance. Geddes suggested that instead of creating a new urban squalor, these can be turned into parks and gardens, so as to give the city fabric some break for fresh air.

Geddes also considered the riverfront as one of the open spaces. It can be developed as a esplanade. It could be extended and designed in details with additions of parks, gardens and trees. The existing embankment in Dhaka was planned and executed by the contribution of the local communities. He called for further extension of that embankment in the same manner, and felt, if necessary the government can make the first contribution, and get the project going. This promenade may enhance the use of the river as boating events can take place on them while the spectator will be able to watch from the embankment.

Geddes actually called for search of every possible avenues where open spaces can be turned into city amenities, like gardens and parks. The island on the river stood for such a purpose according to Geddes's proposal. But the feasibility of this project could raise some questions. Geddes warned about showing concern towards those considerations too. At the time he was working in Dhaka, Geddes found that the two mouths of the river to be abandoned areas. The military position those were built here were no more in use. Therefore he
suggested that they be turned into open spaces and used as parks and gardens after certain improvements. He also pointed out that the muslim graveyards can be turned into wonderful parks and gardens if they are taken care of properly. The main concern of Geddes seems to reflect his concern for the public open spaces suddenly becoming dilapidated and as a result creating unhealthy situation for the city. His concern for the phenomenon of 'Eurasthania' is reflected everywhere. The evil that he has seen in many cities in India, he thought is the result of that phenomenon. Therefore he emphasized that every effort should be made to prevent that from happening.
2.2.8 Setting the Goal for Industrial Development

Geddes called for a look at the issue of industrial development in a much wider view than is generally considered. He argued that the government grants that are needed for the development of new industrial neighborhoods has a much wider and circumstantial relationship. Government grants are not found money. They come from the taxpayers contribution to the exchequer. The city taxation and the taxation from the rural and regional areas are what comprise the government money. Therefore this money should be able to look to it that the benefit reaches out to all its contributors. In the organization and management of industries Geddes preferred the existing organization in individual and/or joint stock management, but he thought the civilized norm in this affair will be to pay attention "towards civic and regional prosperity as well. The true industrialist has constantly something of this wider view." 26 Industries have a role to play in the prosperity of the region around it. The small industries in Dhaka must also be looked upon with this view. Instead of exploitation he called for the prosperity of society by the use of the fruit of industry towards the community.

Geddes appreciated the development of the Dhalkarnagar and Sharafatganj industrial areas in the north-west expansion of the city. He considered Dhaka to be a post-industrial city, therefore its future expansion should take into consideration the development of adequate industrial areas. In his concern for the indigenous city which is by nature supposed to be nature oriented, is not the complete picture of the city. He was interested in the incorporation of advancing technologies in the realm of the new city. The way these industrial and mechatronic production processes can be incorporated into the city

26 Geddes, Sir Patrick; Town Planning for Dhaka p. 16
reality is the most important factor according to his model. When he talked about the industrial workers housing he showed how in the west the earlier workers housing negated the proper consideration of health and hygiene of those areas. In India as in Bengal the worker's housing didn't even found place for the consideration of a particular area for them. They were floating poor people who were recruited to do the work for the industry. Therefore, within the immense competition of the workers looking for job, the circumstances provides the industrialists the opportunity to exploit these poor people, in the name of giving them job, while they are usually ill-paid and consequently ill-fed and poorly sheltered in the "Cooley Lines" and the "By Law Streets." Geddes called for an economic analysis of the whole industrial movement and provide benefit to industrial workers based on the outcome of the industries. Even if the workers are coming from a immensely poor situation, and the provision of garden villages for their housing may seem quite a long jump in their status. But Geddes felt that somewhere we have to begin if we look for the total upliftment of our well-being in a city.

Geddes saw the development of Tejgaon industrial areas and appreciated the concern that was generating about good industrial neighborhoods. The new industrial area development in Tongi and Joydevpur came much later with the 1958 master plan. Geddes commented about the disorganized and unhealthy situation prevailing there. But he did not elaborate too much on the area.
Geddes the Interpreter or the Intruder
3. Geddes the Interpreter or the Intruder

This is a question which is central to this thesis. Geddes worked as a part of the colonial rulers in the colonial context of India. When considering his work in Dhaka or India as a whole, one have to consider his position in the conflicting reality --- that of a most accurate interpreter or the exploitative intruder.

In Dhaka Geddes came to work in special circumstances. What Geddes thought about Dhaka was also the central issue among the policy makers of the time in Dhaka. Geddes’s keen observant eye took all of these into consideration, probably this is the reason why his proposal was considered as an appropriate interpretation of the planning need for Dhaka. In his method he was diagonally opposed to the colonial authorities. Is this a testimony to the fact that colonial reality was one of the reason for the gradual deterioration of old Indian cities, which is also pointed out in all his proposals.

Though his proposal never was acknowledged by the city authorities of his time, but many aspects of it has made permanent mark in the future growth of many of these cities. In Dhaka it is more prominent. Many new planning intervention in Dhaka shows reflection of this fact. Especially the University campus.

The last part of the chapter will analyze the success of his proposal. If not in direct implication atleast in sublime consideration. The analysis of the merits and demerits will not be complete without an assessment of the fact that he was working in a cross cultural context. This question arises out of the need for validity. Geddes’s sensitivity towards the local issues made him a champion in his endeavors. A quick look into present day situations will validate this assessment.
3.1 Rebirth of Dhaka as a Colonial City

Dhaka is an ancient city. It is not really known if there was a urban place that existed so long ago. But the existence of the trading community is now a proven fact. Nevertheless for our purposes this fact is not so much important, since we are looking at the place as an urban entity. Urbanity might have started sometime close to a thousand year from now. But it is the Mughal Subedar Shaista Khan who first proclaimed the foundation of the city as the administrative capital of the 'Subhe- Bangla', the Province of Bengal. After this formal foundation of the city, it went through its days of fortunes and declines. The last Mughal Subedar who left Dhaka for Murshidabad the newly proclaimed capital of Bengal left it in its process of decay which never had been reversed since that day. Only after the advent to power by the British in Bengal is when we see that this city started to see another series of events taking place around it. The British never established their center of activities in Dhaka. In fact they started building up a whole new city in Calcutta. But in the political realm Dhaka found prominence again since the British forced the exiled Nababs of Bengal to remain under custody in the old palace of the Nababs in Dhaka. But this fact did not even generate any revival in the cities reality. During the whole colonial era the city started reviving little by little. The population started growing in a very slow pace. Some administrative functions were beginning to get generated from Dhaka, serving its adjoining regions. The first major decisive development started only in the 1905 when the British Government decided to divide Bengal into two parts. The East Bengal and Assam provinces were brought under one administrative division, and the West Bengal remained the other. Dhaka was proclaimed to be the Capital of the eastern provinces. This gave birth to the city in a completely new context. But even before this new
status was conferred upon the city it had already started going through an industrial revolution, not in a very large scale, but enough to stir new activities within the society. Thus in this period of rebirth the city was already contemplating a new direction in its future. If not exactly in the category of a capital then at least as a important commercial, industrial and trading center. The very location of the city in the center of the region around it gave it a special status naturally. Thus during the colonial era while all the provincial towns and cities were going through some kind of formative changes, Dhaka also was one of them, but with an added attribution of a commercial and trading center.

With the 1905 decision came the first dignified status for the city. But that was again stripped off from the city in 1911, when the division of Bengal was annulled. But then afterwards the most important and appropriate thing started happening in the life of the city. That of the decision to make the city an University City. It gave to the city a much more broader perspective as an identity. The true universalism started taking place. It became almost the celebration of the Bengali psyche. Which is a peace loving and universal one. It finds its comfortable identity in an universal community. The University gave this whole reality a very harmonizing quality. Geddes identified those he always referred back to that aspect and proposed that the city can become a total reality of a city instead of just a university one. But the existence of the university will always give it a universalizing and harmonizing dimension. Dhaka cumulated throughout its history a harmonizing cohabitation of diversified religious, social and cultural groups. It is not only the attribute of the city but it is also the attribute of the whole region in the center of which the city stands. In those days these ideals were quite strong enough to exert influence in the formation of the future reality of the city. As we now know how those ideals have shaped much of the future directions that Dhaka took as a city. In the new circumstances
much of the old ideals began loosing ground, say for example the segregation of the old quarters of Dhaka based on the Hindu caste system. In the new context this lost all its validity and instead is now based on the economic consideration of the people living there. But since the Hindu caste system was based on the profession of the individuals, and since the segregation of the quarters followed that principle, in later date we see how those segregation also plays a positive and effective influence in the new order of the society. Dhaka took all these ideals as blessing to set its future directions. And so far at least in this context it has come out very successfully. Since that day onward Dhaka has gradually grown into a much more complex city. What Geddes proposed for the city may not have been given much recognition but that many of his ideals were followed for the betterment of the city is a proven fact now. Dhaka always fought to identify itself in the duality of its circumstances. The fight to remain a organically growing city and at the same time the overwhelming reality of the twentieth century trying to drive it towards the bizarre world of mechano-centric industrialization, in which realm the cities are just dead fossils of a living one, with its areas planned in a sterile and stagnant manner.
3.2 Assessments made by Geddes in his Proposal

Geddes began his proposal with the consideration of the map for the survey of the city and he later stressed upon the use of such a map for the constant updating of information about the city. So that the appropriate forecasting can be done based on those collected information.

Geddes also observed carefully the influence of the river on the origination of the city and also later on in the existence of the city. Geddes identified the influence of the river on the nature of the habitation in Bengal and its cities and also the advantage that it provides for the communication and irrigation systems of the region. Geddes called for the proper authority to build up a model of the river systems of Bengal. With the help of this model, forecasters can predict the changing river courses and consecutively the changing habitations and riverways.

Geddes was asked to make a proposal for a University city. But he assessed that the city should have a completeness of its own and the University will be enriched by it. And in return the University will also provide the city with an universalizing and harmonizing quality. Geddes in his usual way saw in this a birth of a new dimension in city planning. The complimentary relationship is taken as a positive implication to each other's reality.

In the development and renewal of the city quarters Geddes also tried to influence the morality of the inhabitants. He believed that for any good to come from the efforts of the inhabitants it is necessary that the inhabitants has a heightened feeling for citizenry, and a motivated attitude towards the
betterment of their environment.

The historical layering in Dhaka are important since it is an old city and all the previous relics from the past can be traced in these layering. These information are most important for the renewal of the city. We now know how the very discipline of conservation and renewal has grown through the twentieth century. And in this discipline how the awareness has also grown from interest in a particular area and time phase to an overall and all encompassing understanding of the problem before approach can be made towards the solution.

Geddes believed that the awareness of the inhabitants in their affairs of the environment is the most important factor for the environment to develop into a complimentary and enhancing experience for them. He proscribed that the town planning exhibition should become a permanent affair in the life of the city dweller.

While the exhibition will contain general information about the whole of the city, Geddes emphasized that the parts should also be updated by the local authorities. He compared this effort with the "Casier Sanitaire," in Paris. Now with the help of computers modern town planners will be able to update these information more efficiently. The forecast and prediction those follows from these information will be more closer to accurate with the help of computers.

The question of parts with the whole is always an important relationship for the development of one and the other in a complimentary fashion. Geddes pointed it out while talking about civic surveys, "Civic Survey harmonizes local
with general improvement, and thus arouses and strengthens civic spirit."  

Geddes envisioned that this updating of information about the condition of the parts and then subsequently the public disclosure of it will create competitiveness among the neighbors. Which he thinks is one of the healthiest thing for them. It is healthy, since this competition will naturally reinvigorate the spirit of the people.

---

26 Geddes, Patrick; *Town Planning for Dhaka*
3.3 Dhaka After Geddes

Geddes worked on the proposal for Dhaka in a time of the history of the city, when it was just embarking on a new beginning. The promise of this city's future was so strong that even without any formal recognition of the proposal by Geddes, the city started growing into a huge complex whole. In many of the mechanisms in the function and growth of the city we see the influence of the Geddesian thought. But since the beginning there was no official recognition awarded to the facts and proposals of Geddesian thoughts, it gradually became quite obscure as to where these ideas originated from. The ideas in essence were assimilated into the city's growth. This investigation would help identify the origin of many of the ideas and practices of the cities functioning. The foundation of Geddesian thought was based on an organic form of the city. Especially in Dhaka he himself recognized the wonderful possibility of the city to become one such. All that Geddes appreciated in Dhaka and which he thought will make the city into one of the best in the world, did not find any place through the administrative bureaucracy. Some of his ideas tickled down to future generations but without any recognition. While in the west he was becoming an obscure man it was almost impossible to find a place in the memory of the people of India about a man whose existence was also in a very humble state and without any state recognition. Fortunately some parts of Dhaka grew up in the Geddesian model, especially the Dhaka University Campus and the surrounding Ramna area. But even that later on lost much of the aura of his proposal, though the greenery and some physical attributes still remained, the very essence of the organic city could not survive within the greater reality of the coming industrial and technological revolution. The future of the city after Geddes was the struggle against degeneration and rebirth in
the line of thought of Geddes.

During the Second World War Dhaka gained importance in military status, since it was the last big city between Calcutta and the eastern front of the British Empire which was facing the advancing Japanese forces in Burma. In efforts to strengthen its military position in Dhaka the British Government built two airports in Dhaka and several hospitals. The city was reorganized with more accessible roads and some major thoroughfares. "The northward expansion of the city extended from Ramna to Purana Paltan, Shantinagar, and Segunbagicha." 28

After the independence of India and Pakistan in 1947, Dhaka became the capital of East Pakistan. This time the city started growing in its effort to accommodate all necessary amenities befitting to a capital city. The population of Dhaka grew immensely and quite suddenly, almost overnight. Many Hindu population left Dhaka for India, but at the same time more than equal number of Muslim population came in from India. Two housing projects were developed to house these incoming refugees. One at Mirpur and the other at Mohammedpur. After the 1971 War of Independence these housing projects were abandoned again since the Non-Bengali Muslim refugees who were living here decided to resettle in West Pakistan. Eventually these resettlement areas got included into the main city area. Immediately after the earlier settler left the project sites, local in-migrating population to the city occupied these housing settlements. Along with other developments after the independence in 1947, the Motijheel and Dilkusha commercial areas were developed. In Azimpur, Dhakeshwari, Shantinagar, Motijheel, Dhummondi, and Eskaton the government workers housing were developed. Along with that the adjoining areas of the city

28 Mohaimen, A.; Report on Dhaka City Planning 1917: Sir Patrick Geddes
started developing. Gradually the whole fabric of the city took a homogeneous character befitting an urban area. The new industrial area was developed in Tejgaon. The two major shopping complexes one at New Market and the other at Stadium Market were built to accommodate the shopping needs of the city dwellers. The three new residential model towns were built in Dhanmondi, Gulshan and Banani. But all these happened before the first government sponsored master plan was produced for Dhaka. This first master plan was produced in 1958. The British planning firm Minoprio, Spencely and P.W. MacFarlane were appointed to do the work. This master plan was also not very elaborate and failed to envision many of the future predicament that the city fell into. Along with the master plan a brief report was produced. Many new developments, like Motijheel, Dilkusha commercial areas, Dhanmondi, Gulshan, and Banani Model Towns, Narayanganj, and many other suburbs were developed according to the guideline of the proposal. But even this master plan was also grossly modified in the changing circumstances of economy, social forbearing and political manipulations. This have again created an immense chaos all around the city. Thus the future of the city eventually fell into the hands of tyrannical and whimsical decision makers.

This master plan did not have any strong ideological forbearing but took into account many of the ongoing traditions in Dhaka and cities in Bengal in general. The two very important facts that this master plan brought about to the city were the recognition of a legal document for the future development of the city, and the other was the founding of the Dhaka Improvement Trust, an Institution upholding the master plan and catering to the city dwellers with the fruits that a good master plan can bring to a city.
3.4 Merits and Demerits of the Proposal and its Reflections Today

Geddes came to work in India at the invitation of Lord Pentland, the then Governor of Madras. The exact connection of these two people is not very well known to say that this is the reason that Geddes was asked to come to India to work on its towns and cities. Lord Pentland was aware of the conscious work that Geddes was doing in Edinburgh, with its exhibition on cities and the civic surveys. He was also impressed by the drive for civic awareness that Geddes was devoting most of his time on, in Edinburgh. In this context it is interesting to note when Lord Pentland in one of the many communications sends Geddes a view card with the image of the Governor's Palace in Madras on it. He and his wife signed it and below the image of the Palace he wrote in his own handwriting that, this is where the Governor lives, a poor imitation of the great traditions of India and also so much isolated from the real world that surrounds it. Obviously, it is clear what was the kind of concern that Lord Pentland felt and was eventually driven to bring Geddes in India to work on some towns plans, mainly situated around Madras.

For Geddes this was his lifetime opportunity to be able to come in so close contact of a civilization which he so much longed for to see in this manner. As a sensitive individual and specially hoping around the disciplines of Biology, Sociology and Town Planning he looked for an ideal somewhere, which can be educative for mankind in the turn of the twentieth century saga of human civilization, especially in the west. At this stage of the booming industrialization and machination mankind needed a new ideal to contain its new predicament. Because already, as Geddes pointed out, that man kind was becoming so much infested with the greed for superiority and material wealth that it lost all its rational to prevent the wars it was facing in those years.
Geddes believed that the environment that a man lives in very much influences his character; either make him a civilized being or a violent irrational being. He iterated his concern in this manner, while talking about the war situation in Jerusalem, "There is no permanent reason for men to kill each other. Give them hope of a better land, of enough food for their families, and you remove a main cause of bloodshed." Thus, he concentrated his efforts in the improvement of the environment in which man lives in. He began with his own city, Edinburgh, and in fact his own neighborhood, Ramsey Garden. Thus when he was invited to India he found a new dimension to add to his never ending search for the answer to the idea of containment of the bursting activities of the development of civilization. He correctly realized that once the fruit of the new technology is let loose it will be difficult to contain it from growing. Thus instead of containing this growth with unreasonable conservatism, he called for a progressive approach to deal with the matter. In this instance here in Dhaka, he realized that the city was a post-industrial city, and it was now trying to burst open to new activities towards a future of growth and prosperity. There was no way this growth can be contained, therefore his proposal became an important document to let this growth flow with a positive guideline and a reasonable progression. Especially coming to Dhaka he realized about the fact that here is an unique situation where the organic growth of a city can be made to become a reality. Thus we see him making remarks like, "After looking at some forty cities and always with this quest on in my mind, I answer unhesitatingly --- where better than in Dacca ?--- and this as regards population and place alike." The reason behind it he iterates elsewhere, "In summary then, it is only

---

2 Patrick Geddes Heritage Trail, "Town and Country Planning."

26 Geddes, Patrick; Town Planning for Dhaka
common truth to say that among the many cities I have now studied in India, I have found only one or two others which might be as easily, simply and inexpensively provided with a park system; and this upon an extent and with an effect not only rivaling that of great cities, but surpassing most of them. True, the temples, ghats and other monumental adornments, which beautify such areas in other cities, are not here present; but the landscapes are the main thing; and the rest would be provided by that incipient renewal of religion upon the modern plane of which the current awakening of civic feeling, with its desire for improvement, its zeal towards public health and sanitation, are everywhere becoming such conspicuous beginnings." 26 Obviously Dhaka presented to Geddes a situation where the abundant growth of life promised a organic world that can be most appropriately put to use for prosperity. But Geddes at the same time recognized the true historic reality of Dhaka. A city emerging from a mediaeval frame of physical construct, and taking stride towards a new growth in new social and economic circumstances. Thus he reiterates, "For here is the situation, the only large one, and the best possible, for a substantial improvement of communications and amenities together, and of designing something worthy of the historic and developing city, worthy of the regional metropolis it has always been, and of the university and residential city it is becoming." 26

Geddes held a strong belief that the lesson learned from the past, is one of the most important factors in city planning tradition. But he was also aware that

26 Geddes, Patrick; *Town Planning for Dhaka*

26 Ibid. p. 10, 18
with the changing technologies sometimes the past might have to be looked in
a different perspective. the important thing here is to set a balance in
expectations and means. Like Geddes in the final part of the proposal says, "For
it should not be forgotten that all that has been suggested above for the
amelioration and improvement of Dacca could be done with far less money
than is here absorbed for a single sewage scheme." He continues, "Yet this after
all is but the minor argument. The major one is that we should place ourselves
more and more fully at the constructive point of view --- that of the general
amelioration of the city, of its economic and domestic prosperity upon older lines,
and not sacrifice these, as sacrificed they tend to be, upon the altar of a
nineteenth century sanitation which it is for the twentieth to supersede, by
methods in some respects simpler and more primitive, in others more
advanced." 26

In essence Geddes understood that in the given time for his survey of the city he
could not go into too much details of the cities mechanism. But from a point of
view of already an experienced man in some other Indian cities he pointed out
the possibilities of a proper town planning for Dhaka. He envisioned the direction
that the city should take in the given circumstances. For us now this direction
seems to be the most appropriate one. Such an approach is the most
appropriate one for the cities in third world countries. While we can talk about
the merits of this proposal it seems it is difficult to criticize it, because Geddes did
not go into the depth of any of the issues he dealt with. So the only demerit that
we can perceive is the incompleteness of the work.

26 Geddes, Patrick; *Town Planning for Dhaka* p. 18
Conclusion
4. Conclusion

In the beginning of this article we started with a hypotheses that the overarching ideas in urbanization and city planning that exists today, which is characteristic of and based on the work of post-industrial western society and its philosophical framework, does not entirely fit into the model of another society and culture, which is not only physically far away from it, but also far away from it in its philosophical construct. One inanimate and without a strict order in its form making, the other animated and having a strong order upon which it bases its form making. But our concern here was to look at a man's work who in the beginning of this century crossed this boundary both in terms of time and in terms of place to produce master plans for cities lying in opposition to his own circumstances and tradition. The postulations that he came up with was very much misunderstood by the men of his time and sometimes even today. He was a misunderstood man for the content he dealt with. While coming across a century to another he was also trying to cross the realms of his forbearing. In our critical reproach to his thoughts and deeds we may find how, in a very penetrating way he understood the land and culture across. It seems his greatest failure, in city planning concepts, was not being able to communicate his own understanding too clearly. And also his shallow understanding of the mechanisms of politics, might have helped him to be thrown in the abyss of obscurity.

But since our concern is to look for an appropriate technology and a theoretical scheme for the future of urbanization and city planning in these lands, we find his works to reflect some of those aspirations more properly than ever. In this end of the century period we are hearing more cry for appropriate technology and appropriate approach to social and environmental issues. Geddes also
delineated the appropriate approach for town planners, in every situation he could have perceived in his time. He was an universalist in this respect. The important fact is that the town planner has to be able to perceive the outer and inner mechanisms of a society to be able to appropriately deal with it. In his city survey methodology, he emphasized upon the social factors as much as the physical ones. To him the whole affair stood as a huge living being, thus the very functioning of it depended on the compromises and the determinism that must be exercised, but in a balanced way. Thus he envisioned in all this the equilibrium that is pertinent to a living being and thus we can conclude that behind the general impression of a chaos actually there is a systematic mechanism. Thus an organic form of a physical environment, --- a city.
Appendix
5.1 Bibliography:

1. Levy, Robert; *Mesocosm*, University of California Los Angeles Press, Los Angeles.
7. Swami Vivekananda; *Prachya o Paschayta* (The Orient and the Occident) in Bengali, Viswabharati, Shantiniketan, 1974.
8. Hardy, Dennis; *Patrick Geddes: Social Evolutionist and City Planner* by Helen Meller (Book review article in *Town and Country Planning* v60 p223 July/August, 1991.
18. A. Ghosh; "The City in Early Historical India",...
27. Geddes, Prof. Patrick; Town Planning for Indore Bombay, 1917.
5.2 Annotated Bibliography


   Sub: A written report on the possible future development of a town in the Provincial Bengal. The result of a final resort by the British colonizers to restore some of the cities in India, which fell out of importance due to the shifted political geography. The intention in Dhaka was to turn it into a University town. But Geddes in his proposal stressed in the overall development of the city bringing back its past splendor as one of the old capitals of Bengal, instead of just creating a marginalized University town.

   Note: Based on a week long survey conducted by the author himself.

   Note: Contains a Survey map (1916) of the city furnished by the city council and on which the author made some overlay work for the future development of different areas (not exhaustive).

   Note: 21 pages.


   Sub: Sociology and Civics

   Town Planning

   Emphasizing the use of city surveys before conducting any city planning task.

   Note: An article

   Note: 14 pages.
3. Geddes, Patrick, Sir; "Town Planning and City Design --- In Sociology and In Citizenship",
monograph published by the Sociological Society. October, 27th, 1908.
Sub: Approaches to Town Planning
Direction for future extension of City and its Suburbs.
Note: An Article published in a pamphlet form.
Note: 4 pages.

monograph published by the office of Geddes and Colleagues, Outlook Tower, Edinburgh, 1911.
Sub: Publication of a paper read at the Birkenhead Congress, 1910.
Town Planning
Survey of Public Health Conditions
This is suggested in response to the political and social need of in-migration and out-migration.
Note: An article published in a pamphlet form. 12 pages.

5. Geddes, Patrick, Sir; On Universities in Europe and in India: And A Needed Type of Research Institute, Geographical and Social / Five Letters to an Indian Friend, a monograph containing reprints of letters from "The Pioneer", 11 August, 1901 and from "East and West", September, 1903.
Sub: Letter to Sister Nivedita on reply to her inquiry on the nature of founding of Universities. The four letters are follow up in continuation to the first one.
“A Needed Research Institute; Geographical and Social”.

i. A School of Regional Survey.

ii. From Regional Survey to Regional Service.

iii. Speculative and Practical Synthesis; Applicability to East and West.

iv. Practical Proposals; A Proposed Institute of Regional Survey and Service for Indian Cities and Universities.

Note: A Booklet. 40 pages.


Sub: Universities in India in the Past and Present.

The tradition of European Universities.

Other Educational amenities; Central Library, Museum and Theatre.

Applications in Education

Wider Outlooks in Higher and Adult Education

Constructive Proposals: School of Music, the University as Nascent in Indore, etc.

Note: A Report. 73 pages.

7. Geddes, Patrick, Sir; *Report on Planning for the Lucknow Zoological Garden*, Lucknow, N. K. Press, 19...

Sub: Landscape Design

An Educational Institution.

An Entertainment facility.

Technical report on the enclosures and the suitable environment for the animals.
8. Geddes, Patrick, Sir; Town Planning in Indore; A Report to the Durbar of Indore, Indore, 1917.

Sub: The Report is presented in two separate volumes.

The Report is accompanied by numerous detailed plans representing
a) The city of Indore as it stands today, and has grown during the centuries.
b) Improvements suggested for better health, housing, trade, industries, communications, amenities, education, etc.
c) Extensions, residential and industrial.

b) and c) together make the new town plan or development scheme for Indore.

These two volumes, and the set of plans, represent nearly a year's work by Professor Geddes and his staff, in first making a comprehensive study of the city and its development in the past, with the resulting projects for betterment in the present and future. Indore (the capital of one of the native states of Central India) is the latest of many Indian cities to be thus surveyed and reported on by Professor Geddes. All these surveys and reports, along with those previously made of certain cities at home, are of sociological interest in that they are applications of principles which were growing into that body of scientific knowledge which its contemporary progenitors called 'Civics'.

Note: A Report in two volumes.

Several Detailed Plans.

9. Geddes, Patrick, Sir; Town Planning in Balarampur: A Report to the Hon’ble
Maharaja Sir Bhagvati Prashad Singh Bahadur, &c, &c.

Sub: A extensive survey of the city was carried out. The features which are dominant in the life of the city was identified and then a proposal for the future extension proposed. Being a medieval town his proposal called for adequate measures to restore the charm of the old fabric as much as possible and then draw the extensions. A good example of historic preservation in enlivening a section of a town or the whole town instead of creating a dead edifice. Also a very good example of the reorganization of a town in changed circumstances of industrial development.

A good example of the recognition of the existing urban types in housing category. The application of Garden Village method is also exemplified.

Note: A Report. 80 Pages Containing several maps, both existing and proposed.

10. Geddes, Sir Patrick and Anna; "Cyprus and its Power to Help the East”,

Reprinted (with Illustrations) from the Report of the International Conference on Armenian Aid. (May, 1897.)

Sub: An Article resulting from the address that the authors made in the "International Conference on Armenian Aid", held in London on May 19th and 20th, 1897.

Some of the resolutions taken in the conference are, “That the present condition of the Armenian people urgently calls for further efforts for the relief of distress and the re-building of their social life.” “That the development of the island of Cyprus as a center of industrial training in agriculture and manufacture is recommended, and that this Conference
looks with special interest on the question of silk-culture.”

The authors address the issue of the social and environmental rehabilitation of a city torn by the vast migration of a particular race in the late nineteenth century Cyprus.

Note: A booklet. 15 pages with numerous photographs.


Sub: This is an article written in advance on the Cities and Town Planning Exhibition, and published in the particulars from the Secretariat of the Congres International des Villes, 3bis Rue de la Regence, Brussels. The Congress was held from July 27 - August 1, 1913.

An introduction to the Cities and Town Planning Exhibition.

The author delineated the distinction between World Fairs and the Cities Exhibition and emphasized the need for these kind of exhibitions, especially in the context of the Town Planning Movement.

Note: A booklet, with a Floor Plan of the Exhibition area. 16 pages.


Sub: A very brief planning proposal submitted to the Municipal Council of Nagpur, a small Indian town in the Maharasthra Pradesh. The proposal featured most of the usual survey techniques and typical recommendations that Geddes made for several other Indian towns. A good example of his city survey method. The historic necessity of the
town called for improvement taking in consideration the development of its industrial sector. Thus a new direction had to be sought distinct from its older quarters.

Note: A booklet. 17 pages.


Sub: The Civic Survey of Edinburgh was one of the fundamental purpose of the establishment of the Outlook Tower. The author conducted a series of surveys of this city primarily for the improvement of the city as a whole. It is part of Geddes' beginning in the intervention of planning methodology for the improvement of this mediaeval town fallen in decay due to the immense force of industrialization.

This survey emphasizes on the social aspect. But at the same time draws connection to the environmental improvement.

Note: A booklet containing several photographs. 38 pages.

14. Geddes, Patrick, Sir; Jerusalem Actual and Possible: A report to the Chief Administrator of Palestine and the Military Governor of Jerusalem on Town Planning and City Improvements, University of Bombay, 1919.

Sub: A proposal for the development and reorganization of a city torn apart by generations of war. A rigorous social and political survey was necessary for this work. Eventually this plan was implemented making one of the most important work of Geddes.

Note: A Report. 36 pages + 4 pages in Appendix.