

24.119 Minds and Machines

Problem Set 3. Assigned in class #5. Due in class #6.

NB: *no* quotations, *no* paraphrases; answer in your own words.

1. What is Place's "phenomenological fallacy"? (A short paragraph.) Explain why someone committing this "fallacy" would have on her hands "an entity for which there is no place in the world of physics". (Another short paragraph.)
 2. Explain Objection 2 and Smart's reply. (A short paragraph.) Is the reply convincing? (Another short paragraph.)
 3. Is Smart arguing that after-images are brain-processes? (Yes or no.)
 4. Does Smart think that identities between sensations and brain processes are necessary? (Yes or no.)
 5. "My left leg was amputated. Sometimes I feel pain in my 'phantom knee'. Yet I have no physical knee. So there is nothing physical that could be identified with the pain in my knee -- which is real pain, I assure you! Therefore the identity theory must be wrong." In a paragraph or so, explain how Smart would reply.
 6. Give two (completely convincing!) examples, of your own devising, of *contingently true* sentences of the form 'A=B'.
 7. Classify the following as either rigid or nonrigid, with a sentence or two of explanation in each case: 'The third planet from the Sun', 'J.J C Smart', 'The philosopher called "J J C Smart"', 'The ratio of a circle's circumference to its diameter'
-