Comment on ‘Roles of interbasin frequency changes in the poleward shifts of the maximum intensity location of tropical cyclones’

The MIT Faculty has made this article openly available. Please share how this access benefits you. Your story matters.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>As Published</td>
<td><a href="http://dx.doi.org/10.1088/1748-9326/11/6/068001">http://dx.doi.org/10.1088/1748-9326/11/6/068001</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publisher</td>
<td>IOP Publishing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Version</td>
<td>Final published version</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accessed</td>
<td>Fri Mar 22 04:02:34 EDT 2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citable Link</td>
<td><a href="http://hdl.handle.net/1721.1/105193">http://hdl.handle.net/1721.1/105193</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Terms of Use</td>
<td>Creative Commons Attribution 3.0 Unported licence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Detailed Terms</td>
<td><a href="http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/3.0/">http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/3.0/</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Comment on ‘Roles of interbasin frequency changes in the poleward shifts of the maximum intensity location of tropical cyclones’

This content has been downloaded from IOPscience. Please scroll down to see the full text.
2016 Environ. Res. Lett. 11 068001
(http://iopscience.iop.org/1748-9326/11/6/068001)

View the table of contents for this issue, or go to the journal homepage for more

Download details:
IP Address: 18.51.1.88
This content was downloaded on 06/10/2016 at 19:00

Please note that terms and conditions apply.

You may also be interested in:

Reply to Comment on ‘Roles of interbasin frequency changes in the poleward shifts of maximum intensity location of tropical cyclones’
Il-Ju Moon, Sung-Hun Kim, Phil Klotzbach et al.

Roles of interbasin frequency changes in the poleward shifts of the maximum intensity location of tropical cyclones
Il-Ju Moon, Sung-Hun Kim, Phil Klotzbach et al.

Climate change effects on the worst-case storm surge: a case study of Typhoon Haiyan
Izuru Takayabu, Kenshi Hibino, Hidetaka Sasaki et al.

Large-Scale Solar Cycle Features of Photospheric Magnetic Flux
Wenbin Song and Jingxiu Wang

STATISTICAL ANALYSIS OF FILAMENT FEATURES BASED ON THE H SOLAR IMAGES FROM 1988 TO 2016 BY COMPUTER AUTOMATED DETECTION METHOD
Q. Hao, C. Fang, W. Cao et al.

Multiformity of the tropical cyclone wind–pressure relationship in the western North Pacific: discrepancies among four best-track archives
Mien-Tze Kueh
COMMENT

Comment on ‘Roles of interbasin frequency changes in the poleward shifts of the maximum intensity location of tropical cyclones’

James P Kossin¹, Kerry A Emanuel² and Gabriel A Vecchi³

¹ NOAA National Centers for Environmental Information, Center for Weather and Climate, Madison, WI 53706, USA
² Program in Atmospheres, Oceans, and Climate, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Cambridge, MA 02139, USA
³ NOAA Geophysical Fluid Dynamics Laboratory, Princeton, NJ 08540, USA

The article by Moon et al (2015) [1] (henceforth MKKC) considers interbasin tropical cyclone frequency variability and its effect on the poleward migration of the mean latitude of tropical cyclone lifetime-maximum intensity (LMI) shown in Kossin et al (2014) [2] (henceforth KEV). We read MKKC with great interest, but given the key focus and the title of the article, we were somewhat surprised that MKKC focuses on. We welcome the more in-depth exploration of this question in MKKC, but feel that introducing it as something new is misrepresentative.

Ultimately, the main finding of MKKC is that when the global historical best-track data are segregated into hemispheres, and interbasin frequency variability is accounted for, and an ad hoc intensity threshold is applied to the data, the migration rate in the northern hemisphere is no longer statistically significant. MKKC then claims that this result obviates the results of KEV, but this assertion does not follow from the results of MKKC. Firstly, it is an elementary aspect of statistics that the subsetting of a larger data sample into subsamples will often reduce the signal-to-noise ratio, sometimes to a point of statistical insignificance, so the lack of a significant poleward migration rate in the northern hemisphere does not obviate the existence of a significant global migration. Secondly, there are large and statistically significant poleward migration rates in the western North Pacific, South Pacific, and Southern Indian ocean basins, none of which can be attributed in any way to the interbasin variability that MKKC focuses on. Tropical cyclone activity in these three basins comprise the vast majority of global activity, so the statement that the northern hemispheric trend is dominated by interbasin frequency variability misses the larger and more relevant question of what has driven the poleward migration in these basins (which contribute substantially to the global migration). Toward this question, MKKC offers little advancement.

As a final note, KEV analyzed a documented homogenized reanalysis dataset [3] in addition to the historical best-track data. When the latitude of LMI from the homogenized reanalysis data is normalized to remove the effects of interbasin frequency changes, the poleward migration rate in the northern hemisphere does in fact remain highly significant, decreasing from 83 ± 50 km per decade (with interbasin variability included) to 58 ± 42 km per decade.

MKKC focuses on. The welcome more in-depth exploration of this question in MKKC, but feel that introducing it as something new is misrepresentative.

Ultimately, the main finding of MKKC is that when the global historical best-track data are segregated into hemispheres, and interbasin frequency variability is accounted for, and an ad hoc intensity threshold is applied to the data, the migration rate in the northern hemisphere is no longer statistically significant. MKKC then claims that this result obviates the results of KEV, but this assertion does not follow from the results of MKKC. Firstly, it is an elementary aspect of statistics that the subsetting of a larger data sample into subsamples will often reduce the signal-to-noise ratio, sometimes to a point of statistical insignificance, so the lack of a significant poleward migration rate in the northern hemisphere does not obviate the existence of a significant global migration. Secondly, there are large and statistically significant poleward migration rates in the western North Pacific, South Pacific, and Southern Indian ocean basins, none of which can be attributed in any way to the interbasin variability that MKKC focuses on. Tropical cyclone activity in these three basins comprise the vast majority of global activity, so the statement that the northern hemispheric trend is dominated by interbasin frequency variability misses the larger and more relevant question of what has driven the poleward migration in these basins (which contribute substantially to the global migration). Toward this question, MKKC offers little advancement.

As a final note, KEV analyzed a documented homogenized reanalysis dataset [3] in addition to the historical best-track data. When the latitude of LMI from the homogenized reanalysis data is normalized to remove the effects of interbasin frequency changes, the poleward migration rate in the northern hemisphere does in fact remain highly significant, decreasing from 83 ± 50 km per decade (with interbasin variability included) to 58 ± 42 km per decade.
decade (after accounting for interbasin variability). The analysis of MKKC was limited to the best-track data and did not discuss the robustness of the migration rates in the homogenized data, although these data are available.

The large and significant poleward migration rates in three of the largest and most active tropical cyclone regions, which as stated above cannot be attributed in any way to interbasin variability, the maintenance of significant global trends after removing interbasin variability, as shown in KEV, and the robust trend in the northern hemisphere homogenized reanalysis data (that were not included in MKKC), all point clearly toward a very real physical phenomenon that warrants further study.

References

