### Citation

### As Published
http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.mattod.2018.07.001

### Publisher
Elsevier

### Version
Final published version

### Accessed
Sat Jan 19 02:39:52 EST 2019

### Citable Link
http://hdl.handle.net/1721.1/119419

### Terms of Use
Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License

### Detailed Terms
http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/
3D printing metals like thermoplastics: Fused filament fabrication of metallic glasses

Michael A. Gibson¹,², Nicholas M. Mykulowycz¹, Joseph Shim¹,
Richard Fontana¹, Peter Schmitt¹, Andrew Roberts¹, Jittisa Ketkaew⁴
Ling Shao⁴, Wen Chen⁵, Punnathat Bordeenithikasem⁴, Jonah S. Myerberg¹,
Ric Fulop¹, Matthew D. Verminski¹, Emanuel M. Sachs¹,³, Yet-Ming Chiang¹,²,
Christopher A. Schuh¹,², A. John Hart¹,³, Jan Schroers¹,⁴,⁎

¹Desktop Metal, Inc., Burlington, MA 01803, United States
²Department of Materials Science and Engineering, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Cambridge, MA 02139, United States
³Department of Mechanical Engineering, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Cambridge, MA 02139, United States
⁴Department of Mechanical Engineering & Materials Science, Yale University, New Haven, CT 06520, United States
⁵Department of Mechanical and Industrial Engineering, University of Massachusetts, Amherst, MA 01003, United States

Whereas 3D printing of thermoplastics is highly advanced and can readily create complex geometries, 3D printing of metals is still challenging and limited. The origin of this asymmetry in technological maturity is the continuous softening of thermoplastics with temperature into a readily formable state, which is absent in conventional metals. Unlike conventional metals, bulk metallic glasses (BMGs) demonstrate a supercooled liquid region and continuous softening upon heating, analogous to thermoplastics. Here we demonstrate that, in extension of this analogy, BMGs are also amenable to extrusion-based 3D printing through fused filament fabrication (FFF). When utilizing the BMGs’ supercooled liquid behavior, 3D printing can be realized under similar conditions to those in thermoplastics. Fully dense and amorphous BMG parts are 3D printed in ambient environmental conditions resulting in high-strength metal parts. Due to the similarity between FFF of thermoplastics and BMGs, this method may leverage the technology infrastructure built by the thermoplastic FFF community to rapidly realize and proliferate accessible and practical printing of metals.

Introduction
The materials toolbox has traditionally demanded hard choices [1]. While the structural performance of metals is superior to that of thermoplastics, processing of metals is generally challenging (Fig. 1). In contrast, plastics, particularly thermoplastics, can be readily processed into complex geometries, but exhibit inferior structural performance [1]. The high processability of thermoplastics originates from their continuous softening with temperature into a readily formable state.

In principle, two strategies allow to escape this property-processing trade off. One strategy is the development of novel processing methods which are outside conventional processing strategies. A contemporary example is additive manufacturing (AM), which, for thermoplastics, has enabled 3D printing of complex shapes through a material extrusion process, called fused filament fabrication (FFF). In contrast, the versatility and practicality for AM of metals lags significantly behind [2]. This is essentially due to the inability to maintain metals at viscosities on practical time scales that would be suited for processing/forming operations such as material extrusion in FFF processes (Fig. 1)
Within as-built parts and repeated heating create complex thermomechanical stresses and purity. In addition, localized melting, rapid solidification, and repeated heating create complex thermomechanical stresses within as-built parts. Such stresses often require rigid support structures to resist the accompanying deformations and complex post-processing to achieve dimensionally accurate parts. Alternative techniques are thus being developed to realize suitable flow behavior to achieve material extrusion-based AM of metals. One strategy is semi-solid metallic extrusion, wherein extrusion is performed at a temperature such that a stable mixture of solid and liquid phases results in a suspension with a proper apparent viscosity. Semisolid material extrusion relies on a tight control of the solid’s volume fraction, and therefore of the nozzle thermal conditions. The process is robust when a large difference exists between the solidus and liquidus temperatures of the feedstock alloy, which is sufficiently wide only in a small number of alloys. Another strategy to achieve an appropriate (apparent) viscosity is to use thermoplastics as flowing and binding agents to enable FFF of metal powders combined with the strength and other desirable properties of the metal (Fig. 1). The disadvantage of such processing is that it requires elaborate subsequent solvent and polymer removal followed by sintering to achieve a dense metal part. In short, the dearth of material systems which exhibit rheological behavior suitable for material extrusion is reflected in a lack of accessible metal AM technologies.

A strategy to create an accessible metal AM technology is to develop printing processes around new materials outside the traditional metals classes. A prominent example is bulk metallic glasses (BMGs). The amorphous structure of BMGs results in high strength and elastic limits, which is often paired with other desired properties such as high fracture toughness and high corrosion resistance. Unique among metals, BMGs relax into a (supercooled) liquid upon heating above the glass transition temperature. As in thermoplastics, this behavior can be used for thermoplastic forming (TPF) and hence permits the fabrication of metal articles with the processing methods typically associated with thermoplastic polymers, thereby escaping the property-processing trade-off.

The TTT originates from the metastable nature of the supercooled liquid, which defines the available processing window for BMGs. TPF-based processing of BMGs requires a protocol balance to yield ideal behavior. This is realized through the processing temperature optimized for low viscosity yet sufficient processing time that can be experimentally realized.
BMG parts are comparable to the same and superb properties for as-cast BMG samples.

**Materials and methods**

*Fabrication of BMG feedstock material*

Constitutive elements of purities better than 99.9% (only considering metallic impurities) were alloyed by arc-melted in an argon atmosphere. To ensure homogenous material, sample was flipped four times. The alloyed BMG forming alloy is crystalline after this step. Subsequently, the alloy is reheated in quartz tubes under a vacuum of $10^{-3}$ mbar. The quartz tube has a melting section of 12 mm ID (inner diameter) and 14 mm OD (outer diameter) and a casting section of 2 mm ID and 3 mm OD. After melting for 3 min at 900 °C, the liquid BMG former is forced under argon pressure of $10^5$ Pa into the casting section where it remained for 30 s at the processing temperature of 900 °C. Subsequently, liquid BMG forming alloy, while in the casting section of the quartz tube, is water quenched, by submerging into a water container. After cooling to room temperature, a fully amorphous BMG rod is achieved.

*Mechanical characterization*

Tension tests were conducted with Instron 5543 under quasi-static condition with strain rate of $10^{-4}$ s\(^{-1}\). The amorphous nature of metallic glasses was characterized using DSC (Perkin Elmer Diamond DSC) and XRD (Rigaku Smartlab).

**Results**

*3D printing*

$\text{Zr}_{44}\text{Ti}_{11}\text{Cu}_{10}\text{Ni}_{10}\text{Be}_{25}$ was selected as a model system to study metallic glass material extrusion because it is widely characterized, commercially available, and has high thermoplastic formability [28–30]. Amorphous $\text{Zr}_{44}\text{Ti}_{11}\text{Cu}_{10}\text{Ni}_{10}\text{Be}_{25}$ rods with 1 mm diameter and up to 70 cm length were used as printing media. These rods were fed into a heated extrusion head (Fig. 2). It was found that best results can be achieved when extruded at 460 °C, at which the time to crystallization is approximately 100 s and the viscosity is $\sim 10^5$ Pa s [31]. At lower temperatures, the high viscosity required impractically high extrusion forces, whereas at high temperatures, accelerated crystallization kinetics required impractically short processing times (Fig. 1b). With an extrusion force range of 10–1000 N, a nozzle diameter of 0.5 mm, and an effective length in the extruder of 2 mm, $\text{Zr}_{44}\text{Ti}_{11}\text{Cu}_{10}\text{Ni}_{10}\text{Be}_{25}$ can be extruded with a rate of up to 5 cm/s. Printing was performed onto a bed of stainless steel mesh preheated to $\sim 400$ °C where the crystallization time is $\sim 1$ day [31]. The motion and extrusion system consists of a modified numerically controlled milling table, which is robotically controlled by G-code commands generated from a custom-written toolpath generation software. Motivated by our previous finding that metallurgical bonding of BMGs during TPF can be achieved by straining at the interface, even when processed in air [32], a pulsed Joule-heater was designed to locally heat the previously

![FIGURE 2](image-url)

**Process summary.** (a) Schematics of the TPF based FFF process for direct-write extrusion of BMGs. (b) Physical setup of TPF-based BMG printer. (c) Feed mechanism which generates forces of up to 1000 N (typically <100 N are applied) to follow the G-code of maximum extrusion speeds of 5 cm/s. (d) Extrusion nozzle with Joule heater attached. The BMG feedstock is forced into the extruder head which has an effective extrusion length of 2 mm. Within the head the BMG is heated to the thermoplastic processing temperature of 460 °C to be dispensed through an orifice with an opening diameter of either 0.5 or 1 mm in diameter. Joule heating was powered by a high current voltage power supply (48 V, 72 A) that feeds into a high farad capacitor bank (1F). In order to locally heat the previous layer, a metal brush proceeds the extruder by a short distance (~1 mm). A passing pulsed-current heats predominately the contact area, and careful adjustment of current allows control of temperature to ~460 °C. (e) Heated substrate stage. Heating to 400 °C facilitates initial bonding of extruded BMG to the substrate. The substrate moves relative to the stationary extrusion head, with the two programmed by the same motion system. (f) Capacitor bank of 1F which generates for an applied voltage of 10–20 V, pulsed, 5–20 Hz currents (~10 ohms), for durations of 100–500 μs.
printed layer underneath the nozzle to a temperature similar to the extrusion temperature (Fig. 2). In order to achieve the interfacial strains required to establish a metallurgical bond between layers, the bead height \( h_{\text{bead}} \) and bead width \( w_{\text{bead}} \) were controlled such that the bead aspect ratio was in the range of \( 2 < \frac{w_{\text{bead}}}{h_{\text{bead}}} < 4 \). Such an aspect ratio requires the extrudate to deform laterally within the printing plane, thereby establishing a strain at the interface between the current layer and the prior layer, which acts as a bonding substrate.

Using the process described in Fig. 2, a wide range of BMG parts have been printed. Printing conditions result in a volumetric build rate of \( \sim 10 \text{ mm}^3/\text{s} \). This build rate compares with build rates of \( 1–10 \text{ mm}^3/\text{s} \) for laser powder bed fusion \([26,33]\) and \( \sim 40 \text{ mm}^3/\text{s} \) for thermal spray \([34]\). Fig. 3 shows representative printed parts in a continuous mode, where extrusion is never interrupted during printing (Fig. 3a), and in a start-stop mode, where extrusion is interrupted, e.g., at the end of each printed line (Fig. 3b). For both modes, fully dense \( (\rho = 5.76 \text{ g/cm}^3) \) and pore-free solid BMGs can be achieved (Fig. 3c,d). During printing, the required feed force is typically \(<100 \text{ N} \) but may be required to increase during start-stop to up to \( 1000 \text{ N} \). It is important to emphasize that all aspects of the printing process have been carried out in air, unique among metal 3D printing, and a tremendous benefit in the development of a practical metal 3D printing process.

### Characterization of 3D printed BMG parts

Printed BMG parts have been characterized with thermal and mechanical methods (Fig. 4). To determine the effect of the printing process and the associated temperature exposure, we carried out thermal analysis (Fig. 4a) of the feedstock and printed BMGs, by differential scanning calorimetry. Thermal stability, \( \Delta T \), the temperature difference between the glass transition temperature, \( T_g \), and the crystallization temperature, \( T_x \), and heat of crystallization, \( \Delta H \), of the feedstock BMG are \( T_g = 371 \text{ °C} \), \( T_x = 473 \text{ °C} \), \( \Delta T = 102 \text{ °C} \), \( \Delta H = 83 \pm 5 \text{ J/g} \) and of the printed BMG are \( T_g = 373 \text{ °C} \), \( T_x = 476 \text{ °C} \), \( \Delta T = 103 \text{ °C} \), \( \Delta H = 85 \pm 5 \text{ J/g} \), which are essentially identical within experimental error.

Mechanical characterization was carried out to evaluate the effect of the printing process on the mechanical properties of BMGs. Quasi-static tension was carried out on printed parts in directions both parallel and perpendicular to the printed direction (Fig. 4b). The fracture strength of the printed BMG sample, when loaded parallel to the printed layers, \( \sigma_{||} \), reaches up to \( 1220 \text{ MPa} \). When loaded perpendicular to the printed layers, fracture strength, \( \sigma_{\perp} \), of up to \( 790 \text{ MPa} \) can be achieved. For comparison, the fracture strength of the feedstock material is \( \sim 1900 \text{ MPa} \). \( \sigma_{\perp} \) is highly sensitive to the printing conditions, particularly to the temperature difference between the extruded and the previous layer. In the extreme case, that the temperature difference between extruded BMG and previous layer is such that no deformation of the previous layer takes place, essentially no metallurgical bond forms and as a consequence \( \sigma_{\perp} \sim 0 \text{ MPa} \) (Fig. 4c). This is due to the fact that, when processed in air, the layer to layer bonding relies on the strain of the extruded-previous layer interface to break the native oxide film on the surface, and hence, enable a metallurgical bond \([32]\). An interfacial strain can only be achieved if both layers, the extrudate and the previous layer, deform together. Under these conditions, their surfaces bond
rather than re-oxidize. Hence, the temperature of the previous layer at the location where the extruded material makes contact must be similar to the extruded temperature. For the printed BMGs with $\sigma_i = 790\,\text{MPa}$, where a similar temperature between extruded and previous layer was established, the fractured surface shows regions where a metallurgical bond has occurred (Fig. 4e). The area fraction of the metallurgically bonded regions, which occur bright and vein-like in Fig. 4e, of $\sim 30\%$ is comparable to the ratio of inter-layer bond strength of the 3D printed material to bulk strength, $790\,\text{MPa}/1900\,\text{MPa}$, confirming the thermoplastic strain bonding mechanism [32].

Unique among metal 3D printing processes, and a major advantage of the introduced 3D printing of BMGs through FFF method is that the entire process can be carried out in air. Thermal and mechanical behavior (Fig. 4a,b,c,e) suggest no noticeable effect of the air exposure during fabrication. Further, when considering the temperature exposure during the printing process (Fig. 4f) no discoloration, which would be indicative of oxidation, can be discerned. This is initially surprising, as $\text{Zr}_{44}\text{Ti}_{11}\text{Cu}_{10}\text{Ni}_{10}\text{Be}_{25}$ BMG comprises reactive elements. However, when combined in the amorphous phase they appear more robust against oxidation, which, together with the low processing temperature for TPF-based processing, permits processing in air [3,35].

**Discussion**

Most of presented research has been focused on $\text{Zr}_{44}\text{Ti}_{11}\text{Cu}_{10}\text{Ni}_{10}\text{Be}_{25}$ BMG, that we chose due to its practicality. Further, printing speed, nozzle diameter, and printing forces have not yet been varied systematically to map out processing parameter space. To extend the discussion to a broader range of processing parameters and BMG compositions, we consider the flow of a viscous liquid through the extrusion nozzle (Fig. 5). The extrusion process in the FFF process using TPF of BMGs can be essentially regarded as an extrusion flow process of a high-viscosity Newtonian fluid [36] through a heated cylindrical die. The overall high viscosities of the flowing BMG material results in Reynolds numbers close to zero, i.e., creeping flow conditions [36]. Therefore, the required extrusion pressure, $P$, can be approximated by:

$$P = \frac{32\eta L v}{d^2} \tag{1}$$

where $\eta$ is the viscosity of the BMG, $L$ is the effective die length, $v$ is the extrusion rate, and $d$ is the diameter of the orifice. Eq. (1) allows us to estimate the required forming force to establish a target printing speed for various orifice diameters (0.5, 1, and 2 mm) as a function of the viscosity. For Fig. 5, we assumed an orifice length of $L = 2\,\text{mm}$ and a target extrusion speed of 5 cm/s, which
The ability to carry out this process in air is of practical importance as it avoids costly and typically complicated inert or vacuum conditions. The low TPF processing temperatures during printing and the absence of a first-order phase transition of the BMG during solidification after extrusion results in little shrinkage, at least one order of magnitude less than the shrinkage of liquid-based additive manufacturing processes for conventional metals [2].

A comparison to widely established FFF of thermoplastics, a mature and commercially available technology, suggests a high degree of similarity. It is therefore plausible that many of the engineering challenges that have been solved in thermoplastic FFF can be readily translated to the printing of BMGs. As a consequence, we look forward to a period of potentially rapid progress in 3D printing of BMGs.

Acknowledgments

The characterization of the printed parts was funded under ONR’s “Additive Manufacturing of Alloys for Naval Environments” program.

Appendix A. Supplementary data

Supplementary data associated with this article can be found, in the online version, at https://doi.org/10.1016/j.mattod.2018.07.001.

References